Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index More Information

Index

Abrahams, Sir Sidney, 271 Abril Campoy, Juan Manuel, 210-211 Abu Dhabi Global Market Court (ADGMC), 9-10, 81, 378 accountability, of foreign judges, 1, 2, 18, 20-25 in Africa, 348, 367-368 community membership and, 24-25 through judicial appointment process, 21-22 judicial responsibility and, 24-25 in Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras, 148-149 tenure and, 22-24 Acquah, George Kingsley, 34 activism, judicial, 26-27 in Africa, 354 in colonial-era mixed courts, 261-265 in Mixed Courts of Egypt, 263–264 of Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 119 in Federated States of Micronesia, 448 ad hoc tribunals, foreign judges on, 237-238 Adeline, Brassel, 188 ADGMC. See Abu Dhabi Global Market Court Administrative Court, in Liechtenstein, 63-65, 70 administrative law in Liechtenstein, 57 in Macau, 89 Admiralty law, 77 Aerts, Joseph, 252 Africa, courts in. See also specific nations Commonwealth of Nations, 237-238 foreign judges in, 7-8 hybrid criminal courts in, 8 judicial activism in, 354 representativeness of judges in, 19 Aguda, Akinola, 356 Agyemang, Mabel, 12, 33-40, 398-399 Commercial Court in The Gambia, 39 in The Gambia, 35-38 motivations for being foreign judge, 33-35 professional growth for, 39 AIFCC. See Astana International Financial Centre Court Alexander, Gilchrist, 277 Alleear, Vivekanand, 186-187

Ally, Frank, 190–191, 197 Almagro, Luis, 146 Alvarez, José, 163 Ammisah, Austin, 356 Ancient Greece, foreign judges in, 90–91 Anderson, Benedict, 268, 268 Anderson, Sir John, 411 Andorra, 5, 10, 18. See also Constitutional Court of Andorra Constitution of Andorra (1993), 201, 204 canon of constitutionality, 206-207 recurs d'empara, 204–207 contemporary society in, 202-204 European Convention on Human Rights and, 203-204 European Court of Human Rights and, 201, 203–204, 214 historical background, 201-204 creation as principality, 201 international recognition of, 201-202, 213-214 rule of law in, 204 sovereignty of, 202-204 Universal Declaration of Human Rights and, 213-214 Anguilla, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Antigua and Barbuda, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Antunes, Jose Maria, 132 appointment process, for judges in Brunei Darussalam, 419–420 for Caribbean Court of Justice, 223-224 in Commonwealth of Nations domestic courts to ad hoc tribunals, 237–238 for foreign judges, 234–238 for Constitutional Court of Andorra, 207-211 for Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 21 for foreign judges, 107–108 for Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 21 for foreign judges, 107-108 for Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court, 223-224 by European Court of Human Rights, 21 in The Gambia, 396-399, 407 judicial accountability and independence influenced by, 21-22 in Kuwait, 375-376

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

464

Index

appointment process, for judges (cont.) in Lesotho, 360-361 in Macau, 93 in Papua New Guinea, 429 in Qatar, 379 in Seychelles, 189-194 in Southern African region, 345, 350-354 in United Arab Emirates, 378 Arabic language use, in MENA domestic courts, 389-390 arbitration, in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 53 Ardant, Philippe, 208, 208 Armitage, David, 242-243 Asia, foreign judges in, 9 Astana International Financial Centre Court (AIFCC), 9,82 Australia. See also Papua New Guinea foreign judges funded by, 305, 308, 310-312 foreign judges recruited from, 8-9, 26, 273-280, 300, 305-306, 310-311 Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands, 310-311 Austria civil law in, 57-58 Constitutional Court of, 66-68 Federal Constitutional Law, 68 tax laws in, 63 treaty with Liechtenstein, 63 Azerraf, Alberto, 252 Bahrain, domestic courts, 381-382 foreign judges in, 385-386 Baldrich, Meritxell Tomàs, 212 Barbados, 221. See also Caribbean Court of Justice; Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Barrow, Adama, 393–394 Barth, Sir Jacob, 278 Basdevant, Jules, 265 Basic Laws, People's Republic of China Hong Kong, 42, 44, 52, 78, 292 Macau, 88-89, 100-101 Basutoland Protectorate, 349 Bechuanaland Protectorate, 349 Beck, Emil, 62 Beck, Wilhelm, 58-60 Belize, 221. See also Caribbean Court of Justice; Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Constitution of, 339-340 Bendrihem, Elias, 251 Benjamin, Hayfron, 353 Berchtold, Klaus, 64 Berman, Bruce, 269 Bermuda, 221. See also Caribbean Court of Justice bias, 16, 20 in Brunei, 419–420, 422 in Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia, 174 in hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts, 173-175 in International Criminal Court, 174-175 in International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia, 174-175 in Southern African region, 362, 363

Blanchard, Sir Peter, 309 Blunk, Siegfried, 174 Bosnia-Herzegovina. See also Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina: International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia constitutional framework for, 104-107 under Dayton Agreement, 104 internationalised constitutions, 105 ethnic conflicts in, 105-106 European Convention on Human Rights, 13 parliamentary structure in, 106 Stabilisation and Association Agreement, 115 War Crimes Chamber in Bosnia and Herzegovina, 165-166 Botswana, domestic courts in, 7, 346, 346, 349-350, 368 Court of Appeal, 350-351 foreign judges in, 359 as hybrid system, 356-357 Law Society and, 357-358 localisation of judges, 355-356 political context, 355-359 historic development of, 355 Brand, David, 356 Brennan, Sir Gerard, 46 Brinton, Jasper Yeates, 370-371 British Virgin Islands, 8, 13, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Bruce-Lyle, Frederick, 230-231 Brunei Darussalam, domestic courts in analysis of, 425-426 bifurcation of, 410-411 colonialism and, 411-412 common law traditions in, 409-411 conceptual approach to, 409-411 Court of Appeal, 416 foreign judges in, 411-423 appointments of, 419-420 constitutional interpretation by, 417 historical development of, 411-412 Islamisation movement and, 413-423 judicial independence of, 418–419 judicial review by, 417 legal impact of, 415-416 re-appointments of, 419-420 removal of, 420-421 reputation of, 421-422 under Residency Agreement, 411 residency model for, 412-413 Resident's Court and, 412 retirement of, 419-420 Sultan's control of, 422-423 supervisory jurisdiction for, 417-418 Islamisation of, 413-425 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council and, 414, 422-423 Panel of International Judges, 409 separation of powers and, 412 Supreme Court, 409 Syariah courts, 410-411, 418-419, 423-425

judicial appointments in, 419–420

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

465

Constitutional Court of Andorra judicial appointment of, 207-211 Bussjäger, Peter, 64 Byron, Sir Dennis, 6, 325, 327, 341 CAA. See Constitutional Appointments Authority (Seychelles) Cambodia. See Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Cândido de Pinho, José, 100 Carcassonne, Guy, 200, 207, 208, 211 Caribbean, foreign judges in. See also Caribbean; Caribbean Court of Justice; Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court; specific nations Caribbean Community, 220-221 conceptual approach to, 219, 324-327 demographics for, 324-325 extraterritorial courts, 324-325 independence of, 333-336 institutionalisation of, 333-336 foreign courts as part of domestic judicial system in, 229 foreign judging as concept, 327-329, 343-344 definitions in, 327, 328 diversity in, 327-329 relational elements of, 327-328 foreignness and, 327-328 geography of, 324-325 history of, 8, 325 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council and, 326-328, 330-331 jurisdiction of, 333-336 judicial independence in, 337 for extraterritorial courts, 333-336 judicial tenure on, 336-340 social distance from society and, 340-343 Caribbean Community (CARICOM), 220-221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court diversity within, 220-221 Organisation of Eastern Caribbean States, 222 regionalism in, 220 Revised Treaty of Chaguaramas, 220-221 Treaty of Chaguaramas, 220 Caribbean Council of Legal Education, 230 Caribbean Court of Justice (CCJ), 5-8, 220-223, 330-337 Caribbean Council of Legal Education and, 230 establishment of, 221 as extraterritorial court, 324-325 independence of, 333-336 institutionalisation of, 333-336 foreign judges in, 223-232 appointment process for, 223-224 colonialism and, 225-227 composition and size of, 224 definition of, 224-225 disadvantages of, 228 impartiality of, 224-225 judicial benefits of, 227-228 judicial expectations of, 228-229 methodological approach to, 223-224

Burgorgue-Larsen, Laurence, 5, 19. See also

permanent judicial tenure for, 336-340 public perception of, 228-229 treatment of, 227-228 Guyana in, 331-332 integration movement and, 221 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council, 6-8, 282 replaced by CCJ, 221, 227 judicial tenure on, 336–340 legitimacy of, 225-227 nationalism and, 222-223 regionalism of, 222-223 Revised Treaty of Chaguaramas and, 221 CARICOM. See Caribbean Community Carpi, Cesare, 261–262 Casey, Sir Maurice, 309 Cassese, Antonio, 242 Cassin, René, 266-267 Castro, Xiomara, 157 Catalano, Nicola, 266 Caullet, Jean-Yves, 210, 211 Cayman Islands, 221 CCJ. See Caribbean Court of Justice Central African Republic, Special Criminal Court in, 8,165-166 Central American states. See also Comisión Internacional Contra la Impunidad en Guatemala; Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras; specific nations Esquipulas agreements, 151-153 framework treaties for, 151-152 international human rights instruments in, 153 Washington Treaties (1907/1923), 152 Chad, Extraordinary African Chambers, 8 Chamberlain, Joseph, 269-270 Cheung, Andrew, 297 Chikopa, Lovemore, 238 China. See also People's Republic of China colonial-era mixed courts in, 255-257 Mixed Court of the International Settlement of Shanghai, 264 Chinese International Commercial Court (CICC), 84, 85 Chinese language use, in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 290-291 Chong, Steven, 415 CICC. See Chinese International Commercial Court CICIG. See Comisión Internacional Contra la Impunidad en Guatemala citizenship, of foreign judges foreignness and, 4-5 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal and, 42 non-citizens and, 4 in Federated States of Micronesia, 447 state borders and, 4-5 transnational, 312-313 citizenship laws foreign judges and, 4 foreignness and, 4 Civil and Commercial Court (Qatar), 9-10 Civil Code in East Timor, 132-134

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

466

Index

civil law jurisdictions Austria, 57-58 foreign judges in, 5 appointment of, 16-17 international commercial courts in, 85 Macau as. o Seychelles, 190 Singapore International Commercial Court and, 71, 77-78 Collegio Garante della Costituzionalità delle Norme (San Marino), 10 Colombia, Special Jurisdiction for Peace, 10 Colonial Administrative Service (British), 276-277 Colonial Legal Service appointment process for, 278-280 branches of, 270 conceptual approach to, 268-269 emergence of, 271 historical development of, 269-271 Indian Civil Service and, 269-270 Inns of Court and, 275-276 legal rankings in, 272-273 promotions in, 280-283 recruitment of colonial legal officers, 273-280 Administrative Service experience and, 276-277 incentives for, 277-278 policies for, 273, 273 pupillage in, 275-276 selection criteria in, 273-274 structure of, 272 Sudan Political Service and, 269-270 territorial jurisdiction of, 281 transfers in, 280-283 colonial-era mixed courts in China, 255-257 Mixed Court of the International Settlement of Shanghai, 264 establishment of, 258 European Convention on Human Rights and, 265-266 European Court of Human Rights and, 265-266 European Court of Justice and, 265-266 foreign judges on, 254–255 Institut de droit international, 257-258 judicial activism in, 261-265 in Mixed Courts of Egypt, 263-264 jurisdiction of, 261 Mixed Benches of Ethiopia, 254 Mixed Commercial Court, 257, 264 Mixed Courts of Egypt, 253-254, 258-260 composition of, 259 judicial activism in, 263–264 legal provisions of, 259-260 Napoleonic system of administrative justice and, 260 Mixed Court of Lebanon, 254-255, 261, 264 Mixed Court of Syria, 254-255, 261, 264 Mixed Court of Tangier, 250-255, 260-261, 266, 267 constitutional approach in, 261-262 establishment of, 254-255 foreign judges on, 254-255 Montreux Convention and, 264-265 multilateral treaties and, 261

during Ottoman Empire, 255-257 in postwar era, 265-267 treaty-based rights in, 258-265 colonialism in Brunei Darussalam, 411–412 Caribbean Court of Justice and, 225-227 in East Timor Indonesian involvement in, 127 Portugal's role in, 126-127 Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court and, 225-227 foreign judges as effect of, 14-15 historical context for foreign judges and, 7 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal influenced by, 291 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council, 6-8, 282 in Brunei Darussalam, 414, 422–423 in Caribbean, 326-328, 330-331, 333-336 Caribbean Court of Justice as replacement for, 221, 227 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal and, 45, 47 in Pacific region, 300, 317 in Papua New Guinea, 432-436 Australian role in, 432–434 British judicial initiatives and, 433-434 characteristics of colonial courts, 434-436 kiap justice, 433-434 in lower courts, 434 in superior courts, 435-436 in Seychelles, 181 in Southern African region, 348-354 Comisión Internacional Contra la Impunidad en Guatemala (CICIG), 140-141, 152-158 establishment of, 143–145 foreign judges and, 156-157 as international human rights instrument, 155 legal scope of, 144 tolerated shame concept and, 155-156 Commercial Court in The Gambia, 39 Commercial Lists, 77 common law jurisdictions Brunei Darussalam as, 409-411 Court of Final Appeal as influence on, 27 foreign judges in, 5 implementation of, 16-17 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal and, 48 development of common law traditions, 27 in international commercial courts, 85 in Pacific region, 302, 305-306, 308-309, 311-313, 315 in Papua New Guinea, 430, 438–439, 441, 444–445 Seychelles, 181, 190 Singapore International Commercial Court and, 71, 77-78 Commonwealth Fund for Technical Cooperation, 33-34, 236-237, 240-241, 311 Commonwealth judges, 19-20, 35-40 in domestic courts in the Commonwealth, 233-241 motivations for, 33-35 in Pacific region, 300–305 Commonwealth of Nations, domestic courts in in Africa, 237-238

appointment of judges in, 234-238

to ad hoc tribunals, 237-238

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

in commonwealth states, 235 in dependent/overseas territories, 235-236 for politically-sensitive cases, 237-238 conceptual approach to, 233-234 foreign judges in advantages of, 238-241 appointment of, 234-238 challenges for, 238-241 independence of, 240 removal of domestic judges by, 238 tenure for, 239 in Pacific region, 311 Compact of Free Association (FSM), 449-450 competence, of foreign judges, 15, 28 on Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 100-110 on Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 109-110 Constitution of 1921 (Liechtenstein), 60-61 Constitution of Andorra (1993), 201, 204, 204 canon of constitutionality, 206-207 recurs d'empara, 204-207 Constitution of Belize, 339-340 Constitution of the Federated States of Micronesia, 451-454 Constitution of Fiji, 308 Constitution of Samoa, 308 Constitution of Seychelles (1993), 181-183 articles of, 185 judicial appointments under, 183-185 Supreme Court established under, 182-183 Constitution of the Democratic Republic of East Timor, 131 Constitution of the Principality of Liechtenstein, 28, 60 Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 234 Constitution of the Republic of The Gambia, 35-36, 393, 403 governmental structure under, 394–395 judicial independence under, 395-396 separation of powers in, 394-395 Constitution of Tunisia (2014), 387-388 Constitutional Appointments Authority (CAA) (Seychelles), 183-185, 191-194, 199 Constitutional Court, in Liechtenstein, 59-61, 64, 65 Austrian judges in, 69 Austrian model and, 65-66 'differentiated principle of legality', 66 electoral laws and, 66 European Court of Human Rights and, 67-68 European law in, 68-69 evolution of interpretation of fundamental rights, 67-68 foreign judges as influence on, 65-69 impeachment against head of government and, 65-66 judicial influences on, 67-68 rule of law principles and, 66-67 same-sex marriage cases in, 68 Constitutional Court of Andorra, 10, 200, 204-217 analysis of, 217-218 case law for, 214-215 composition and size of, 205 European Court of Human Rights and, 211-214, 217 foreign judges on, 209

academic training of, 213-215 culture as influence on, 212-213 diversity of, 212-213 gender of, 215-216 judicial appointment of, 207-211 judicial review of, 211-216 member profile of, 208-211 native language as influence on, 212-213 French influences on, 209, 210 jurisdiction of, 205 political influence of, 216-217 President of, 215-216 public perception of, 216-217 recurs d'empara and, 205-206 representativeness on, 215-216 Spanish influences on, 206, 209, 210 Constitutional Court of Austria, 66 Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 4, 5, 10 appointment of judges to, 21 foreign judges, 107–108 conceptual approach to, 103-104 democratisation promoted through, 118-119 establishment of, 103 ethnic conflict influenced by, 119 European case law in, 115-117 European Court of Human Rights and, 108, 112-113, 113-115 foreign judges on, 108, 107-123 appointment of, 107-108 competence of, 109-110 competition of, 107-109 judicial panels for, 110 limitations on ethnic makeup of, 120-122 mission of, 110, 120-122 normative legitimacy of, 120-122 removal of, 109 review typologies for, 109-110 tenure of, 109 historical context for, 103 legal cultural conflicts and, 111-113 European legal standards and, 112 interpretation of legal standards, 112–113 legal reasoning traditions, 112-113 socialist legal culture context, 111 legitimacy of, 117-122 normative, 118-122 sociological, 117-118 neutrality of, 12 public trust in, 117, 117 relationship with political actors, 117-118 rule of law in, 118-119 working conditions for, 113-115 concurring decisions, 114-115 decision-making, 114 dissenting decisions, 114-115 Constitutional Court of Kosovo activism of, 119

467

conceptual approach to, 103–104 democratisation promoted through, 118–119 establishment of, 103 ethnic conflict influenced by, 119

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

468

Index

Constitutional Court of Kosovo (cont.) European Convention on Human Rights and, 112 European Court of Human Rights and, 112-113 foreign judges on, 107–123 appointment of, 107-108 competence of, 109-110 competition of, 107-109 judicial panels for, 110 limited legitimacy of, 122 mission of, 110, 120-122 normative legitimacy of, 120–122 removal of, 109 review typologies for, 109-110 as sustainable and transitional solution, 120 tenure of. 100 under General Framework Agreement for Peace, 103 historical context for, 103 legal cultural conflicts and, 111-113 EU legal standards and, 112 interpretation of legal standards, 112-113 legal reasoning traditions, 112-113 socialist legal culture context, 111 legitimacy of, 117-122 normative, 118-122 sociological, 117-118 public trust in, 117 relationship with political actors, 117-118 rule of law in, 118-119 statehood and, 120 working conditions for, 113-115 concurring decisions, 114-115 decision-making, 114 dissenting decisions, 114-115 Constitutional Court of Qatar, 380 Constitutional Court of South Africa, 367-368 constitutional courts. See also specific courts composition of, 205 constitutional law, in Macau, 89 contract law, in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 53 Cook Islands, 8, 300 corruption, political in El Salvador, 141-142 in Guatemala, 141-142 in Honduras, 141–142, 144–145 Court of Appeal in Botswana, 350-351 in Brunei Darussalam, 416 in The Gambia, 405 in Kuwait, 374 in Lesotho, 346, 351, 360-362 in Seychelles, 189-194 foreign judges in, 186 in South Africa, 353-354 Court of Cassation (Kuwait), 374 Court of Final Appeal (Macau), 92-93, 98 Court of First Instance (Macau), 92-94, 98 Court of Second Instance (Macau), 92-94 COVID-19 pandemic borderless adjudication as result of, 29-30 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal during, 49-50 international commercial courts and, 87

Davies, Geoffrey, 409 Dawson, Sir Daryl, 46 Dayton Agreement. See General Framework Agreement for Peace Declaration of Independence, in Kosovo, 104 decolonisation, historical context for foreign judges and, 7, 29-30 democracy through Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 118-110 through Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 118-119 in The Gambia, 393–394, 408 constitutionalism as element of, 394 transition to democracy, 392-393 Democratic Republic of Congo, institution-building in. 11 dependent territories, domestic courts in, 235-236 deracialisation, of judiciary, in South Africa, 234, 354 Derham, David, 434 Dias Azedo, José, 99–100 Díaz-Ambrona, Juan Antonio, 208, 210 Dickinson, Laura, 168-169 DIFCC. See Dubai International Financial Centre Court 'differentiated principle of legality', 66 Dillon, John Douglas, 309 Dingake, Oagile, 241, 355, 357, 357 diversity, judicial, 2, 6, 8-9, 13, 19 in Andorra, 212–218 in Caribbean courts, 327-329 in Commonwealth nations, 77-78, 85-86 in Papua New Guinea, 432–434 on Singapore International Commercial Court, 75-76 in Southern Africa, 188 Dixon, Rosalind, 335, 347 Domah, Satyabhooshun, 190-191 Dominica, Commonwealth of, 221. See also Caribbean Court of Justice; Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court domestic courts. See also specific courts definition of, 6-7 foreign judges on, conceptual approach to, 1-2 Donne, Sir Gavan, 309 dual citizenship, for foreign judges, 5 Dubai International Financial Centre Court (DIFCC), 9-10, 80-81, 377-378 establishment of, 81 Duff, Antony, 171 Dziedzic, Anna, 25, 234, 335, 429 Eames, Geoffrey, 239 East Timor, judiciary system in, 9 Civil Code in, 132–134 colonial history and Indonesian involvement in, 127

Portugal's role in, 126-127

conceptual approach to, 124-126

criminal tribunals. See hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts: international criminal

tribunals

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 - The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

Constitution of the Democratic Republic of East Timor, 131 domestic courts in, 134-138 establishment of, 126–130 foreign judges in, 130-139 in domestic courts, 134-138 impartiality of, 134 independence of, 134, 137-138 recruitment of, 125-126 from 2002-2006, 130-134 from 2006-2014, 134-137 from 2014–2019, 137–138 United Nations Development Programme and, 133–134 history wars in, 134 legitimacy of, 126 local Timorese judges in, 133-134 methodological approach to, 124-125 official languages of, 130-131, 133 Penal Code in, 132–134 political parties and, 134 National Congress for Timorese Reconstruction, 134 Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor, 134 Portugal and, 131-133 colonial history of, 126-127 legal traditions influenced by, 132-133 recruitment processes for for foreign judges, 125-126 by United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor, 128 separation of powers in, 134-137 Serious Crimes Panel, 129, 131 Special Panels for Serious Crimes in East Timor, 165-166 United Nations Development Programme and, 124, 132 appointment of foreign judges by, 133-134 United Nations Mission of Support to East Timor, 130 United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor and, 127–130 international assistance through, 129-130 legal structure of, 128 recruitment of judicial personnel, 128 rule of law traditions under, 127 training by, 128-129, 138 Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court, 6-7, 220-223 Caribbean Council of Legal Education and, 230 foreign judges in, 223–232 appointment process for, 223-224 colonialism and, 225-227 definition of, 224-225 disadvantages of, 228 impartiality of, 224-225 judicial benefits of, 227-228 judicial expectations of, 228-229 methodological approach to, 223-224 public perception of, 228-229 treatment of, 227-228 jurisdiction of, 222, 325 legitimacy of, 225-227

469

nationalism and, 222-223 regionalism of, 222-223 Revised Treaty of Chaguaramas and, 222 structural features of, 325 Eboe-Osuji, Chile, 174 ECC. See English Commercial Court ECCC. See Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia ECHR. See European Convention on Human Rights Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS), 393-394 ECtHR. See European Court of Human Rights Egypt. See also Middle East and North African region Čivil Code in, 373 foreign judges from, 385-386 as judicial demotion, 386 laws for, 385 in United Arab Emirates, 385-386 Mixed Courts of Egypt, 253-254, 258-260, 370-371 composition of, 250 judicial activism in, 263-264 legal provisions of, 259–260 Napoleonic system of administrative justice and, 260 Ehrenzeller, Bernhard, 64 Ehrhardt, Albert, 271 Eichelbaum, Sir Thomas, 46 El Salvador new constitution in, 150-151 political corruption in, 141-142 electoral laws, in Liechtenstein, 66 English Commercial Court (ECC), 83 domestic cases in, 83 English language, use of in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 47 in Singapore International Commercial Court, 76 Erne, Franz, 64 Esparon, David, 188 Esquipulas agreements, 151-153 Eswatini, Kingdom of, domestic courts in, 239, 346, 368. See also Swaziland, domestic courts in Africanisation of, 367 localisation of, 367 political context for, 364-367 Southern African Development Community and, 366 Supreme Court, 351-352 ethnic conflicts, in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Kosovo, 106-107 EUMIC. See European Union Multilateral Investment Court Europe, foreign judges in. See also specific nations Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina and, 108 historical context for, 10 European case law, in Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 115-117 European Commission, 115 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), 13, 67 Andorra and, 203–204 colonial-era mixed courts and, 265-266

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

470

Index

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), 10, 13 appointment of judges by, 21 colonial-era mixed courts and, 265-266 Constitutional Court of Andorra and, 201, 203-204, 211-214, 217 Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina and, 108, 112-115 Constitutional Court of Kosovo and, 108, 113-115 Constitutional Court of Liechtenstein and, 67-68 European Court of Justice, colonial-era mixed courts and, 265-266 European law, Constitutional Court (Liechtenstein) and, 68-69 European law traditions Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina and, 112 Constitutional Court of Kosovo and, 112 European Union Multilateral Investment Court (EUMIC), 82-83, 85-87 European Union-Singapore Investment Protection Agreement, 83 expatriate judges, in Pacific regions, 316 expertise, of foreign judges, 13 comparative benefits of, 13 Extraordinary African Chambers (Chad), 8 Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC), 165-168 bias in, 174 jurisdiction for, 172 public perception of, 169-171 extraterritorial courts, 324-325 independence of, 333-336 institutionalisation of, 333-336 Federal Constitutional Court (Germany), 67-68 Federated States of Micronesia (FSM), domestic courts in, 8, 300 Compact of Free Association and, 449-450 Constitution of, 451-454 constitutional framework for, 448, 458 amendments to Constitution, 453-454 cultural references in, 453, 453 local custom and tradition and, 459-461 reform proposals, 451-454 cultural identity and, 456-459 domestic judges in, discrimination against, 450 federal structure of, 447 foreign judges in conceptual approach to, 447-448 cultural values of, 456-459 entrenchment of, 449-451 lack of cultural knowledge for, 452-453 national origin of, 449 negative public response to, 450-451 as non-citizens, 447 from U.S., 449-452 judicial activism in, 448 U.S. influence on Constitution of FSM, 451-454 through cultural values, 456-459 de-Americanisation of, 449, 461-462

as foreign judges, 449-452 Micronesian jurisprudence in conflict with, 454-456 Feldman, David, 5, 108, 121 Féraud-Giraud, Louis-Joseph-Delphin, 263-264 Fernando, Anthony, 186, 188 Field, David Dudley, 257 Fiji, 8, 239, 300 citizenship laws in, 4 Constitution of, 308 superior courts in, 303, 304 Floissac, Sir Vincent, 231 Fok, Joseph, 14 Fombad, Charles, 350-351, 394 Fong Man Chong, 100 Ford, Anthony, 309 foreign judges, in domestic courts. See also specific courts; specific nations; specific topics accountability and independence of, 20-25 through appointment process, 21-22 community membership and, 24-25 judicial responsibility and, 24-25 tenure security and, 22-24 adjudication of disputes, 25-29 appointment of, 15-18 in civil law systems, 16-17 in common law systems, 16-17 jurisdiction size as factor in, 16 citizenship laws and, 4 in civil law jurisdictions, 5 implementation as result of, 16-17 colonialism and, 14-15 historical context for, 7 in common law jurisdictions, 5 implementation as result of, 16-17 competence of, 28 conceptual approach to, 1-2 cross-border interactions between, 6 debate over, 1 definition of, 3-6 as non-citizens, 4 by professional qualifications, 5 development of law and, 25-29 distance from domestic politics as factor for, 12 as dual citizens, 5 effectiveness of, 14-15 expertise of, 13 comparative benefits of, 13 foreignness as influential factor for, 2 future of, 29-30 historical context for, 7, 90-92 in African nations, 7-8 in Ancient Greece, 90-91 in Asian nations, 9 in Caribbean nations, 8 colonial influences in, 7 decolonisation in, 7, 29-30 in Europe, 10 in Latin America, 10 in Middle Ages, 91–92

in Middle East region, 9–10 in Pacific region, 8–9

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

identity attributes of, 19-20 for institution-building, 11-12 international influences on, 17-18 rule of law assistance, 18 sovereignty issues and, 17-18 judicial review by, 25-29 jurisdictional comparisons in, 2 legal implications of, 18-29 legitimacy of, 14-15 normative, 18 sociological, 18 methodological approach to, 1-3 on mixed benches, 28-29 motivations of, 15 as naturalised citizens, 5 rationale for, 11 recruitment of, 3, 8-9 remuneration, 11, 22, 33–36, 194, 315 representativeness and, 19-20 in African courts, 10 for Commonwealth judges, 19-20 'international judges' and, 19-20 for reputation of courts, 13-14 by type of legal system, 16-17 indirect rule systems, 17 in mixed systems, 16 foreignness in Caribbean courts, 327-328 citizenship and, 4-5 definition of, 3-4 globalisation as factor for, 5 judging influenced by, 2 regionalism as influence on, 6 France, legal traditions in. See also Andorra Constitutional Court of Andorra and, 209, 210 Franz Josef II (Prince), 62 French, Robert, 45 FRETILIN. See Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor FSM. See Federated States of Micronesia fundamental rights Constitutional Court in Liechtenstein and, 67-68 in Macau legal cases, 98-99 Fur, Pierre Le, 251 Furse, Ralph, 273-274 The Gambia, domestic courts in analysis of, 406-408 Commercial Court in The Gambia, 39 Commonwealth Fund for Technical Cooperation in, 33-34 conceptual approach to, 392-393 Constitution of the Republic of The Gambia, 35-36, 393, 403 governmental structure under, 394-395 judicial independence under, 395-396 separation of powers in, 394-395 Court of Appeal, 405 democracy and, 393-394, 408 constitutionalism as element of, 394 transition to, 392-393

Index

471

foreign judges in, 396 appointment of, 396-399, 407 under DFID/CS scheme, 397-398 judicial independence of, 35-37, 394-396 as mercenary judges, 401-402 from Nigeria, 401-402 renewal of, 400 termination of, 400 judicial independence in, 399-402, 406-407 in Constitution of the Republic of The Gambia, 395-396 for foreign judges, 35-37, 394-396 Judicial Service Commission and, 397, 406 political context for, 393-394 rule of law in, 394-396, 399-402 systemic reform of, 402-406 Gambian Bar Association and, 403 through Gambianisation of judiciary, 402-403 Gambia Bar Association, 403 Gaudet, Michel, 266 Gault, Sir Thomas, 46 gender, of judges on Constitutional Court of Andorra, 215-216 travelling judges, 313, 316, 321 General Framework Agreement for Peace (Dayton Agreement), Constitutional Courts of Bosnia-Herzegovina/Kosovo under, 103 General/Mixed Court, in Kuwait, 374 Georges, Telford, 231, 241, 325, 328 Germany Basic Law in, 60 Federal Constitutional Court, 60, 67-68 foreign judges from, 432 Gibbs, Sir Harry, 307 Gleeson, Murray, 45 Goldsborough, Edwin, 309 Govinden, Rony, 186-187 Grabherr, Elmar, 64 Greece. See Ancient Greece Grenada, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court the Grenadines, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Gschnitzer, Franz, 62, 69 Guàrdia Canela, Josep Delfí, 210 Guatemala. See also Comisión Internacional Contra la Impunidad en Guatemala coup d'etat in, 150 new constitution in, 150-151 political corruption in, 141-142 Gummow, William, 45 Gusmão, Xanana, 134–137 Guyana, Republic of, 220-221. See also Caribbean Court of Justice Caribbean Court of Justice cases and, 331-332 colonial constitution of, 329 habeas corpus cases, in Macau, 97-98 Häberle, Peter, 62 Hahl, Albert, 432 Haiti, Institutional Strengthening for the Fight Against Corruption in Haiti, 157

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

472

Index

Handley, Kenneth, 309 Hanlon, David, 454 Harhoff, Frederick, 174-175 Hashim (Sultan), 411 Hau'ofa, Epeli, 317, 318 Hayton, David, 231 Hernandez, Orlando, 142, 144-145 Hill, Helen, 130 Hirschl, R., 347 HKCFA. See Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal HKSAR. See Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Hobbs, Harry, 6 Hodžić, Refik, 175-176 Honduras, 10. See also Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras exodus of citizens from, 142 governance crises in, 142 human rights abuses in, 141–142 institution-building in, 11 Inter-American Court of Human Rights and, 142 model cities in, 142-143 new constitution in, 150-151 political corruption in, 141-142, 144-145 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal (HKCFA), 5, 9, 14 arbitration in, 53 under Basic Law, 42, 44, 52, 78, 292 citizenship and, 292 colonial influences on, 291 common law jurisdiction, 48 development of common law traditions, 27 conceptual approach to, 41-42 definitional terms in, 41-42 contract law in, 53 during COVID-19 pandemic, 49-50 English language use in, 47 establishment of, 284-285, 289 foreign judges on, 43-55 under Basic Law, 44 as benefit to host jurisdiction, 50-52 Chinese language requirements for, 290-291 citizenship considerations for, 42 conflicts of interest for, 294 constitutional basis for, 42-44 current and past judges, 45-47 diversity of, 298 divided patriotism of, 292-295 domestic criticisms of, 298-299 expertise of, 296-298 independence of, 48-49 judicial oaths for, 292-294 judicial status of, 44–45 jurisdictional basis for, 42-44 jurisprudential influences of, 53-55 lack of knowledge for, 285-291 limitation of, 28 practical issues with, 49-50 public interest in, 287 qualification requirements for, 43-44 reasons for invitation to, 47-49 retirement and removal of, 45 support systems for, 288-289

in Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 42-44 human rights law in, 53 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council and, 45, 47 judicial structure of, 43 land law in, 53 National Security Law and, 290-292, 295 permanent judges on, 43 Singapore International Commercial Court and, 71-72, 78-80 Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of (HSKAR), 42-44 Admiralty law, 77 Basic Law in, 42, 44, 52, 78, 292 Commercial Lists, 77 population demographics for, 285 Hoti, Avdullah, 118-119 Howie, Craig, 356-357 Huber, Eugen, 62 human rights abuses in Central American states, 153 Comisión Internacional Contra la Impunidad en Guatemala and, 155 in Honduras, 141-142 Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras and, 155 in Papua New Guinea, 439-440 human rights law in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 53 in Macau, 89 hybrid court systems, 356-357 hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts. See also specific tribunals in Africa, 8 challenges for, 172-176 audience, 175-176 bias, 173-175 recusal, 173-175 conceptual approach to, 159-160 emergence of, 164-166 as institutional mechanism, 168-171 International Criminal Court, 163-164 Rome Statute, 163-164 jurisdiction of, 171-172 justifications for, 166-172 legitimacy of, 169-170 public perceptions of, 169-171 ICC. See International Criminal Court ICTR. See International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda ICTY. See International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia identity, as judicial attribute, 19-20 impartiality, of foreign judges, 11, 12, 24-25 in Caribbean region, 341, 348 in East Timor, 134

international criminal justice and, 163, 164, 174

in Middle East and North African region, 371, 380, 391 in Pacific region, 301 impeachment. See removal of judges

Indian Civil Service, 269–270

indigenisation, 39

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

473

in Federated States of Micronesia, 318-319, 321 in The Gambia, 402, 407 in Papua New Guinea, 26 in Southern African region, 348-354 historical factors for, 349-350 indirect rule systems, foreign judges and, 17 Inns of Court, 275-276 Institut de droit international, 257-258 Institutional Strengthening for the Fight Against Corruption in Haiti (RILCH), 157 institution-building in Democratic Republic of Congo, 11 foreign judges' role in, 11-12 in Honduras, 11 in Kosovo, 11 Inter-American Court of Human Rights, 142 Interim Independent Constitutional Dispute Resolution Court (Kenva), 8 International Commerce Court (People's Republic of China), 9 international commercial arbitration. See also international commercial courts in Singapore, 9, 80 International Commercial Court (Singapore), 9, 80 international commercial courts. See also Singapore International Commercial Court Abu Dhabi Global Market Court, 9-10, 81 Astana International Financial Centre Court, 9, 82 Chinese International Commercial Court, 84, 85 in civil law jurisdictions, 85 in common law jurisdictions, 85 COVID-19 pandemic and, 87 Dubai International Financial Centre Court, 80-81 establishment of, 81 English Commercial Court, 83 domestic cases in, 83 European Union Multilateral Investment Court, 82-83, 85-87 foreign judges on, 84-85 constitutional impediments to, 87 future role of, 86-87 globalisation of lex mercatoria, 87 Netherlands Commercial Court, 83-84 Paris Commercial Court, 83 Qatar International Court and Dispute Resolution Centre, 82 International Court of Justice, 247-248 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 460 International Criminal Court (ICC), 163-164 bias in, 174-175 Rome Statute, 163-164 international criminal law, 171 criticisms of, 176-177 International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR), 127, 162–163, 231 establishment of, 165 International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY), 127, 162-163 bias in, 174-175 establishment of, 165

international criminal tribunals. See also hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts after Cold War, 162 development of, 160-166 Leipzig War Crimes Trials, 161 Paris Peace Conference (1919), 160-161 after World War I, 161 after World War II, 161–162 International Military Tribunals for Nuremberg, 162 Tokyo Tribunals, 162 'international judges', 19-20 International Military Tribunals for Nuremberg, 162 International Zone of Tangier, 250-255 establishment of, 250–251 institutional infrastructure for, 253-254 investigation tribunals, 238 Islamisation, of domestic courts in Brunei Darussalam, 413-425 Jackson, Vicki, 335, 347 Jamaica, 221. See also Caribbean Court of Justice , Jammeh, Yahya, 240, 392–394 Jawara, Dawda Kairaba, 393 Jeffries, Charles, 271, 282 Jimenez, Juan, 146 Johnson, Terence, 271 Jordan, 385-387 JSC. See Judicial Service Commission Juddoo, Nemaduthsingh, 191 judges. See foreign judges; specific topics judicial activism. See activism judicial career structure, 16-17 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (U.K.), 6-8, 237, 282 in Brunei domestic courts, 414, 422-423 Caribbean Court of Justice as replacement for, 221, 227 in Caribbean courts, 326-328, 330-331 jurisdiction of, 333-336 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal and, 45, 47 judicial independence, 20-25 in Brunei Darussalam, 418-419 on Caribbean Court of Justice, 333-336 in Caribbean courts, 337 in Caribbean region, 324-330, 333-340, 343-344 Commonwealth of Nations' courts, 240 community membership and, 24-25 in East Timor, 134, 137–138 in extraterritorial courts, 333-336 in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 48-49 in host jurisdictions, 35-37 in The Gambia, 35-37 through judicial appointment process, 21-22 judicial responsibility and, 24-25 in Pacific region, 300-302, 308-309, 320, 321 tenure, 22–24 judicial review, by foreign judges in Brunei Darussalam, 417 on Constitutional Court of Andorra, 211-216 on Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 109-110 in domestic courts, 25-29

in Papua New Guinea, 428, 434

More Information

474

Index

397, 406 judiciary industry, 310 justice initiatives, host jurisdictions and, 37-38 Kahn, Paul, 25 Kasper-Ansermet, Laurent, 174 Kazakhstan, Astana International Financial Centre Court, 9, 82 Kenya, Interim Independent Constitutional Dispute Resolution Court, 8 Al-Khalifa, Hamad bin Isa (King), 381 Khama, Ian, 355-356 kiap justice, 433-434 Kidu, Buri, 430-431 King, Edward, 456, 458 Kingdom of Eswatini. See Eswatini Kirby, Ian, 357–358, 364 Kiribati, 8, 300 superior court in, 303 Kirk-Greene, Anthony, 269 Kohlegger, Karl, 69 Kosovo. See also Constitutional Court of Kosovo; International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia Comprehensive Settlement Proposal for, 104 constitutional framework for, 104-107 constitution-making, 104 internationalisation of constitutions, 105 Declaration of Independence, 104 ethnic conflicts in, 106-107 institution-building in, 11 UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo, 167 Koutonin, Mawuna, 316 Kühn, Zdenĕk, 111 Kühne, Joseph, 64 Kurti, Albin, 118-119 Kuwait, domestic courts in, 374-376 Court of Appeal, 374 Court of Cassation, 374 foreign judges in, 375-376 appointment of, 375-376 from Egypt, 385–386 non-citizen, 4 General/Mixed Court, 374 Specialised Courts, 374 labour laws, in Liechtenstein, 57 Lai, Jimmy, 291 Lam, Johnson, 297 Lambourne, David, 319–320 land law, in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 53 language use, in judicial systems. See also English language Arabic language in MENA domestic courts, 389-390 in Constitutional Court of Andorra, 212-213 in East Timor, 130–131, 133 in Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 290-291 Latin America, foreign judges in. See also specific nations historical context for, 10 Laubreaux, Daniel Urrutia, 146

Judicial Service Commission (JSC), in The Gambia,

Law, Peter, 239 Leadership Tribunal, in Papua New Guinea, 428, 440 Lebanon Mixed Court of Lebanon, 254-255 Special Tribunal for Lebanon, 9-10, 165-166 apprehended bias in, 173 recusal issues in, 173 legal education, 5, 302, 327-328, 349-350, 384-385, 429 legal reasoning in Andorra, 211, 213 in Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina/ Kosovo, 112-113 in Federated States of Micronesia, 459 in Papua New Guinea, 441–443 legitimacy, of foreign judges, 14-15 on Caribbean Court of Justice, 225-227 in Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 117-122 normative legitimacy, 118-122 sociological legitimacy, 117-118 in East Timor, 126 on Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court, 225-227 on hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts, 160-170 normative, 18 sociological, 18 in Southern African region, 345-346 Leipzig War Crimes Trials, 161 Lemonde, Marcel, 174 Lesotho, domestic courts in, 237-238, 346, 349-350, 368 Court of Appeal, 346, 351, 360-362 foreign judges in, 360-361 appointment of, 360-361 manipulation of, 362 removal of, 361 political context for, 359-364 Southern African Development Community and, 363-364 Leung, Priscilla, 294 Levers, Priya, 342-343 Lewis, Sir Allen, 230-231 lex mercatoria, globalisation of, 87 Li Kwok-Nang, Andrew, 45, 47, 51, 289–290, 299 Liechtenstein, 18. See also Constitutional Court administrative law in, 57 Constitution of, 28, 60 court system in, 62-64 Administrative Court, 63-65, 70 ordinary courts, 63, 69-70 public prosecution in, 63 structure of, 63 European Convention on Human Rights and, 67 foreign judges in, 62-70 in Administrative Court, 70 Austrian model influenced by, 65-66 as legal tradition, 61-62 in ordinary courts, 69-70 received laws influenced by, 65 judicial system in, development of, 58-62 under Constitution of 1921, 60-61

sovereign independence as influence on, 58–60

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

labour laws in, 57 Landtag in, 60-61 legal order in, 56-58 Austrian civil law as influence on, 57–58 foreign judges as influence on, 65-70 historical background of, 56-57 as hybrid system, 57-58 tax laws, 56-57 National Socialists in, 66 property laws in, 57 sovereign independence for, 57 judicial system after, 58-60 Switzerland and, 56 tax laws in legal order, 56-57 treaty with Austria, 63 Lilongwe Principles, in Seychelles, 188 Locke, John, 394-395 Luchaire, François, 208 Ma, Geoffrey, 289–290, 296 Macau, Special Administrative Region of administrative law in, 89 Basic Law, 88-89, 100-101 civil law system in, 9 constitutional law in, 89 foreign judges in, 92-101 appointment of, 93 declining numbers of, 94-96 dissenting opinions by, 97 exclusion from national security cases, 96-97 fundamental rights cases, 98-99 habeas corpus cases, 97-98 proportion of, 94-96 human rights law in, 89 judicial systems in, 89, 93 collaboration in, 101 Court of Final Appeal, 92-93, 98 Court of First Instance, 92-94, 98 Court of Second Instance, 92-94 laws in force concept, 89 'One Country, Two Systems' principle, 88-90 Chinese legal systems and, 93-94 MACCIH. See Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras MacGregor, Francis, 186 Mächler, August, 64 Magistrates' Court (Seychelles), 183 al-Maktoum, Mohammed Bin Rashid (Sheikh), 377 Manoury, Paul, 259 Marshall Islands, 8, 300 citizenship laws in, 4 Martens, Friedrich, 263 Martić, Milan, 174 Mason, Sir Anthony, 46, 51-53, 97, 289. See also Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal majority rulings, 295 Masuku, Thomas, 366 Matadeen, Kheshoe Parsad, 191 Mauritius, 7 Maus, Didier, 207, 208

475

McHugh, Michael, 46 McLachlin, Beverley, 45, 49 MENA region. See Middle East and North Africa region Menon, Sundaresh, 72 mercenary judges, 401-402 Meron, Theodor, 174–175 methodological nationalism, 2 nation-states and, 2 Michelson, Charles, 251 Micronesia. See Federated States of Micronesia Middle Ages, foreign judges during, 91-92 Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region, domestic courts in. See also Bahrain; Kuwait; Qatar; United Arab Emirates; specific nations analysis of, 390-391 Arab Spring and, 390 civil law traditions in, 372-373 common law traditions in, 372-373 conceptual approaches to, 369-370 Constitutional Courts, 389 in contemporary courts, 374-382 domestic judges in, 384-385 in exporting states, 382, 383 foreign judges in, 9-10, 370-382 colonial influences on, 370-371 historical context for, 9-10 independence of, 387-388 in mixed courts, 370-371 pan-Arabism movement and, 372-373 recruitment of, 383-385, 390-391 as rentier judges, 390-391 skills and knowledge gaps filled by, 383-385 utilitarianism of, 372-373 geographical boundaries of, 369 in importing states, 382, 383 independence of, 387-388 lack of organic legal traditions and, 388 language issues in, 388-390 Arabic language use, 389–390 political economy of law in, 382-388 separation of church and state in, 373 Western influences on, 373 Millhouse, Robin, 309 Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras (MACCIH), 140-158 constitutionality of, 146-147 Constitutive Agreement, 145-149 establishment of, 143-145 foreign judges and, 142-143, 147-149 accountability of, 148-149 communication by, 148 judicial aesthetics, 148 recruitment of, 156-157 as institutional organisation, 145-147 as international human rights instrument, 155 under international treaties, 149-152 justification of interventions by, 149-152 mandate, 145–147 Organization of American States and, 144-146 sovereignty of, 149-157 tolerated shame concept and, 155-156

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

476

Index

Mitchell, Dame Roma, 307 Mitterrand, François, 201, 211 mixed benches. See also colonial-era mixed courts foreign judges on, 28-29 Mixed Benches of Ethiopia, 254 Mixed Commercial Court, 257, 264 Mixed Courts of Egypt, 253-254, 258-260, 370-371 composition of, 259 judicial activism in, 263-264 legal provisions of, 259-260 Napoleonic system of administrative justice and, 260 Mixed Court of Lebanon, 254-255, 261, 264 Mixed Court of the Shanghai International Settlement, 257 Mixed Court of Syria, 254-255, 261, 264 Mixed Court of Tangier, 250-255, 260-261, 266, 267 constitutional approach in, 261-262 establishment of, 254-255 foreign judges on, 254-255 Mixed Court of the International Settlement of Shanghai, 264 mixed courts. See colonial-era mixed courts; Mixed Court of Tangier Mixed Courts of Egypt, 253-254 Mladić, Ratko, 174 mobility, of foreign judges, 301-302 hierarchies of, 316-318, 322 impediments on, 319-321 mobility studies, of foreign judges, 313-319, 321-322 model cities, in Honduras, 142-143 Modinos, Polys, 266-267 Mollas i Battlori, Isidre, 210 Monaco, 10 Monnerville, Gaston, 208 Montreux Convention, 264-265 Montserrat, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Moore, Stanley, 231 Morocco International Zone of Tangier, 250-255 establishment of, 250-251 institutional infrastructure for, 253-254 Mixed Court of Tangier, 250-255, 260-261, 266, 267 constitutional approach in, 261-262 establishment of, 254-255 foreign judges on, 254-255 Morrison, Dennis, 339 Mosito, Kananelo, 361 motivations, of foreign judges, 15, 33-35 personal growth, 34 remuneration and, 34 as test of judicial commitment, 34-35 Mottley, Elliott, 339-340 Muria, Sir John, 309, 318-319 Murray, Hubert, 434 Namibia citizenship laws in, 4

Narokobi, Bernard, 439 National Congress for Timorese Reconstruction, 134 national security issues, in Macau, 96-97 National Security Law (Hong Kong), 290-292, 295 National Socialists, in Liechtenstein, 66 nationalism in Caribbean Community, 222-223 methodological, 2 nation-states borders of, 4-5 citizenship and, 4-5 methodological nationalism and, 2 naturalised citizens, foreign judges as, 5 Naudí, Meritxell Palmitjavila, 216 Nauru, 8, 300 superior court in, 303 NCC. See Netherlands Commercial Court Nelson, Ivo, 135 Netherlands Commercial Court (NCC), 83-84 New Zealand, judicial traditions in conceptual approach to, 242-243 domestic judges in, 247-248 domestic law influenced by, 246 globalisation as influence on, 247-248 Indigenous law and legal systems, 244 international law and, 246 Newton, Sir Isaac, 92 Nicaragua, 150-151 Nigeria, foreign judges from, 401-402 Niue, 300 non-citizens, foreign judges as, 4 in Federated States of Micronesia, 447 Nonggor, John, 441 non-permanent judges. See Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal normative legitimacy, of foreign judges, 18 Nuremberg Trials. See International Military Tribunals for Nuremberg OAS. See Organization of American States Ochs, Sarah, 169 Odoki, Benjamin, 366 Oliveira, João Gil, 100 'One Country, Two Systems' principle, 88-90 Chinese legal systems and, 93-94 Organization of American States (OAS), 144-146 Orie, Alphons, 174 Oswald, Wilhelm, 64 Ottoman Empire, colonial-era mixed courts in, 255-257 overseas territories, domestic courts in, 235-236 Pacific region Commonwealth judges in, 300-305 historical context for, 8-9 mobility and movement in, 302 Pacific region, foreign judges in. See also travelling judges; specific nations colonial frameworks for, 300, 317

in Commonwealth nations, 311

conceptual approach to, 300-302

Napoleonic system, of administrative justice, 260

foreign judges in, 4, 7, 346

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

demographics for, 313-319 demand and supply of judges, 314-316 nationality of judges, 314 intra-regional movement of, 318-319 judiciary industry and, 310 jurisdictions for, 302-305 mobility of, 301-302 hierarchies of, 316-318, 322 impediments on, 319-321 in mobility studies, 313-319, 321-322 modalities of travel, 305-313 for arrival, 305-309 length of stay, 305-309 for local judges, 307-308 as migration, 312-313, 315-316 movement patterns and, 309-312 for resident foreign judges, 305-306 return mechanisms and, 305-309 for short-term appointments, 308-309 temporariness and, 308-309 for visiting foreign judges, 306-308 nationality of, 314 in superior courts, 302-305 numbers and proportions of foreign judges, 305 Palau, 8, 300 Panel of International Judges, in Brunei Darussalam, 409 Papua New Guinea, domestic courts in, 8, 300, 428 analysis of, 445–446 citizenship laws in, 4 colonial influences on, 432-436 Australian role in, 432–434 British judicial initiatives and, 433-434 characteristics of colonial courts, 434-436 kiap justice, 433-434 in lower courts, 434 in superior courts, 435-436 constitutional framework for, 427, 439-440, 445 District Court, 428 domestic judges in, 427 foreign judges in appointment of, 429 conceptual approach to, 427-428 expansive powers of, 437 from Germany, 432 under home-grown Constitution, 436-440 human rights protections by, 439-440 judicial interpretation by, 437-438 legalistic approach to, 427 liberalisation of, 437 localisation, 430-431 recruitment of, 431 responsiveness of, 440-445 sourcing of, 429-430 Leadership Tribunal, 428, 440 Supreme Court, 428, 437-438 Village Court, 428 Paris Commercial Court, 83 Paris Peace Conference (1919), 160-161 Pascuet, Roser Suñé, 216 Pasha, Nubar, 371 Paulsen, Owen, 305

477

Peer, Josef, 59-60 Penal Code, in East Timor, 132–134 People's Republic of China (PRC). See also Hong Kong; Macau Chinese International Commercial Court, 84, 85 in Hong Kong, 42, 44, 52 International Commerce Court, 9 Judges Law, 84 in Macau, 88-89, 100-101 National Security Law, 290–292, 295 Nationality Law, 292 'One Country, Two Systems' principle, Macau under, 88-90, 93-94 Promulgation of National Law in, 78 Special Administrative Regions, 9 Perera, Andrew Ranjan, 186–187, 194 Perišić, Momčilo, 175–176 Permanent Court of Arbitration, 247 permanent judges, on Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 43 Pescatore, Pierre, 267 Peterkin, Sir Neville, 230–231 Pilotti, Massimo, 266 Pi-Sunver, Carles Viver, 208-210 political corruption. See corruption Portugal East Timor and, 124-139 colonial history of, 126-127 legal traditions in, 132–133 foreign judges recruited from, 7, 9, 94, 99 PRC. See People's Republic of China property laws, in Liechtenstein, 57 pupillage, in Colonial Legal Service, 275-276 Qatar, domestic courts in, 378-381 Civil and Commercial Court, 9-10 Constitutional Court of Qatar, 380 foreign judges in appointment of, 379 non-citizen, 4 recruitment of, 378-379 tenure for, 379-380 Qatar International Court and Dispute Resolution Centre (QICDRC), 82, 380-381 Quinn, James Aiden O'Brien, 185 Rajah, V. K., 72 Ramesh, Kannan, 409, 415 Ramodibedi, Michael, 190 recruitment, of foreign judges, 3 in East Timor, 125-126 for foreign judges, 125-126 by United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor, 128 for Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras, 156-157 in Papua New Guinea, 431 in Qatar, 378-379

recurs d'empara, in Andorra

Constitution of Andorra, 204–207 Constitutional Court of Andorra, 205–206

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

478

Index

recusal of judges in hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts, 173-175 in Special Tribunal for Lebanon, 173 Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands, 310-311 removal of judges in Brunei Darussalam, 420-421 in Caribbean region, 325, 327, 338, 341 in Commonwealth of Nations' courts, 238 from Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 109 from Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 109 in East Timor, 126 in The Gambia, 400 from Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 45 in Lesotho, 361 in Pacific region, 320, 321 in United Arab Emirates, 378 representativeness, 19-20 in African courts, 19 for Commonwealth judges, 19-20 on Constitutional Court of Andorra, 215-216 'international judges' and, 19-20 reputation, of domestic courts, foreign judges and, 13-14 Residency Agreement, in Brunei Darussalam, 411 residency model, in Brunei, 412-413 Resident's Court, in Brunei, 412 retirement, of judges in Brunei Darussalam, 419–420 from Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 45 Revised Treaty of Chaguaramas, 220-222 Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor (FRETILIN), 134 Richardson, Sir Ivor, 46 RILCH. See Institutional Strengthening for the Fight Against Corruption in Haiti Robert, Louis, 90, 91 Roberts, Denys, 415, 419-421 Roberts, John, 230-231 Robotham, Sir Lascellas, 230-231 Rome Statute, 163-164 rule of law assistance, 18 rule of law principles in Andorra, 204 in Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 118–119 in Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 118-119 in The Gambia, 394-396, 399-402 in Liechtenstein, 66-67 Rules of Court Orders, in SICC, 74 Russell, Sir Alison, 271 Rwanda. See International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda Sacirbey, Muhamed, 163 SADC. See Southern African Development Community Saied, Mohammed, 409-410 Saifuddien III, Omar Ali (Sultan), 418 Saint Kitts and Nevis, 221, 331. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court

Saint Lucia, 220–221, 230–231. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Saint Vincent, 221. See also Eastern Caribbean Supreme Court Sakora, Bernard, 438-439 Salika, Gibbs, 431 same-sex marriage cases, in Liechtenstein, 68 Samoa, 8 Constitution of, 308 New Zealand judges in, 244-245 superior court in, 303 San Marino, 10 al-Sanhūrī, 'Abd al-Razzāq, 373 Sauzier, André, 185, 196-197 Schäffer, Heinz, 64 Schofield, Derek, 342 Schreiner, Bill, 356 Schwander, Vital, 62 Scott, Michael Dishington, 309 SCSL. See Special Court for Sierra Leone Serious Crimes Panel, in East Timor, 129, 131 Šešelj, Vojislav, 174 Sey, Mary, 309, 398 Sevchelles, 7 citizenship laws in, 4 colonialism in, 181 common law traditions in, 181, 190 Constitution of Seychelles (1993), 181-183 articles of, 185, 185 judicial appointments under, 183-185 Supreme Court established under, 182-183 Court of Appeal, 189-194 foreign judges in, 186 courts in constitutional establishment of, 182-183 Magistrates Court, 183 Supreme Court, 182-183, 186, 187 foreign judges in, 187-198 appointment of, 189-194 in Court of Appeal, 186 as impartial mediators, 196-198 as innovators, 196-198 naturalised, 194-196 public perceptions of, 198 on Supreme Court, 187 tenure limits for, 24 under French civil law, 190 judicial officers in, 183-188 appointment of, 183–185 Constitutional Appointments Authority and, 183-185, 191-194, 199 Lilongwe Principles, 188 Southern African Chief Justices Forum, 188, 188 SICC. See Singapore International Commercial Court Sierra Leone. See Special Court for Sierra Leone Singapore amendments to Constitution, 73 common law traditions in, 71 European Union-Singapore Investment Protection Agreement, 83 Supreme Court of Judicature Act, 73-74

Singapore International Commercial Court (SICC), 9 as civil law court, 71, 77–78

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

Index

as common law court, 71, 77-78 English language use in, 76 establishment of, 71 foreign judges on, 72-80 diversity as result of, 75-76 nationality of, 76-78 functions and purpose of, 72-73 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal, 71-72, 78-80 international commercial arbitration in, 80 jurisdiction of, 73-75 methodological approach to, 71-72 Rules of Court Orders, 74 transfer cases in, 74-75 UNCITRAL Model Law and, 79 Slaughter, Anne-Marie, 6 socialist legal culture, 111 sociological legitimacy, of foreign judges, 18 Solomon Islands, 8-9, 300 Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands, 310-311 superior court in, 303 Somare, Sir Michael, 430, 440 Somers, Sir Edward, 46 South Africa Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 234 Constitutional Court, 367-368 Court of Appeal, 353-354 deracialisation of judiciary in, 234, 354 foreign judges in, 352 Southern African Chief Justices Forum, 188, 188 South African Law Society, 366 Southern African Development Community (SADC) in Eswatini, 366 in Lesotho, 363-364 Southern African region, domestic courts in bias in, 362, 363 colonial history as influence on, 348-354 conceptual approach to, 345-348 cross-border influences in, 352-354 delayed indigenisation in, 348-354 historical factors for, 349-350 foreign judges in appointment of, 345, 350-354 country of origin for, 352 judicialisation of politics and, 347, 347 legitimacy of, 345-346 manipulation of, 345 from South Africa, 352 structure of, 350-352 sovereignty of Andorra, 202–204 of foreign judges, 17-18 for Liechtenstein, 57 judicial system after, 58-60 of Mission to support the Fight against Corruption and Impunity in Honduras, 149-157 Spain, legal traditions in. See also Andorra Constitutional Court of Andorra influenced by, 206, 209, 210 Special Administrative Regions (People's Republic of China), 9

479

Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL), 8, 165-166, 168-169 jurisdiction for, 172 public perception of, 169-171 Special Criminal Court (Central African Republic), 8, 165-166 Special Jurisdiction for Peace (Colombia), 10 Special Panels for Serious Crimes in East Timor, 165-166 Special Tribunal for Lebanon, 9-10, 165-166 apprehended bias in, 173 recusal issues in, 173 Specialised Courts, Kuwait, 374 Spigelman, James, 46 Sri Lanka, 7 Stabilisation and Association Agreement, between Bosnia-Herzegovina and European Union, 115 Struycken, Arnold, 266-267 Subra de Bieusses, Pierre, 208, 210 Sudan Political Service, 269-270 Supreme Court of Brunei Darussalam, 409 Supreme Court of Eswatini, 351-352 Supreme Court of Monaco, 10 Supreme Court of Papua New Guinea, 428, 437-438 Swaziland, domestic courts in, 349-350. See also Eswatini, Kingdom of, domestic courts in Constitution of Swaziland, 352 Switzerland Federal Court, 67-68 Liechtenstein legal order influenced by, 56 Syariah Courts, in Brunei Darussalam, 410-411, 418-419, 423-425 judicial appointments in, 419-420 Tamanaha, Brian, 454–455, 461 Tau, Tebogo, 357 tax laws in Austria, 63 in Liechtenstein, 56-57 treaty with Austria, 63 Tebbutt, Patrick, 350-351, 356-357 tenure, of foreign judges accountability and independence influenced by, 22-24 in Caribbean courts, 336-340 in Commonwealth of Nations' courts, 239 on Constitutional Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, 109 on Constitutional Court of Kosovo, 109 fixed term appointments, 190-191, 305, 338, 339, 358, 403, 419 in The Gambia, 400, 405 in Middle East and North African region, 379-380, 386 in Pacific region, 306-307, 322 in Qatar, 379-380 in Seychelles, 24 in Southern Africa region, 346, 351, 356, 361, 362, 367-368 Thürer, Daniel, 64, 69 Tokyo Tribunals, 162 tolerated shame, as concept, in Central America, 155-156 Tonga, 8–9, 300 superior court in, 303 Torrens, Shannon Maree, 174

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09878-6 — The Cambridge Handbook of Foreign Judges on Domestic Courts Anna Dziedzic, Simon N. M. Young Index

More Information

480

Index

transnational citizenship, 312-313 travelling judges definition of, 300-301 as expatriate judges, 316 gender and, 313, 316, 321 methodological approach to, 302-305 modalities of travel for, 306-307, 305-313 Treaty of Chaguaramas, 220. See also Revised Treaty of Chaguaramas Trias, Pere Vilanova, 200 tribunals. See hybrid international criminal tribunals and courts; international criminal tribunals Trinidad and Tobago, 221, 232, 330, 331. See also Caribbean Court of Justice Tunisia, 387-388 Turks and Caicos, 221, 340. See also Caribbean Court of Justice Tuvalu, 8–9, 300 superior court in, 303 Twomey, Mathilda, 238 UAE. See United Arab Emirates Uganda, 7 U.K. See United Kingdom UN. See United Nations UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK), 167 UNCITRAL Model Law, 79 UNDP. See United Nations Ungerank, Wilhelm, 63 United Arab Emirates (UAE), domestic courts in Abu Dhabi Global Market Court, 9-10, 81, 378 Dubai International Financial Centre Court, 9-10, 80-81, 377-378 establishments in, 81 establishment of, 376-377 foreign judges in appointment of, 378 from Egypt, 385-386 non-citizen, 4 removal of, 378 United Kingdom (U.K.). See also colonialism English Commercial Court, 83 domestic cases in, 83 foreign judges recruited from, 8-9 Judicial Committee of the Privy Council, 6-8, 282 in Brunei Darussalam domestic courts, 414, 422-423 Caribbean Court of Justice as replacement for, 221, 227 in Caribbean courts, 326–328, 330–331, 333–336 Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal and, 45, 47 United Nations (UN) Development Programme, 124, 132 appointment of foreign judges by, 133-134 Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo, 167 Mission of Support to East Timor, 130, 130

Transitional Administration in East Timor, 127-130 international assistance through, 129-130 legal structure of, 128 recruitment of judicial personnel, 128 rule of law traditions under, 127 training by, 128-129, 138 United States (U.S.) Federated States of Micronesia domestic courts influenced by Constitution of FSM and, 451-454 de-Americanisation of, 449, 461-462 through U.S. cultural values, 456-459 U.S. judges in, 449-452 U.S. jurisprudence in conflict with, 454-456 foreign judges recruited from, 8-9 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Andorra and, 213-214 UNMIK. See UN Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo; United Nations UNMISET. See United Nations UNTAET. See United Nations U.S. See United States Vallender, Klaus, 64 Vanuatu, 8-9, 12, 300 superior court in, 303 Velasquez, Ivan, 144 Village Court, in Papua New Guinea, 428 Villeda, Marco Antonio, 140-141, 145-157 War Crimes Chamber in Bosnia and Herzegovina, 165-166 Ward, Sir Gordon, 309, 310 Washington Treaties (1907/1923), 152 Wildhaber, Luzius, 64 Wildman, Hugh, 340–341 Wilhelm II (Kaiser), 161 Winter, Gerard, 306 Wolf, Louis de, 251 Wood, Frank, 185, 197 Wooding, Hugh, 329 World War I, international criminal tribunals after, 161 World War II, international criminal tribunals after, 161-162 International Military Tribunals for Nuremberg, 162 Tokyo Tribunals, 162 Wowo, Joseph, 401 Wylie, Norman, 356 Ximenes, Claudio, 132

Yamase, Dennis, 454–455 Yip, Man, 76–78 Young, Harold, 335 Young, Simon, 325

al-Zaabi, Mohammed bin Saqr, 391