Against Injustice

Traditional theories of justice as formulated by political philosophers, jurists, and economists have all tended to see injustice as simply a breach of justice, a breakdown of the normal order. Amartya Sen's work acts as a corrective to this tradition by arguing that we can recognize patent injustices and come to a reasoned agreement about the need to remedy them, without reference to an explicit theory of justice. Against Injustice brings together distinguished academics from a variety of different fields – including economics, law, philosophy, and anthropology – to explore the ideas underlying Sen's critique of traditional approaches to injustice. The centerpiece of the book is the first chapter by Sen, in which he outlines his conception of the relationship between economics, law, and ethics. The rest of book addresses a variety of theoretical and empirical issues that relate to this conception, concluding with a response from Sen to his critics.

Reiko Gotoh is Full Professor in the Graduate School of Core Ethics and Frontier Sciences at Ritsumeikan University, Japan.

Paul Dumouchel is Full Professor in the Graduate School of Core Ethics and Frontier Sciences at Ritsumeikan University, Japan.
Against Injustice

*The New Economics of Amartya Sen*

*Edited by*

Reiko Gotoh
Paul Dumouchel
## Contents

*List of figures*  
page vii  

*List of tables*  
viii  

*List of contributors*  
ix  

*Acknowledgements*  
x  

**Introduction**  
REIKO GOTOH AND PAUL DUMOUCHEL  
1  

### Part I  
37  

1. Economics, law, and ethics  
AMARTYA SEN  
39  

2. Neorepublicanism and Sen’s economic, legal, and ethical desiderata  
PHILIP PETTIT  
55  

3. The Prajâpati test: response to Amartya Sen  
MARCEL HÉNAFF  
66  

### Part II  
71  

4. The power of a democratic public  
PHILIP PETTIT  
73  

5. The challenge of gender justice  
MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM  
94  

6. Gift, market, and social justice  
MARCEL HÉNAFF  
112  

7. Justice and public reciprocity  
REIKO GOTOH  
140
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>vi</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Reasoning with preferences? 161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JOHN BROOME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Conceptions of individual rights and freedom in welfare economics: a re-examination 187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PRASANTA K. PATTANAIK AND YONGSHENG XU</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part III**  

| 10 | On applying synthetic indices of multidimensional well-being: health and income inequalities in France, Germany, Italy, and the United Kingdom 221 |
|    | ANDREA BRANDOLINI |
| 11 | Assessing children’s capabilities: operationalizing metrics for evaluating music programs with poor children in Brazilian primary schools 252 |
|    | FLAVIO COMIM |
| 12 | The search for socially sustainable development: conceptual and methodological issues 275 |
|    | JEAN-LUC DUBOIS |

**Part IV**  

| 13 | Response 297 |
|    | AMARTYA SEN |

**Index**  

310
Figures

9.1 Decision tree of “right to go out of home unescorted” game page 206
9.2 Decision tree of “right to go out of home unescorted” with payoffs 207
9.3 Decision tree of “right to go out of home unescorted” with modified payoffs 208
10.1 Strategies for multidimensional analysis of well-being 223
10.2 ISO–HDI contours 228
10.3 Isopoverty contours for the Bourguignon–Chakravarty multidimensional poverty index 234
10.4 TSUI multidimensional inequality index 240
10.5 Atkinson multidimensional deprivation indicator 241
10.6 Bourguignon–Chakravarty multidimensional poverty index – I 243
10.7 Bourguignon–Chakravarty multidimensional poverty index – II 244
11.1 GII for cities and Brazil 268
11.2 Triangles of impact 270
   (a) Performance of students in Belém 270
   (b) Performance of students in Porto Alegre 270
   (c) Performance of students in São Paulo 270
   (d) Performance of students in Rio de Janeiro 271
   (e) Performance of students in Recife 271
   (f) Performance of students in Salvador 271
## Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Formulations of individual rights</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Formulations of freedom</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>A game form</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Game Forms 4.1 and 4.2 showing a limitation of interpretation A</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Game Forms 5.1 and 5.2 showing a limitation of interpretation A</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Health and income distribution statistics</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Different target groups</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Elkoshi’s classification (2002)</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>General results, round 1</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Gender impacts</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>Percentage variation of GII for cities in comparison with non-participating children</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

ANDREA BRANDOLINI Economist, Department of Structural Economic Analysis, Bank of Italy

JOHN BROOME White’s Professor of Moral Philosophy and Fellow of Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford

FLAVIO COMIM Senior Economist, United Nations Development Programme in Brazil

JEAN-LUC DUBOIS Director of Research at IRD (Institut de Recherche sur le Développement) and Researcher at C3ED (Centre d’économie et d’éthique pour le développement), University of Versailles

PAUL DUMOUCHEL Professor of Philosophy, Graduate School of Core Ethics and Frontier Sciences, Ritsumeikan University

REIKO GOTOH Professor of Economic Philosophy, Graduate School of Core Ethics and Frontier Sciences, Ritsumeikan University

MARCEL HÉNAFF Professor of Philosophy and Anthropology, Department of Political Science, University of California, San Diego

MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM Ernst Freund Distinguished Service Professor of Law and Ethics, Law and Philosophy, The University of Chicago

PRASANTA K. PATTANAIK Professor of Economics, University of California, Riverside

PHILIP PETTIT Laurance S. Rockefeller University Professor of Politics and Human Values, Princeton University

AMARTYA SEN Lamont University Professor and Professor of Economics and Philosophy, Harvard University

YONGSHENG XU Professor of Economics, Georgia State University
The editors wish to thank all those who helped make this project a success, both the book itself and the 2005 International Conference “Ethics, Economics, and Law: Against Injustice” held at Ritsumeikan University, Kyoto, Japan, on which this volume is based. First we want to thank all the participants in the conference, speakers, chairs, or commentators, in particular Kozo Watanabe, Kotaro Suzumura, Monte Cassim, David Estlund, Enrica Chiappero-Martinetti, Sabina Alkire, Basudeb Chaudhuri, Anantha Duraiappah, as well as discussants Yoshiki Wakamatsu, Noriatsu Matsui, Ko Hasegawa, Koichi Suga, Koichi Tadenuma, Naoki Yoshihara, Makoto Usami, Susumu Morimura, Hitohiko Hirano, Shinichiro Hama, Yuko Kamishima, Noriko Kashiwazaki, Madoka Saito, Kumiko Otsuka, Iwao Hirose. Taku Saito provided substantial help in the revision of the manuscript. Students of the Graduate School of Core Ethics and Frontier Sciences and the Research Staff of Ritsumeikan University gave us indispensable support during the conference itself and the rest of this project. We also want to thank the HDCA (Human Development and Capability Association), in the framework of which the 2005 conference was organized. Finally, we are grateful to JSPS (Japan Society for the Promotion of Science) for grant 16330055 “The Idea of Global Welfare System Based on a Formulation of the Capability Approach” as well as grant 17633003 “International Meeting towards the Capability Conference in Japan” and to Ritsumeikan University for financial support.