Clinical Pragmatics

Many children and adults experience significant breakdown in the use of language. The resulting pragmatic disorders present a considerable barrier to effective communication. This book is the first critical examination of the current state of our knowledge of pragmatic disorders and provides a comprehensive overview of the main concepts and theories in pragmatics. It examines the full range of pragmatic disorders that occur in children and adults and discusses how they are assessed and treated by clinicians. Louise Cummings attempts to integrate the fields of pragmatics, language pathology and cognitive science by examining the ways in which pragmatics can make a useful contribution to debates about cognitive theories of autism. The reader is encouraged to think in a critical fashion about how clinicians, experimentalists and theorists deal with pragmatic issues.

Louise Cummings is Reader in Linguistics in the School of Arts and Humanities at Nottingham Trent University.
Clinical Pragmatics

Louise Cummings
In fond memory of my grandparents
Nan & Bob Cummings
Ruby & James Stewart
Contents

Preface   page ix
Acknowledgements    xi

1 Clinical pragmatics: theory and practice    1
  1.1 Introduction    1
  1.2 The scope of clinical pragmatics    4
  1.3 The emergence of clinical pragmatics    9
  1.4 Concepts and theories in pragmatics
    1.4.1 Speech acts    13
    1.4.2 Implicatures    14
    1.4.3 Presuppositions    16
    1.4.4 Deixis    17
    1.4.5 Context    18
    1.4.6 Non-literal language    21
    1.4.7 Conversation    21
    1.4.8 Discourse    23
    1.4.9 Relevance theory    24
    1.4.10 Cognition and pragmatics    26
  1.5 The multidisciplinary nature of clinical pragmatics    29
  1.6 Primary and secondary pragmatic disorders    32
  1.7 Pragmatic deficits and pragmatic preservation    34
  Notes    35

2 A survey of developmental pragmatic disorders    40
  2.1 Introduction    40
  2.2 Developmental language disorder    42
  2.3 Autistic spectrum disorder    53
  2.4 Emotional and behavioural disorders    60
  2.5 Mental retardation    67
  Notes    76

3 A survey of acquired pragmatic disorders    88
  3.1 Introduction    88
  3.2 Left-hemisphere damage    90
  3.3 Right-hemisphere damage    96
  3.4 Schizophrenia    100
  3.5 Traumatic brain injury    104
  3.6 Neurodegenerative disorders    108
  Notes    112
Contents

4 The contribution of pragmatics to cognitive theories of autism 118
  4.1 Introduction 118
  4.2 Cognitive theories of autism 118
    4.2.1 Theory of mind (ToM) theory 119
    4.2.2 Weak central coherence (WCC) theory 121
    4.2.3 Executive function (EF) theory 122
  4.3 The relationship between cognitive theories 123
  4.4 The criterion of pragmatic adequacy 125
  4.5 A pragmatic challenge to cognitive theories 128
  4.6 The validity of pragmatic adequacy 134
  Notes 135

5 The cognitive substrates of acquired pragmatic disorders 139
  5.1 Introduction 139
  5.2 Pragmatic theory 142
    5.2.1 Relevance theory 143
    5.2.2 Modular pragmatics 148
  5.3 Cognitive theory 158
    5.3.1 Theory of mind theories 159
    5.3.2 Executive function deficits 168
  Notes 170

6 The assessment and treatment of pragmatic disorders 177
  6.1 Introduction 177
  6.2 Pragmatic language assessment 180
    6.2.1 Pragmatics profiles and checklists 180
    6.2.2 Pragmatics tests 185
    6.2.3 Conversation analysis 187
    6.2.4 Discourse analysis 191
  6.3 Pragmatic language intervention 195
    6.3.1 Conversation skills 197
    6.3.2 Social communication 202
    6.3.3 Pragmatic skills training 204
    6.3.4 Teaching theory of mind 207
  Notes 209

7 A critical evaluation of pragmatic assessment and treatment techniques 216
  7.1 Introduction 216
  7.2 The domain of pragmatics 216
  7.3 Clinical studies of pragmatics 218
  7.4 Implications for the management of pragmatic disorders 229
    7.4.1 Pragmatic language assessment 230
    7.4.2 Pragmatic language intervention 237
  7.5 Overcoming problems of definition and delimitation 243
  7.6 Conclusion 249
  Notes 250

Bibliography 256

Index 299
Preface

When different disciplines converge on the study of a set of phenomena, one of several things can happen. In one scenario, these disciplines can begin to embrace the concepts, theories and methodologies of those fields of enquiry that are concerned to explain the same phenomena. The result is a genuinely interdisciplinary enquiry which leads to theoretical and other gains that were not realised within any single discipline. In another scenario, the same disciplines can acknowledge shared explanatory interests and can even engage with the concepts and frameworks of neighbouring areas of enquiry. However, to all intents and purposes, there is only the appearance of interdisciplinary enquiry and research proceeds largely along disciplinary lines. In yet another scenario, individual disciplines operate alongside each other with little interest in how other fields of enquiry are attempting to explain essentially the same phenomena. For much of the thirty-year history of clinical pragmatics, the disciplines that have come together to give rise to this field of study (largely pragmatics and language pathology) have displayed the characteristics of the second and third scenarios outlined above. The result has been considerable disarray, with clinical studies undertaken more often than not because they can be done, not because they should be done. No one has gained from this situation, least of all our child and adult clients with pragmatic disorders.

This book addresses what is currently known about a range of pragmatic disorders in children and adults. Pragmatic disorders are now a significant area of clinical language study. Yet, for all their interest to clinical researchers and practitioners, there has been much in the short history of clinical pragmatics that has been problematic. While clinical studies have proceeded apace, they have often done so in a theoretical vacuum. The result has been a large, sprawling body of findings that bear little relation to each other and are not even faithful to the pragmatic concepts that they purport to explain. There have been significant clinical implications of the type of enquiry that has sought to rush ahead with repeated (and often repetitive) studies in the absence of a rationally motivated basis. At best, these studies provide an uncertain foundation upon which to devise reliable pragmatic assessments and plan effective pragmatic interventions. We must acknowledge that one inevitable consequence of this
adverse impact on assessment and intervention is that pragmatically disordered clients have for too long not been receiving the type of high-quality clinical services that we have now come to expect for clients with other language disorders (e.g. specific language impairment, aphasia, phonological disorder).

As well as surveying our current state of knowledge of developmental and acquired pragmatic disorders, this book also assumes a deeply critical purpose. Few contributions to clinical pragmatics have even attempted a rational appraisal of the phenomena that investigators have simply assumed to be pragmatic. A research programme that purports to study certain pragmatic notions, but then misrepresents those notions, is neither advancing its own theoretical ends nor revealing anything of significance about the pragmatic competence of a particular clinical population. A similar rational appraisal is necessary of theoretical developments in areas such as developmental psychopathology and cognitive science, areas which should be actively embraced by researchers who are seeking a theoretical explanation of pragmatic disorders. Interdisciplinary exchanges between these disciplines and clinical pragmatics should be facilitated wherever possible, but they must also be handled with great care. For at the same time as they have the potential to throw new light on certain problems, their mismanagement can subvert the very explanatory gains that they were intended to achieve. A further purpose of this book is thus to examine the nature of these interdisciplinary exchanges, many of which have gone unnoticed by clinical pragmatists, and to suggest ways in which these exchanges may contribute to our understanding of pragmatic disorders.
Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge with gratitude the assistance of the following people: Judith Heaney for her careful preparation of the bibliography and compilation of the text; Sian Griffiths and other staff at the Boots and Clifton libraries of Nottingham Trent University for their assistance in locating literature; and Helen Barton of Cambridge University Press, for her receptive response to my proposal of this book. The assistance of each of these individuals has been invaluable. Lucy Dipper’s detailed comments on an earlier version of the manuscript were particularly constructive. I am very grateful to her for her thorough review of the manuscript on behalf of Cambridge University Press.

Much of the research for this book was undertaken while I was a Visiting Fellow in the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH) at the University of Cambridge. I am grateful to the Director of CRASSH, Mary Jacobus, for her support and encouragement. During my time at Cambridge, Wolfson College provided me with an environment that was particularly conducive to conducting research. I extend my gratitude to its President and Fellows.

Finally, I have been supported in this endeavour by family members and friends who are too numerous to mention individually. I am grateful to them for their kind words of encouragement during my many months of writing.

Chapter 3 originally appeared in Seminars in Speech and Language. Chapter 7 originally appeared in Language and Communication. Both have been extensively reworked for this volume.