

Galen's Epistemology

Determining what has gone wrong in a malfunctioning body and proposing an effective treatment requires expertise. Since antiquity, philosophers and doctors have wondered what sort of knowledge this expertise involves, and whether and how it can warrant its conclusions. Few people were as qualified to deal with these questions as Galen of Pergamum (129–c. 216). A practising doctor with a keen interest in logic and natural science, he devoted much of his enormous literary output to the task of putting medicine on firm methodological grounds. At the same time, he reflected on philosophical issues entailed by this project, such as the nature of experience, its relation to reason, the criteria of truth, and the methods of justification. This volume explores Galen's contributions to (mainly scientific) epistemology, as they arise in the specific inquiries and polemics of his works, as well as their legacy in the Islamic world.

R. J. HANKINSON is a professor of Philosophy and Classics at the University of Texas at Austin.

MATYÁŠ HAVRDA is a senior researcher at the Institute of Philosophy at the Czech Academy of Sciences.



GALEN'S EPISTEMOLOGY

Experience, Reason, and Method in Ancient Medicine

EDITED BY

R. J. HANKINSON

University of Texas, Austin

and

MATYÁŠ HAVRDA

Czech Academy of Sciences







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009073806

DOI: 10.1017/9781009072670

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022 First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-316-51348-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-07380-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

$A\ell$	breviations	<i>page</i> vii
	troduction J. Hankinson & Matyáš Havrda	I
Ι	'Do I Wake or Sleep?': Galen, Scepticism, and Dreams <i>Jonathan Barnes</i>	13
2	Galen's Empiricist Background: A Study of the Argument in <i>On Medical Experience Inna Kupreeva</i>	32
3	Discovery, Method, and Justification: Galen and the Determination of Therapy <i>R. J. Hankinson</i>	79
4	From Problems to Demonstrations: Two Case Studies of Galen's Method Matyáš Havrda	116
5	Galen's Notion of Dialectic Teun Tieleman	136
6	The Relationship between Perceptual Experience and <i>Logos</i> : Galen's Clinical Perspective <i>P. N. Singer</i>	156
7	Galen against Archigenes on the Pulse and What It Teaches Us about Galen's Method of <i>Diairesis</i> Orly Lewis	190
8	On Sense-Perception: Galen in Dialogue with Plato and the Stoics Katerina Jerodiakonou	218

V



vi	Contents	
9	Reason and Experience in Galen's Moral Epistemology David Kaufman	232
10	The Arabic <i>Alexandrians' Summary</i> of Galen's <i>On the Therapeutic Method Elvira Wakelnig</i>	250
ΙΙ	What Level of Certainty Can Medical Sign-Inference Reach? A Discussion of Galen's Demonstrative Method in the Islamic World Pauline Koetschet	275
Bib	liography	290
Ind	Index of Passages	
Gen	General Subject Index	



Abbreviations

The citations of Galen's works follow the conventions of CGT. Otherwise, unless included in the list below, ancient authors are cited according to LSJ and TLL.

Aët. Aëtius, Placita philosophorum

Agnellus of Ravenna, Commentary on Galen's 'Sects for Agnell. in

SI Beginners'

Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt (1972–) ANRW

BIP Boudon-Millot, Jouanna, and Pietrobelli

BM Boudon-Millot

Commentaria in Aristotelem Graeca (1882–1909) **CAG CCTC** Cambridge Classical Texts and Commentaries **CGT** Cambridge Galen Translations (2013–)

Chrysippus the Stoic Chrysipp.

CMG Corpus medicorum Graecorum (1914–)

DeL Phillip De Lacy Diocl. Diocles of Carvstus

DK Diels, H., and Kranz, W. (1951–26). Die Fragmente

der Vorsokratiker. Berlin.

DL Diogenes Laertius, Lives of Eminent Philosophers

Euc. Elem. Euclid, Elements Н Helmreich

Ioh. Alex. in John of Alexandria, Commentary on Galen's 'Sects for

SI Beginners'

K. Kühn (1821-33)

KD Epicurus, *Kuriai doxai* (= DL 10.139–154)

LCL Loeb Classical Library



> viii List of Abbreviations

Liddell, H. G., Scott, R., and Jones, H. S. (eds.) LSI

> (1996). A Greek-English Lexicon (Ninth edition, with a revised supplement). Oxford: Oxford University Press

Nemes. Nat. Nemesius of Emessa, On the Nature of Man

hom.

Pall. in SI Palladius, Scholia on Galen's 'Sects for Beginners'

PhA Philosophia Antiqua (Brill)

Plut. Cons. Plutarch, Consolation to Apollonius

Apol.

Plut. Comm. Plutarch, Common Conceptions against the Stoics

Not.

Plut. San. Tu. Plutarch, Advice about Keeping Well

Plut. Ser. Num. Plutarch, On the Delays of Divine Vengeance

Vind.

Plut. OC Plutarch, Table Talk

SAM Studies in Ancient Medicine (Brill)

Seneca the Younger, Consolation to Polybius Sen. Cons.

Polyb.

SVF von Arnim, H. (ed.) (1903–1924) Stoicorum veterum

fragmenta. Leipzig.

Thesaurus Linguae Latinae (1900–) TLL

WF Walzer and Frede (1985)