

"How do we know a rising power when we see one, what do rising powers want and under what conditions might they be satisfied? Rohan Mukherjee's Ascending Order tackles these questions and provides compelling answers that are backed up by solid historical scholarship. The book's distinctive contribution lies in its argument that rising powers seek symbolic equality with the established great powers, and that they look to the institutional openness and procedural fairness of the core institutions of the international system to determine if that equality is achievable. The emphasis on equality, openness, and fairness is truly original and it adds a fascinating normative dimension to the analysis of power transition politics. Mukherjee's arguments warrant the attention of scholars and policymakers grappling with the rise of China and India, and the implications for the established powers such as the United States."

Yuen Foong Khong, Li Ka Shing Professor of Political Science, Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy, National University of Singapore

"Despite two decades of intensifying struggle – particularly between the United States, Russia, and China – over international order, scholars still know very little about what drives states to contest, reform, or accept the 'rules, norms, and arrangements' of international politics. Based on careful historical research, Rohan Mukherjee argues that key institutions of International order are essentially clubs for great powers. Rising states care about the rules and regulations of those clubs: Can they join? Will they get the same rights as the existing members, or be treated like second-class citizens? The answers to these two questions, Mukherjee shows, have major consequences for the fate of international orders – including the current one. Ascending Order is an important and insightful contribution to the academic clubs studying status, power transitions, and international order."

Dan Nexon, Professor of Government and Foreign Service, Georgetown University, and co-author of Exit from Hegemony: The Unraveling of the American Global Order

"International institutions have been key arenas of contestation and accommodation of the status aspirations of rising powers since the nineteenth century. Here is one of the rare historical treatments of how and when institutions matter for states seeking great power status and the socio-psychological calculations that go behind it. This book is a great addition to the growing literature on international status and power transitions."

T.V. Paul, James McGill Professor of International Relations, McGill University, Canada, and co-editor of *Status in World Politics*



Ascending Order

Why do rising powers sometimes challenge an international order that enables their growth, and at other times support an order that constrains them? Ascending Order offers the first comprehensive study of conflict and cooperation as new powers join the global arena. International institutions shape the choices of rising states as they pursue equal status with established powers. Open membership rules and fair decision-making procedures facilitate equality and cooperation, while exclusion and unfairness frequently produce conflict. Using original and robust archival evidence, the book examines these dynamics in three cases: the United States and the maritime laws of war in the mid-nineteenth century; Japan and naval arms control in the interwar period; and India and nuclear nonproliferation in the Cold War. This study shows that the future of contemporary international order depends on the ability of international institutions to address the status ambitions of rising powers such as China and India.

ROHAN MUKHERJEE is Assistant Professor of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He was previously Assistant Professor at Yale-NUS College, Singapore. He holds a PhD in Politics from Princeton University and a BA in Philosophy, Politics, and Economics from the University of Oxford.



Cambridge Studies in International Relations: 160

Ascending Order

EDITORS

Evelyn Goh Christian Reus-Smit Nicholas J. Wheeler

EDITORIAL BOARD

Jacqueline Best, Karin Fierke, William Grimes, Yuen Foong Khong, Andrew Kydd, Lily Ling, Andrew Linklater, Nicola Phillips, Elizabeth Shakman Hurd, Jacquie True, Leslie Vinjamuri, Alexander Wendt

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series aims to publish the best new scholarship in international studies, irrespective of subject matter, methodological approach or theoretical perspective. The series seeks to bring the latest theoretical work in International Relations to bear on the most important problems and issues in global politics.

159 Claire Vergerio
War, States, and International Order
Alberico Gentili and the Foundational Myth of the Laws of War

158 Peter Joachim Katzenstein
Uncertainty and Its Discontents
Worldviews in World Politics

157 Jessica Auchter Global Corpse Politics The Obscenity Taboo

156 Robert Falkner
Environmentalism and Global International Society

155 David Traven
Law and Sentiment in International Politics
Ethics, Emotions, and the Evolution of the Laws of War

154 Allison Carnegie and Austin Carson
Secrets in Global Governance
Disclosure Dilemmas and the Challenge of International Cooperation



Ascending Order

Rising Powers and the Politics of Status in International Institutions

ROHAN MUKHERJEE

London School of Economics and Political Science







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009186797

DOI: 10.1017/9781009186803

© Rohan Mukherjee 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-009-18681-0 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-18679-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Shailey



Any claim enforced by equals on equals without recourse to arbitration, no matter whether the issue is of the greatest or the least significance, amounts still to enslavement.

Pericles, in Thucydides, *The Peloponnesian War*, 1.141 (Martin Hammond, trans.)



Contents

$L\iota$	st of Figures	page x
Lis	st of Tables	X
Ac	knowledgments	xii
List of Abbreviations		XV
1	Introduction	1
2	Conceptual Foundations	28
3	Institutional Status Theory	55
4	The United States and the Atlantic System in the Nineteenth Century	83
5	Japan and the Washington System of the Interwar Period	136
6	India and the International Order of the Cold War	191
7	China and the Liberal International Order	246
8	Conclusion	281
Appendix: Case Selection		300
Index		309



Figures

4.1	Institutional status theory and the United States in the	
	Atlantic system	page 98
5.1	Institutional status theory and Japan in the	
	Washington system	146
6.1	Institutional status theory and India in the	
	Cold War	201
A.1	Comparing the rises of the United States, Japan, and	
	India, 1820–1990	307

 \mathbf{X}



Tables

1.1	Typology of theories of revisionism among	
	rising powers	page 10
1.2	Strategies of rising powers toward the	
	international order	19
3.1	Status-seeking strategies	58
3.2	Institutional openness and procedural fairness	68
3.3	Strategies of rising powers toward the	
	international order	69
3.4	Case studies	77
3.5	Observable implications of status strategies	81
7.1	Institutional Status Theory and China in the liberal	
	international order	264
A.1	Core regulatory security institutions	301
A.2	Identifying rising powers: a first cut	305
A.3	Case studies	308



Acknowledgments

In my journey from doctoral dissertation to first book, I have experienced the tremendous decency, kindness, and generosity of individuals and institutions, many of whom owed me nothing and simply took a chance on a set of ideas shared at a conference or some written words that landed on their desk. The following is my wholly inadequate attempt to acknowledge their contributions.

Aaron Friedberg, John Ikenberry, and Keren Yarhi-Milo helped me light a tiny intellectual flame and keep it alive in the Department of Politics at Princeton University. First drafts took shape during a predoctoral fellowship at MIT, where Owen Cote, Brendan Green, Galen Jackson, Vipin Narang, Barry Posen, and Dick Samuels shared their deep knowledge of everything from military technology to archival sources.

The book gained substance during my time as an assistant professor at Yale-NUS College. My colleagues in Global Affairs in particular – Chin-Hao Huang, Steven Oliver, Anju Paul, Navin Rajagobal, Kate Sanger, and Risa Toha – left their imprint on it through innumerable personal and professional kindnesses. Meenakshi Annamalai, Grace Kwan, Vicky Poon, Sarah Ruslan, Jolene Tan, and Kden Tan helped keep the project ticking through grant management, administration, and library resources.

At a workshop on the first draft of the manuscript, Aaron Friedberg, Stacie Goddard, John Ikenberry, Jennifer Lind, Vipin Narang, Jack Snyder, and Keren Yarhi-Milo helped revise and reassemble my arguments and evidence into something worth sharing with the world. I am grateful to Cynthia Ernst for her help in organizing this meeting. Rajesh Basrur, Stephen P. Cohen, Deborah Larson, George Lawson, Manjari Miller, and Jayant Prasad offered vital feedback at other academic gatherings. If there is anything meritorious in this book, it is due to the care and acuity with which all the above scholars treated its evolving contents.

xii



Acknowledgments

xiii

My research benefited immensely from the institutional assistance of librarians and archivists in Princeton, New Jersey; Cambridge, Massachusetts; Singapore; Washington, DC; and New Delhi. Several institutions supported my work, including the Lynde and Harry Bradley Foundation, the Princeton Institute for International and Regional Studies, the Center for International Security Studies, the Mamdouha S. Bobst Center for Peace and Justice, the Niehaus Center for Globalization and Governance, the Stanton Foundation, and Yale-NUS College.

The gargantuan task of research for a book would have been impossible without the help of friends and colleagues who lent a hand at key moments. Nate Hodson and Michelle Mangan put me up in their beautiful home in Washington, DC. Miklos Bankuti made sure I had wheels to get to College Park and back efficiently. As a summer research assistant at Yale-NUS, Ruchika Goel returned to Washington and New Delhi for a second pass at the archives. When the pandemic precluded travel to New Delhi to address a reviewer's queries, Yogesh Joshi most generously shared his own haul of primary documents on India and the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) negotiations.

When it came to the publishing process, Courtney Fung, Evelyn Goh, Devesh Kapur, Raymond Kuo, Darren Lim, Manjari Miller, Nuno Monteiro, Vipin Narang, Dick Samuels, Ben Schupmann, Patrick Thoendel, Srdjan Vucetic, and Keren Yarhi-Milo all took the time to read and critique my book proposal. Alexandre Debs and Rahul Sagar have the dubious distinction of doing the same for the entire manuscript, with Rahul reading multiple drafts of each chapter. Kudrat Virk masterfully copyedited the final version of the manuscript. John Haslam at Cambridge University Press was the perfect editor, not least for picking three anonymous reviewers who read my work sympathetically and offered valuable suggestions that resulted in a much stronger final product than I could have imagined. I am grateful to the editors of Cambridge Studies in International Relations for subsequently adding the book to their series.

I fully expected friends to get tired of hearing about the same project for years on end. On the contrary, they rallied around me, making every little bit of progress worth celebrating. For this, I appreciate Lester Ang, Kokila Annamalai, Kanti Bajpai, Graeme Blair, Nienke Boer, Varanya Chaubey, Courtney Fung, Nirmala George, Kevin



xiv

Acknowledgments

Goldstein, Sinja Graf, Zach Howlett, Caitlin Hutchinson, Ulas Ince, Shalini Jain, Alexander Lanoszka, Nick Lotito, Neena Mahadev, Anit Mukherjee, Karthik Nachiappan, Swapna Kona Nayudu, Elizabeth Nugent, Mridhula Pillay, C. Raja Mohan, Rahul Sagar, Ben Schupmann, Nick Smith, Christina Tarnopolsky, Kriti Vikram, Abhijit Visaria, Christine Walker, and Sara Watson.

Two friends and mentors, Devesh Kapur and David Malone, have profoundly impacted my intellectual and personal development. I continue to learn from and be humbled by the extent to which they have given of themselves to build communities of scholarship that span disciplines, institutions, and continents.

My family is a consistent source of support and encouragement. Utpala Mukherjee, Siddhartha Mukherjee, Navneet and Tekchand Hingorani, and Richa Hingorani are among my greatest cheerleaders. Simita and Tanmoy Brahma were down the road for many years in New Jersey, and have remained so metaphorically, always present when I have needed them.

This book is dedicated to my wife, Shailey Hingorani, who after eleven years still laughs the loudest at my jokes and whom I still find the most interesting person in any room. Her fierce intellect and dedication to leading a life of consequence are the necessary antidote to the moments of self-doubt that accompany academic life. I am excited for the rest of this journey, in our leaky cardboard gondola, toward the salty open sea (with due apologies to Margaret Atwood).

In my better moments, I am also thankful for our cats, Charles and Frida, who engage in constant positional conflict despite living in a world of abundant resources.



Abbreviations

ADB Asian Development Bank

AEC Atomic Energy Commission (US)
AIIB Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank
ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

BJP Bharatiya Janata Party (India) CCP Chinese Communist Party

CINC Composite Index of National Capability
CTBT Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty
DAC Development Assistance Committee (OECD)

DAE Department of Atomic Energy (India)
DSS dispute settlement system (WTO)

ENCD Eighteen-Nation Committee on Disarmament

EU European Union
G8 Group of Eight
G20 Group of Twenty
GDP gross domestic product

IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
IBSA India, Brazil, South Africa group
ICBM intercontinental ballistic missile
IFI international financial institution
IMF International Monetary Fund
IST Institutional Status Theory

LGBTQ+ lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer/

questioning, and others
LIO liberal international order
MP Member of Parliament
NAM Non-Aligned Movement
NDB New Development Bank

NPT Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear

Weapons (Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty)

xv



xvi List of Abbreviations

NSG Nuclear Suppliers Group

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and

Development

P-5 five permanent members (UNSC)

PTBT Partial Test Ban Treaty

SALT Strategic Arms Limitation Talks SCO Shanghai Cooperation Organization SDR Special Drawing Rights (IMF)

UK United Kingdom UN United Nations

UNCHR United Nations Commission on Human Rights UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of

the Sea

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention on

Climate Change

UNGA United Nations General Assembly
UNHRC United Nations Human Rights Council
UNSC United Nations Security Council

US United States

WHO World Health Organization WTO World Trade Organization