

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89599-6 - Emergencies and the Limits of Legality

Edited by Victor Ramraj

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

- Abu Ghraib incident, 67–8
- Ackerman, Bruce, and
 supermajoritarian model, 86,
 219, 232, 236–8, 248–9
 critiques by Dyzenhaus and Gross,
 280–6
- Act of Indemnity, 46–8, 66, 71–3,
 75
- Agamben, Giorgio, 61–2, 346–54; *see*
 ‘bare life’
- agency, 156–71
- anti-terrorist measures
 globalisation v territoriality, 368–73
 international, 365–6
 as legal black hole, 367–8
 and prescriptive legal positivism,
 201–28
 and support for dissident groups,
 177–86
- Arendt, Hannah, 345–54, 356–7
- ‘bare life’, 23, 337–54, 359; *see also*
 Agamben, Giorgio meaning,
 348
- Benton, Lauren, 354–6, 366–7
- Black, Charles, 66
- Bybee Memo, 396–8
- Catilinarian conspiracy as example *see*
 Cicero, Marcus Tullius
- Chatterjee, Partha, 344–6
- Cicero, Marcus Tullius, 69–71, 77–8, 92
- Civil Contingencies Act 2004 (UK),
 238–40
- civil disobedience compared with
 extra-legal action, 113
- civil liberties *see under* human rights
- colonial perspectives on legality, 22,
 337–59
 and Gross-Dyzenhaus debate, 341–4
 ‘jurisdictional politics’ *see*
 ‘jurisdictional politics’
 racial factors in colonial
 administration, 344–6
 ‘rule of colonial difference’, 344–6,
 354–6
- combatant status review tribunals
 (CSRT), 153–5
- common law, history of extra-legal
 action in, 191–4
- ‘compulsion of legality’ *see* rule of law
 model, Dyzenhaus’s
- constitutional government, basis in
 legality, 3–4
- ‘constitutional / legal speciality’,
 369–73
- constraints on power, 64
 agency, 156–71
 constitutional constraints, 148–9,
 278–86
 emergency statutes *see* emergency
 statutes
 ‘escalating cascade of
 supermajorities’ (ECS) *see*
 Ackerman, Bruce
- ex post* ratification and covert
 operations, 316–18
- informal constraints, 13–14, 156–71
- judicial responses to extra-legal
 action, 19–22
- of judiciary, 149–51
- mitigation of legal sanctions, 21–2,
 327–32
- moral constraints, 10–11

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89599-6 - Emergencies and the Limits of Legality

Edited by Victor Ramraj

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

409

- moral force within institutions, 157–61
 - ‘moralized politics’, 13
 - ‘ordinary law of emergencies’, 18
 - people’s role in *ex post* ratification, 44–5, 64, 66–8, 115–17, 318–27; *see under* people, role of the
 - political constraints, 145–55
 - ‘moralized politics’, 13
 - ‘prescriptive legal positivism’ *see* prescriptive legal positivism (PLP)
 - presidentialism, challenge of *see* presidentialism
 - prospective legal constraints, 16–19
 - ELM and, 85–91
 - shift between formal and informal power, 167
- covert operations and *ex post* ratification, 316–18
- ‘culture of justification’, meaning of, 14
- derogation from human rights
 - commitments, 229–46, 254–7
 - in American law, 246–9
 - in British law, 251–3
 - in Canadian law, 249–51
 - criteria for, 207
- Dicey, A V (Albert Venn), 46–52, 57, 66, 71–3, 75, 191–4, 339
- disaster
 - meaning of ‘disaster’, 208
 - natural disasters and emergency powers, 231–4
- dissident groups
 - effect of anti-terrorist measures on, 177–86
 - ‘terrorist organisation’, meaning of, 201–2
 - viewpoint on extra-legal action, 15, 172–98
- Duiker, K Sello, 339
- Dworkin, Ronald, 137–8
- Dyzenhaus, David *see* rule of law model, Dyzenhaus’s
- Emergencies Act (Canadian), 240–3
- emergency *see* state of emergency
- emergency powers *see also* extra-legal action
 - authorisation of, PLP as to, 213–22
 - design of institutions as factor in control of, 278–86
 - and human rights, 231–4
 - and natural disasters, 231–4
 - in non-violent emergencies, 229–57
 - and presidentialism, 258–86
 - requirements for safe, 165–6
 - risk management approach to, 379–82
 - seepage into legal system, 244–6
- emergency statutes, 229–57
 - American, 235–8
 - British, 238–40
 - Canadian, 240–3
- ‘escalating cascade of supermajorities’ (ECS) *see* Ackerman, Bruce
- ex post* ratification
 - and covert operations, 316–18
 - and ELM *see under* extra-legal measures model (ELM)
 - people’s role in *see under* people, role of the
- exception, state of, 61–2; *see also* Schmitt, Carl, on the sovereign and the exception meaning, 147–8
- extra-legal action *see also* anti-terrorist measures; emergency powers; indefinite detention; torture
 - acknowledgement by officials, ELM as to, 81–5
 - common law doctrines of (history of), 191–4
 - compared with civil disobedience, 113
 - constraints on *see* constraints on power
 - covert operations and *ex post* ratification, 316–18
 - defence of *see* necessity, defence of dissident groups’ viewpoint, 15, 172–98
 - and human rights, 159, 161–6
 - judicial responses to extra-legal action, 19–22

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89599-6 - Emergencies and the Limits of Legality

Edited by Victor Ramraj

Index

[More information](#)

410

INDEX

- extra-legal action (*cont.*)
 justifying, 106, 111–17, 176–7
 use of language, 115
 moral constraints, 10–11
 morality of flexible responses to
 emergencies, 159, 161–6
 necessity as defence for *see* necessity,
 defence of
 objective test, 124–5
 people's role in sanctioning *see*
 people, role of the
 subjective test, 122–9
 violating laws of war, case for,
 105–8
 violating moral rules, justification
 for, 108–10
- extra-legal measures model (ELM), 7,
 12, 16–19, 40–2; *see also*
 Gross-Dyzenhaus debate
 and acknowledgement of actions by
 officials, 81–5
 contrast with rule of law model,
 33–59
 critiques of, 13–15, 18–19, 21, 23–4,
 112–17, 145–7, 170, 187–94
 and Dicey's legality model, 46–52
 and duty of public officials, 113
 and *ex post* ratification
 Abu Ghraib incident as example,
 67–8
 Catilinarian conspiracy as
 example, 69–71, 77–8, 92
 effectiveness in cases of covert
 action, 316–18
 effects, 69–71
 'Jamaica affair' as example, 48–50,
 79–80, 339–40, 374–8
 legal black hole, whether, 71–81
 methods, 65–9
 people's role *see* people, role of the
 Pinochet affair as example, 76
 'extra-legal', meaning of, 113
 intended audience, 27
 and international action against
 abuses, 76–7
 as legal black hole, 11–12, 61–4,
 71–81
 and Locke's prerogative theory, 42–6
- 'may act illegally', meaning of,
 113–14
 and National Emergencies Act,
 235–8
 'necessary', meaning of, 114–15
 and presidentialism, 268–73
 and prospective constraints, 85–91
 and seepage of emergency powers,
 244–6
 sociological perspective on,
 187–94
 and torture, 20–2, 67–8
 and uncertainty, 72–81
 and unlegalisable actions, 52–6
 comparison with other
 approaches, 289–313
- Fuller, Lon, 131–5
- Geneva Conventions
 and human rights, 392
 whether applicable in domestic law,
 388–9
 whether applicable to terrorist
 organisations, 390–2
- Goldsmith, Jack, 78, 80
- Gross-Dyzenhaus debate
 colonial perspectives on, 341–4
 on international legality,
 399–404
 on legal black holes, 11–12
 and laws of war, 385–407
 PLP as to, 222–8
 and presidentialism, 278–86
 on prospective legal constraints,
 16–17
 summary, 7–8
 and supermajoritarian escalator
 model, 280–6
- Gross, Oren *see* extra-legal measures
 model
- Guha, Ranajit, 346
- habeas corpus*, suspension of writ of,
 148–9, 240
 in American law, 246–9
 in British law, 251–3
 in Canadian law, 249–51

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89599-6 - Emergencies and the Limits of Legality

Edited by Victor Ramraj

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

411

- Hamdan, Salim Ahmed (Hamdan v Rumsfeld), 387–96
- Hamdi, Yaser Esam (Hamdi v Rumsfeld), 376–7
- Hart, H L A (Herbert Lionel Adolphus), 56–7, 130–1, 149
- Hobbes, Thomas, 57
- human rights
and choice of most moral means, 159, 161–6
civil liberties, PLP as to, 216–17
criteria for derogation from commitments, 207
derogation from *see* derogation from human rights commitments
and emergency powers, 231–4
and Geneva Conventions, 392
- ‘Identity Thesis’, 36
- ‘Ilbert Bill Affair’, 345–54
- indefinite detention
and judiciary, 122–9
legality and, 53, 118–41
operation in Malaysia and Singapore, 119–29
and rule of law model, 135–6
subjective test, 122–9
whether legalisable, 135–1
- institutions
controlling flexibility and agency in, 166–7
flexibility of response to emergencies, 159, 161–6
importance of structure for control of emergency power, 278–86
theories of, 157–61
- instrumental laws, 99–102
- international perspectives, 22–4
anti-terrorist measures, 365–6
colonial perspectives *see* colonial perspectives on legality
globalisation v territoriality as to anti-terrorist measures, 368–73
indefinite detention in Malaysia and Singapore, 118–41
international prosecution of abuses and ELM, 76–7
- international state of emergency, 27–8, 360–84
- iustitium*, 62, 69–71
- ‘Jamaica affair’, 48–50, 79–80, 339–40, 374–8
- Jefferson, Thomas, 66–7, 78–9, 113
- judicial review
and indefinite detention, 123–9
PLP as to, 219–22
- judiciary
authorisation of emergency powers, PLP as to, 213–22
constraints on, 149–51
defence of legality, 5–6, 50–1
and indefinite detention, 122–9
and objective test, 124–5
response to extra-legal action, 19–22
and sovereignty, 148–51
- ‘jurisdictional politics’, 23, 337–56, 359
- and international state of emergency, 364–73
- and rule of law model, 373–4
- Kant, Immanuel, 159, 161–6
- Kelsen, Hans, 36
- language
used to justify action, 115
- ‘lawless void’ *see* legal black holes
- laws of war
case for violating in emergency, 105–8
as legal black hole, 385–407
- legal black hole, 11–12, 152–5
anti-terrorist measures as, 367–8
comparison of different approaches to, 289–313
ELM as, 61–4, 71–81
laws of war as, 385–407
meaning, 152
- legal research on ‘war of terror’, 194–8
- ‘legal spaciality’ *see* ‘constitutional / legal spaciality’

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89599-6 - Emergencies and the Limits of Legality

Edited by Victor Ramraj

Index

[More information](#)

412

INDEX

- legality / rule of law
 - and 'bare life', 23
 - basis in law as association of people, 100, 103–4
 - basis in non-instrumental law, 104–5
 - as basis of constitutional government, 3–4
 - colonial perspectives *see* colonial perspectives on legality
 - commitment to maintaining in emergency, 3–9
 - CSRTs as e.g. of maintaining, 153–5
 - defence by judiciary *see* judiciary
 - Dicey's legality model, 46–52
 - ELM model *see* extra-legal measures model (ELM)
 - and indefinite detention, 53, 118–41
 - institutional support for, 14–15
 - instrumental and non-instrumental laws, 99–102, 104–5
 - international perspectives, 22–4
 - and international state of emergency, 27–8, 360–84
 - meaning of 'rule of law', 97–9
 - moral and prudential approaches contrasted, 97–117
 - moral basis, 10–11
 - as moral principle, 129–35
 - moral principles of, 102–3
 - natural law theories, 57–8
 - normative theories summarised, 9–12
 - and political considerations, 377–9
 - political / sociological theories summarised, 12–16
 - positivist theories summarised, 35–6, 56–9
 - and prescriptive legal positivism *see* prescriptive legal positivism
 - and presidentialism, 258–6
 - and prudential reasoning, 97–117
 - and race, 344–6
 - realist theories, 37, 58–9 summarised, 9–10
 - research on adapting to 'war on terror', 194–8
 - rule of law model *see* rule of law model, Dyzenhaus's
 - and seepage of emergency powers, 244–6
 - sociological perspectives, 172–98
 - theoretical approaches, summary of, 24–7
 - and torture *see* torture
 - and unlegalisable actions *see* unlegalisable actions
- legislature
 - and endorsement of state of emergency, 218–19
- Locke, John, 4, 42–6, 159, 161–6
- lying, morality of, 159–60, 165
- Mahathir Mohammad, Dr, 123–6
- meanings
 - 'bare life', 348
 - 'compulsion of legality', 33–4
 - 'culture of justification', 14
 - 'disaster', 208
 - 'exception', 147–8
 - 'extra-legal', 113
 - iustitium*, 62
 - 'legal lack hole', 152
 - 'may act illegally', 113–14
 - 'moral', 97
 - 'necessary', 114–15
 - prerogative, 42
 - 'prescriptive legal positivism', 204
 - 'public officials', 113
 - 'rule of law', 97–9
 - 'state of emergency', 206–7, 209
 - 'terrorist act', 215
 - 'terrorist organisation', 201–2
 - 'the sovereign', 147–8
- military necessity, 105–8
- mitigation approach to legal sanctions, 21–2
 - where defence of necessity upheld, 327–32
- morality, 153–5
 - as constraint on extra-legal action *see under* constraints on power
 - of flexible responses to emergencies, 159, 161–6

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89599-6 - Emergencies and the Limits of Legality

Edited by Victor Ramraj

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

413

- human rights and choice of most moral means, 159, 161–6
- institutions as means to moral ends, 157–61
- ‘integrity’ of moral principle, 137–8
- justifying violation of moral rules, 108–10
- legality as a moral concept, 129–35
- of lying, 159–60, 165
- meaning of ‘moral’, 97
- moral and prudential approaches to legality, 97–117
- moral principles of legality, 102–3
- ‘moralized politics’, 13, 145–55
- National Emergencies Act (US), 235–8
- natural disasters and emergency powers, 231–4
- ‘necessary’, meaning of, 114–15
- necessity, defence of, 20–1, 54–5
 - comparison of different approaches to, 289–313
 - meaning of ‘necessary’, 114–15
 - military necessity, 105–8
 - mitigation of legal sanctions where defence upheld, 327–32
- non-instrumental laws, 99–102
 - as basis of legality, 104–5
- objective test for extra-legal action, 124–5
- official disobedience *see* extra-legal action
- ‘ordinary law of emergencies’, 18
- people, role of the
 - in *ex post* ratification, 44–5, 64, 66–8, 115–17, 318–27; *see* people, role of the
 - legality as human association, 100, 103–4
- Pinochet, General Augusto, 76
- political questions doctrine, 152–3
- politics and legality, 377–9
- potestas*, 167–8
- prerogative, theory of *see* Locke, John
- prescriptive legal positivism
 - and anti-terrorist measures, 201–28
 - prescriptive legal positivism (PLP), 17–18, 201–8
 - authorisation of emergency powers, 213–22
 - and Gross-Dyzenhaus debate, 222–8
 - meaning, 204
 - and state of emergency, 206–13
 - presidentialism, 18–19, 258–86
 - elements of, 259–63
 - and ELM, 268–73
 - exercise of emergency power, 263–8
 - Gross-Dyzenhaus debate on, 278–86
 - and rule of law model, 273–8
 - prudential reasonin
 - and institutions, 157–61
 - and legality, 97–117
- racial factors in colonial
 - administration, 344–6
- Raustiala, Kal, 369–70
- research on adapting legality to ‘war on terror’, 27–8
- risk management and emergency powers, 379–82
- rule by law and indefinite detention, 118–41
- ‘rule of colonial difference’, 344–6, 354–6
- rule of law *see* legality
- rule of law model, Dyzenhaus’s, 7–8, 11, 14; *see also*
 - Gross-Dyzenhaus debate
 - colonial perspectives on, 341–4
 - contrast with ELM, 33–59
 - critiques of, 11–15, 18–19, 23–4, 145–7, 169–70, 187–94, 203–4
 - and indefinite detention, 135–6
 - intended audience, 27
 - and jurisdictional politics, 373–4
 - meaning of ‘compulsion of legality’, 33–4
 - and presidentialism, 273–8
 - sociological perspective on, 187–94
 - and unlegalisable actions, comparison with other approaches, 289–313

- rule of recognition, Hart's, 56–7, 130–1, 149
- Schmitt, Carl, on the sovereign and the exception, 4, 6, 33, 40, 45–6, 174, 337–8, 364–5
 - colonial perspectives, 349–50
- Separation Thesis, 129–30
- sovereignty *see also* Schmitt, Carl
 - challenge of terrorism, 232
 - and judiciary, 148–51
 - as to location institutionally, 147–51
 - meaning of 'the sovereign', 147–8
- state of emergency
 - endorsement by legislature, 218–19
 - international state of emergency, 27–8, 360–84
 - in legal theory, 34–7
 - meaning, 206–7, 209
 - non-violent emergencies and emergency powers, 229–57
 - and prescriptive legal positivism, 206–13
- subjective test for indefinite detention, 122–9
- supermajoritarian escalator model *see* Ackerman, Bruce
- terrorism's challenge to sovereignty, 232
- 'terrorist act', meaning of, 215
- terrorist organisations
 - meaning of 'terrorist organisation', 201–2
 - whether Geneva Conventions applicable to, 390–2
- 'thin veneer of legality', 56
- torture
 - and the Bybee Memo, 396–8
 - defence of necessity as to, 54–5
 - and international law, 398–9
 - justifying, 176–7
 - legality as to, 20–2, 52–3
- uncertainty and ELM, 72–81
- unlegalisable actions, 52–6, 314–33
 - comparison of different approaches to, 289–313
 - covert operations and *ex post* ratification, 316–18
- 'war on terror'
 - developing legal research on, 194–8