A destructive patriarchal power still exists that is damaging to men and women alike. This book is the narrative of reoccurring resistance to this societal force from its origins in classical time to the present day.

Why is America again fighting an unjust and limitless war? In this era of rising economic inequality and diminished human rights and values, why is America's political discussion distorted by religious fundamentalism, the fear of gay marriage, and the specter of abortion outlawed? Such contradictions within democracies arise from a patriarchal psychology still alive in our personal and political lives, in tension with the equal voice that is the basis of democracy. The Deepening Darkness traces the roots of this tension by joining Carol Gilligan's renowned expertise in developmental psychology with David Richards's impassioned research into ethical resistance to injustice.

In a moving collective voice, they find a duality between repressive power and liberated emotional and erotic bonds, born in the Roman Republic and reproduced through the course of subsequent political arrangements. At the heart of this duality is the transformation of private desire into a crime against the state and a construction of gender that replicates the state's war against dissent and transgressive sexuality. In order to blind them to the violence, constraint, and emotional trauma radiating outward from those who control the levers of power, men are told that the only way to rescue their masculinity is to channel a portion of the state's anger upon a perceived enemy: unregulated women, religious and ethnic others, and men who challenge dominant norms. Borrowing Arundhati Roy's phrase “Love Laws” – the laws that lay down who should be loved and how and how much – Gilligan and Richards show that resistance to those laws is a resistance to the very logic of the patriarchal oppression that poisons our culture. Desire and attachment freely chosen among equals are quite literally the heart of the democracy we can and must nurture.

Carol Gilligan has been University Professor at New York University since 2002. She is also a visiting professor at the University of Cambridge affiliated with the Centre for Gender Studies and with Jesus College. She previously taught at Harvard University for more than 30 years and became Harvard's first gender studies professor in 1997. Her groundbreaking book In a Different Voice (1982) led to critical acclaim, after which she initiated the Harvard Project on Women's Psychology and Girls' Development and co-authored or edited five books. She received a Senior Research Scholar Award from the Spencer Foundation, a Grawemeyer Award for her contributions to education, and a Heinz Award for her contributions to understanding the human condition, and she was named by Time magazine one of the twenty-five most influential Americans. Most recently, The Birth of Pleasure (2002) was described by the Times Literary Supplement as "a thrilling new paradigm." Her play The Scarlet Letter was part of the 2007 WomenCenterStage festival in New York City, and her monologue "My House Is Wallpapered with Lies" was performed as part of the June 2006 V-Day festival, "Until the Violence Stops: NYC." Her first novel, Kyra, was published in 2008.

David A. J. Richards is Edwin D. Webb Professor of Law at New York University School of Law, where he teaches constitutional law and criminal law. He is the author of sixteen books, most recently Tragic Manhood and Democracy: Verdi's Voice and the Powers of Musical Art (2004); Disarming Manhood: The Roots of Ethical Resistance (2005); The Case for Gay Rights: From Bowers to Lawrence and Beyond (2005); and Patriarchal Religion, Sexuality, and Gender: A Critique of New Natural Law (with Nicholas Bamforth; Cambridge University Press, 2008). Two of his books were named best academic books of their years, and he was Shikes lecturer in civil liberties at the Harvard Law School in 1998.


More information
The Deepening Darkness

Patriarchy, Resistance, and Democracy’s Future

Carol Gilligan
New York University

David A. J. Richards
New York University
For Jim Gilligan and Donald Levy, our lovers, and the most loving of men
When men ceased to be equal, egotism replaced fellow-feeling and decency succumbed to violence. The result was despotism.

Tacitus. *The Annals of Imperial Rome*

It is because [Vergil] discovered and revealed the perennial shape of what truly destroys us – not because he accurately reflects the grandeurs and miseries of a crucial and dynamic age (as he does), not because he croons us gentle lullabies of culture reborn (as he does not) – that we continue to trust him to guide us through the dim mazes of our arrogance and fear.

W. R. Johnson. *Darkness Visible: A Study of Vergil’s Aeneid*

Abstract words such as glory, honor, courage, or hallow were obscene beside the concrete names of villages, the numbers of roads, the names of rivers, the numbers of regiments and the dates.

Ernest Hemingway. *A Farewell to Arms*
# Contents

*Acknowledgments*  
*Introduction and Overview* ................................ 1

**Part One: Roman Patriarchy: Entering the Darkness**

1 *Why Rome? Why Now?* ................................ 9

2 *Roman Patriarchy and Violence* ......................... 22

3 *Vergil on the Darkness Visible* .......................... 53

4 *Apuleius on Conversion* ................................. 82

5 *Augustine on Conversion* ................................. 102

**Part Two: Resistance Across Time and Culture**

6 *Resistance: Religion* ................................. 121

1. *The Historical Jesus* .............................. 122

2. *The Jews and Christian Anti-Semitism* ................ 129

3. *The Argument for Toleration* ........................ 137
   i. *Christian Resistance: Bayle and Locke* ........ 137
   ii. *Jewish Resistance: Spinoza* .................... 139

4. *Ethical Religion and Constitutional Rights* .......... 140
   i. *Radical Abolitionism* ............................ 141
   ii. *Martin Luther King, Jr.* ........................ 144
   iii. *Religion and the Values of Constitutional Democracy* 150

5. *The Legacy of Celibacy* ............................... 151
   i. *The Priest Sexual Abuse Scandal* ............... 151
   ii. *James Carroll on Resistance to War and to Anti-Semitism* 156
## Contents

7 Resistance: Psychology ........................................ 159
   1. Freud’s Opening and Closing to Women .......................... 160
   2. The Alternative Psychology of Ian D. Suttie .................. 190
   3. The Lens of Gender ............................................. 192

8 Resistance: The Artists ......................................... 198
   1. Why Art? ..................................................... 198
   2. Hemingway’s *A Farewell to Arms* .......................... 201
   3. Joyce’s *Ulysses* ........................................... 203
   4. Wharton’s *The Age of Innocence* .................................. 209
   5. Virginia Woolf’s *Mrs. Dalloway, To the Lighthouse,* and *Three Guineas* .......................... 213
   6. Lawrence’s *Lady Chatterley’s Lover* ...................... 217

9 Resistance: Politics ............................................... 225
   1. Between Patriarchy and Democracy: Contradictions in American Constitutionalism .......................... 225
   2. The Psychological Roots of Fascism and the Rebirth of Democratic Constitutionalism .................. 232
   3. Irrational Prejudice: Anti-Semitism as the Model for Racism, Sexism, and Homophobia ............... 238
   4. The Resistance Movements of the 1960s and Later .......................................................... 240
   5. Resistance to Fundamentalism in American Constitutional Law .......................... 243

Part Three: Democracy’s Future ..........................................

10 The Contemporary Scene ...................................... 249
   1. Impact of Western Colonialism in Asia and the Middle East .............. 249
   2. The War on Terror ............................................. 253
   3. Sexual Voice and the Interpretation of the 1960s .......................... 257

Conclusion .......................................................... 264

Notes ............................................................... 269
Bibliography ....................................................... 303
Index ............................................................... 325
Acknowledgments

This collaborative work arose from co-teaching a seminar on gender and democracy over the past seven years at the New York University School of Law. When we began teaching together, Carol was working on the book that would be published as *The Birth of Pleasure* (Alfred A. Knopf, 2002) and has been working since then both on a play inspired by *The Scarlet Letter* (performed in different versions in New York City and at the North Carolina School of the Arts) and on a novel, *Kyra*, published last year (Random House, 2008). She has also written a series of papers inspired by questions that came out of our seminar, including “Knowing and Not Knowing: Reflections on Manhood” (*Psychotherapy and Politics*, 2004); “Recovering Psyche: Reflections on Life History and History” (*Annual of Psychoanalysis*, 2004); and “When the Mind Leaves the Body…and Returns” (*Daedalus*, 2006). As a direct consequence of ongoing conversations in the seminar, David wrote *Tragic Manhood and Democracy: Verdi’s Voice and the Powers of Musical Art* (Sussex Academic Press, 2004); *Disarming Manhood: Roots of Ethical Resistance* (Swallow Press/Ohio University Press, 2005); *The Case for Gay Rights: From Bowers to Lawrence and Beyond* (Kansas University Press, 2005); and (with Nicholas Bamforth) *Patriarchal Religion, Sexuality, and Gender: A Critique of New Natural Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2008). Our collaborative work had been so creative for us singly that we naturally turned to writing a book together that would both clarify our method and show its fertility.

We had been discussing Roman literature and sources in our seminar for some time, but the inspiration for the current collaborative work arose from teaching a term in the fall of 2005 with Eva Cantarella, Professor of Roman Law, Milan University, who visited at the NYU School of Law as part of our Global Program. It was Eva who gave us the idea that Roman history might also support our argument, and, inspired by her insights, we undertook the research and writing that led to the current work. Eva also gave us invaluable bibliographical advice during the period of our
Acknowledgments

revision of the manuscript. We must thank not only Eva but Professor Joseph Weiler, who then headed our Global Program, for facilitating Eva’s teaching with us. We are especially in the debt of Simon Goldhill, Eve D’Ambra, and Judith Hallett, the three remarkable readers of our manuscript for Cambridge University Press, who encouraged our project and gave us invaluable suggestions for how to improve it both in general and in detail. We thank as well John Berger, our editor at Cambridge, who supported our project enthusiastically throughout and secured for us the excellent reader’s reports that guided our revision of the manuscript. We also wish to express our appreciation to Douglas Mitchell of University of Chicago Press for generously sharing with us a helpful reader’s report and acknowledge as well our debt to Phyllis Berk, a brilliant editor, who gave us invaluable advice on matters both organizational and stylistic. David’s assistant, Lavinia Barbu, rendered service above and beyond the call of duty in helping us prepare the bibliography, for which we are deeply grateful.

We both learned much from conversations with Normi Noel, Kristin Linklater, and Tina Packer and are in debt to Normi, in particular, for our understanding and use of Shakespeare’s Hamlet in this work. We thank the students and faculty who discussed our ideas and manuscript with us, as it developed in the seminar we taught in the fall term of 2006, to wit, Russell Ferri, Tiasha Palikovic, Dylan Yaeger, and Professor Cees Maris of Amsterdam University, who was visiting NYU as a Global Fellow; we thank as well the students who discussed the manuscript with us in the fall term of 2007, namely, Kristen Berg, Lauren Burke, Corey Callahan, Isaac Cheng, Edgar Cho, Matthew Dewitz, Rebecca Israel, Tamzin Kinnebrew, Justin Lee, Leah Lotto, Patricia Naftali, Beth Nash, and Yvette Russell. We are indebted to our colleagues Peggy Davis and Moshe Halbertal, to our friends Dana Jack and Wiktor Osiatinsky, and to our former students Maribel Morey and Zvi Triger for their illuminating comments on the manuscript. We are grateful as well for the helpful comments of members of the faculty of law at the National University of Singapore, in particular, Kumuralingam Amirthalingam, Simon Chesterman, and Arun Kumar Thiruvengadam. Finally, our thanks to John Sexton and Jerome Bruner for their wisdom in bringing us together.

The book was researched and written during sabbatical leaves and during summers, supported in part by generous research grants from the New York University School of Law Filomen D’Agostino and Max E. Greenberg Faculty Research Fund. Deans Richard Revesz and Mary Brabec also facilitated the teaching arrangements and leaves during 2006–07 that made research and writing of this book possible. We are grateful as well for the financial support of the School of Law for the professional editing and indexing of this work.
Acknowledgments

A work of this sort, so rooted in our personal lives, also arose in conversations with those closest to us, the two remarkable men, James Gilligan and Donald Levy, to whom we have dedicated this work.

Carol Gilligan and David A. J. Richards
March, 2008