Muslims of Medieval Latin Christendom, c. 1050–1614

In the face of crusades, conversions, and expulsions, Muslims and their communities survived to thrive for over 500 years in medieval Europe. This comprehensive new study explores how the presence of Islamic minorities transformed Europe in everything from architecture to cooking, literature to science, and served as a stimulus for Christian society to define itself. Combining a series of regional studies, Brian Catlos compares the varied experiences of Muslims across Iberia, Southern Italy, the Crusader Kingdoms, and Hungary to examine those ideologies that informed their experiences, their place in society, and their sense of themselves as Muslims and as members of multi-confessional societies. This is a pioneering new narrative of the history of medieval and early modern Europe from the perspective of Islamic minorities; one which is not, as we might first assume, driven by ideology, isolation, and decline, but instead one in which successful communities persisted because they remained actively integrated within the larger Christian and Jewish societies in which they lived.

BRIAN CATLOS is Associate Professor of Religious Studies at the University of Colorado at Boulder and Research Associate in Humanities at the University of California Santa Cruz. Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-88939-1 - Muslims of Medieval Latin Christendom, c. 1050–1614 Brian A. Catlos Frontmatter More information

Muslims of Medieval Latin Christendom, c. 1050–1614

Brian A. Catlos

University of Colorado at Boulder University of California, Santa Cruz



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521889391

© Brian Catlos 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Catlos, Brian A. Muslims of Latin Christendom, ca. 1050–1614 / Brian Catlos, University of Colorado at Boulder, University of California, Santa Cruz. pages cm. ISBN 978-0-521-88939-1 (hardback) 1. Muslims – Europe – History – To 1500. 2. Arabs – Europe – History – To 1500.

Europe – Civilization – Arab influences.
Europe – Civilization – Middle Eastern influences.
Europe – Civilization – Islamic influences.
Title.
BP65.A1C38 2014
940.088'297–dc23

2013021433

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-88939-1 - Muslims of Medieval Latin Christendom, c. 1050–1614 Brian A. Catlos Frontmatter More information

For Wadjih F. al-Hamwi

أستاذي، صديىقي، أخي و… أبي Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-88939-1 - Muslims of Medieval Latin Christendom, c. 1050–1614 Brian A. Catlos Frontmatter More information

Contents

	List of illustrations	page ix
	List of maps	х
	Preface	xi
	Acknowledgements	XV
	List of abbreviations	xvii
	Note on usage	xviii
	Introduction: Islam and Latin Christendom to 1050	1
Part 1	Static diasporas: Muslim communities of Latin Christendom	13
1	The tide turns: the Christian Spains I (c. 1050–c. 1150)	17
2	A triumph of pragmatism: the Christian Spains II (c. 1150–c. 1320)	49
3	Pushing the boundaries: Italy and North Africa (c. 1050–c. 1350)	90
4	Infidels in the Holy Land: the Latin East (1099–1291)	128
5	Diversity in an age of crises: the Christian Spains III (c. 1350–1526)	163
6	Strangers in strange lands: foreign Muslims and slaves in Latin Christendom (c. 1050–c.1550)	228
7	Christians in name: the Morisco problem (1499–1614)	281

vii

viii List of contents

Part 2	Living in sin: Islamicate society under Latin dominion	309
8	Thought: images and ideals of Muslims and Islamicate society in Latin Christendom	313
9	Word: law, administration and Islamicate society under Latin rule	350
10	Deed: the economic, social, and cultural life of the Muslims of Latin Christendom	420
Postscript: <i>Convivencia</i> , intolerance or "questions badly put"?		515
	Glossary	536
	Bibliography	540
	Index	610

Illustrations

Figure 1	Communal and individual wealth	page 462
Figure 2	Ritual divergence and expression of domination	511

Maps

Map 1	The Mediterranean, c. 1050	page 10
Map 2	The Iberian Peninsula, c. 1050	46
Map 3	Conquests of the Castilians, Aragonese, and	
	Portuguese, 1150–1300	59
Map 4	Subject Muslim settlement in the Iberian Peninsula,	
	c. 1320	87
Map 5	Subject Muslim communities of Sicily, Southern Italy,	
	and Ifrīqiya, 1060–1350	95
Map 6	Crusader principalities and subject Muslim	
	settlements, c. 1170	143
Map 7	Muslim settlement in Hungary and the north-east;	
	centres of Muslim slavery and Islamic commerce	
	(c. 1300)	264
Map 8	The Morisco diaspora	299

Links to related illustrations, documents, and maps can be found at www.muslimsofmedievallatinchristendom.info.

Preface

In the popular imagination medieval Europe is a land defined by Christian religion and culture, inhabited also by a small, persecuted Jewish minority, but which was essentially uniform in terms of religious identity. Muslims, on the other hand, are typically imagined as having constituted a foreign "other," living in an Islamic world separated from what is often referred to as "the West" by a well-defined frontier marked by ideological opposition and political violence - Crusade and jihād. In this view, these worlds are seen as two self-contained and largely homogenous and incompatible components of an oppositional binary, as if they were two personalities, locked in what many would see as a timeless struggle – a "clash of civilizations" rooted in the fundamental, immutable, and irreconcilable differences believed to underlie their two cultures. On the other hand, relatively few outside of the Academy are aware that Islamic communities in fact comprised part of medieval European society, and that from the eleventh century through to the seventeenth century – beyond what is traditionally regarded as the end of the Middle Ages - populations of free Muslim subjects lived within the bounds of Western Christendom, or that Muslim slaves and travelers were a common fixture of European society long before the opening of the Atlantic world.

In fact, the Muslims of medieval Europe included substantial communities scattered right across the Latin-dominated Mediterranean, from the Atlantic coast to the Transjordan, as well as in Central and Eastern Europe. In some areas they survived only for a century or two, while in others they persevered for well over five hundred years. They did not live as isolated enclaves, they were not uniformly poor, and were not necessarily subject to systematic repression; rather, they comprised diverse communities and dynamic societies that played an important role in the formation of what would eventually emerge a modern European culture and society. This book sets out to survey the history of the Muslims of Latin Christendom, examining the experience of the various regional communities, and the circumstances that contributed both to their survival and to their demise. It aims also to investigate the relations of the

xi

xii Preface

Muslims, Christians (and Jews) who lived in medieval Europe in terms of how they imagined each other, how they structured their relationships, how they interacted politically, economically, culturally, and socially, and the impact they had on the development of European culture and society.

What is revealed is a tremendous variety of experience, both in terms of the internal life of these communities, their integration with the Christians under whose domination they lived, and their capacity to survive and persist. It reflects a history rich in possibilities, and shows that their survival and demise cannot simply be ascribed to the ideological conditions or changing religious culture of pre-modern Europe. Over the course of this study it will become clear that a whole range of factors, both local and regional, pragmatic and idealistic, contributed to their experience – a fact that may carry valuable lessons for our understanding of religious and cultural diversity, both in the world of the Middle Ages and in the world of today.

"History," the saying goes, "is written by the winners." If so, then this is a book about "the losers." It is a book about the conquered, rather than the conquerors, about those who submitted, rather than those who triumphed. It is about communities and individuals who chose to stay in their ancestral lands and live under the regime of rulers and cultures whom they considered to be illegitimate, and who considered them, at best, to be infidels, and, at worst, agents of the devil; who chose to put their own salvation and the fate of their descendants in jeopardy; and who chose to live as a subjugated, second-class people, in a world in which it was most certainly not held to be self-evidently true that all men were equal or that they had certain unalienable rights. This is a book about the Muslims of Latin Christendom: an ethno-religious minority that comprised a significant proportion of the population of the Christian lands of the Mediterranean in the Middle Ages, and yet whose existence has been all but forgotten outside scholarly circles and the campaigns of local Spanish tourism boards.

Why is this case? It is not because there were few of them. In 1609, when the expulsion of the converted Christian descendants of the last Muslims of Spain was undertaken, over 300,000 were forced from their native lands into foreign exile – roughly twenty times the number of Spanish Jews who chose expulsion over conversion in 1492. A hundred and twenty years earlier Portugal's Muslims had been expelled. It is not because it was specifically a Spanish problem. Significant communities existed also in Southern Italy, the Holy Land, and Hungary, and Muslim captives and slaves were sold and sent to the corners of Christendom. It is hardly a question of impact. Contact with Muslims and the Islamic world was one of the essential forces

Preface

that shaped the European culture that emerged out of Latin Christendom. The existence of significant Muslim minorities within this society was a powerful engine of acculturation, adaptation, and innovation – a challenge and a stimulus for the Christians under whom they lived.

The historical obscurity of these Muslim minorities is due to two factors. The first relates to sources. It is indeed the case, for the most part, that "the winners" – consciously or not – determine the material that remains for future historians to use. Leaving aside the vicissitudes of war, fire, and natural disasters, the records and artifacts that survive the passing of ages are – generally speaking – those that are regarded as having some value and use, or a continuing relevance. In the centuries that passed since the disappearance of these communities, relatively few of the documents relating to the Muslims of Latin Christendom passed those tests, and those that did tended to be concentrated in a few specific regions. The second issue is scholarly bias and concern. Until the 1970s and the explosion of research relating to groups that had hitherto been considered marginal to the grand historical narrative, such as peasants, women, heretics, few historians perceived the subject Muslim communities as being a worthy object of historical inquiry.

Since then, however, there has been an flurry of academic interest, and a tremendous volume of historical research has been carried out on Italy and the Spanish kingdoms (quite a bit less on the Muslim communities of the Frankish East and Hungary). Both in Italy, and Spain - where Islamic society persevered beyond the Middle Ages - the impact of the Muslim past was undeniable: it left its imprint on language, food, popular culture, literature, architecture, and in a rich historical record. This has provided material for North American, British, French, and - most of all - Spanish historians to produce countless monographs, journal articles, and papers, examining every imaginable aspect of subject Muslim (mudéjar) history. It is this great output of scholarly work that has made the present study both possible and necessary. The overwhelming majority of the studies that have been carried out focus on specific communities, towns, regions, or kingdoms, or on specific themes or perspectives, and most are restricted to a rather narrow period of time. This has provided us with a means for understanding *mudéjar* society in rich detail, but has made it difficult to rise above the particularities of concrete communities and to discern larger patterns in their history. No scholarly monograph has undertaken to analyze the subject Muslim communities of Latin Christendom as a phenomenon, or has taken a broadly inclusive, comparative approach to the subject.

This is altogether understandable, given the challenges such a project presents. These communities were scattered across the breadth of the

xiv Preface

Latin lands, and followed distinct historical trajectories in each region. The availability and nature of sources vary dramatically from place to place and over time, making comparison difficult, and obscuring overarching narratives and common trends. Compounding this is the tendency for historical studies of these communities to be burdened by the agendas of the historians who have written them – agendas that reflect a whole range of modern ideological positions relating to the relationship of Christianity and Islam, the nature of ethno-religious culture and identity, and the place of Muslims in the national identities of European countries. Nevertheless, it is precisely the aim of the present study to provide such an analysis.

The first part of the book, "Static diasporas: Muslim communities of Latin Christendom," presents a historical narrative of the Muslim minorities from the mid eleventh century through to the beginning of the sixteenth - a political history of a people with no great heroic figures, no long-ruling dynasties, and no independent, sovereign territory. The second part, "Living in sin: Islamicate society under Latin dominion," adopts a thematic approach, and analyzes the ideological structures, administrative institutions, and quotidian relationships that gave shape to subject Muslim society and the *mudejar* experience under Christian rule. The aim is to present a synthesis – an assessment of the history of the Muslim subjects of pre-modern Europe and of their relations with the Christian majority alongside whom they lived. It endeavors to propose a history of Christian domination of Islamic communities and the Muslim response to that domination, understood as much as possible from the perspective of those communities themselves. Hence, it is not a book about "European perceptions" of Islam, or Orientalism. It is not a book about Christian theological prejudices, or Crusade. It is not a book about the impact of Islam on the development of the West. And it is not a book about the brutality of Western colonial violence, or apparatuses of ethnic and religious oppression – although all of these matters necessarily enter into the discussion. Rather, it is a book about how subject communities persevered through centuries of domination, and the effect this had on them and on the societies in which they lived. Most significantly, perhaps, it presents a history that has not, up to this point, been accessible as a whole to scholars and students, and so constitutes a glimpse of a hitherto under-illuminated dimension of the complex world of the medieval past – a history of peoples who, while largely voiceless, were far from insignificant. It does not pretend to be exhaustive, and cannot aspire to be complete; its aim is to present the major trends and the most significant forces that shaped this encounter between the Islamic and Christian worlds, and to serve as a digest of present research and a starting point for further reading.

Acknowledgements

To say that this is a book that owes an immense debt to countless scholars is no hollow conceit. Faced with the enormous work of my colleagues and those who have gone before us, the research and writing became at once a rich pleasure and an exercise in humility – the more I learned, the more I was reminded of how little I knew. I regret that the notes and bibliography appended to this volume give only a suggestion of the scholarship that has contributed to this study, but the practical exigencies of publication make it inevitable that much would go unacknowledged. Nevertheless, a number of institutions and individuals deserve to be thanked directly and by name; with the qualification that any shortcomings of this study are, of course, my own.

First I would like to thank Núria Silleras-Fernández, who not only endured the writing of this book at close quarters, but read drafts and provided critical advice throughout. My editors at Cambridge, Michael Watson and Elizabeth Friend-Smith, are to be credited for their support (and patience!). The University of California Santa Cruz supported this project with a series of faculty research grants, and a fellowship "top up" from the Humanities Division, as did the University of California Office of the President, indirectly, through the Mediterranean Studies Multi-Campus Research Project. My colleagues in the History and Literature departments at UCSC, notably Gail Hershatter and Sharon Kinoshita, also deserve thanks for their mentorship and advice. The National Endowment for the Humanities provided a Faculty Research Fellowship and funding for three Summer Institutes for College and University Professors that I co-directed, in which I had a chance to discuss my work with scholars from across the USA. Thanks are due especially to David Abulafia, David Nirenberg and Paul Freedman for the many letters of reference they have written me in support of this project. The Institució Milà i Fontanals (Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas) in Barcelona has been my second academic home for some fifteen years. The director, Luís Calvo, and colleagues including Maria Teresa Ferrer i Mallol, Josefina Mutgé, and Roser Salicrú i Lluch, have been critical in my development as a scholar,

xv

xvi Acknowledgements

and have provided me with a stimulating environment to work in during the summer months. It has been a pleasure to participate in a series of research projects at the IMF (currently, Dr. Salicrú's Consolidated Research Group 2009-SGR-1452). The archivists and staff at the Arxiu de la Corona d'Aragó have also been instrumental; special thanks are due to the Director, Carlos López, and to Albert Torra. I owe a debt also to many Spanish scholars, but I should specifically thank Jaume Riera i Sans, Carlos Laliena Corbera, Esteban Sarasa Sánchez, and Josep Torró i Abad. I had the privilege of studying under J. N. Hillgarth at Toronto; his rigor and generosity remain an inspiration.

Some of the many others whom I should credit either for their ongoing support, for assisting with specific queries and general advice, or for generously sharing their work, include: Filomena Barros, Simon Barton, Joshua Birk, Richard Cassidy, Pete Catlos (my brother), O. Remie Constable, Fred Denny, Ana Echevarría Arsuaga, Paul Cobb, Monica Green, Fabiana Guillén Diop, David Freidenreich, Ángel Galán Sánchez, Mercedes García-Arenal, Claire Gilbert, L. P. Harvey, Peregrine Horden, Paul Hyams, Benjamin Z. Kedar, József Laszlovszky, Karla Mallette, Mark Meyerson, Jean-Pierre Molénat, Lisa Nielson, Gabriel Rota, Flocell Sabaté i Currell, Belén Vicéns Sáiz, Stefan Stantchev, Miguel Torrens, Robin Vose, David Wacks, Gerard Wiegers, and especially, Andrew Watson, dissertation supervisor, friend, and careful reader. My graduate student, Aaron Stamper, assisted with the bibliography and index and with other assorted queries. I should also thank my colleagues, the Department of Religious Studies and the College of Arts and Sciences of the University of Colorado at Boulder (my new academic home), all of whom have been extremely welcoming and supportive, and have provided an ideal environment for finishing this project. The excellent work of the staff of the Inter-Library Loan Service at Norlin Library (University of Colorado at Boulder) was also instrumental. Finally, Bar Bona Sort, in carrer Carders, Barcelona, provided crucial support over the course of several summers in the form of dependable, highspeed wi-fi, and industrial-strength mojitos; Paul's Coffee Shop in Louisville, Colorado, fueled me with americanos. If I have left anyone out, please excuse the oversight.

Abbreviations

ACA Ar. ARP	Arxiu de la Corona d'Aragó (Barcelona) Arabic Arxiu del Reial Patrimoni
C.	cancillería
carp.	carpeta
Cat.	Catalan
Cast.	Castilian
CODOIN	P. de Bofarull y Mascaró, et al. (eds.), Colección de
	documentos inéditos de la Corona de Aragón (Barcelona: José
	Eusebio Montfort, 1847–1910).
CSIC	Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas/Consell
	Superior d'Investigacions Científiques
Lat.	Latin
MR	Mestre Racional
PCG	Menéndez Pidal, Ramón (ed.), Primera crònica general de
	España (Madrid: Gredos, 1977).
pergs.	pergamins
Port.	Portuguese
Rom.	Romance

xvii

Note on usage

All dates provided within the book are Common Era (CE) unless otherwise noted. Place-names are given in the modern form used by their native inhabitants, with the exception of some for which the current English name is more recognizable (e.g. "Mecca," not "Makka"). For sites that were formerly under Islamic rule the Arabic name is also provided at the first instance of each. I have eschewed the use of "Spain" for the period prior to the Hapsburg era, for the "Iberian Peninsula," or simply "Iberia." "Spain" (*Hispania*) was imagined as a unity only in certain specific contexts, was of variable meaning, and tended, in any case, to be expressed as often as not in the plural as "the Spains," or "all the Spains" (as in *Imperator totius Hispaniae*).

The transliteration system used for Arabic conforms to standard academic use. Technical terms relating to Arabo-Islamic culture are normally given in Arabic and pluralized in Arabic, with exceptions made occasionally for words that have passed into the English lexicon, or for the sake of prose style (even sometimes at the cost of consistency). Definite articles are sometimes added even when technically unnecessary (e.g. "the dār al-Islām"). Terms in Latin and other languages are treated similarly. In excerpts from documents, the words Sarracenus, Moro, Agarenus, and the various other epithets are translated simply as "Muslim," except in rare cases where a pejorative sense was clearly intended, or the terminology itself is discussed.

Personal names occur in a number of forms. Normally, the names of individuals are given in the form in which they occur in the primary sources, with the exception of well-known personalities, whose names may appear in English or whatever language they are normally expressed in. The names of individual subject Muslims usually appear in a Latinate/ Romance form, even if corrupted. The names of rulers and other major personalities are given in the form corresponding to the language of the principality they ruled over (e.g. "Alfonso" in Castile, "Afonso" in Portugal, "Alfons" in the Crown of Aragon). The rulers of Norman Sicily and the Crusader Levant are given in English (e.g. "William II,"

xviii

Note on usage

xix

not "Guilelmus II"), for the sake of prose style, and because there was no singular contemporary vernacular tradition which determined their form. The names of emperors and popes are given in English. Regnal years are provided where appropriate. Locative surnames are sometimes translated, sometimes not (e.g. Bernard of Sahagún, but Sibila d'Acerra). Honorifics are usually given in English, except for Muslim rulers, who are better known by the Arabic versions.