The Performance of Nationalism

Imagine the patriotic camaraderie of national day parades. How crucial is performance for the sustenance of the nation? The Performance of Nationalism considers the formation of the Indian and Pakistani nation, in the wake of the most violent chapter of its history: the partition of the subcontinent. In the process, Jisha Menon offers a fresh analysis of nationalism from the perspective of performance. Menon recovers the manifold valences of “mimesis”: as aesthetic representation, as the constitution of a community of witnesses, and as the mimetic relationality that underlies the encounter between India and Pakistan. The particular performances considered here range from Wagah border ceremonies, to the partition theatre of Asghar Wajahat, Kirti Jain, M.K. Raina, and the cinema of Ritwik Ghatak and M.S. Sathyu. By pointing to the tropes of twins, doubles, and doppelgängers that suffuse these performances, this study troubles the idea of two insular nation-states of India and Pakistan. In the process, Menon recovers mimetic modes of thinking that unsettle the reified categories of identity politics.

Jisha Menon is Assistant Professor of Theatre and Performance Studies at Stanford University.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MODERN THEATRE

Series editor
David Bradby, Royal Holloway, University of London

Advisory board
Martin Banham, University of Leeds
Jacky Bratton, Royal Holloway, University of London
Tracy Davis, Northwestern University
Sir Richard Eyre
Michael Robinson, University of East Anglia
Sheila Stowell, University of Birmingham

Volumes for Cambridge Studies in Modern Theatre explore the political, social, and cultural functions of theatre while also paying careful attention to detailed performance analysis. The focus of the series is on political approaches to the modern theatre with attention also being paid to theatres of earlier periods and their influence on contemporary drama. Topics in the series are chosen to investigate this relationship and include both playwrights (their aims and intentions set against the effects of their work) and process [with emphasis on rehearsal and production methods, the political structure within theatre companies, and their choice of audiences or performance venues]. Further topics will include devised theatre, agitprop, community theatre, para-theatre and performance art. In all cases the series will be alive to the special cultural and political factors operating in the theatres examined.

Books published
Jo Riley, Chinese Theatre and the Actor in Performance
Jonathan Kalb, The Theatre of Heiner Müller
Richard Boon and Jane Plastow, eds. Theatre Matters: Performance and Culture on the World Stage
Claude Schumacher, ed. Staging the Holocaust: The Shoah in Drama and Performance
Philip Roberts, The Royal Court Theatre and the Modern Stage
Nicholas Grene, *The Politics of Irish Drama: Plays in Context from Boucicault to Friel*

Anatoly Smeliansky, *The Russian Theatre after Stalin*

Clive Barker and Maggie B. Gale, eds. *British Theatre between the Wars, 1918–1939*

Michael Patterson, *Strategies of Political Theatre: Post-War British Playwrights*


Gabriele Griffin, *Contemporary Black and Asian Women Playwrights in Britain*

Loren Kruger, *Post-Imperial Brecht: Politics and Performance, East and South*

David Barnett, *Rainer Werner Fassbinder and the German Theatre*

Mary Luckhurst, *Dramaturgy: A Revolution in Theatre*

Scott Boltwood, *Brian Friel, Ireland, and The North*

Gerwin Strobl, *The Swastika and the Stage: German Theatre and Society, 1933–1945*

Gene A. Plunka, *Holocaust Drama: The Theater of Atrocity*

Nadine Holdsworth, *Joan Littlewood’s Theatre*

William Storm, *Irony and the Modern Theatre*

Janelle Reinelt and Gerald Hewitt, *The Political Theatre of David Edgar: Negotiation and Retrieval*

Jisha Menon, *The Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition*
The Performance of Nationalism
India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition

Jisha Menon
Contents

List of illustrations page viii
Acknowledgments x

1 Introduction 1
2 Bordering on drama: the performance of politics and the politics of performance 22
3 Ghatak’s cinema and the discoherence of the Bengal Partition 54
4 The poetics and politics of accommodation 86
5 Somatic texts and the gender of partition 119
6 Kashmir: hospitality and the “unfinished business” of partition 154
7 Afterword 185

Notes 189
Bibliography 228
Index 257
Illustrations

2.1 A Pakistan Ranger and an Indian Border Security Force soldier marching during the Wagah border ceremony. Photo: AP/Aman Sharma. page 45

2.2 Soldiers glare at each other at the Wagah border. Photo: AP/Vincent Thian. 48

3.1 Neeta prepares to leave home. Meghe Dhaka Tara by Ritwik Ghatak. Courtesy National Film Archives of India. 67

3.2 Mimetic doubles: Bhrigu and Anasuya reflect the relationship between person and place. Komal Gandhar by Ritwik Ghatak. Courtesy National Film Archives of India. 75

3.3 Kinship in crisis. Subarnarekha by Ritwik Ghatak. Courtesy National Film Archives of India. 82

4.1 Amina turns back to look at her beloved who vanishes from the mirror. Garm Hawa by M.S. Sathyu. 99

4.2 Mai turns to the call of “Daadima,” or grandmother. Jinnay Lahore Nahin Vekhya by Sheema Kirmani. Photographer: S. Thyagarajan, Theatre Archives: Natarang Pratishthan. 112

5.1 Saadia hides under the string-bed. Aur Kitne Tukde by Kirti Jain. Photographer: S. Thyagarajan, Theatre Archives: Natarang Pratishthan. 130
List of illustrations


5.3 Harnam Kaur – the failed martyr. *Aur Kitne Tukde* by Kirti Jain. Photographer: S. Thyagarajan, Theatre Archives: Natarang Pratishthan. 143

6.1 Bhand performer as Shiva in *Shikargah*. Photographer: Anant Raina. 160

6.2 Interchangeable roles of Mashkara and Badshah, the jester and the king. *Badshah Pather* by M.K. Raina. Photographer: Jisha Menon. 179

6.3 Mad Badshah on the heath. Photographer: Jisha Menon. 181
Acknowledgments

The journey of writing this book has revealed to me the numerous ways in which I am sustained by the support of friends and strangers. This book bears the traces of mentors, friends, family, colleagues, and students over the past several years. I am blessed not only to have been the student of extraordinary scholars but also the beneficiary of their kindness. The critical generosity of Harry Elam continues to nurture and inspire me. Purnima Mankekar and Akhil Gupta opened the doors of postcolonial anthropology to me and demonstrated the rewards of pursuing interdisciplinary scholarship. To Peggy Phelan I owe a greater debt than I can convey for her brilliance and mentorship. For their intellectual nurture, I thank Jean-Marie Apostolides, David Palumbo-Liu, Patricia Parker, Michael Ramsaur, Alice Rayner, Rush Rehm, and Carl Weber. Ania Loomba and Lata Mani inspire me to live a life of the mind with courage, vitality, and a sense of harmony.

The Fab Four were my first home away from home: Thanks to the cheer and camaraderie of Brandi Catanese, Faedra Carpenter, Shawn Kairschner, and Zack. Lalaei Ameeriar, Patrick Anderson, Susan Bennett, Nandi Bhatia, Renu Capelli, Manishita Das, Chandan Gowda, Edith Gimm, Aleta Hayes, Michael Hunter, Bakirathi Mani, Janelle Reinelt, Freddie Rokem, Natalia Roudavskova, Rebecca Schneider, Steve Wilmer, Bill Worthen, Haiping Yan, and Patricia Ybarra offered a vibrant intellectual community at Stanford and beyond. Maya Dodd and Gauri Gill have been the source of solidarity, wisdom, and joy across the globe from the dazzling beaches of Carmel to the rough waters of monsoon Goa.

This is also the place to register some older debts: Suryakumari Dennison, Ranita Hirji, Srikrishna Ayyangar, Sandeep Bakshi,
Acknowledgments

Priyo Bannerjee, Saugata Bhaduri, Damayanti Bhattacharya, Piyas Chakrabarti, Reena Chakrabarty, Nitoo Das, Paromita Das, Prachi Deshpande, Sharmistha Ghosh, Alexis Halkovic, Shruti Kapila, Laura Luktisch, Franson Manjali, Nayanika Mookherjee, Misa Oishi, Shruti Pant, G.J.V. Prasad, and the late Professor Meenakshi Mukherjee at Jawaharlal Nehru University offered a formidable intellectual community and laid the groundwork for me to pursue a career in academia. Deepa Chikermane, Pushpa Menon, Anita Raj, Priya Raman, and Sonali Sattar ensure that I never feel like a stranger at home: Their homes and hearts have always remained open to me.

I cherish my former colleagues in the Department of English at UBC for their collegiality, humor, and compassion; I am especially grateful to Patsy Badir, Sarika Bose, Richard Cavell, Mary Chapman, Sian Echard, Sneja Gunew, Stephen Guy-Bray, Tina Lupton, and Laura Moss. My colleagues at Stanford push me to do the best work that I possibly can: Conversations with Jennifer Brody, Michele Elam, Thomas Blom Hansen, Leslie Hill, Allyson Hobbes, Branislav Jakovjevic, Aishwary Kumar, Sangeeta Mediratta, Cherrie Moraga, Paula Moya, Helen Paris, Janice Ross, Parma Sengupta and Anna Schulz have crucially informed my thinking. My thanks to the administrative staff in the Drama Department at Stanford, especially Patrice O’Dwyer, Stephany Baker, and Christina Hartung for their patience and inspiring proficiency.

I thank my interlocutors at the various venues where I have presented parts of this research, including American Society for Theatre Research; the Modern Language Association; Women and Theatre Program; Duke University; Yale University; University of California, Davis; Tufts University; Brown University; University of British Columbia; Swarthmore College; International Centre for Advanced Theatre Studies (Helsinki); Alternative Law Forum, Bangalore; Azim Premji University, and Clayman Institute, Stanford. My thanks to Shahzad Bashir, Suvir Kaul, and Miyako Inoue for reading drafts of chapters and offering valuable advice. I have thought through most of the ideas in this book with my brilliant students who will find a trace of their voice in the text that follows. In particular, I thank Jessica Nakamura and Lindsey Mantoan for their superb
Acknowledgments

research assistantship. Generous support from the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada, the Annenberg Faculty Fellowship, and the Clayman Institute for Gender Research at Stanford University facilitated my research and offered opportunities for excellent critical feedback on my project.

I have been very fortunate to have the firm support of Cambridge University Press. I am especially grateful to the late David Bradby for his enthusiasm for this manuscript. Vicki Cooper and the anonymous readers offered excellent advice and detailed reports, which pushed me to sharpen my arguments. I am indebted to Rebecca Taylor and Fleur Jones for their unflagging attentiveness to this manuscript.

My thanks to the artists who assisted me with this project: Rukhsana Ahmad, B. Gauri, Kirti Jain, Basir Kazmi, Sheema Kermani, Shahid Nadeem, and Asghar Wajahat have offered important insights into the many questions I explore in the pages that follow. M.K. Raina went beyond the call of duty to help me with my project for which I remain very grateful.

Sections of individual chapters have appeared in different versions. I thank the publishers for their permission to reprint and the editors for their feedback and advice. Different versions of Chapter 3 and Chapter 4 appeared in Modern Drama (Volume 46, Number 2, Summer 2003) and Feminist Review (Volume 84, Sept. 2006), respectively.

Finally, thanks to my family: This project would not have been possible without the support and everyday acts of generosity of Sanjay Rajagopalan. My sisters, Roji Menon and Jyothi Menon; my brother, Manoj Menon; and their families have been a source of great strength to me. The rapturous delight of my son, Rahil Menon, makes me believe in and grateful for the power of miracles. Finally, I thank my parents: My father’s robust sense of humor and my mother’s faith and serenity carried me through my darkest moments. I dedicate this book to my parents as thanks for giving me my life a second time.