

WITTGENSTEIN'S PHILOSOPHICAL INVESTIGATIONS

Published in 1953, Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations* had a deeply unsettling effect upon our most basic philosophical ideas concerning thought, sensation and language. Its claim that philosophical questions of meaning necessitate a close analysis of the way we use language continues to influence Anglo-American philosophy today. However, its compressed and dialogic prose is not always easy to follow. This collection of essays deepens but also challenges our understanding of the work's major themes, such as the connection between meaning and use; the nature of concepts; thought and intentionality; and language games. Bringing together leading philosophers and Wittgenstein scholars, it offers a genuinely critical approach, developing new perspectives and demonstrating Wittgenstein's relevance for contemporary philosophy. This volume will appeal to readers interested in the later Wittgenstein, in addition to those interested in the philosophy of language, the philosophy of mind, metaphysics and epistemology.

ARIF AHMED is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a fellow of Girton College. He is the author of *Saul Kripke* (2007).



CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

Titles published in this series:

Hegel's *Phenomenology of Spirit: A Critical Guide* EDITED BY DEAN MOYAR AND MICHAEL QUANTE

Mill's On Liberty: A Critical Guide EDITED BY C. L. TEN

Kant's Idea For A Universal History With A Cosmopolitan Aim: A Critical Guide EDITED BY AMÉLIE OKSENBERG RORTY AND JAMES SCHMIDT

Kant's Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals: A Critical Guide

EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMANN

Kant's Critique of Practical Reason: A Critical Guide
EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMANN

Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*: A Critical Guide

EDITED BY ARIF AHMED



WITTGENSTEIN'S Philosophical Investigations A Critical Guide

EDITED BY

ARIF AHMED

University of Cambridge







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521886130

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data
Wittgenstein's Philosophical investigations: a critical guide / edited by Arif Ahmed.
p. cm. – (Cambridge critical guides)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-88613-0

Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951. Philosophische Untersuchungen.
 Language and languages – Philosophy.
 Philosophy.
 Ahmed, Arif.
 Title.
 Series.
 B3376.w563P532785
 2010

3376.W563P532785 2010 192–dc22 2009054018

18BN 978-0-521-88613-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	List of contributors Acknowledgments	page vii ix
	Introduction ARIF AHMED	I
I	From referentialism to human action: the Augustinian theory of language ROBERT HANNA	11
2	What's doing? Activity, naming and Wittgenstein's response to Augustine MICHAEL LUNTLEY	30
3	Measure for measure? Wittgenstein on language-game criteria and the Paris standard metre bar dale jacquette	49
4	Wittgenstein on family resemblance concepts MICHAEL FORSTER	66
5	Wittgenstein on concepts HANS-JOHANN GLOCK	88
6	Wittgenstein vs contextualism JASON BRIDGES	109
7	Wittgenstein and the linguistic turn RICHARD RORTY	129
8	Rorty's Wittgenstein PAUL HORWICH	145



V1	Contents	
9	Are meaning, understanding, etc. definite states? JOHN McDOWELL	162
IO	Another strand in the private language argument david stern	178
II	Deductive inference and aspect perception arif ahmed	197
12	Remembering intentions WILLIAM CHILD	218
	Bibliography Index	235 245



Contributors

ARIF AHMED is University Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Cambridge. He has written on rule-following and private language as well as on issues in contemporary philosophy of language and metaphysics relating to conditionals and causation.

JASON BRIDGES is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Chicago. He has published papers in philosophy of language and has edited a volume of papers in honour of Barry Stroud.

WILLIAM CHILD is a fellow of University College Oxford and a University Lecturer in Philosophy. In addition to numerous articles on Wittgenstein and philosophy of mind, he is the author of *Causality, Interpretation and the Mind* (1994) and is the co-editor, with David Charles, of a volume of papers in honour of David Pears.

MICHAEL FORSTER is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Wittgenstein on the Arbitrariness of Grammar* (2004) as well as articles and books on a very wide range of subjects in the history of philosophy.

HANS-JOHANN GLOCK is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Zurich and has written widely on Wittgenstein. His publications include *A Wittgenstein Dictionary* (1996), *Quine and Davidson on Language, Thought and Reality* (Cambridge University Press 2003) and *What is Analytic Philosophy?* (Cambridge University Press 2008).

ROBERT HANNA is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado at Boulder, and in 2008/9 was a visiting Professor at the University of Cambridge, where he held a bye-fellowship at Fitzwilliam College. He has written a number of books and papers on modern debates in metaphysics and epistemology as well as the history of philosophy. His publications include *Kant, Science and Human Nature* (2006) and *Rationality and Logic* (2006).



viii

List of contributors

PAUL HORWICH is Professor of Philosophy at New York University and has published many books and papers on philosophical logic and metaphysics. His books include *Probability and Evidence* (Cambridge University Press 1982) and *Reflections on Meaning* (2005).

DALE JACQUETTE is Professor of Philosophy at the Pennsylvania State University. He is the author of *Wittgenstein's Thought in Transition* (1998) and of *Frege: A Philosophical Biography* (forthcoming, Cambridge University Press).

MICHAEL LUNTLEY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick. He is the author of *Contemporary Philosophy of Thought* (1999) and of *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Judgment* (2003).

JOHN McDOWELL is Distinguished University Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. His best-known and most influential work is *Mind and World* (1994).

Before his death in 2007, RICHARD RORTY was Professor Emeritus in Comparative Literature at Stanford University. His many works include *Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature* (1979).

DAVID STERN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa and a Wittgenstein scholar. He is the author of *Wittgenstein's 'Philosophical Investigations': An Introduction* (Cambridge University Press 2004) and of *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language* (1995).



Acknowledgments

I am most grateful to my contributors for their patience during the composition of this volume, to Jane Heal for helpful comments, to two Cambridge University Press readers for their valuable advice, to Damien Freeman for painstaking and efficient editorial assistance, and to Hilary Gaskin at Cambridge University Press for *her* patience, and encouragement. I am also very grateful to Sebastian Köhler, Gemma Murray and Adam Stewart-Wallace for assistance with the index and to Charlotte Lee for her advice on German.

Richard Rorty's essay 'Wittgenstein and the linguistic turn' was originally published in *Cultures: Conflict – Analysis – Dialogue. Proceedings of the 29th International Ludwig Wittgenstein Symposium, Kirchberg am Wechsel, Austria 2006* by the Austrian Ludwig Wittgenstein Society (Heusenstamm: ontos verlag, 2007), and appears here by kind permission of Mary Rorty.

Throughout the volume, quotations are taken from *Philosophical Investigations*, translated by G. E. M. Anscombe, 2nd edition (Oxford: Blackwell, reprinted 1998).