The Dynamics of Interstate Boundaries

The Dynamics of Interstate Boundaries explains why some borders deter insurgents, smugglers, bandits, and militants while most suffer from infiltration and crisis. Grappling with an issue at the core of the modern state and international security, George Gavrilis explores border control from the nineteenth-century Ottoman Empire to twenty-first-century Central Asia, China, and Afghanistan.

Border control strategies emanate from core policies of state formation and the local design of border guard institutions. Secure and open borders depend on institutional design, not on military power. Based on research in numerous border regions, this book advances the study of the state, local security institutions, and conflict and cooperation over border control. It holds critical lessons for policy makers and international organizations working to enhance border security in dangerous regions.

George Gavrilis is Assistant Professor of Government at the University of Texas, Austin, and holds an International Affairs Fellowship with the Council on Foreign Relations (2008–09). He has previously held the positions of Director of Research for the Council on Foreign Relations Oral History Project, Columbia University; Associate Research Fellow at the Institute for Social and Economic Research and Policy, Columbia University; and National Security Postdoctoral Fellow, Olin Institute of Strategic Studies at Harvard University. His articles have appeared in Foreign Affairs, The Washington Quarterly, American Behavioral Scientist, and New Perspectives on Turkey, and he has conducted research in the Middle East, Central Asia, and Europe.
The Dynamics of Interstate Boundaries

GEORGE GAVRILIS
University of Texas, Austin
To Constantine and Feridun
Contents

Tables, Figure, and Maps  page viii
Acknowledgments  ix

1  THE TROUBLE WITH BORDERS  1
2  FOUR CLAIMS ABOUT INTERSTATE BOUNDARIES  14
3  BORDER GUARDS, BANDITS, AND THE OTTOMAN-GREEK BOUNDARY REGIME IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY  37
4  THE VIEW FROM ABOVE  66
5  STATE FORMATION AND CENTRAL ASIAN PERIPHERIES IN THE TWENTIETH AND TWENTY-FIRST CENTURIES  93
6  THE VIEW FROM BELOW  130
7  IMPLICATIONS AND INTERVENTIONS  157

Bibliography  173
Index  195
Tables, Figure, and Maps

Tables

2.1 Typology of border security strategies  page 16
2.2 Counterargument  16
3.1 Evolution of the Ottoman-Greek boundary regime  56
4.1 Greek government revenue and expenditures  76
5.1 State formation and border policy in Central Asia  118
5.2 Military expenditures and armed forces in Central Asian region  128
6.1 Policing and cooperative outcomes by 2006  143

Figure

6.1 Cross-border traffic and stability  155

Maps

3.1 The Ottoman-Greek boundary, 1832  41
3.2 Border post positions  49
4.1 Ottoman map of Agrafa  81
4.2 Sketch of grey areas on the Ottoman-Greek border  82
5.1 Central Asia  95
6.1 Kyrgyz border crossings  145
Acknowledgments

From the very start of this project to its completion, I had the good fortune to travel to a dozen border regions around the world, work in a half-dozen archives, learn several languages, and speak to people from all walks of life whose daily existence borders affect. Because no two borders look or function alike at first glance, building a theory was a difficult task. If I have succeeded, even partially, it is thanks to the many wonderful people who have helped me every step of the way.

This project stands on the shoulders of three outstanding scholars at Columbia University. Karen Barkey brilliantly showed me how to turn the long-gone Ottoman Empire into a laboratory for social inquiry. Jack Snyder helped me balance method and theory and always demanded that I speak to real-world problems.

Then there is Charles Tilly. He graciously took an interest in my project even as our first conversation about borders turned me into a bumbling fool. His razor-sharp comments turned my interest into a workable project, and his advice and care over the years have taught me what it means to be a scholar.

I benefited from the wise suggestions of Rifa’at Abu-El-Haj, Vince Boudreau, Val Bunce, Alex Cooley, Colin Elman, Tanisha Fazal, Hein Goemans, Gary Goertz, Dimitris Gondicas, Tony Greenwood, Mike Hanagan, Pauline Jones Luong, Maria Kousis, Mary Ellen Lane, Roy Licklider, Charles Lipson, Heath Lowry, Elise Massicard, Michael Meeker, Joel Migdal, Victoria Murrillo, Katia Papagianni, Christine Philliou, Graeme Robertson, Philipspos Savvides, Sid Tarrow, Wayne Te Brake, Alexander Wendt, İpek Yosmaoğlu, and Bill Zartman.

Many others offered up great suggestions at a number of workshops that include the Workshop on Contentious Politics at Columbia University,
Acknowledgments

the Consortium on Qualitative Research Methods at Arizona State University, the PIPES Workshop in International Relations at the University of Chicago, the Workshop on Colonial Legacies at Cornell University, the Workshop on Interdisciplinarity in Middle East Studies at the Institute of the European University in Florence, and the Institut Français d'Etudes Anatoliennes in Istanbul. I also thank great discussants and audience members for their questions at conferences that include those of the International Studies Association, the American Political Science Association, and the American Historical Association, as well as an anthropology conference at the University of California at Berkeley and the Lineae Terrarum Borders Conference in El Paso and Ciudad Juárez.

The Social Sciences Research Council gave this project a start with a generous grant whose funds were provided by the Ford Foundation. The grant sponsored my education in Ottoman Turkish and allowed me to spend an idyllic semester studying Ottoman history in the Department of Near Eastern Studies at Princeton. The American Research Institute in Turkey and the Institute for Turkish Studies generously supported my archival work. The Dean’s Office at the University of Texas funded my research in Central Asia.

In the field I amassed huge debts of gratitude left and right. The knowledgeable staff of the Archives of the Prime Ministry in Istanbul, especially Berrin Başbüg and İlhan Ovaşoğlu, made working there a pleasure. Thanks go to Koç University and Atilla Aşkar for logistical support. In Istanbul, Neşe Eviyaoğlu and the Özgür, Hacievliyagil, and Yosmaoğlu families made me feel very much at home. Feridun Özgür was an outstanding language teacher. In Athens, Greece, at the Historical Archives of the Foreign Ministry I am grateful to all the staff and, above all, to Ioannis Mpegos. In London, many thanks go to Shelley Deanne. At NATO headquarters in Belgium, Ino Afentouli organized an outstanding briefing and initiated invaluable interviews. In Kyrgyzstan, I was once again surrounded by wonderful, generous individuals such as Nana Canter, Amanda Wooden at the OSCE field office in Osh, and, most of all, Ernist Jumagulov and his entire family. There are a number of people in Uzbekistan who deserve thanks, but given the political situation there, I would rather not identify them. They know the extent of my gratitude.

In 2003–04 I was a postdoctoral Fellow at the Olin Institute for Strategic Studies. There, thanks go to Steven Rosen, Monica Toft, and especially to Ann Townes. A fellow post-doc, Taylor Fravel, gave me brilliant comments more than once. My office mate, Ron Hassner, made me laugh constantly.
Acknowledgments

except when he referred to one of my early chapter drafts as a “two-story house with three elevators.” I hope I have made the most of their thoughtfulness.

More recently, I have found a supportive environment at the University of Texas at Austin and with my colleagues there: Zoltan Barany, Catherine Boone, Gary Freeman, John Higley, Wendy Hunter, Ian Manners, Nancy Moses, Shylashri Shankar, Peter Trubowitz, and Harrison Wagner. Kaushlesh Biyani provided great technical and research assistance. Our dean at the time, Richard Lariviere, graciously encouraged my research.

I should add that this project owes a great deal to the Institute for Social and Economic Research and Policy (ISERP) at Columbia University, which made for a wonderful sabbatical. Most of all, endless thanks must go to William McAllister at ISERP for his intellectual support and friendship.

At Cambridge University Press, I thank Lew Bateman, Jack Goldstone, Libby Wood, and the two anonymous reviewers. Lew has published many authors who have inspired me, and so I am honored to have received his vote of confidence.

Dear friends made this project viable, and a passing acknowledgment cannot do them justice. Ioannis Armakolas, Chares Demetriou, Viki Kotsikopoulou, and Tammy Smith are marvelous friends and a tremendous source of support. Yonca Köksal is a brilliant sociologist, and her outstanding knowledge of Ottoman Turkish helped me decipher my most difficult documents. Jennifer Mitzen, a truly philosophical and thorough mind, gave my work a critical eye whenever I asked. Patrick McDonald and Ami Pedazhur combine the best of friendship and collegiality at UT-Austin. Mona El-Ghobashy delivered incredibly constructive comments and a good dose of humor in the final stretch. Antonio Borrelli guided me and suffered through much of this project.

My two sets of parents, Irini and Nick, Dimitri and Jane, extended unconditional love, support, and minimal grief for my long international absences. My sister, Antonia, was my best friend through and through. But most of all, my accomplishments are a credit to my mom, Irini, and her parents, Antonia and Constantine.