NEW PERSPECTIVES ON TYPE IDENTITY

The type identity theory, according to which types of mental state are identical to types of physical state, fell out of favor for some years but is now being considered with renewed interest. Many philosophers are critically re-examining the arguments which were marshaled against it, finding in the type identity theory both resources to strengthen a comprehensive, physicalistic metaphysics, and a useful tool in understanding the relationship between developments in psychology and new results in neuroscience. This volume brings together leading philosophers of mind, whose essays challenge in new ways the standard objections to type identity theory, such as the multiple realizability objection and the modal argument. Other essays show how cognitive science and neuroscience are lending new support to type identity theory, and still others provide, extend, and improve traditional arguments concerning the theory’s explanatory power.

Simone Gozzano is Professor of Philosophy of Mind at the University of L’Aquila. He is the author of four books (in Italian) on topics such as Intentionality, Animal Minds, Mental Causation, and Consciousness. He is the co-editor, with Francesco Orilia, of Tropes and the Philosophy of Mind (2008).

Christopher S. Hill is Professor of Philosophy at Brown University. He is the author of three books: Sensations: A Defense of Type Materialism (Cambridge, 1991), Thought and World: An Austere Portrayal of Truth, Reference, and Semantic Correspondence (Cambridge, 2002), and Consciousness (Cambridge, 2009).
NEW PERSPECTIVES
ON TYPE IDENTITY

The Mental and the Physical

EDITED BY
SIMONE GOZZANO
AND
CHRISTOPHER S. HILL
For SG’s family, Costanza, Emilia, and Eugenio, and two stellar friends of CSH’s, Tony Brueckner and Ivan Fox.
Contents

List of contributors  ix
Acknowledgements  x

Introduction  1
Simone Gozzano and Christopher S. Hill

1 Acquaintance and the mind–body problem  16
Katalin Balog

2 Identity, reduction, and conserved mechanisms: perspectives from circadian rhythm research  43
William Bechtel

3 Property identity and reductive explanation  66
Angar Beckermann

4 A brief history of neuroscience's actual influences on mind–brain reductionism  88
John Bickle

5 Type-identity conditions for phenomenal properties  111
Simone Gozzano

6 Locating qualia: do they reside in the brain or in the body and the world?  127
Christopher S. Hill

7 In defence of the identity theory mark I  150
Frank Jackson

8 The very idea of token physicalism  167
Jaegwon Kim
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>viii</th>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>About face: philosophical naturalism, the heuristic identity theory, and recent findings about prosopagnosia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert N. McCauley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>On justifying neurobiologicalism for consciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brian P. McLaughlin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The causal contribution of mental events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alyssa Ney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Return of the zombies?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Perry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Identity, variability, and multiple realization in the special sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lawrence A. Shapiro and Thomas W. Polger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Katalin Balog, Rutgers University, USA
William Bechtel, University of California at San Diego, USA
Ansgar Beckermann, Bielefeld Universität, Germany
John Bickle, Mississippi State University, USA
Simone Gozzano, Università di L’Aquila, Italy
Christopher S. Hill, Brown University, USA
Frank Jackson, Princeton University, USA; The Australian National University, Australia
Jaegwon Kim, Brown University, USA
Robert N. McCauley, Emory University, USA
Brian P. McLaughlin, Rutgers University, USA
Alyssa Ney, University of Rochester, USA
John Perry, University of California, Riverside, USA
Thomas W. Polger, University of Cincinnati, USA
Lawrence A. Shapiro, University of Wisconsin, USA
Acknowledgements

The aim of this book is to stimulate a reconsideration of the type-identity theory. We thank our fellow contributors for sharing our enthusiasm for this goal, for providing advice as to how best to achieve it, and for keeping and surpassing the promises made in their abstracts. We are particularly grateful to Larry Shapiro and Thomas Polger. When the book was just an idea, they supported its realization with zeal. We also wish to thank Hilary Gaskin, our editor at Cambridge University Press, for providing support and advice, both early and late, and for selecting splendid referees. A number of friends and colleagues have commented on the project, providing insightful criticism and suggestions. We are particularly grateful to Ausonio Marras, Stephen White, Mauro Dorato, Andrea Iacona, and Mario De Caro. In addition, we wish to acknowledge the contributions of Alexandra King, Anna Lowe, and Rob Wilkinson, who have provided valuable editorial assistance in the later stages, and the stimulating environments offered by our home departments, the Dipartimento di Storia e Metodologie Comorate at the Università di L’Aquila, and the Philosophy Department at Brown University.