

## Index

---

- abilities  
  justice and 61
- abortion 95, 116
- action  
  autonomous acts 12, 19, 45, 91  
  freedom of 12  
  offensive actions 35
- actual bodily harm 153
- agency 44, 136, 137, 244, 261  
  autonomy and 23–4, 235  
  future selves and 39, 41  
  model of information 227  
  moral 75, 76
- agreements  
  consent as 112, 126, 142, 263
- arbitrary claims 13
- Arneson, R. J. 54
- Association of Anaesthetists 106
- autonomy 9, 45, 48, 53, 111, 139, 215, 222, 227, 261  
  action for harm to 197, 202  
  autonomous acts 12, 19, 45, 91  
  autonomous persons 12, 19, 45  
  children 75  
  consent and 41–5, 46, 144, 261, 264  
    relational model 232  
  etymology 10  
  failure to lead autonomous life 26  
  justice and 58, 59–63  
  limits of 29–30, 46  
    future selves 38–41  
    harm principle 30–3, 36  
    other limiting principles 33–5  
    protection of future autonomy 36–8  
  locus of control and 91  
  mandatory 97–101  
  as moral basis for consent 41–5  
  nature of 9–11  
  paternalism and 55  
  professional–patient relationships and 76, 80, 84, 86, 90, 94–5  
  protection of future autonomy 36–8
- relational model 235, 247, 266  
  as self-determination 11–13  
    as moral rational self-determination 17–22, 45  
    as rational self-determination 13–17, 45, 59  
  value of 23–9, 46
- Barilan, Y. M. 85
- battery 150–2, 190, 191–6, 218, 238, 260, 265, 266  
  consent and 153–4, 195, 222, 237
- Beauchamp, T. L. 56, 57, 129
- behaviour  
  justice and 62  
  professional–patient relationships and 94
- beneficence principle 48, 49–51, 56, 70, 223, 237, 261, 263  
  paternalism and 51  
  professional–patient relationships and 88, 89, 90, 92
- Berg, J. W. 208
- best interests of patients 207
- Biegler, P. 127–8
- bioethics 260
- Bolam* test 164–5, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 172, 198, 203, 208  
  *Bolitho* case and 172–7
- Brazier, M. 173, 176, 177, 206
- breach of consent 238, 259
- Bristol Royal Infirmary Inquiry 69
- British Medical Association (BMA) 49
- Brock, D. W. 51
- burden of proof  
  battery 153
- Burkitt Wright, E. 93
- capacity *see* competence and capacity  
  care 74, 203  
  delivery of care 106, 225–6  
  holistic approach to care 107

- professional–patient relationships and
  - 89, 90, 103, 125, 162
  - standard of 167–8, 169–83, 198, 204, 265
  - team approach to care 107
- carelessness 209
- categorical imperative 20, 21, 227
- causation 200, 213, 259
  - disclosure of information and 183–4, 190
  - content of test 187–8
  - nature of test 184–7, 200
- caveat emptor* 108
- challenging decisions 83, 89, 204
- chance
  - loss of 197
- children
  - autonomy 75
  - parental involvement in decisions about 128
  - refusal of consent 132
  - refusal of treatment 210
  - relationships with 75
- Childress, J. F. 56, 57, 129
- choice
  - consent as 124–7
- codes of practice 217–18, 246
- coercion 158, 229, 237
- collateral risks 161–2
- common law
  - problems of 214–16, 219, 224, 266
- communication 81, 244
  - consent and 119, 120, 121, 143, 145, 223, 228, 232, 234, 267
  - professional–patient relationships 244
  - trust and 244
- communitarianism 10, 11, 108, 222
  - health service delivery and 225, 226
- compassion 74, 103
- competence and capacity
  - for autonomy 37, 38, 60, 140
  - to benefit 62
  - consent and 140–1, 154–6, 193, 241
  - emergency treatment 253
  - for rationality 19
  - refusal of treatment and 210, 212
- complaints system 214
- compulsory testing and treatment 82
- conduit model of information 230
- confidence
  - loss of 91
- conscience
  - rights of 95
- consent 9, 62, 67, 69, 72, 79, 110, 142–3, 222, 262
  - absent 146
  - addressing gap between practice and principle 217–18
  - as agreement 112, 126, 142, 263
  - answering questions and 168–9, 236, 245, 246
  - autonomy and 41–5, 46, 144, 261, 264
  - relational model 232
  - battery 153–4, 195, 222, 237
  - breach of consent 238, 259
  - as choice 124–7
  - competence and 140–1, 154–6, 193, 241
  - definition 110–13, 121
  - development of law 220–1
    - cycle of criticism and scope for further development 221–5
  - disclosure of information and 163–9, 190
  - duration 124
  - effect of 255–7
  - emergency treatment and 208, 253–5
  - form of 255
  - ineffective 146
  - information, knowledge and risk 134–9
  - informed 41–2, 125, 151, 160, 193, 199, 216, 217, 226
  - legal regulation *see* legal regulation of consent
  - limits to 122, 235
  - Manson and O’Neill’s model of genuine consent 226–31, 232, 267
  - as mental state 113, 114, 119, 121, 124, 142, 234
  - model 143, 191
  - nature and function of consent to medical treatment 113–22, 141–2
  - negligence and 162–3, 196–209
    - Sidaway* case and standard of disclosure 163–9
    - standard of care 167–8, 169–83, 198
  - non-treatment and 127–9, 182–3, 212–13, 234, 258
  - obligation to facilitate understanding and good decision-making 246–50
  - outcome responsibility and 118, 119, 232, 236, 256–7, 264
  - as permission 113, 115, 126, 142, 234, 255–7, 263
  - power and control and 133–4
  - presumed 145
  - problems of common law 214–16, 219, 224, 266
  - process of 122–4, 241–6
  - professional–patient relationships and 76
  - real 159–62, 194

## 292 Index

- consent (*cont.*)  
 refusal 130–2, 143, 146, 257–8, 264  
 relational model 231–3, 247, 266  
   implementation 233  
 shared decision-making and 129–30  
 therapeutic privilege 183, 202, 205, 206, 208  
 voluntariness and 139–40, 156–9  
 waiver of right to 100, 123, 264
- consequences 48
- consequentialism 54
- constructivist model of decision-making 14
- consultation process 217
- context dependence 229
- control 90  
   consent and 133–4  
   locus of 91  
   over information 236, 243
- controversial treatments 204
- cooperation  
   professional–patient relationships and 92
- corporal punishment 158
- corrective justice 63, 64, 202
- cosmetic treatments 239
- counselling 179, 180, 181
- critical self-reflection 18
- damage 188–9, 196
- damages 128, 188
- day surgery 106
- deception 85, 87, 90
- decision-making  
   rationality and 14
- defensive approach to consent 106
- deferring decisions 82
- delays 242
- delivery of care 106, 225–6
- deontology 68
- Department of Health 106
- dependency 100, 222
- determinism 10, 18, 25, 26
- development of law 220–1  
   cycle of criticism and scope for further development 221–5
- Dickenson, D. 65
- disclosure of information 134, 174, 190, 193, 201, 203, 204, 213, 218, 224  
   causation and 183–4, 190  
   content of test 187–8  
   nature of test 184–7, 200  
   emergency treatment and 208, 253–5  
   exceptions 253–5  
   genuine consent model 229–31  
   measuring outcome 250–3
- obligation to facilitate understanding and good decision-making 246–50
- relevance 241
- Sidaway* case and standard of disclosure 163–9  
   timing of 56  
   understanding and 177–80, 193
- dishonesty 237
- distress  
   information likely to cause 207, 208
- distributive justice 63, 125, 202
- doctor–patient relationships *see*  
   professional–patient relationships
- duration of consent 124
- duress 229
- Dworkin, Gerald 10, 39
- education 105
- Eekelaar, J. 77
- effect of consent 255–7
- emergency treatment 243  
   consent and 208, 253–5
- empathy 74, 78, 79
- equality  
   justice and 57, 61
- ethics 214, 224  
   bioethics 260  
   virtue ethics 67–70, 71
- experts 43  
   expert evidence 170, 199
- explanation of decisions 96, 146
- factory model of care 108
- false consciousness argument for mandatory autonomy 99
- Feinberg, J. 32
- fiduciary relationships 74
- Ford, Henry 38
- form of consent 255
- fraud 229, 237
- future  
   development of law 220–1  
   cycle of criticism and scope for further development 221–5  
   future selves 38–41  
   legal regulation 220  
   proposed principles 234–6, 237–41  
   protection of future autonomy 36–8
- garrison model 32
- Gaut, B. 14
- Gauthier, C. C. 17
- General Medical Council (GMC) 214, 218
- general risk 166
- genetic counselling 83

- genuine consent model 226–31, 232, 267
- Giesen, D. 186
- Gill, R. 125
- Gillon, R. 111
- goals 53
- good life 14, 34
- goods 27
- government and the state 28, 216, 257
  - healthcare systems and 108
  - justice and 58
- Grubb, A. 183
- guilt 86
- harm principle 30–3, 36, 60
- Harris, J. 132
- Hayes, J. 186
- Hayry, M. 34
- Helsinki Declaration 119
- Heywood, R. 217
- Hippocratic Oath 49
- holistic approach to care 107
- Honoré, T. 64
- Hume, David 15, 20
- humility 104
- Hurd, H. M. 114, 115, 116
- identity
  - autonomy and 26, 99
  - future selves 38–41
  - real consent and 161–2
- indemnity 257
- indeterminacy 67
- information 80, 82
  - agency model 227
  - conduit model 230
  - consent and 134–9
  - control over 236, 243
  - disclosure *see* disclosure of information
  - likely to cause distress 207, 208
  - misinterpretation 87
  - misunderstanding 86
  - overburdening with 230
  - questions 168–9, 236, 245, 246
  - understanding *see* understanding
  - waiver of right to 100, 201–2, 207, 245, 251, 264
- informed consent 41–2, 125, 151, 160, 193, 199, 216, 217, 226
- institutions 73
  - professional–patient relationships and 106–7
- instrumental approach to rationality 15, 222
- instrumental value of autonomy 27
- insurance 257
- integrity 104
- intention
  - consent as 114
- Internet 80
- interpretation 67, 68
- irrationality 52, 53, 55, 82, 96, 198
- Jones, M. A. 173, 214
- justice 57–9, 70, 71, 104, 262
  - autonomy and 58, 59–63
  - corrective justice 63, 64, 202
  - distributive justice 63, 125, 202
  - resources and 58, 61–3
  - responsibility and 58, 63–7
- Kant, Immanuel 15, 16, 17, 20, 21, 22, 44, 222, 227
- Kennedy, I. 205
- knowledge
  - consent and 134–9
- Korsgaard, C. M. 16, 39, 40
- Kuczewski, M. 122
- language 67
- Law Commission
  - competence/capacity and 154
- legal regulation of consent 149–50, 190, 191, 195, 218, 233, 260, 265, 266
- future 220
  - obligation to facilitate understanding and good decision-making 246–50
  - proposed principles 234–6, 237–41
  - regulation of process 241–6
  - negligence and 162–3
- legislation 217, 268–9
- Levi, B. H. 28, 37
- liabilities 258–9
- liberalism
  - autonomy and 10, 11, 15, 18, 44, 202, 216, 260
  - consent and 223, 226, 260
- libertarianism 80
  - autonomy and 10, 11, 18, 44, 222, 226
- limits
  - autonomy 29–30, 46
  - future selves 38–41
  - harm principle 30–3, 36
  - other limiting principles 33–5
  - protection of future autonomy 36–8
  - consent 122, 235
- locus of control 91
- logical argument for mandatory autonomy 100

## 294 Index

- loss of chance claim 197
- luck 118
- lying 22, 87
- Maclean, M. 77
- mandatory autonomy 97–101
- manipulation 85, 86, 87, 90
- Manson, Neil C. 15, 21, 44, 45, 46, 136, 137, 138, 139, 225, 237, 243, 244, 246, 266
  - model of genuine consent 226–31, 232, 267
- market systems 107, 225, 226
- marriage 77
- May, T. 95
- McKinstry, B. 81
- medical treatment 35
  - beneficence principle 48, 49–51, 56, 70, 223, 237, 261, 263
  - paternalism and 51
  - professional–patient relationships and 88, 89, 90, 92
  - consent to *see* consent
  - controversial treatments 204
  - doctor–patient relationships *see* professional–patient relationships
  - experts 43
    - expert evidence 170, 199
  - medically indicated 95
  - moral luck and 65
  - paternalism and 52–4, 56, 57
  - recommending treatment 205
  - risk of *see* risk
- Meisel, A. 122
- mental illness
  - consent and 153
  - information likely to cause distress 207
  - refusal of treatment and 211
- mental state
  - consent as 113, 114, 119, 121, 124, 142, 234
- Mill, J. S. 27, 30, 34, 35, 38, 83
- Miola, J. 173, 176, 177
- misinterpretation 86, 87
- mistakes
  - learning and 34
  - paternalism and 52
- misunderstanding 86, 178
- Montgomery, J. 73, 173
- moral luck 65
- moral responsibility 78
- moral status
  - children 75
- morality
  - autonomy and 23, 25, 34
  - autonomy as moral basis for consent 41–5
  - moral argument for mandatory autonomy 99–100
  - moral rational self-determination 17–22, 45
- murder
  - consent and 116
- Murphy, L. B. 59
- National Audit Office 214
- National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE) 88
- necessity defence 154
- Nedelsky, J. 18
- negligence 127–8, 191–6, 215, 218, 229, 265, 266
  - causation and 183–4, 190
  - content of test 187–8
  - nature of test 184–7, 200
  - consent and 162–3, 196–209
    - Sidaway* case and standard of disclosure 163–9
    - standard of care 167–8, 169–83, 198
    - legally recognised damage 188–9
- neo-Humeans 15, 20, 222
- NHS Redress scheme 215
- no-fault compensation system 119
- non-interference 246
- non-maleficence principle 48
  - professional–patient relationships and 88
- non-reciprocal relationships 93
- non-treatment 127–9, 182–3, 212–13, 234, 258
- novel claims 215
- Nursing and Midwifery Council (NMC) 218
- offensive actions 35
- O'Neill, Onora 15, 17, 21, 23, 44, 45, 46, 136, 137, 138, 139, 222, 225, 237, 243, 244, 246, 266
  - model of genuine consent 226–31, 232, 267
- outcome responsibility
  - consent and 118, 119, 232, 236, 256–7, 264
  - justice and 58, 63–7
- overriding decisions 54, 250
- Parfit, D. 36, 38, 39, 40
- paternalism 51–7, 60, 69, 70, 111, 167, 207, 220, 221, 224
- Patients Association 260
- Pellegrino, E. D. 69

- permission  
   consent and 113, 115, 126, 142, 234, 255–7, 263
- persuasion 84, 87, 96, 156, 247, 266  
   professional's duty to persuade 180–2
- politics  
   consent and 107
- power  
   consent and 133–4  
   professional–patient relationships and 81, 87, 90, 94, 95, 145, 241
- pressure for change 222
- presumed consent 145
- prisoners  
   consent and 158
- privacy 242
- private treatment 127
- privilege  
   therapeutic 183, 202, 205, 206, 208
- procedural dependency 100
- professionalism 102–5
- professional–patient relationships 72–9, 108–9, 111, 112, 120, 215, 232, 234, 262, 269  
   communication and 244  
   consent and 225  
   duty of care 89, 90, 103, 125, 162  
   external factors 105–8  
   obligation to facilitate understanding and good decision-making 246–50  
   patient's obligations 93–7, 143  
   mandatory autonomy and 97–101  
   power and 81, 87, 90, 94, 95, 145, 241  
   professional's obligations 79–93  
   virtue of professionalism and professional virtues 102–5  
   virtuous patient 101–2
- prophylaxis argument for mandatory autonomy 98
- prudence 104  
   prudent–patient standard 164, 167, 168, 200, 206, 221, 251
- public-health concerns 153
- public interests 32
- questions  
   answering 168–9, 236, 245, 246
- rape  
   consent and 115, 121
- rationality 33, 222, 223  
   autonomy as rational self-determination 13–17, 45, 59  
   definition 13  
   rational self-reflection 26
- reaction 24
- real consent 159–62, 194
- reasons for decisions 248–50
- recognitional model of decision-making 14
- recognitional rationality 222, 223
- recommending treatment 205
- reductionism 36
- refusal of treatment 83, 95, 126, 150, 209–12  
   non-treatment 127–9, 182–3, 212–13, 234, 258  
   refusal of consent 130–2, 143, 146, 257–8, 264  
   religious grounds 159, 210  
   withholding treatment 127–9
- regulation 233, 265  
   consent 149–50, 190, 191, 195, 218, 233, 260, 265, 266  
   future 220  
   negligence and 162–3  
   obligation to facilitate understanding and good decision-making 246–50  
   proposed principles 234–6, 237–41  
   regulation of process 241–6
- relational dependence 222
- relational model of consent 231–3, 247, 266  
   implementation 233
- relationships *see* professional–patient relationships
- religion  
   refusal of treatment and 159
- remedies 258–9  
   damages 128, 188
- research  
   consent and 118, 151, 239
- resources 127
- justice and 58, 61–3
- respect  
   professional–patient relationships and 78, 94
- responsibility  
   consent and 118, 119, 232, 236, 256–7, 264  
   justice and 58, 63–7  
   moral 78
- Richards, D. A. J. 25
- rights 133  
   bodily integrity 234  
   consent and 117, 122, 124, 227, 231, 235  
   *see also* self-determination
- risk 54, 69, 95, 260  
   collateral risks 161–2

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89693-1 - Autonomy, Informed Consent and Medical Law: A Relational Challenge  
Alasdair Maclean

Index

[More information](#)

## 296 Index

- risk (*cont.*)  
 consent and 134–9  
 disclosure of information and 163–9,  
 174, 190, 193  
 failure to disclose 256  
 general 166  
 material 164  
 specific 166
- Robertson, G. 207
- Rössler, B. 26
- Schneider, C. 97, 98, 99, 100
- second opinions 213
- self-determination 10, 28, 37, 45, 99, 207,  
 221, 223, 227  
 autonomy as 11–13  
 as moral rational self-determination  
 17–22, 45  
 as rational self-determination 13–17,  
 45, 59  
 legal right 149  
 paternalism and 52
- self-fulfilment 28
- self-help groups 94
- self-knowledge 27
- self-reflection  
 critical 18  
 rational 26
- self-regulation 233
- shared decision-making  
 consent and 129–30
- Skegg, P. D. G. 173
- social conditioning 105
- specific risk 166
- Stirrat, G.M. 125
- Stone, J. 57
- submission  
 consent and 113
- substantive dependency 100
- Szasz, T. 48
- Taylor, J. S. 41, 42, 43, 44, 46
- team approach to care 107
- temperance 104
- test results 57
- therapeutic argument for mandatory  
 autonomy 98–9
- therapeutic privilege 183, 202, 205, 206,  
 208
- Thomasma, D. C. 69
- threats 156
- time constraints 242
- timing of disclosure of information 56
- tolerance 104
- tort law 216
- trust  
 communication and 244  
 professional–patient relationships and  
 77, 90, 92, 93, 97, 105
- unaffordable treatment 127
- understanding  
 disclosure of information and 177–80,  
 193  
 misunderstanding 86, 178  
 obligation to facilitate understanding and  
 good decision-making 246–50
- undue influence 158
- universalisability constraint 17
- US President's Commission 130
- utility 88
- values 53
- virtues 262  
 virtue ethics 67–70, 71  
 virtue of professionalism and  
 professional virtues 102–5  
 virtuous patient 101–2
- voluntariness  
 consent and 139–40, 156–9
- vulnerability 94
- waiver  
 of right to consent 100, 123, 264  
 of right to information 100, 201–2, 207,  
 245, 251, 264
- Weintraub, M. 85
- welfare need 62
- withholding treatment 127–9
- witnesses  
 expert evidence 170, 199
- Wolf, S. 24
- wrong acts  
 consent and 116, 117