The Politics of Working Life and Meaningful Waged Work

Can waged work under capitalism be meaningful? How does this meaningfulness express itself in the politics of working life? More fundamentally, how should work be socially and economically valued, rewarded, organised and regulated to become more meaningful? Knut Laaser and Jan Ch. Karlsson address these questions and provide a novel theory of meaningful work that is deeply ingrained in Critical Social Science approaches. The authors conceptualise work on a continuum between meaningful and meaningless that rests on objective and subjective dimensions of autonomy, dignity and recognition, all pushed and pulled by the multilayered control and power dynamics of waged work. They challenge the tendency to promote unpolitical concepts in the scholarship of meaningful work. The explanatory power of the meaningful work framework is illustrated by the analysis of empirical case studies on Norwegian industry operators, British bank employees, Indian security guards, German university academics and Swedish cabin crew members.

KNUT LAASER is Senior Researcher at the Brandenburg University of Technology Cottbus–Senftenberg, Germany, Lecturer at the University of Stirling, UK and Visiting Professor at Aarhus Summer University since 2019. He has published on the moral economy of work and employment and more recently on meaningful work in international and world-leading journals.

JAN CH. KARLSSON is Professor Emeritus of Sociology at the Department of Working Life Science, Karlstad University, Sweden. He is the author of Organizational Misbehaviour in the Workplace: Narratives of Dignity and Resistance (2012), Collective Mobilization in Changing Conditions: Worker Collectivity in a Turbulent Age (2019) and Explaining Society: Critical Realism in the Social Sciences (2019).

The Politics of Working Life and Meaningful Waged Work

KNUT LAASER Brandenburg University of Technology Cottbus–Senftenberg and University of Stirling

JAN CH. KARLSSON Karlstad University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009098571

DOI: 10.1017/9781009089692

© Knut Laaser and Jan Ch. Karlsson 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Laaser, Knut, 1981– author. | Karlsson, Jan Ch., 1948– author. Title: The politics of working life and meaningful waged work / Knut Laaser, University of Stirling, Jan Ch. Karlsson, Karlstad University. Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2023037475 | ISBN 9781009098571 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009089692 (ebook) Subjects: LCSH: Work – Social aspects. | Work – Psychological aspects. |

Subjects: LCSH: Work – Social aspects. | Work – Psychological aspects. | Work – Political aspects. | Industrial sociology.

Classification: LCC HD4904 .L23 2024 | DDC 306.3/6–dc23/eng/20230830 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023037475

ISBN 978-1-009-09857-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Tables		page viii
Preface		
Acknowledgements		
1	Meaningful Work	1
	The Job Satisfaction Paradox as a	
	Theoretical Principle for Meaningful Work	6
	The Argumentation of the Book	13
	Part I Problems in Analyses of Meaningful Work	
2	Contradictions in the Concept of Work	19
	Contradictions in Definitions of Work	20
	A Note on Hegel and the Formative Character of Labour	23
	Durkheim's Limited Concepts of Work	24
	Weber's Diverging Concepts of Work	28
	Marx's Combined Concepts of Work	32
	Towards a Social Science Concept of Work	37
	A Note on the Concept of Work in Meaningful Work	
	Literature	43
	Conclusion	49
3	The Ideological Meaning of Exploitative Work Forms	50
	Natural Slaves: The Ideological Meaning of Slavery	53
	Subordination in the Tripartite Society:	
	The Ideological Meaning of Serfdom	59
	Possessive Individualism: The Ideological Meaning	
	of Wage Labour	62
	Conclusion	66
4	The Politics of Working Life	69
	Agency, Structure and Tendencies	71

v

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-09857-1 — The Politics of Working Life and Meaningful Waged Work
Knut Laaser , Jan Ch. Karlsson
Frontmatter
More Information

vi		Contents
	Identity, Interest and Agency Formal Corporate Agency: Work Organisation,	74
	Employer Associations and Trade Unions Informal Corporate Agency: Self-Organisation,	78
	Worker Collectivity and Community of Coping	80
	Conclusion	87
	Part II Theoretical Traditions in Analysing Meaningful Waged Work	
5	Approaching the Meaning of Waged Work through	
	Its Meaninglessness	91
	Instrumental Work Orientation Is the Solution	92
	Technological Development Is the Solution	94
	The (Re)appropriation of Wage Labour Is the Solution	97
	Stability and Belongingness Is the Solution	101
	Maintaining the Ideal of Craftwork Is the Solution	102
	The Solution Lies beyond Wage Labour Conclusion	106 111
	Conclusion	111
6	Designing, Organising and Managing Meaningful Waged Work	115
	The American Dream of Unlimited Individual Self-Growth: Accounts of Meaningful Wage Labour in	L
	Classical Management Theory	116
	The Neo–Human Relations Troika: Maslow,	
	McGregor and Herzberg	121
	Job Characteristics, Job Engagement and the	
	Psychological Experience of Meaningful Waged Work	128
	Leadership and Meaningful Waged Work	131
	Conclusion	133
7	Meaningful Wage Labour as a Human Condition:	
	Humanist Accounts of Meaningful Waged Work	137
	The Search for Meaning: Humanist Approaches to	
	Meaningful Wage Labour	138
	Passion and Meaningful Wage Labour as Calling	144
	Conclusion	152
8	The Political Philosophy of Meaningful Wage Labour	154
	Virtue Ethics, Flourishing and Wage Labour	155

Сог	Contents	
	The Problem of Low-Skilled Waged Work Liberal Political Philosophy of Meaningful Waged Work:	161
	Meaningful Wage Labour as a Preference	166
	The Problem of Autonomy and Dignity under Capitalism	169
	Conclusion	174
	Part III Meaningful and Meaningless Waged Work: Theory and Empirical Examples	
9	Objective and Subjective Dimensions of Meaningful Waged Work: Towards a New Meaningful Work	
	Framework	179
	Bridging the Objective/Subjective Meaningful	
	Work Divide	181
	Autonomy	186
	Dignity	198
	Recognition	209
	Corroborating the Framework	223
	Conclusion	230
10	Theorising Meaningful and Meaningless Waged Work	231
	Mechanisms, Tendencies and Property Spaces	231
	Empirical Tendencies and Case Studies along the	
	Meaningful-Meaningless Waged Work Continuum	233
	Conclusion	287
11	Conclusion: Meaningful Waged Work and Its Implications	
11	for the Critical Analysis of Work and Employment	288
	Work Forms Structuring the Sphere of Necessity	288
	Unions and Self-organisations as Employee Agency	293
	From Dualities to Dualisms	296
	The Framework from Meaningful to	
	Meaningless Waged Work	297
Ref	erences	301
Ind	ex	330

Tables

3.1	Comparison of ideologies of exploitative work forms	page 67
4.1	Presence and absence of properties in propositions	
	and Archer's definition of Corporate and	
	Primary Agency	77
9.1	Meaningful Waged Work according to the	
	Management and Organisational Behaviour Tradition	224
9.2	Meaningful Waged Work according to the	
	Humanist Tradition	226
9.3	Meaningful Waged Work according to the	
	Political Philosophy Tradition	227
10.1	Objective and subjective tendencies of autonomy,	
	dignity and recognition	233

Preface

Why another book on meaningful work? As sociologists of work we are baffled that the discipline has so far shied away from conceptually and analytically engaging with debates about meaningful work that take place in other disciplines, most prominently psychology and philosophy, as well as in interdisciplinary discussions, primarily within organisational and managerial discourses. One could argue that sociology has contributed to understandings of meaningful work by debating and developing concepts such as job quality, good work, job satisfaction or decent work, and yet these are not the same. Useful as they are, they are focusing on very particular aspects of work and employment such as job conditions, employment conditions, the nature of job tasks and their complexity, availability for learning and skill development and so on. Indeed, sociology has been heavily engaged in discourses about good and bad jobs (Kalleberg, 2011), job quality (Warhurst and Knox, 2022), mapping good work (Williams et al., 2020), job satisfaction (Berglund and Esser, 2020) and similar concepts. These concepts and the debates they have informed have been useful for making policy recommendations for improving working conditions, identifying precarious employment conditions, promoting the importance of workers' voice and strengthening skill formation systems. Yet concepts such as job satisfaction have been criticised for resulting in a rather one-dimensional understanding of work and the meaning it provides to workers. For example, many surveys about job satisfaction mix intrinsic and extrinsic factors but lack robust definitions of them. The so-called Skills and Employment Survey is a case in point. Exploring the work orientation for over twenty-five years, the survey collects data from workers about a wide range of work characteristics. Here, the most important dimension of good work for more than 20,000 respondents is a rather vague one: 'Like doing it'. Without doubt this survey and similar ones provide invaluable data about the experience of work. They pave the way for х

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-09857-1 — The Politics of Working Life and Meaningful Waged Work Knut Laaser , Jan Ch. Karlsson Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Preface

timely policy interventions and inform further working life research. But the under-theorisation of items coupled with the combination of intrinsic with extrinsic factors muddy the water. We are left wondering what it is that workers like doing. The tasks? The people they are doing it with? The people they are doing it for? The reputation that comes with it? The belonging to a workplace in general and the comfort routines in particular can offer? A combination of some or all of these aspects?

So, a crucial question that emerges from the lack of sociological theory and empirical studies on meaningful work is: why is there such an absence? We think that sociologists have so far avoided conceptualising and researching meaningful work because it does not seem to fit the critical agenda many sociologists have when it comes to waged work. Indeed, as we will illustrate in Chapter 5, the majority of social theory and empirical research on work portray it negatively. Here work is seen as a burden and necessity that suppresses autonomy and freedom, violates dignity and fosters inequality. In fact, sociologists have been rather eager to engage in opposite discourses such as about the end of work as wage labour, about the meaninglessness of modern work and about the importance of refusing work, rather than contemplating the meaningfulness of work. As we consider ourselves to be critical social scientists as well, we are sympathetic to these approaches and consider wage labour as contested and in many ways problematic. And yet we think it is important to reclaim the field of meaningful work and develop a critical vocabulary and, essentially, a framework for exploring under which conditions waged work is nevertheless meaningful and how this meaningfulness expresses itself. Our ambition with the meaningful work framework that we present in this book is to provide a framework for capturing the complex nature of contemporary waged work as well as its experience. In doing so, our ambition is to provide a critical social theory that offers, in Axel Honneth's (2010:225) words, a vocabulary for those who 'not only fear losing their jobs but also the quality of their jobs'.

Acknowledgements

Robert MacKenzie gave us invaluable comments on the book in one of its later stages. We are forever grateful. We also wish to express our heartfelt gratitude for comments from Stephen Ackroyd, Jonas Axelsson, Lars Ivarsson, Robin Jonsson, Kristina Palm and Chris Warhurst. Our thanks and appreciation also go out to Sharon Bolton, who worked with one of the authors on a meaningful work framework for low-skilled work and thereby contributed important ideas to the meaningful work project (Laaser and Bolton, 2022). The usual disclaimers apply.

Permission has been granted for selected use of material from the following:

- Jan Ch. Karlsson (2013) Begreppet arbete. Definitioner, ideologier och sociala former. Lund: Arkiv.
- Jan Ch. Karlsson (2015) Work, passion, exploitation Nordic Journal of Working Life Studies, 5(2): 3–16.
- Jan Ch. Karlsson and Per Månson (2017) The concepts of work in Marx, Durkheim and Weber. *Nordic Journal of Working Life Studies*, 7(2): 107–119.