

## FREUD, JUNG, AND JONAH

Religion, more than sexuality, cast psychoanalysis in controversy and onto the world stage even as it threatened to dismantle the first psychoanalytic collective. In the founding years of the psychoanalytic periodicals, religion sold sex research to a new and growing readership. The psychoanalytic pioneers mapped the unknown frontiers of the human mind onto known territory, developing and publishing their ideas in tandem and in protest to one another. As such, the relational dynamics of this wildly successful publishing campaign is most apparent in the subject of religion, not least because its symbolized terrain was so often deployed as a vehicle for motivating, disciplining, and editing out members of the psychoanalytic community. This book offers an interdisciplinary approach to religion and psychology, including a compelling denouement that reveals new narratives about long-standing rumors in the early history of the psychoanalytic movement. Above all, this volume demonstrates that the first generation of psychoanalysts succeeded in writing themselves into the history of religious thought.

MAYA BALAKIRSKY KATZ is a clinical psychoanalyst and an associate professor of Jewish art at Bar-Ilan University, Israel. She is the author of *The Visual Culture of Chabad* (2010) and *Drawing the Iron Curtain: Jews and the Golden Age of Soviet Animation* (2016). She is a coeditor of the journal *Images: A Journal of Jewish Art and Visual Culture*.

# FREUD, JUNG, AND JONAH

*Religion and the Birth of the Psychoanalytic Periodical*

MAYA BALAKIRSKY KATZ

*Bar-Ilan University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-10826-3 — Freud, Jung, and Jonah  
Maya Balakirsky Katz  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University’s mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009108263](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009108263)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009103787

© Maya Balakirsky Katz 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023  
First paperback edition 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

NAMES: Katz, Maya Balakirsky, 1973– author.

TITLE: Freud, Jung, and Jonah : religion and the birth of the psychoanalytic periodical /  
Maya Balakirsky Katz.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2023. |  
Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022013585 (print) | LCCN 2022013586 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009100007  
(hardback) | ISBN 9781009108263 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009103787 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Psychoanalysis and religion. | Freud, Sigmund, 1856-1939. |  
Jung, C. G. (Carl Gustav), 1875-1961.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BF175.4.R44 K38 2023 (print) | LCC BF175.4.R44 (ebook) |  
DDC 150.19/5–DC23/eng/20220617

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022013585>  
LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022013586>

ISBN 978-1-009-10000-7 Hardback  
ISBN 978-1-009-10826-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-10826-3 — Freud, Jung, and Jonah  
Maya Balakirsky Katz  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*To Menachem, fellow traveler*

It is a most remarkable experience to see morality, which is supposed to have been given us by God and thus deeply implanted in us, functioning as a *periodic phenomenon* (*periodisches Phänomen*). For after a certain number of months the whole moral fuss is over, the criticism of the super-ego is silent, the ego is rehabilitated and again enjoys all the rights of man till the next attack.

Freud, *New Introductory Lectures on Psycho-analysis*, 1933

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>Note on Sources and Translation</i>	xii
No. 1 Introduction: Periodic Religion and the Psychoanalytic Movement	i
No. 2 The First Numbers and the Five Stages of Periodical Publication	32
No. 3 The Religious Rise and Fall of the <i>Zentralblatt</i>	98
No. 4 Jonah’s Journey across the Nations: Zurich, Vienna, America, and Munich	135
No. 5 The Holy Romanish Moses: Art and Psychoanalytic Interpretation	193
No. 6 Triangles: Thoroughbreds, Dray Horses, and the “Dream Problem”	266
No. 7 A Reflection on “the Christian Aeon” and “Us Jews”	318
<i>References</i>	347
<i>Index</i>	371

# Figures

3.1	Sigmund Freud, “Gross ist die Diana der Epheser,” <i>Zentralblatt</i> 2, no. 3 (1911): 158–159	page 100
3.2	Hermann Knackfuss, illustration for Goethe’s poem “Great is Diana of the Ephesians,” in Heinrich Düntzer, ed. <i>Goethe’s Werke: Illustriert von ersten deutschen Künstlern</i> , 5 vols. (Stuttgart; Leipzig: Deutsche Verlagsanstalt, 1882–1885), vol. 1, 242	113
4.1	Group photograph at the Third Psychoanalytic Congress in Weimar, Germany. September 22, 1911 (Library of Congress, Prints & Photographs Division, Sigmund Freud Collection, LC-DIG-ppmsca-10504)	141
4.2	Photograph of Freud by Max Halberstadt, in Hamburg (1909). Reprinted in <i>Zentralblatt</i> 1, no. 12 (1911), inside page	144
5.1	Table of contents and advertisement for <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914), inside page	202
5.2	Max Pollak, portrait-etching of Sigmund Freud, 1914 (© Freud Museum, London)	203
5.3	<i>Der Fisch im Leib der Muttergöttin</i> . <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 2 (1914)	206
5.4	<i>Eros, die Mandragorawurzel in der Hand</i> . <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 2 (1914)	207
5.5	Illustration of Rape of Ganymede in <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 6 (1914)	208
5.6	Michelangelo’s Moses, <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914)	215
5.7	Illustrations for Freud’s “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914)	221
5.8	Reconstruction of Sigmund Freud, illustration D for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)	224
5.9	Max Klinger, <i>Der Philosoph</i> , <i>Imago</i> 2, no. 2, frontispiece	232
5.10	“The Prophet.” Reconstruction of Sigmund Freud, Illustration 1. for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)	234

## List of Figures

ix

- |      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 5.11 | “The Satyr.” Reconstruction of Sigmund Freud, Illustration 2. for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)                               | 235 |
| 5.12 | “Man.” Reconstruction of Sigmund Freud, Illustration 3. for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)                                     | 236 |
| 5.13 | “Fig. D[eus].” Reconstruction of Sigmund Freud, Illustration D. for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed and outlined by Maya Balakirsky Katz)                | 240 |
| 5.14 | Outlined rendering of Inertia-Man (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)   | 242 |
| 5.15 | The Frontispiece laid atop itself in reverse with fingers touching. “Supplement” for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)            | 243 |
| 5.16 | The Frontispiece laid atop itself in reverse in frontal pose. “Supplement” for “Der Moses,” <i>Imago</i> 3, no. 1 (1914) (Reconstructed by Maya Balakirsky Katz)                  | 244 |
| 5.17 | Byline, “Über die Wirkungen unbewußter Todeswünsche,” <i>Zeitschrift</i> 2, no. 4 (1914)  | 246 |
| 5.18 | “Dr. ***.” In “Über die Wirkungen unbewußter Todeswünsche,” <i>Zeitschrift</i> 2, no. 4 (1914)  | 247 |
| 6.1  | C. G. Jung, Philemon. <i>The Red Book</i> (© 2009 Foundation of the Works of C. G. Jung, Zürich. First published by W.W. Norton & Co.)  | 276 |
| 6.2  | Franz Marc, <i>Die grossen blauen Pferde</i> (The Large Blue Horses), 1911 (Oil on canvas. Walkers Art Center. Gift of the T. B. Walker Foundation, Gilbert M. Walker Fund, 1942) | 280 |
| 7.1  | C. G. Jung, Ship, Sun, and Whale-Dragon. <i>The Red Book</i> (© 2009 Foundation of the Works of C. G. Jung, Zürich. First published by W.W. Norton & Co.)                         | 326 |
| 7.2  | R. Eisler, “Orpheus – The Fisher” (London, 1921. Plate XLVII)   | 329 |
| 7.3  | The Wolf as <i>prima materia</i> devouring the dead king (Maier, <i>Scrutinium chymicum</i> (1687), Emblema XXIV)   | 330 |
| 7.4  | Jonah in the Belly of the Whale (Khludov Psalter, Codex 129, fol. 157 [Monastery of St. Nicholas, Preobrazhensk, Russia], Byzantine, ninth century)                               | 330 |
| 7.5  | <i>Biblia pauperum</i> (1471), edition of 1906  | 331 |



## *Acknowledgments*

I am acutely aware that much of what personally drove me to write this book was my interest in the writer's process, especially the notion of an intersubjective voice but also those less seemly stages we do not often speak of, such as the line of attribution we owe our predecessors and the post-publication creative revision of our own thinking in response to critics. The enormity of what I owe to my predecessors makes it impossible to repay my debts, so I limit myself here to acknowledging the interests most recently accrued. Without the faith of David Repetto at Cambridge University Press, I would not have been able to call these words a book and without the editorial hand of Menachem Katz and Trent Hancock my reader would not have been able to read it. The meticulous work of typesetter Udayasankar Paramasivam arranged my thoughts into pages. The patient timekeeper Hemalatha Subramanian made sure we all got it done in this life.

I would like to express my gratitude to Arlene Shaner, the Historical Collections Librarian at the New York Academy of Medicine, who granted me access to the Academy's collection of psychoanalytic journals at a time when the library was officially closed to researchers and the risk of pandemic contagion was still very real. Her act of faith in public research inspired me during the pandemic. Bryony Davies at the Freud Museum in London graciously made archival materials available to me. I thank Thomas C. Fischer at the C. G. Jung Foundation for the generous permission to reprint two images from *The Red Book: Liber Novus*. I am also grateful to Murray M. Schwartz, the editor of *American Imago*, for granting me permission to use my article as the basis for Chapter 3.

I thank Susanna Heschel, Shaul Magid, and Glenn Dynner for inviting me to participate in the Working Group on Hasidism at Dartmouth College in 2020 to discuss the ways that an identity category – in that case, gender – can raise and address the real issues of attribution, plagiarism, authority, historical narrative, and disciplinary formation. The group

*Acknowledgments*

xi

also demonstrated how fragile those very links that connect people can be in the context of a publication network.

I am most grateful to Mary Bergstein, whose work has inspired me from the day I discovered it, and who helped me think through the early stages of the proposal.

The sea of scholarship, like the ship sailing for Tarshish, appears more out of control than ever and even the most scrupulous scholar will have no choice but to hurl some of her precious cargo overboard. For this task, I want to thank my fellow writer and friend Candace Orcutt.

My colleagues at Bar-Ilan University have generously and selflessly given me the gift of time, particularly Sharon Goldman who helped me mark the passage of that time with wine. I began this book when I was still in training at the New Jersey Institute of Psychoanalysis, whose faculty and candidates shared with me their gift of words. I could not have done any of it had I not been blessed with the gift of love from Menachem Katz and the gift of magic from our children Ilan, Yair, Talia, Shai, and Dina.

Raanana, Israel  
10th of Tishrei, 5783

## *Note on Sources and Translation*

This book springs from the psychoanalytic periodicals published before the First World War, when German was still the lingua franca of Europe's scientific community. Yet, my book is written in the lingua franca of contemporary psychoanalytic literature, which took shape during the historical twists of the Second World War and the conversion of the literary corpus of psychoanalysis into English. It would be a heavy burden to retranslate entire passages into English when multiple translations of the early psychoanalytic corpus exist. I have, therefore, drawn on existing translations wherever possible. Since I engaged with these texts in their original publication contexts – a decision that colors the entirety of my argument in this volume – I first provide the original German citation and page references, followed by its republished English translation. It is my hope that this provides a convenience for the reader. When German texts did not originally appear in the psychoanalytic periodicals and are available in English, I quote directly from English translations without cumbersome citation of the original German sources of publication.

Where the available English translations are revised versions of the original text, as is often the case with anthologies, or where English translations are simply not available, which is the case with many of Freud's early colleagues, who did not attract English translators, and with sections of the periodicals that generally did not warrant reprintings such as the reviews, observations, miscellanea, and correspondence sheets, I have had to rely on my own translation. Since my challenges are both the definitional adulteration of a text in the project of translation and my own personal limitations, I have also rendered key original German words in parentheses so that readers can weigh my usages and generate their own associations with the original.