

Political Patronage in Asian Bureaucracies

Political patronage is defined as political actors appointing individuals at their discretion to key positions in the public sector. The book examines this practice in the bureaucracies of 11 Asian countries through the use of a typological framework of patronage types. The framework is based on two key criteria: the basis of trust and the major role of political appointees. Several countries with well-developed civil service systems showed minimal levels of patronage (Japan, Singapore, and South Korea). Two countries with weak civil service showed very high levels of patronage appointments (Bangladesh and India). Sandwiched between those extremes are countries with formal civil service systems that are heavily influenced by political parties and by social ties to society (Vietnam, Kazakhstan, and China). The book concludes that not all patronage is the same and what is important is the tasks being performed by appointees and the nature of the trust relationship.

B. GUY PETERS is Maurice Falk Professor of American Government at the University of Pittsburgh and Editor of the *International Review of Public Policy*. He was the founding president of the International Public Policy Association. His most recent books include *Administrative Traditions: Understanding the Roots of Contemporary Administrative Behavior* (2021) and *Democratic Backsliding and Public Policy* (2021).

COLIN KNOX is Professor at the Graduate School of Public Policy, Nazarbayev University, Kazakhstan, and an emeritus professor at Ulster University (UK). His most recent books are *The Economics of Schooling in a Divided Society: The Case for Shared Education* (2015) (with Vani Borooah); and *Public Policy, Philanthropy and Peacebuilding in Northern Ireland* (2016) (with Padraic Quirk).

BYONG-SEOB KIM is Emeritus Professor at the Graduate School of Public Administration, Seoul National University. He was the president of the Korean Association for Public Administration. His most recent book is *A Discussion on Leadership* (『大學衍義』; 대학연의: 리더십을 말하다) (2018).

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20806-2 — Political Patronage in Asian Bureaucracies
Edited by B. Guy Peters , Colin Knox , Byeong Seob Kim
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Political Patronage in Asian Bureaucracies

Edited by

B. GUY PETERS

University of Pittsburgh

COLIN KNOX

Nazarbayev University

BYONG-SEOB KIM

Seoul National University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-20806-2 — Political Patronage in Asian Bureaucracies
 Edited by B. Guy Peters, Colin Knox, Byeong Seob Kim
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467
 Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009208062

DOI: 10.1017/9781009208055

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Peters, B. Guy, editor. | Knox, Colin, 1953– editor. | Kim, Byong-Seob, 1953– editor.

Title: Political patronage in Asian bureaucracies / edited by B. Guy Peters, Colin Knox, Byong-Seob Kim.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022055192 (print) | LCCN 2022055193 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009208062 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009208055 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Patronage, Political – Asia – Case studies. |

Bureaucracy – Asia – Case studies.

Classification: LCC JQ32 .P65 2023 (print) | LCC JQ32 (ebook) |

DDC 324.2/04–dc23/eng/20230106

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022055192>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022055193>

ISBN 978-1-009-20806-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
1 Patronage in Asian Political Systems: A Framework for Research B. GUY PETERS	1
Part I One-Party Dominated Systems	
2 Governing the Global City’s Mandarinate: Politically Motivated Appointments in Singapore’s Public Sector ASSEL MUSSAGULOVA AND GEORGE WONG	25
3 Patronage and Politicisation in the Indian Administrative Service NARESH CHANDRA SAXENA	49
4 Political Patronage, Civil Service Politicization, and the Ordeals of Career Civil Servants: Insights from Bangladesh MOHAMMAD MIZANUR RAHMAN	69
Part II Two-Party/Multi-Party Systems	
5 Patronage Appointment in Japanese Politics: Political Representation in a Large Bureaucracy MASAO KIKUCHI	99
6 Patronage in Mongolia OYUNSUREN DAMDINSUREN, JULIAN DIERKES, AND BYAMBAKHAND LUGUUSHARAV	121

vi		<i>Contents</i>
7	Loyalty or Expertise? The Practice of Political Patronage in Taiwan TONG-YI HUANG AND ZONG-XIAN HUANG	154
8	Political Appointments in South Korea HYEJIN KANG, MIN HAN KIM, AND BYONG-SEOB KIM	183
9	Patronage Appointments in the Philippine Public Service MARIA FE VILLAMEJOR-MENDOZA	199
	Part III Autocracies	
10	Varieties of Patronage in a Single-Party State: Ministers in China JIANGNAN ZHU, SIQIN KANG, AND YAOWENSONG SONG	231
11	Party Patronage in Kazakhstan COLIN KNOX AND SALTANAT JANENOVA	260
12	Political Patronage in Vietnam MINH-QUANG LE, CHI-KIEN PHUNG, AND QUANG-MINH LE	288
13	Political Patronage in Asian Bureaucracies COLIN KNOX AND B. GUY PETERS	311
	<i>Index</i>	330

Figures

5.1 Dynamics of policymaking power balance before and after World War II in Japan	<i>page</i> 104
6.1 Types of organizations that young work-seekers want to work in	131
6.2 The extent of the spread of corruption in public service	136
7.1 Structure of the central government in Taiwan	163
8.1 Ministers by the nature of appointments	193
8.2 Historical changes in the number of ministers (by trust and roles)	193
8.3 Ministers (by trust and roles) across ministries	194
8.4 Prior job experience of programmatic technocrats	194
9.1 Composition of occupied CES positions, 2011–2020	214
9.2 Gender distribution among occupants of CES positions, 2011–2020	215
9.3 Author’s conceptual typology of the emerging roles/ relationships in patronage appointment in the Philippine public sector	222
10.1 Where the ministries and ministers stay in China’s Party–state hierarchy	237
10.2 Number of ministers from the minority groups across years	242
10.3 Distribution of expertise across ministries	248
10.4 Basis of trust: loyalty to the Party and social groups, and personal connections	251
10.5 Distribution of personal connections across ministries	252
10.6 Distribution of personal connections by patrons across ministries	253
10.7 Distribution of loyalty to social groups across ministries	254
10.8 Varieties of patronage of Chinese ministers	254
11.1 Who exercises patronage in Kazakhstan?	270

viii	<i>List of Figures</i>
11.2 Government effectiveness	275
11.3 Access to state jobs by political group	276
11.4 Rigorous and impartial public administration	277
11.5 Criteria for appointment decisions in the state administration	279
11.6 Neopatrimonial Index	280
12.1 The context of formation of the traditional Vietnamese culture and society	292
12.2 Vietnamese political government system in relation to appointing power and political influences	300
12.3 Typology of Patronage Appointees divided by characteristics and levels in the Vietnamese political system: a meta-analysis	305

Tables

1.1	Typology of types of patronage	<i>page</i> 9
3.1	Wage as a multiple of per capita GDP	52
5.1	Size and type of civil service in Japan	107
5.2	Breakdown of special civil service in National Civil Service	107
5.3	Typology of patronage in Japan	114
6.1	Mongolia’s civil service classification and category	130
6.2	Ambassadors appointed by President Ts. Elbegdorj	144
6.3	Ambassadors appointed by President Battulga	147
6.4	Ambassadors appointed by President U. Khurelsukh	149
7.1	Typology of patronage	160
7.2	Taiwanese central government civil service (2011–2018)	166
7.3	Background of ministers (2000–2020)	170
8.1	Socio-demographic attributes of ministers	191
8.2	Ministers’ prior job experience	192
9.1	Number of civil service personnel by major subdivision by year, 1964–2020	206
9.2	Number of government personnel, by classification of position, 2004–2020	207
9.3	The Philippine civil service by branch, 2004, 2020	209
9.4	Distribution of career civil servants by level, 2008 and 2017	210
9.5	Career executive service officer rank, salary grade, and equivalent CES positions	211
9.6	Occupancy of CES positions, 2011–2017	213
9.7	Composition of occupied CES positions by gender, 2011–2020	214
9.8	Status of eligibility of third-tier appointments in the civil service from Aquino to Duterte	215
9.9	Profile of the career executives	216

x	<i>List of Tables</i>
10.1	Number of ministries across years 238
10.2	Proportion of policy and political appointment 246
11.1	Range and depth of party patronage scoring 264
11.2	Index of party patronage by policy area 264
11.3	Scope of patronage by level 266
11.4	Motivations in making political appointments 271
11.5	Technical and political priorities 272
11.6	Typology of types of patronage 281
12.1	Brief comparisons of the status of the nobility and the methods of mandarin recruitment among some major feudal dynasties in Vietnam 298
12.2	Typology of types of patronage 302
13.1	Factors explaining political patronage 321
13.2	Asian patronage patterns 327

Contributors

OYUNSUREN DAMDINSUREN is Senior Lecturer at the School of International Relations and Public Administration, National University of Mongolia. Her research focuses on diplomacy, foreign policy, international organizations, nuclear non-proliferation, peace, and development studies.

JULIAN DIERKES is Associate Professor and Keidanren Chair in Japanese Research at the University of British Columbia's School of Public Policy and Global Affairs. His research has focused on democratization and mining governance in Mongolia since 2005. He is one of the principal authors of the Mongolia Focus blog.

TONG-YI HUANG is Professor in the Department of Public Administration at National Chengchi University, Taiwan. He received his Ph.D. in the Department of Government from the University of Texas at Austin. His areas of specialization include comparative politics, deliberative democracy, digital governance, and public management.

ZONG-XIAN HUANG is a Ph.D. student in the Department of Public Administration and Policy at the University at Albany's Rockefeller College of Public Affairs and Policy. His research interests include digital governance, information technology management, and public management.

SALTANAT JANENOVA is Lecturer in Public Policy in the School for Policy Studies, University of Bristol, UK, and Professor at the Public Administration Academy under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Her research interests include public sector reforms in the Eurasia region, open government, corruption, and innovations in public services.

HYEJIN KANG is Assistant Professor of Public Administration at the Department of Public Administration within the College of Social Sciences at Dong-A University. She is a political scientist and public administration scholar by training. Her research interests include political appointment, policy and political leadership of government ministers, and trust in government.

SIQIN KANG received his Ph.D. in political science from the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong. His research interest includes Chinese politics and transnationalism. His research has appeared in *Political Research Quarterly*, *Journal of Contemporary China*, and book chapters.

MASAO KIKUCHI is Professor of Public Policy and Management in the Department of Public Management, School of Business Administration, at Meiji University in Tokyo, Japan. His research interests include comparative local governance and crisis management in the Asian region. Dr. Kikuchi received his Ph.D. in political science from Meiji University.

BYONG-SEOB KIM is Professor Emeritus of Public Administration at Seoul National University (SNU), former Chairman of the Presidential Committee on Government Innovation and Decentralization, former President of the Korean Association for Public Administration, and former Dean of the Graduate School of Public Administration at SNU. His research interests include public interest, citizen happiness, and national leadership.

MIN HAN KIM is Visiting Scholar at Global Development Institute at Seoul National University. His research and academic interests include civil service, intergovernmental relations, regionalism, and agenda-setting in the policy process.

COLIN KNOX is Professor at the Graduate School of Public Policy, Nazarbayev University, Kazakhstan, and an emeritus professor at Ulster University (UK).

MINH-QUANG LE is Lecturer at the University of Economics and Business, VNU, Viet Nam. He received his Ph.D. in Public Policy and Management at the University of Palermo, Italy, and for the past 7 years (2015–2022) has been a visiting scholar in different universities in Norway, Poland, and the Netherlands. His research focuses on political institutions, local governance, and immigration issues.

List of Contributors

xiii

QUANG-MINH LE is Lecturer in the Department of Leadership Studies and Public Policy, Academy of Politics – Region I in Hanoi, Vietnam. He received his Ph.D. in public policy at the University of Palermo, Italy. His studies focus on public management, especially on public governance and state-owned enterprises.

BYAMBAKHAND LUGUUSHARAV is a Researcher at the Institute of International Studies, Academy of Sciences of Mongolia. Her research focuses on U.S. foreign policy, Mongolia-U.S. relations, and Mongolia-NATO relations.

ASSEL MUSSAGULOVA is Research Fellow at the Lee Kuan Yew Centre for Innovative Cities. Her research interests include public management, human resources, and organizational behavior. Her current research project focuses on the career transitions of Singaporean workers and policies needed to support the workforce in precarious employment conditions.

B. GUY PETERS is Maurice Falk Professor of Government at the University of Pittsburgh, and Editor of the *International Review of Public Policy*. He was the founding president of the International Public Policy Association. His most recent books include *Administrative Traditions: The Roots of Contemporary Administrative Behavior*, and *Democratic Backsliding and Public Policy*.

CHI-KIEN PHUNG (Ph.D.) is Lecturer and Researcher at the Faculty of Political Science, University of Social Sciences and Humanities, Vietnam National University (VNU-USSH). His studies mainly focus on international political relations, world political institutions, and foreign policy of Vietnam.

MOHAMMAD MIZANUR RAHMAN is Associate Researcher at the Institute of Development Policy, University of Antwerp, has practiced civil service for over two-and-a-half decades. He holds a Ph.D. in political science and has published articles and book chapters. He authored the book *Development Agenda and Donor Influence in South Asia: Bangladesh's Experiences in the PRSP Regime* (Routledge, 2018).

NARESH CHANDRA SAXENA was a career civil servant and retired as Secretary, Planning Commission, Government of India, in 2002. Dr. Saxena did his doctorate in forestry from the University of Oxford in 1992. He was awarded an honorary Ph.D. from the University of East Anglia (UK) in 2006.

YAOWENSONG SONG is an M.Phil. student in the Department of Government and Public Administration at the Chinese University of Hong Kong. He is interested in comparative politics and political methodology, with a focus on contemporary China.

MARIA FE VILLAMEJOR-MENDOZA is Professor of Public Administration and Public Policy and former Dean of the National College of Public Administration and Governance (NCPAG), University of the Philippines. Her areas of expertise are regulatory governance, public sector reform, combating corruption, climate change adaptation, collaborative governance, and quality of government services.

GEORGE WONG is currently at the Singapore Management University. He obtained his Ph.D. in sociology from the Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. His research sits at the intersections of urban politics and governance, and community development in Asian cities. Beyond academia, he is a community organizer and town councilor.

JIANGNAN ZHU is Associate Professor at the University of Hong Kong. She studies Chinese politics, especially corruption and anticorruption, information politics, and elite politics. Her work has appeared in *Comparative Political Studies*, *Governance*, *Public Administration Review*, *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, *China Journal*, and *Journal of Contemporary China*.

Abbreviations

AL	Awami League
BERC	Bangladesh Energy Regulatory Commission
BJP	Bharatiya Janata Party
BNP	Bangladesh Nationalist Party
BPSC	Bangladesh Public Service Commission
BSC	Bureau of Civil Service
BSEC	Bangladesh Securities and Exchange Commission
CA	Commission on Appointments
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CD	Constituency director
CDSA	Corruption, Drug Trafficking and Other Serious Crimes (Confiscation of Benefits) Act
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CEP	currently estimated potential
CEPA	Committee of Experts on Public Administration
CESB	Career Executive Service Board
CESO	Career Executive Service Officer
COS	contract of service
COVID-19	Coronavirus-19
CPIB	Corrupt Practices Investigation Bureau (Singapore)
CPV	Communist Party of Vietnam
CS	Civil Service
CSC	Civil Service Commission
CSE	Career Executive Service
DCD	deputy constituency director
DM	District Magistrate
DP	Democratic Party (Mongolia)
DPJ	Democratic Party of Japan
DPP	Democratic Progressive Party
EM	executive meeting

GA	Grassroots Adviser
GDP	gross domestic product
GOI	Government of India
GOOC	Government-owned and controlled corporation
HCSE	higher civil servant examination
IAS	Indian Administrative Service
ICS	Indian Civil Service
IPP	Index of Party Patronage
IPS	Indian Police Service
JBC	Judicial and Bar Council
JO	Job order
JSP	Japan Socialist Party
KHUN	National Labor Party (Mongolia)
KIIS	Key information interviews?
KMT	Kuomintang
LDP	Liberal Democratic Party
LGU	local government unit
LWD	local water district
MARA	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs
MC	Ministry of Commerce
MCA	Ministry of Civil Affairs
MCCY	Ministry of Community, Culture, and Youth
MCT	Ministry of Culture and Tourism
MDGS	Millennium Development Goals
ME	Ministry of Education (China)
MEE	Ministry of Ecology and Environment
MEM	Ministry of Emergency Management
MF	Ministry of Finance
MFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MHRSS	Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security
MHURD	Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development
MIIT	Ministry of Industry and Information Technology
MJ	Ministry of Justice
MLAS	Members of the State-Level Legislative Assemblies
MND	Ministry of National Defense (China)
MNR	Ministry of Natural Resources
MNT	Mongolian Tughrik
MOHA	Ministry of Internal/Home Affairs
MP	Member of Parliament

List of Abbreviations

xvii

MPP	Mongolian Peoples' Party
MPRP	Mongolian People's Revolutionary Party
MPS	Ministry of Public Security
MSS	Ministry of State Security
MST	Ministry of Science and Technology
MT	Ministry of Transport
MVA	Ministry of Veterans Affairs
MWR	Ministry of Water Resources
NAO	National Audit Office
NDRC	National Development and Reform Commission
NEAC	National Ethnic Affairs Commission
NGA	National government agency
NGO	non-governmental organization
NHC	National Health Commission
NPC	National People's Congress
NPM	New Public Management
NPPCC	National People's Political Consultative Conference
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PA	People's Association
PA-CSM	People's Association constituency staff member
PAP	People's Action Party
PARC	Policy Affairs Research Commission
PASC	patronage as corruption
PASG	patronage as governance
PBOC	People's Bank of China
PCA	Prevention of Corruption Act
PM	Prime Minister
PRC	People's Republic of China
PSC	Politburo Standing Committee <i>or</i> Public Service Commission (Singapore)
PSU	Public sector undertaking
QUANGO	quasi-nongovernmental organization
ROC	Republic of China
SDGS	Sustainable Development Goals
SG	salary grade
SIRPA	School of International Relations and Public Administration (National University of Mongolia)
SNTV/MMD	single non-transferable vote in multimember district

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-20806-2 — Political Patronage in Asian Bureaucracies
Edited by B. Guy Peters , Colin Knox , Byeong Seob Kim
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

SUC	State universities and college
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UP	Uttar Pradesh
UPSC	Union Public Service Commission
WDR	World Development Report