

A Tale of Two Granadas

In 1570s New Kingdom of Granada (modern Colombia), a new generation of *mestizo* (half-Spanish, half-indigenous) men sought positions of increasing power in the colony's two largest cities. In response, Spanish nativist factions zealously attacked them as unequal and unqualified, unleashing an intense political battle that lasted almost two decades. At stake was whether membership in the small colonial community and thus access to its most lucrative professions should depend on *limpieza de sangre* (blood purity) or values-based integration (Christian citizenship). *A Tale of Two Granadas* examines the vast, trans-Atlantic transformation of political ideas about subjecthood that ultimately allowed some colonial *mestizos* and *indios ladinos* (acculturated natives) to establish urban citizenship alongside Spaniards in colonial Santafé de Bogotá and Tunja. In a spirit of comparison, it illustrates how some of the descendants of Spain's last Muslims appealed to the same new conceptions of citizenship to avoid disenfranchisement in the face of growing prejudice.

Max Deardorff is Assistant Professor of History at the University of Florida. He is a former Fulbright Scholar and fellow at the Max Planck Institute for Legal History and Legal Theory. He is the recipient of the Association for Spanish and Portuguese Historical Studies (ASPHS) prize for best early career article.

CAMBRIDGE LATIN AMERICAN STUDIES

General Editors

KRIS LANE, Tulane University
 MATTHEW RESTALL, Pennsylvania State University

Editor Emeritus

HERBERT S. KLEIN
 Gouverneur Morris Emeritus Professor of History, Columbia University and Hoover
 Research Fellow, Stanford University

Other Books in the Series

- 129 *A Colonial Book Market: Peruvian Print Culture in the Age of Enlightenment*, Agnes Gehbald
- 128 *Veracruz and the Caribbean in the Seventeenth Century*, Joseph M. H. Clark
- 127 *We, the King: Creating Royal Legislation in the Sixteenth Century Spanish New World*, Adrian Masters
- 126 *A History of Chile 1808–2018, 2nd edition*, William F. Sater and Simon Collier
- 125 *The Dread Plague and the Cow Killers: The Politics of Animal Disease in Mexico and the World*, Thomas Rath
- 124 *Islands in the Lake: Environment and Ethnohistory in Xochimilco, New Spain*, Richard M. Conway
- 123 *Journey to Indo-América: APRA and the Transnational Politics of Exile, Persecution, and Solidarity, 1918–1945*, Geneviève Dorais
- 122 *Nationalizing Nature: Iguaza Falls and National Parks at the Brazil-Argentina Border*, Frederico Freitas
- 121 *Islanders and Empire: Smuggling and Political Defiance in Hispaniola, 1580–1690*, Juan José Ponce-Vázquez
- 120 *Our Time Is Now: Race and Modernity in Postcolonial Guatemala*, Julie Gibbings
- 119 *The Sexual Question: A History of Prostitution in Peru, 1850s–1950s*, Paulo Drinot
- 118 *A Silver River in a Silver World: Dutch Trade in the Rio de la Plata, 1648–1678*, David Freeman
- 117 *Laboring for the State: Women, Family, and Work in Revolutionary Cuba, 1959–1971*, Rachel Hynson
- 116 *Violence and The Caste War of Yucatán*, Wolfgang Gabbert
- 115 *For Christ and Country: Militant Catholic Youth in Post-Revolutionary Mexico*, Robert Weis
- 114 *The Mexican Mission: Indigenous Reconstruction and Mendicant Enterprise in New Spain, 1521–1600*, Ryan Dominic Crewe

A Tale of Two Granadas

*Custom, Community, and Citizenship in the Spanish
Empire, 1568–1668*

MAX DEARDORFF

University of Florida



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-33540-9 — A Tale of Two Granadas
Max Deardorff
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009335409

DOI: 10.1017/9781009335447

© Max Deardorff 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of
relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of
Congress.*

ISBN 978-1-009-33540-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>List of Maps</i>	vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
Introduction	i
1 Iberian Antecedents	34
2 Politics, Reform, and the Emergence of Christian Citizenship	52
3 <i>Moriscos</i> , Arabic Old Christians, and Spanish Jurisprudence (1492–1614)	78
4 Cultivating the Christian Republic: The New Kingdom of Granada and the Archbishop Zapata de Cárdenas	116
5 Life in the City: The <i>Casa Poblada</i> and Urban Citizenship	142
6 The Roots of the <i>Mestizo</i> Controversy in the New Kingdom of Granada	171
7 The <i>Mestizo</i> Priesthood	208
8 <i>Mestizo</i> Officials in the Christian Republic	239
9 Urban Indians in Santafé and Tunja, 1568–1668	260
Epilogue	290
<i>Glossary</i>	305
<i>Bibliography</i>	318
<i>Index</i>	349

Figures

2.1	Incidence of legislation in the lands of Castile through provincial council, diocesan synod, or other legal deliberation (<i>juntas</i> or cathedral constitutions), 1300–1700	page 68
2.2	A decade-by-decade tabulation of the production of legislative constitutions, from 1400 to 1700, in the Kingdom of Castile	69
6.1	Drawing created by Don Diego de Torres while in Madrid on trial	191
9.1	Residence categories of indigenous testators (1568–1668)	273

Maps

0.1	Willem Janszoon Blaeu, <i>La provincia de Tierra Firme y el Nuevo Reino de Granada y Popayán</i> (1631)	page 31
1.1	Map of sixteenth-century Spain	48
2.1	Sites of provincial councils celebrated during the monarchy’s golden age of ecclesiastical legislation	70
5.1	A 1623 urban map of the city of Tunja	147
6.1	Map of the New Kingdom of Granada ca. 1600	173

Tables

5.1	Demography of Tunja in 1620	<i>page 147</i>
-----	-----------------------------	-----------------

Acknowledgments

This book is the product of more than a decade of work and its parts have been written on three different continents in a number of different institutional spaces. I am grateful to acquisitions editor Cecelia Cancellaro and series editors Matthew Restall and Kris Lane for having seen potential in this book, and for having helped ferry it over the finish line. On my way here, I have accrued many debts.

I began this project as a graduate student at Notre Dame. I was drawn to Notre Dame because of its remarkable concentration of specialists on the late medieval and early modern Hispanic world. I was lucky to have Karen Graubart as an adviser. She guided me through many a historical minefield and has been both a fantastic advocate and a compassionate critic throughout the years. Sabine MacCormack and Remie Constable made important contributions to the early stages of this project and I am sad they will not be able to see it in its final form. Felipe Fernández-Armesto reminded me to put regional concerns into a global perspective. Juan Vitulli stepped in to give some late-stage advice. I was lucky to be introduced to modern Latin America by Ted Beatty and Jaime Pensado, wonderful people, scholars, and teachers. For their friendship and scholarly camaraderie, I would also like to acknowledge Brett Rodríguez, Maria Cecilia Ulrickson, Belen Vicens, Adam Duker, Anne McGinness, Katy Kole, Charles Strauss, Keelin Burke, Bry Martin, Victor Maqqe, John Moscatiello, and David Komline. Notre Dame's Nanovic Institute, Kellogg Institute, and the Institute for Scholarship in the Liberal Arts all provided material support for the project at this early stage.

Parts of this book were written from Nashville, where I was welcomed by a tremendous group of students and scholars at Vanderbilt University.

I am so very grateful to Jane Landers, who throughout the years has treated me like family and opened many doors. Celso Castilho offered advice and support as I finished the project. Marshall Eakin and Eddie Wright-Rios made space and time for me as a visiting graduate student. Marcio Bahia offered friendship and encouragement and showed me that it is possible to celebrate *Festa Junina* any time of year. Courtney Campbell, Sveinn Mani Johannesson, Halla Gunnarsdottir, Dan O'Maley, Juliet Larkin-Gilmore, Katie McKenna, Mario Rewers. Anthony Siracusa, Christian Rocha, Justin Hubbard, and Eric Ritter provided a wonderful surrogate graduate community. Among this group, Max Pendergraph stands out as a constant source of friendship support throughout the years and across continents.

After finishing the dissertation, I was incredibly lucky to land a postdoctoral fellowship funded by the Max Planck Institute as a part of the multi-disciplinary *Convivencia* working group. Through a series of meetings in Berlin, Halle, Frankfurt, Barcelona, Lisbon, and Rome, the working group offered the opportunity to think about religious and ethnic diversity in Spanish territories across a *longue durée* and from multiple methodological perspectives. For the many insights shared during our periodic meetings, I am thankful to all the members of the group, and especially Thomas Duve, Raja Sakrani, Christoph Meyer, Alfons Aragoneses, David Nirenberg, Mònica Colominas Aparicio, Elena Paulino, and Helga Wendt.

At home base back in Frankfurt, at the Max Planck Institute for Legal History and Legal Theory, I learned an incredible amount from the director, Thomas Duve, and the magnificent team of researchers he has assembled. Thomas provided a model for inquisitive scholarship and the collaborative research projects he has designed will be paying dividends for decades to come. I am especially grateful to have been enlisted to contribute to the *Historical Dictionary of Canon Law in Hispanic America and the Philippines, 16th–18th centuries (DCH)*, managed successively by two colleagues from whom I have also learned a lot, Osvaldo Moutin and Pilar Mejía. At the weekly meetings of the *Reunión Latina*, I was kept abreast of new sources, methods, and topics of interest by my colleagues Benedetta Albani, Mariana Dias Paes, Raquel Sirotti, Karla Escobar, Constanza López Lamerain, Angela Ballone, José María Humanes, José Luis Paz Nomey, Christoph Rosenmüller, Pamela Cacciavillani, Leticia Vita, Alfonso Alibrandi, and Manuel Bastias Saavedra. Agustín Casagrande, David Rex Galindo, José Luis Egío, and Manuela Bragagnolo kept me close company and were a constant source

Acknowledgments

xi

of inspiration as I worked on this project. Otto Danwerth and I share a great number of scholarly interests and I was incredibly lucky to have him so close at hand. This wonderful group of people gave me much helpful feedback on research talks over the years. Donal Coffey, James Thompson, and Nicole Pasakarnis always made me look forward to coming into the office. Sandra Michelle Röseler's very timely help was a lifesaver.

The periodic seminars from members within other departments at the Institute, the rotating series of talks from Dictionary contributors, and the regular cycle of presentations at the *Seminario Permanente* made for a very enriching working environment. In house, I learned a lot from Christiane Birr, Caspar Ehlers, Christoph Meyer, Massimo Meccarelli, Karl Härter, Peter Collin, and Heinz Mohnhaupt. Shared seminar meetings and meals with Tamar Herzog, Javier Villa-Flores, Fritz Schwaller, Jeremy Mumford, Alejandro Agüero, Renzo Honores, Pedro Cardim, Carmen Alveal, Gustavo Machado Cabral, Gustavo Siqueira, Francisco Ortega, Armando Guevara Gil, Ana Díaz Serrano, Juan Cobo Betancourt, Natalie Cobo, Romina Zamora, and Álvaro Caso Bello opened a lot of intellectual doors. It was a real pleasure to reconnect with Parker Van Valkenburgh through one such event.

At the University of Florida, Heather Vrana, Jeff Needell, and Lillian Guerra have given me a warm welcome and continuing support. Nina Caputo has been a wonderful interlocutor for things Iberian. I feel lucky for all the advice Mitch Hart has given me. I am also grateful to my colleagues who took the time to read and comment on the chapter drafts I circulated at departmental seminars for works-in-progress organized by Florin Curta and Nancy Hunt. Over a series of chats, Sheryl Kroen listened to the big picture as I tried to put all my ideas in order. I am also grateful to the University of Florida College of Liberal Arts and Sciences and Center for the Humanities and the Public Sphere (Rothman Endowment), which materially supported the publication of the book.

Over the years, I have been lucky to receive feedback from a number of generous souls outside of my institution. Invitations at the Université de Strasbourg, the Käte Hamburger Kolleg Center for Advanced Study (Bonn), the Research Seminar on Early Modern History at Ludwig-Maximilians Universität (Munich), the Pontificia Universidad Javeriana (Bogotá), the Harvard Latin American History Seminar, and the Seminário Permanente de História do Direito at the Universidade Federal do Ceará offered the opportunity to sharpen my arguments. My experience at the 2018 meeting of the Southwest Seminar was priceless

and I will long be in debt for all the attentive feedback I received through that event. I am likewise grateful to the *La Patrona* Collective for Colonial Latin American Scholarship and its members for having welcomed me in.

I was lucky to have been the recipient of funding from outside fellowships whose support has enriched my research. A Mellon Foundation grant allowed me to attend Ronnie Po-Chia Hsia's doctoral seminar on *Translating Christianity* and workshop my very first draft of what has become Chapter 4 of this book. The Fulbright IIE Cultural and Scientific Exchange Grant facilitated work in Spanish archives. While I was a Fulbright grantee, Mercedes García-Arenal offered office space at the CSIC, showed me the ropes, and helped me make connections. While I was in Madrid and Valladolid, Fernando Rodríguez Mediano, Manuel Lucena Giraldo, James Amelang, Javier Vela Santamaría, Fermín del Pino Díaz, and José Martínez Millán offered their time and left perceptible imprints on this manuscript. Funds provided by my postdoctoral fellowship at the Max Planck Institute made possible additional travel to archives in Colombia.

During research trips, I have been very grateful to archivists who have shared their time and their knowledge, and to friends and fellow researchers for their camaraderie. In Tunja, archivists Alba Arévalo Paez, Nancy Rojas, and Viviana Ulloa have really brightened my visits. I am indebted to the *directora* Rósula Vargas de Castañeda for having introduced me to the Academia Boyacense de Historia. Martha Fernández shared hard-to-find books and introduced me to Luis Wiesner, who unfortunately has since passed away. In Bogotá, Mauricio Tovar helped orient me within the massive holdings of the Archivo General de la Nación. Marta Hincapié assisted me at the Archivo de Provincia San Luis Bertrán de Colombia. Paloma and Manuela Fernández and Laura Reyes first helped me get my footing in the big city. And Eugenio Fernández helped me finally wrap my head around Bogotá's source bases. In Spain, I am especially grateful for the archival help I received from Luis Calenda, Francisco Molinero Rodríguez, Carmen Hernández Montalbán, Mónica García Aranda, and Amalia García Pedraza. Esther Fernández Medina has been a constant friend in the archives and gave me a better introduction to Granada than I ever would have managed on my own. I am also thankful to the archives for having introduced me to friends Michael Francis, Luis Miguel Glave, Erin Stone, Brad Mollman, Mark Lentz, Kate Godfrey, Patrick Funicello, and Valentina Tikoff.

Over the years, I have profited from close readings by and thoughtful conversations with helpful colleagues. A number of scholars have

Acknowledgments

xiii

selflessly offered their time to read and comment on the manuscript. Ken Mills was especially helpful in the project's formative years. Mercedes García-Arenal read and commented on work at an intermediate stage. José Carlos de la Puente Luna and Maya Stanfield-Mazzi each donated their time to read a chapter during the depth of the pandemic. As the book edged closer to the finish line, Kathryn Burns, Juliet Wiersema, and Joanne Rappaport each independently read the full manuscript and provided constructive criticisms that led me to re-think the organization of the book. Ida Altman read the penultimate draft of a thorny chapter. And in ways big and small, over the past five years, my work has profited from conversations I have had with Luis Wiesner, Fritz Schwaller, Kris Lane, Alcira Dueñas, Michelle McKinley, Renée Souloudre-Lafrance, David Wheat, Kathryn McKnight, Dana Velasco Murillo, Mark Hanna, Bianca Premo, David Sartorius, Yanna Yannakakis, Rob Schwaller, Juan-José Ponce Vázquez, Karen Cousins, Juan Cobo Betancourt, Santiago Muñoz, Max Hering Torres, Arndt Brendecke, Claire Gilbert, María Díez Jiménez, José Pascual Martínez, Bernard Vincent, Enrique Soria Mesa, Manuel Fernández Chaves, Carlos Garriga, Tamar Herzog, Alejandro de la Fuente, Tom Cummins, Jessica Roitman, and Margarita Vargas Betancourt.

Finally – family. I grew up surrounded by books. I cannot thank my parents Deidre and Richard enough for all the time they spent reading to me when I was young and taking me to libraries and bookstores when I grew a little bit older. Nancy, Pam, Mark, this is what I have been up to all those years! To my Brazilian family, *obrigado por tudo*. And to my greatest accomplice of all, Fernanda Bretones Lane, who has read just about every part of this manuscript at about every stage, has been an adventurous traveling partner, and has made numerous sacrifices along the way, I could not have done this without you. Thank you for making it so much fun.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-33540-9 — A Tale of Two Granadas
Max Deardorff
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
