

The Collaborative Congress

The Collaborative Congress is an in-depth study of how members work together to create policy in a polarized legislature. While the modern Congress is characterized by partisanship and conflict, members frequently look for opportunities to find common ground on substantive policy. This book challenges the conventional narrative of a hopelessly dysfunctional legislature by revealing the widespread use of collaboration for successful policymaking. Drawing on a new dataset of communication between members, social network analysis, and qualitative interviews, chapters demonstrate that nearly every member engages in collaboration across a broad array of issues. The book identifies the strategic and political considerations that influence a member's decision to collaborate and shows that collaborative legislation is more successful at every stage of the policymaking process. This title is part of the Flip it Open Programme and may also be available Open Access. Check our website Cambridge Core for details.

Alison W. Craig is Assistant Professor of Government at the University of Texas. She received the Carl Albert prize for the best dissertation in legislative studies and has testified before Congress on improving civility and collaboration among members. Her research has been funded by the National Science Foundation and published in the *American Journal of Political Science* and *Legislative Studies Quarterly*.

The Collaborative Congress

Reaching Common Ground in a Polarized House

ALISON W. CRAIG

University of Texas, Austin



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-33826-4 — The Collaborative Congress
Alison W. Craig
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009338264

DOI: 10.1017/9781009338288

© Alison W. Craig 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the
Library of Congress*

ISBN 978-1-009-33826-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-33826-4 — The Collaborative Congress
Alison W. Craig
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Jan, my brilliant mentor and friend

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
1 Collaboration in Congress (Yes, It Exists!)	i
2 Social Exchange in Congress	18
3 Identifying Policy Collaboration	44
4 The Breadth and Substance of Collaborative Issues	70
5 The Most (and Least) Collaborative Members of Congress	100
6 The Interdependence of Collaborative Relationships	132
7 Legislative Benefits of Collaboration	161
8 The Future of Collaboration	201
<i>Appendix A Interview Notes</i>	215
<i>Appendix B Model Specifications and Fit</i>	219
<i>References</i>	223
<i>Index</i>	235

Figures

1.1	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2009 by Congressmen Bart Gordon (D-TN) and James Sensenbrenner (R-WI) soliciting original cosponsors for the Combat Methamphetamine Enhancement Act	<i>page 13</i>
2.1	Representatives Christopher Shays (R-CT) and Martin Meehan (D-MA) celebrate House passage of the Shays-Meehan Bipartisan Campaign Reform Act of 2002	21
2.2	Facebook post from Congresswoman Abigail Spanberger (D-VA) promoting the Freedom to Invest in Tomorrow’s Workforce Act, introduced with Congressman Rob Wittman (R-VA)	33
2.3	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2005 by Congressman John Larson (D-CT) and Congresswoman Rosa DeLauro (D-CT) soliciting signatures on a letter to the House Agriculture and Energy and Commerce Committees regarding commodities futures traders	36
2.4	House floor schedule for the week of February 25, 2019, as distributed by Majority Leader Steny Hoyer (D-MD)	40
3.1	Dear Colleague letter sent in 1919 by Congressmen Scott Ferris (R-OK), C. Bascom Slep (R-VA), and Delegate J. Kuhio Kalaniana’ole (R-HI) inviting members to an upcoming lecture	49
3.2	Dear Colleague letter sent in 1940 by Congressman Clare Hoffman (R-MI) denouncing remarks by President Franklin Roosevelt	50
3.3	Dear Colleague letter sent in 1986 by Congressmen Thomas Petri (R-WI) and Paul Henry (R-MI) soliciting	

	cosponsors for the Children’s Options for Intensive Compensatory Education Act	52
3.4	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2007 by Congressmen Barney Frank (D-MA) and Paul Gillmor (R-OR) soliciting cosponsors for the Industrial Bank Holding Company Act	56
3.5	Total number of electronic Dear Colleague letters sent by all members in each Congress, 1999–2010	59
3.6	Number of members who sent electronic Dear Colleague letters in each Congress, 1999–2010	60
3.7	Distribution of words per Dear Colleague letter in each Congress, 1999–2010	60
3.8	Percentage of all Dear Colleague letters sent by purpose, 1999–2010	61
3.9	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2008 by Congressman Henry Waxman (D-CA) and Congresswoman Lucille Roybal-Allard (D-CA) soliciting cosponsors for the Vaccines for Children Access Act	65
3.10	Policy collaboration network of the 110th Congress, 2007–2008	66
3.11	Number of members who signed individual electronic Dear Colleague letters in each Congress (1999–2010)	67
3.12	Distribution of signer count across all Dear Colleague letters, 1999–2010	68
3.13	Distribution of cosponsor count across all bills introduced in light gray overlaid with the distribution of signer count across all Dear Colleague letters sent in dark gray, 1999–2010	68
4.1	Total number of DCLs sent by policy topic, 1999–2010	76
4.2	Proportion of all DCLs sent and bills introduced by policy topic, 1999–2010	77
4.3	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2009 by Congressmen Glenn Nye (D-VA) and Aaron Schock (R-IL) soliciting signatures on a letter to House leadership regarding health-care reform	80
4.4	Proportion of DCLs that are collaborative by policy topic, 1999–2010	81
4.5	Proportion of collaborative DCLs that are bipartisan or partisan by policy topic, 1999–2010	83
4.6	Coefficients from a multinomial logistic regression model estimating the likelihood a letter is collaborative and bipartisan (BP), collaborative and partisan (P), or non-collaborative (NC) by policy topic, 1999–2010	85

List of Figures xi

4.7	Relative risk ratios from multinomial logistic regression model in Table 4.1 predicting the likelihood a DCL is collaborative	88
4.8	Percentage of House bills and resolutions introduced that are collaborative (left) and bipartisan (right) by bill type, 2001–2010	90
4.9	Percentage of collaborative bills and resolutions by bill type, 2001–2010	92
4.10	Predicted probability that a bill is collaborative or bipartisan by bill type	95
4.11	Predicted probability that a bill is collaborative by dimensionality, conditional on bill type	96
4.12	Predicted probability that a bill is bipartisan by dimensionality, conditional on bill type	96
5.1	Distribution of the number of collaborative partners (degree centrality) for each member by Congress, 1999–2010	105
5.2	Distribution of the number of collaborative partners (degree centrality) for each member by party, 1999–2010	107
5.3	Ego network for Congressman Gregg Harper (R-MS) in the 111th Congress (2009–2010)	121
5.4	Distribution of the number of bipartisan collaborative partners for each member by Congress, 1999–2010	126
5.5	Ego network for Congressman Michael McCaul (R-TX) in the 111th Congress (2009–2010)	128
5.6	Coefficients from temporal network autocorrelation models in Tables 5.2 and 5.3 predicting a member’s number of collaborative partners	130
6.1	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2009 by Congressman Jim McDermott (D-WA) soliciting cosponsors for the Sensible Estate Tax Act	135
6.2	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2009 by Congressmen Jim McDermott (D-WA) and Frank Wolf (R-VA) soliciting cosponsors for the Conflict Minerals Trade Act	136
6.3	Twitter exchange between Congressmen Kurt Schrader (D-OR) and Reid Ribble (R-WI) celebrating the advancement of the Biennial Budgeting and Enhanced Oversight Act of 2014	140
6.4	Policy collaboration networks for the 107th through 111th Congresses (2001–2010)	148
6.5	Proportion of ties by partisanship by Congress, 2001–2010	150
6.6	Triadic closure and structural imbalance	152

xii	<i>List of Figures</i>	
6.7	Coefficients from temporal exponential random graph model (TERGM) in Table 6.2 estimating the determinants of tie formation in the policy collaboration networks	158
7.1	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2007 by Congressmen John Dingell (D-MI), Ed Whitfield (R-KY), and George Miller (D-CA) soliciting original cosponsors for the Protecting Children’s Health in Schools Act	165
7.2	Average number of cosponsors across all collaborative and noncollaborative legislation, 2001–2010	172
7.3	Average number of cosponsors across all substantive legislation, divided into unpromoted, noncollaborative, partisan collaborative, and bipartisan collaborative bills, 2001–2010	173
7.4	Average number of cosponsors across all substantive legislation by legislative progress, 2001–2010	174
7.5	Predicted number of cosponsors for noncollaborative versus collaborative legislation	177
7.6	Percentage of substantive legislation reported out of committee, divided into unpromoted, noncollaborative, partisan collaborative, and bipartisan collaborative bills, 2001–2010	179
7.7	Predicted probability of a committee report for noncollaborative versus collaborative legislation	183
7.8	Predicted probability of a committee report for noncollaborative versus collaborative legislation for significant legislation and committee chairs	184
7.9	Percentage of substantive legislation passing the House, divided into noncollaborative, partisan collaborative, and bipartisan collaborative bills, 2001–2010	186
7.10	Predicted probability of House passage for noncollaborative versus collaborative legislation	189
7.11	Predicted probability of House passage for noncollaborative versus collaborative legislation reported by committee	190
7.12	Dear Colleague letter sent in 2003 by Congressmen Max Burns (R-GA) and John Boehner (R-OH) soliciting original cosponsors for the Child Medication Safety Act	191
7.13	Senator Saxby Chambliss (R-GA), Senator Dianne Feinstein (D-CA), Representative Devin Nunes (R-CA), Jason Hubbard, and Representative Jim Costa (D-CA) address the media during a press conference to introduce the Hubbard Act of 2008	193

List of Figures xiii

7.14	Percentage of substantive legislation enacted, divided into noncollaborative, partisan collaborative, and bipartisan collaborative bills, 2001–2010	195
7.15	Predicted probability of enactment for noncollaborative versus collaborative legislation	198
B.1	Goodness-of-fit plots for the temporal exponential random graph model from Table 6.2	222

Tables

4.1	The likelihood of collaboration as a function of dimensionality and agenda space, 1999–2010	<i>page 87</i>
4.2	Number of House bills and resolutions introduced in each Congress classified by substance, 2001–2010	90
4.3	The likelihood a bill is collaborative or bipartisan as a function of bill substance and the dimensionality of the policy area, 2001–2010	94
5.1	Most collaborative members (measured as the highest number of unique relationships) in the US House of Representatives, 1999–2010	106
5.2	Number of collaborative relationships as a function of a member’s incentives and opportunities, 2001–2010	123
5.3	Number of bipartisan and partisan collaborative relationships as a function of a member’s incentives and opportunities, 2001–2010	127
6.1	Descriptive statistics for the policy collaboration networks, 2001–2010	149
6.2	Conditional log odds of tie formation in the policy collaboration networks as a function of strategic considerations, personal relationships, and shared policy goals, 2001–2010	155
7.1	Number of cosponsors on a bill as a function of collaboration, 2001–2010	176
7.2	Probability a bill is reported out of committee as a function of collaboration, 2001–2010	181
7.3	Probability a bill passes the House as a function of collaboration, 2001–2010	187

xvi	<i>List of Tables</i>	
7.4	Probability a bill is enacted as a function of collaboration, 2001–2010	197
A.1	Summary statistics for members whose staff was in the interview pool (left) and all members of the 114th Congress (right)	216
A.2	Initial questions for interviews with congressional staff	217
B.1	Likelihood of collaboration as a function of issue area, 1999–2010	220

Acknowledgments

I am deeply grateful to the many people who provided support and assistance during the writing of this book. I am fortunate to work with a fantastic group of colleagues at the University of Texas who have been incredibly supportive throughout this process. In particular, I owe a debt of gratitude to Sean Theriault, who has been a consistent source of feedback and encouragement. Between providing a sounding board for all of my ideas and concerns and pushing me to “send it out already,” this book possibly would not exist if I did not have the support of such a wonderful colleague and friend. I am also grateful to Bryan Jones, Chris Wlezien, Derek Epp, Bat Sparrow, Bethany Albertson, and Dan Brinks for their advice on the manuscript and publishing process.

This project began while I was a graduate student at the Ohio State University, where I had the privilege of working with Jan Box-Steffensmeier, my brilliant and endlessly patient mentor. I was fortunate enough to meet Jan while deciding if I wanted to go to graduate school, and it was our “30-minute meeting” turned into a two-hour conversation on Congress that inspired me to become an academic. Since that meeting, Jan has been a constant source of support who is always available for feedback and advice (even if I do not take her up on that nearly as often as I should). I am also grateful to Skyler Cranmer, Mike Neblo, and Herb Weisberg for continually pushing me to think bigger and deeper.

The list of people who have provided helpful comments and suggestions for this book would likely fill an entire page, but a few people were exceptionally generous with their time and attention. I am grateful to Alan Wiseman, Tracy Sulkin, Justin Kirkland, Jennifer Victor, Wendy Schiller, Annelise Russell, Zac McGee, and Mark Hand for reading and

providing detailed feedback on multiple chapters of this manuscript. I am also thankful for the help of my editor, Rachel Blaifeder, and the team at Cambridge University Press for turning this book into a reality.

I am indebted to my colleagues from my past life as a congressional staffer who indirectly inspired this project. I started researching congressional networks because I could not stop thinking about how meaningful relationships were in the day-to-day work of members and staff on Capitol Hill. “Can we get someone to work with us?” was one of the first questions on nearly every policy proposal. I credit Darlene Hooley, Kurt Schrader, Joan Mooney, Anne Marie Feeney, and Mark Dedrick for teaching me the ins and outs of Capitol Hill and everything I know about the legislative process. I am also grateful to the many congressional staff members who were willing to take the time to sit down with me and talk about collaboration in their offices.

I thank the National Science Foundation, Hewlett Foundation, American University, Dirksen Center, Ohio State University, and the University of Texas at Austin for their generous financial support of this project. I would also like to thank the Carl Albert Center, the Library of Congress, and the National Archives for providing access to archival documents.

Finally, I am grateful to my cheerleaders, who provided endless support and encouragement along the way: Greg, Bri, Kati, Latham, and of course, my parents.