Beyond Totalitarianism

In essays written jointly by specialists on Soviet and German history, the contributors to this book rethink and rework the nature of Stalinism and Nazism and establish a new methodology for viewing their histories that goes well beyond the now-outdated twentieth-century models of totalitarianism, ideology, and personality. Doing the labor of comparison gives us the means to ascertain the historicity of the two extraordinary regimes and the wreckage they have left. With the end of the Cold War and the collapse of the Soviet Union, scholars of Europe are no longer burdened with the political baggage that constricted research and conditioned interpretation and have access to hitherto closed archives. The time is right for a fresh look at the two gigantic dictatorships of the twentieth century and for a return to the original intent of thought on totalitarian regimes – understanding the intertwined trajectories of socialism and nationalism in European and global history.

Michael Geyer, Samuel N. Harper Professor of German and European History and director of the Human Rights Program at the University of Chicago, has a PhD from the Albert Ludwigs Universität Freiburg and was a Postdoctoral Fellow at the University of Oxford. He taught at the University of Michigan and as visiting professor in Bochum and Leipzig. He most recently wrote (with Konrad Jarausch) *Shattered Past: Reconstructing German History* and edited (with Lucian Höltscher) *Die Gegenwart Gottes in der modernen Gesellschaft* (2006). He has published extensively on the German military, war, and genocide as well as on resistance, terror, and religion. His current work focuses on defeat, nationalism, and self-destruction. He has been a Fellow at the American Academy in Berlin and the recipient of a Guggenheim Fellowship and a Humboldt Forschungspreis.

Sheila Fitzpatrick, the Bernadotte E. Schmitt Distinguished Service Professor in Modern Russian History at the University of Chicago, is the author of many books on Soviet social, cultural, and political history, including *The Russian Revolution, Stalin’s Peasants, Everyday Stalinism*, and, most recently, *Tear Off the Masks! Identity and Imposture in Twentieth-Century Russia* (2005). With Robert Gellately, she edited *Accusatory Practices: Denunciation in Modern European History, 1789–1989*. A past president of the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies (AAASS), she is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and the Australian Academy of the Humanities, as well as a regular contributor to the *London Review of Books*. Her current research topics include displaced persons in Europe after the Second World War. In 2008–9, she is a Fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg in Berlin.
Beyond Totalitarianism

Stalinism and Nazism Compared

MICHAEL GEYER
University of Chicago

SHEILA FITZPATRICK
University of Chicago
## Contents

*List of Contributors*  
*Acknowledgments*  

### 1 Introduction: After Totalitarianism – Stalinism and Nazism Compared  
*Michael Geyer with assistance from Sheila Fitzpatrick*  

### Part I: Governance  

#### 2 The Political (Dis)Orders of Stalinism and National Socialism  
*Yoram Gorlizki and Hans Mommsen*  

#### 3 Utopian Biopolitics: Reproductive Policies, Gender Roles, and Sexuality in Nazi Germany and the Soviet Union  
*David L. Hoffmann and Annette F. Timm*  

### Part II: Violence  

#### 4 State Violence – Violent Societies  
*Christian Gerlach and Nicolas Werth*  

#### 5 The Quest for Order and the Pursuit of Terror: National Socialist Germany and the Stalinist Soviet Union as Multiethnic Empires  
*Jörg Baberowski and Anselm Doering-Manteuffel*  

### Part III: Socialization  

#### 6 Frameworks for Social Engineering: Stalinist Schema of Identification and the Nazi Volksgemeinschaft  
*Christopher R. Browning and Lewis H. Siegelbaum*  

#### 7 Energizing the Everyday: On the Breaking and Making of Social Bonds in Nazism and Stalinism  
*Sheila Fitzpatrick and Alf Lüdtke*
Contents

8 The New Man in Stalinist Russia and Nazi Germany 302
   Peter Fritzsche and Jochen Hellbeck

PART IV: ENTANGLEMENTS

9 States of Exception: The Nazi-Soviet War as a System of Violence, 1939–1945 345
   Mark Edele and Michael Geyer

10 Mutual Perceptions and Projections: Stalin’s Russia in Nazi Germany – Nazi Germany in the Soviet Union 396
   Katerina Clark and Karl Schlögel

Works Cited 443
Index 517
Contributors

Jörg Baberowski is Professor of Eastern European History at the Humboldt-University Berlin. He is currently working on a book project, Stalin: Karriere eines Gewalttäters.

Christopher R. Browning is the Frank Porter Graham Professor of History at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Among his recent publications is The Origins of the Final Solution: The Evolution of Nazi Jewish Policy, September 1939–March 1942 (2004).

Katerina Clark is Professor of Comparative Literature and of Slavic Languages and Literatures. She is working on a book tentatively titled Moscow: The Fourth Rome.

Anselm Doering-Manteuffel is Professor of Contemporary History, University of Tübingen. He is working on a book with the title Deutsche Geschichte des 20. Jahrhunderts.

Mark Edele is Senior Lecturer in History at the University of Western Australia. His book on Soviet Second World War veterans is due to appear from Oxford University Press.

Sheila Fitzpatrick is Bernadotte E. Schmitt Distinguished Service Professor in Modern Russian History at the University of Chicago. Her recent publications include Tear Off the Masks! Identity and Imposture in Twentieth-Century Russia, and she is currently working on a project on displaced persons in Germany after the Second World War.

Peter Fritzsche is Professor of History at the University of Illinois. He has just published Life and Death in the Third Reich (2008).

Christian Gerlach is Associate Professor of History at the University of Pittsburgh and in transition to the Professur für Zeitgeschichte at the University of Bern. His current research projects include “Extremely Violent Societies: Mass

Michael Geyer is Samuel N. Harper Professor of German and European History at the University of Chicago. He is completing a book titled Catastrophic Nationalism: Defeat and Self-destruction in Germany, 1918 and 1945.

Yoram Gorlizki is Professor of Politics at the University of Manchester. He is currently completing two monographs, one on the Soviet justice system from 1948 to 1964 and the other, with Oleg Khlevniuk, on Soviet regional politics from 1945 to 1970.

Jochen Hellbeck is Associate Professor of History at Rutgers University. He is currently working on a study of the battle of Stalingrad as it was experienced on the ground level on both sides of the front.

David L. Hoffmann is Professor of History at The Ohio State University. He is currently completing a monograph entitled Cultivating the Masses: Soviet Social Interventionism in Its International Context, 1914–1939.

Alf Lüdtke is Professor of Historical Anthropology at the University of Erfurt and Research Fellow of the Max-Planck-Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnical Diversity in Göttingen. He is currently completing a book project titled Work: Production and Destruction. Vignettes on the 20th Century.

Hans Mommsen is Professor Emeritus of Modern History at the Ruhr-University Bochum. His numerous publications on the Weimar Republic, the Third Reich, and Democratic Socialism include The Rise and Fall of the Weimar Democracy, Alternatives to Hitler, and From Weimar to Auschwitz.

Karl Schlögel is Professor of East European History at the Europa Universität Viadrina in Frankfurt/Oder. Among his recent publications are the edited volumes Sankt Petersburg: Schauplätze eine Stadtgeschichte and Oder-Odra: Blicke auf einen europäischen Strom and the paperback edition of Berlin Ostbahnhof Europas: Russen und Deutsche in ihrem Jahrhundert (all 2007).

Lewis H. Siegelbaum is Professor of History at Michigan State University. His most recent publication is Cars for Comrades: The Life of the Soviet Automobile.

Annette F. Timm is Assistant Professor of History at the University of Calgary, Alberta, Canada. She is in the process of publishing a monograph tentatively entitled The Politics of Fertility in Twentieth-Century Berlin: Sexual Citizenship in Marriage Counseling and Venereal Disease Control.

Nicolas Werth is Directeur de recherche at the CNRS (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique) in Paris, at the Institut d'Histoire du Temps Présent. He is author of Cannibal Island: Death in a Siberian Gulag, La Terreur et le Désarroi: Staline et son système, and Les Années Staline.
Acknowledgments

This project was originally conceived as a joint undertaking by the two editors and Terry Martin (co-organizer 2002–3). Our plan was to gather two sets of experts, one on German history and the other on Soviet history, and pair them in the study of particular aspects of the Nazi-Stalinist comparison. Papers were to be jointly written and presented to the whole group at workshops and conferences to be held over a period of several years. The first two meetings were held in Cambridge on May 3–5, 2002, and May 2–4, 2003, and the third and fourth in Chicago on April 30–May 2, 2004, and May 20–21, 2005. The core group of participants, authors of the studies published in this volume, attended all four meetings. Other attendees at single meetings were Robert Gellately, Julie Hessler, Peter Holquist, Oleg Khlevniuk, Cornelia Rauh-Kühne, and Ronald Grigor Suny. Mark Edele joined the project as Michael Geyer’s coauthor in 2007.

The project was made possible by generous support from the Davis Center for Russian Studies at Harvard, the University of Chicago, and the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, through its 2002 Distinguished Achievement Award to Sheila Fitzpatrick. Warm thanks for organizational and practical support are due to Helen Grigoriev and Ann Sjostedt of the Davis Center and Emma Gilligan at the University of Chicago.

The editors thank the Modern European History Workshop of the University of Chicago and the Midwest Russian Historians’ Workshop, held at De Paul University in October 2004, for helpful discussion of earlier drafts of the Introduction. We would also like to acknowledge the research assistance of Leah Goldberg and Barry Haneberg in translating and editing parts of the manuscript. Kimba Tichenor did invaluable work as the main editorial and research assistant during the last stages of the project. We are particularly grateful for the comments of the two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press and for the support of two dedicated editors at the Press, Eric Crahan and Lewis Bateman.
Beyond Totalitarianism