

Meaning, Discourse and Society

Meaning, Discourse and Society investigates the construction of reality within discourse. When people talk about things such as language, the mind, globalisation or weeds, they are less discussing the outside world than objects they have created collaboratively by talking about them. Wolfgang Teubert shows that meaning cannot be found in mental concepts or neural activity, as implied by the cognitive sciences. He argues instead that meaning is negotiated and knowledge is created by symbolic interaction, thus taking language as a social, rather than a mental, phenomenon. Discourses, Teubert contends, can be viewed as collective minds, enabling the members of discourse communities to make sense of themselves and of the world around them. By taking an active stance in constructing the reality they share, people thus can take part in moulding the world in accordance with their perceived needs.

WOLFGANG TEUBERT is Professor of Corpus Linguistics at the University of Birmingham. His previous book publications include *Corpus Linguistics: A Short Introduction* (2007, with Anna Cermakova), *Text, Discourse and Corpora* (2007, with Michael Hoey, Michael Stubbs and Michaela Mahlberg) and he was co-editor of *Corpus Linguistics: Critical Concepts in Linguistics: A Reader* (2007) and *Text Corpora and Multilingual Lexicography* (2007).



Meaning, Discourse and Society

Wolfgang Teubert





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521885652

© Wolfgang Teubert 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Teubert, Wolfgang.

Meaning, discourse and society / Wolfgang Teubert.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-88565-2 (hardback)

1. Meaning (Psychology). 2. Discourse analysis. 3. Sociolinguistics. I. Title.

BF463.M4T48 2010

401-dc22

2010000326

ISBN 978-0-521-88565-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgements		page VII
	Introduction No meaning without other people The futile quest for a language system Should the mind be an object of scientific enquiry? The discourse community constructs reality The sixteen topics of this book	1 1 5 9 11 12
Pa	art I Meaning, the mind and the brain	31
1	The cognitive turn	33
2	The long history of mind linguistics	47
3	What do we know about mental concepts?	53
4	Morphing theoretical sémes into 'real' concepts	63
5	From mental representations to conceptual ontologies	67
6	What is meaning?	73
7	Where should we look for meaning? Option a: The individual intentional mind Option b: The individual computational mind/brain Option c: The brain where language becomes reality Option d: The discourse as the collective mind	88 88 90 95 107
Pa	art II Discourse and society	111
8	Language as discourse	113
9	Society presupposes language, and language presupposes society Language as an essential human feature Language and society	124 124 127

v



vi	Contents	
	Blumer's symbolic interactionism From the individual mind to the discourse as the collective mind	132 135
10	A closer look at oral societies	140
11	Differences between oral and literate societies The profane and the arcane origins of writing Some effects of literacy Literacy, meaning and reflection	150 152 156 163
12	Empirical linguistics deals only with recorded language	166
13	Meaning, knowledge and the construction of reality Truth and meaning Meaning and knowledge The collaborative construction of reality	171 171 176 180
14	The language of the scientific experimental report	190
15	Diachronicity, intertextuality and hermeneutics	199
16	Meaning and the interpretation of a haiku	215
	Conclusion Authorship, intentionality and mental states: can the quest for meaning	241
	dispense with the investigation of the solitary mind? How real are the realities we experience? The social dimension of experience and intentionality Why the media discourse advertises individual agency We can collaborate to change our reality	241 249 258 262 269
Bibliography		273
Index		283



Acknowledgements

The impulse to write this book arose from the quandary of the nature of meaning which had bewildered me for many years. Only when I had moved away from the more navel-gazing disposition of my former research institution in Germany, where I used to look for meaning in the depths of solitary minds, and had been enveloped in a British university's spirit of sociability, did it begin to dawn on me that just as it is meaning that creates society, it is society that gives rise to meaning. Meaning emerges whenever people interact symbolically, negotiating the signs they use to communicate. As long as such interaction continues, meaning keeps evolving. Therefore there can never be a finite answer to the meaning of meaning. Meaning is only in the discourse, not in people's minds, and not in a reality out there. If we want to make sense of this discourse and the realities it has in stock for us, we do it not as monadic entities, but by working together, adding layer after layer of interpretation to all the previous layers of which the discourse consists. While such an approach is contrary to that of nativist linguistics, of the cognitive sciences and of the philosophy of mind, it is certainly not new or original. It draws on ideas developed in corpus linguistics and integrationist linguistics and on pragmatism, hermeneutics, social constructivism/constructionism and various brands of discourse studies, to name some key inspirations.

I would like to thank the University of Birmingham, its School of Humanities, and most of all my colleagues at the Department of English for the warm welcome they extended to me when I arrived here nine years ago. Without this stimulating atmosphere, the constant encouragement and the generous intellectual support I would never have ventured on this book project. As long as I continue to breathe this academic air, I will, I hope, keep changing and developing my outlook. In this sense the ideas presented here are more work in progress than a conclusive perspective.

Over this time I was given ample opportunity to present my ideas to my colleagues at Birmingham and many other places, and not only did they receive them with endless forbearance but they also opened my eyes to many aspects I had overlooked. I am equally grateful to my undergraduate students who engaged in often heated discussions with me, trying to instil a modicum of

vii



viii Acknowledgements

common sense into my ruminations. Many of the topics touched upon in this book have been introduced to me by my graduate students, among them Tony Bastow, Lisa Cheung, Angel Garralda, Nelya Koteyko, Fumiko Kondo, Maria Oset Garcia, Dominic Smith, Laura Strakova, Wang Fang and Wang Weiqun. Friends at a number of Chinese universities, Feng Zhiwei, Li Wenzhong, Pu Jianzhong and Wei Naixing, in particular, have repeatedly given me the opportunity to present my ideas and discuss them in remarkable depth with their students.

The University of Birmingham and the Arts and Humanities Research Council granted me a year of study leave which gave me time to organise my ideas. Bill Dodd and Michael Toolan have generously exercised their heartwarming friendship by reading and commenting on earlier versions of many chapters; without their calls to order I would have frequently lost my thread. I owe it to them that the ideas presented here have received some sort of *Gestalt*. Deeply felt thanks also go to Ruth Mell, who took care of the index, and to Jacquie Mullender, who not only corrected my English but also remedied numerous inconsistencies. Caroline, my wife, had to suffer a lot from my occasional irascible outbursts, and without her unfaltering support I might well have given up this project. Finally, I would like to thank Helen Barton, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for her trust and her imperturbable patience.