

Land and Liberalism

Irish land in the 1880s was a site of ideological conflict, with resonances for liberal politics far beyond Ireland itself. The Irish Land War – internationalised partly through the influence of Henry George, the American social reformer and political economist – came at a decisive juncture in Anglo-American political thought and provided many radicals across the North Atlantic with a vision of a more just and morally coherent political economy. Looking at the discourses and practices of these agrarian radicals, alongside developments in liberal political thought, Andrew Phemister shows how they utilised the land question to articulate a natural and universal right to life that highlighted the contradictions between liberty and property. In response to this popular agrarian movement, liberal thinkers discarded many older individualistic assumptions, and their radical democratic implications, in the name of protecting social order, property, and economic progress. *Land and Liberalism* thus vividly demonstrates the centrality of Henry George and the Irish Land War to the transformation of liberal thought.

ANDREW PHEMISTER is a Research Associate at Newcastle University. He has previously held postdoctoral positions in History at NUI Galway, the University of Oxford, and Edinburgh's Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities.



Land and Liberalism

Henry George and the Irish Land War

Andrew Phemister

Newcastle University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009202893

DOI: 10.1017/9781009202909

© Andrew Phemister 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Phemister, Andrew, author.

Title: Land and liberalism: Henry George and the Irish land war / Andrew Phemister.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press,

2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022033776 | ISBN 9781009202893 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781009202909 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: George, Henry, 1839–1897. | Land tenure – Ireland – History – 19th century. | Land use – Ireland – History – 19th century. | Land reform – Ireland – History – 19th century.

Classification: LCC HD625 .P46 2023 | DDC 333.3/1415-dc23/eng/20220825

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2022033776

ISBN 978-1-009-20289-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> For Sarah, and Norah, and Brodie, and Jamie.



Contents

Acknowledgements		page VIII
	Introduction	1
1	'Our American Aristotle': Henry George's Gilded Age	13
2	Agrarianism and Political Thought	44
3	The Land War and the Land League	79
4	The Catholic Church and the Land Question	118
5	Transatlantic Radicalism and the Land Question	153
6	Class, Culture, and Place	188
	Conclusion	222
Bibliography		233
Index		275

vii



Acknowledgements

I have been extremely fortunate to have benefited from the support and encouragement of a great many kind, thoughtful, and generous people during the long gestation of this work. Foremost among them is Enda Delaney, who supervised both my undergraduate and doctoral dissertations at Edinburgh. I am deeply grateful for his unstinting assistance and the consistent belief he has shown in my research. Without his scholarly guidance, expertise, and support, this book would not exist. This work is also indebted to the advice and judicious criticism of Ewen Cameron, whose extensive knowledge of the land question shaped its direction. At Cambridge, where I first started working on Henry George and Ireland, I was extremely lucky to learn a great deal from Eugenio Biagini. His scholarship on Victorian liberalism and his generous, collegial intellect were formative influences. Earlier iterations of this research were meticulously and valuably deconstructed by Niall Whelehan, David Silkenat, and David Sim, all of whom provided helpful criticism. Alvin Jackson, Owen Dudley Edwards, and Andrew Newby have also offered sage advice at important junctures. At Edinburgh, I was privileged to have been part of a supportive community of talented young historians of Ireland (and beyond), including Sophie Cooper, Tommy Dolan, Roseanna Doughty, Catherine Bateson, Joe Curran, and Bobbie Nolan. Further afield, friendships and fascinating conversations shared with colleagues have been, as they are for many, among the most enriching aspects of academic life. Time spent with Pete Hession, Cathal Smith, Patrick Doyle, Rose Luminiello, Sean Donnelly, Alison Garden, Maurice Casey, and many others unnamed reliably reenergised an often tired and confused mind. A special thanks must also go to my school history teachers, Stephen Brady and Graeme Wright, for kindling an interest that I've yet to shake off.

This book is the product of several years of research and therefore also of a number of different institutions. The staff and fellows at the University of Edinburgh's Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities provided a friendly and stimulating environment for developing some aspects of this work. At Oxford, I found a similarly engaging atmosphere at Hertford College, and I am indebted to both Ian McBride and Marc Mulholland for their help and

viii



Acknowledgements

ix

support. In Galway, although my time was constrained by the exigencies of the pandemic, I was very fortunate to encounter Dan Carey and John Cunningham, both of whom were extremely hospitable and charitable with their time, energy, and expertise. The research was made possible by various funders, including the School of History, Classics and Archaeology at the University of Edinburgh; the British Association for Irish Studies; the Royal Historical Society; Edinburgh's Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities; the Irish government; and the Irish Research Council. I am grateful to my editor, Liz Friend-Smith, for her guidance and patience and also to the librarians and archivists at all the institutions and repositories I visited, especially at the Archives of the Catholic University of America and the Archives of the Archdiocese of New York, for their invaluable assistance.

Academia can be a precarious pursuit, and in that regard, none of this would have been possible without the love, support, and reassurance of my family. My mum, a dedicated and brilliant professor of philosophy, raised me on her own and has been a constant source of encouragement. Whatever talent and insight I can bring to the study of history, I owe to her Socratic parenting. With resolute support, my dad has provided perspective and the wisdom to recognise the importance of other things in life. Finally, and most importantly, I am grateful to my wife Sarah, whose sharp intellect, kindness, and humour have inspired and sustained me throughout, and our children, Norah, Brodie, and Jamie. Their infectious enthusiasm and endless curiosity have taught me far more than I could ever hope to learn by reading books.