

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory
Anna R. Kinsella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory

Evolution has not typically been recognised by linguists as a constraining factor when developing linguistic theories. This book demonstrates that our theories of language must reflect the fact that language has evolved. It critiques a currently dominant framework in the field of linguistics – the Minimalist Program – by showing how it fails to take evolution into account. It approaches the question of the evolution of human language in a novel way by applying findings from the field of evolutionary biology to language. Key properties associated with typically evolving systems are identified in language, and the shortcomings of the Minimalist Program in its outright rejection of these features are exposed. The book will be of interest to individual researchers and advanced students in linguistics, psychology, biology, anthropology, and cognitive science.

ANNA R. KINSELLA is a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellow in the Language Evolution & Computation Research Unit in the School of Philosophy, Psychology, and Language Sciences at the University of Edinburgh.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory
Anna R. Kinsella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Approaches to the Evolution of Language

The evolution of human language is a rapidly growing area of study and research, undertaken from a wide range of perspectives. This new series provides a forum for the very best contributions to this fascinating subject. Taking an interdisciplinary approach, the series as a whole encourages a productive dialogue between those working in linguistics, biology, psychology, anthropology and cognitive science.

Published titles

Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory *Anna R. Kinsella*

Further titles planned for the series

The Evolution of Human Language: Bilingual Perspectives
Richard K. Larson, Viviane Depréz and Hiroko Yamakido

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory
Anna R. Kinsella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory

Anna R. Kinsella



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory
Anna R. Kinsella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi
Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521895309

© Anna R. Kinsella 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-89530-9 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory
Anna R. Kinsella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

For my husband –
my strength, my sanity, my cook.

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page ix</i>
<i>List of tables</i>	x
<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiii
1 Constraining our theory of language	1
1.1 Language and evolution	1
1.2 Studies in syntactic theory	3
1.3 Studies in evolution	7
1.4 Studies in language evolution	10
1.5 Constraining the theory of language	16
1.6 A history of generative grammar	17
1.7 Minimalism – a program for syntactic theorising	21
1.8 Syntactic theory in the light of evolution: the book	36
2 Language as a perfect system	39
2.1 Introduction	39
2.2 The perfection of language	39
2.3 Perfection = adaptation?	49
2.4 Simply a matter of terminology?	53
2.5 Perfection in nature	60
2.6 Conclusions	68
3 Language as an evolvable system	70
3.1 Introduction	70
3.2 The simplicity of the minimalist language faculty	70
3.3 The complexity of the non-minimalist language faculty	72
3.4 Measuring complexity	77
3.5 The direction of evolution	81
3.6 Minimalist methodology	87
3.7 Minimalism and saltationism	91
3.8 Evolvability	96
3.9 Conclusions	110
4 Language as a recursive system	112
4.1 Introduction	112
4.2 What is recursion?	113

viii	Contents	
	4.3 What's special about language?	129
	4.4 The uniqueness of recursion	134
	4.5 Language without recursion	150
	4.6 Conclusions	158
5	Language as a minimal system	160
	5.1 Introduction	160
	5.2 Degeneracy and imperfection in the system	161
	5.3 'Extra' operations and competing motivations	163
	5.4 What is meant by 'perfection' anyhow?	166
	5.5 An imperfection in the mapping process	170
	5.6 Stipulations without independent motivation	171
	5.7 Shifting the burden of explanation	175
	5.8 Phenomena left unexplained	178
	5.9 Conclusions	183
6	Towards an evolvable theory of syntax	185
	6.1 Evolution as a constraint on theories of language	185
	6.2 Reconciling minimalism and evolution	186
	6.3 Evolutionarily plausible theories of language	188
	6.4 Final remarks	194
	<i>Bibliography</i>	195
	<i>Index</i>	211

Figures

1.1	Minimalist architecture	<i>page</i> 25
1.2	Derivation by phase architecture	36
2.1	Information transfer from the computational component to the external systems	43
2.2	Inclusive hierarchy of perfect, optimal, meliorizing, and satisficing systems	56
3.1	The trade-off between degeneracy and modularity for evolvability	103
4.1	Recursive factorial function	115
4.2	A finite state syntax for Bengalese finch song	122
4.3	Non-recursive hierarchical structure for the Bengalese finch song	122
4.4	Recursive hierarchical structure for the Bengalese finch song	122
4.5	Stages in the evolution of modern human language syntax	125
4.6	Features that make language 'special'	134
4.7	Environmental representation for path creation task	136
4.8	Recursive solution to path creation problem	136
4.9	Hierarchical structure of mountain gorilla food preparation technique (Byrne and Russon 1998)	142
4.10	Phrase structure rules for mountain gorilla food preparation (Byrne and Russon 1998)	142
6.1	An inheritance hierarchy for [kick the bucket]	190

Tables

2.1	Requirements for Government and Binding and minimalist analyses of superiority effects	<i>page</i> 48
4.1	Types of grammars and equivalent machines required to generate different types of recursive structure	117
4.2	Iteration versus recursion: examples and requirements	118
4.3	Recursion in the communicative and cognitive systems of humans and animals	149
4.4	The place of recursion in Jackendoff's stages	156

Preface

The general theme of this book is the evolutionary plausibility of the Minimalist Program. Yet there is also a background theme – the importance of evolution in studies of language. In linguistics, theory is underdetermined by data, requiring us to look to other domains in order to constrain our accounts. Evolution, however, has not been typically recognised by linguists as a constraining factor. This book shows that our theories of language must be constructed in such a way as to be compatible with the fact that language has evolved.

The tenets of a dominant modern syntactic theory – the Minimalist Program – are investigated from an evolutionary perspective, applying evidence from evolutionary biology to data from linguistics in a previously unexplored manner. Key properties of evolvability are identified in language, and the shortcomings of the Minimalist Program, in its outright rejection of these features, are exposed.

All those who seek to understand what is that sets humans apart from all other species will find issues of interest in the chapters which follow. This includes not only evolutionary linguists, but linguists of many persuasions, as well as psychologists, philosophers, anthropologists, primatologists, neuroscientists, biologists, and cognitive scientists. The book will have something new to offer to each group through its synthesis of disparate fields, its detailed critique of a current syntactic theory, and its recipe for an evolutionarily plausible syntactic theory.

Due to its strongly cross-disciplinary nature, some sections of the book will not represent new ground for every reader. This is particularly the case for chapter 1, where background issues are discussed. Readers with a background in linguistics may therefore wish to skip over sections 1.2.1, 1.2.2, and 1.6. Those linguists with a particular grounding in minimalist theorising may in addition wish to omit section 1.7. On the other hand, those with a background in evolutionary biology may feel that section 1.3 can be passed over. Elsewhere in the book, the terminology has been kept as transparent as possible; where domain-specific vocabulary has been used, explanation is offered so that all sections may be accessible to the non-specialist.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory

Anna R. Kinsella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii Preface

This is a modified version of my PhD thesis, which was written at the Language Evolution & Computation Research Unit at the University of Edinburgh, under my maiden name – Parker. This book, and the thesis on which it is based, would never have been completed without the help of a number of people. Firstly, I would like to extend a huge debt of gratitude to my supervisors, and colleagues, Jim Hurford and Simon Kirby. Without their enthusiasm, generosity, and patience, I would not have got here. For advice, proofreading, and engaging discussions, I would like to thank: Dan Dediu, Mike Dowman, Daniel Everett, David Hawkey, Caroline Heycock, Stefan Höfler, Fred Karlsson, Gary Marcus, Mits Ota, Graham Ritchie, Andrew Smith, Kenny Smith, Maggie Tallerman, Mónica Tamariz, Arie Verhagen, and Daniel Wedgwood. I would also like to thank those who read the manuscript on behalf of my publishers, Cambridge University Press, for their helpful comments and suggestions.

Abbreviations

ACC	accusative case
AdvP	Adverbial Phrase
Agr _o	Object Agreement Head
Agr _s	Subject Agreement Head
Agr _o P	Object Agreement Phrase
Agr _s P	Subject Agreement Phrase
AP	articulatory–phonetic (interface)
C	Complementizer
CauseP	Cause Phrase
CI	conceptual–intentional (interface)
CON	constraint set
CondP	Conditional Phrase
CP	Complementizer Phrase
D	Determiner
DP	Determiner Phrase
DS	Deep Structure
EOI	Extended Optional Infinitive
EPP	Extended Projection Principle
EST	Extended Standard Theory
EVAL	evaluation procedure
FL	faculty of language
FLB	faculty of language in the broad sense
FLN	faculty of language in the narrow sense
GB	Government and Binding Theory
GEN	generator
GF-tier	Grammatical Function tier
G-SLI	grammatical specific language impairment
HCF	Hauser, Chomsky and Fitch (2002)
HEOC	Have an Effect on Output Condition
I	Inflection
IDEN	identity marker
INGR	ingressive

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-89530-9 - Language Evolution and Syntactic Theory

Anna R. Kinsella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv	List of abbreviations
IP	Inflectional Phrase
LDD	long-distance dependency
LF	Logical Form
LSLT	<i>The Logical Structure of Linguistic Theory</i>
MP	Minimalist Program
N	Noun
NOM	nominative case
NOMLZR	nominalizer
NRRelC	Non-Restrictive Relative Clause
NP	Noun Phrase
OBJ	Object
OS	object shift
OT	Optimality Theory
PF	Phonological Form
PKU	Phenylketonuria
PP	Preposition Phrase
PPT	Principles and Parameters Theory
RDDR	Representational Deficit for Dependent Relations
REST	Revised Extended Standard Theory
S	Sentence
SLI	specific language impairment
Spec	Specifier
SS	Surface Structure
ST	Standard Theory
SUBJ	Subject
T	Tense
TP	Tense Phrase
TOP	Topic marker
UG	Universal Grammar
v	light causative verb
V	Main Verb
V2	verb second
vP/v*P	Causative Verb Phrase
VP	Verb Phrase