Against Throne and Altar

Modern republicanism – distinguished from its classical counterpart by its commercial character and jealous distrust of those in power, by its use of representative institutions, and by its employment of a separation of powers and a system of checks and balances – owes an immense debt to the republican experiment conducted in England between 1649, when Charles I was executed, and 1660, when Charles II was crowned. Though abortive, this experiment left a legacy in the political science articulated both by its champions, John Milton, Marchamont Nedham, and James Harrington, and by its sometime opponent and ultimate supporter, Thomas Hobbes. This volume examines these four thinkers, situates them with regard to the novel species of republicanism first championed in the early 1500s by Niccolò Machiavelli, and examines the debt that he and they owed the Epicurean tradition in philosophy and the political science crafted by the Arab philosophers Alfarabi, Avicenna, and Averroës.

Paul A. Rahe holds a B.A. from Yale University, an M.A. in Litterae Humaniores from the University of Oxford, and a Ph.D in ancient history from Yale University. Professor Rahe’s first book, Republics Ancient and Modern: Classical Republicanism and the American Revolution, was an alternative selection of the History Book Club, was reissued in a three-volume paperback edition in 1994, and remains in print. He co-edited Montesquieu’s Political Science: Essays on the Spirit of Laws and edited Machiavelli’s Liberal Republican Legacy, and he has published a host of articles in journals and chapters in edited books. Currently, Professor Rahe is a professor of history and political science at Hillsdale College.
Against Throne and Altar

*Machiavelli and Political Theory under the English Republic*

PAUL A. RAHE

*Hillsdale College*
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA
www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521883900

© Paul A. Rahe 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Rahe, Paul Anthony.
Against throne and altar : Machiavelli and political theory under the English Republic /
Paul A. Rahe.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-88390-0 (hardback)
History – Commonwealth and Protectorate, 1649–1660. I. Title.
JCI43.M4R35 2008
320.092'241–dc22 2007031033

ISBN 978-0-521-88390-0 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such
Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
Antonia Marie Rahe
Contents

Acknowledgments ix
Abbreviations and Brief Titles xi

Introduction 1
Prologue: Machiavelli in the English Revolution 4

PART I: MACHIAVELLI’S NEW REPUBLICANISM
1 Machiavelli’s Populist Turn 22
2 The Ravages of an Ambitious Idleness 56

PART II: REVOLUTIONARY ARISTOTELIANISM
3 The Classical Republicanism of John Milton 104
4 The Liberation of Captive Minds 139

PART III: MACHIAVELLIAN REPUBLICANISM ANGLICIZED
5 Marchamont Nedham and the Regicide Republic 179
6 Servant of the Rump 197
7 The Good Old Cause 219

PART IV: THOMAS HOBBES AND THE NEW REPUBLICANISM
8 Thomas Hobbes’s Republican Youth 249
9 The Making of a Modern Monarchist 273
10 The Very Model of a Modern Moralist 291
11 The Hobbesian Republicanism of James Harrington 321

Epilogue 347

Index 357
Acknowledgments

While working on this book, I piled up many debts. Over the years, I have learned a great deal from exchanges with James W. Muller, David Wootton, Blair Worden, Jonathan Scott, James Hankins, Charles Butterworth, Ralph Lerner, Harvey C. Mansfield, Cary J. Nederman, Antony Black, and William Connell. On two occasions, Lars Engle, chairman of the Department of English at the University of Tulsa, and I co-taught a seminar titled “The English Revolution: Politics and Literature,” and in the course of our discussions in and out of class he taught me much. Lori Curtis, who was for some years director of Special Collections at McFarlin Library at the University of Tulsa, was assiduous in locating and securing pertinent materials, and Marc Carlson, Ann Blakely, Tamara Stansfield, and the staff at the interlibrary loan office at that library performed miracles. Charles Burnett at the Warburg Institute kindly responded to my inquiries regarding the reception of Averroism in the Christian West; Antony Black allowed me to see the pertinent chapters of his forthcoming book comparing political thought in Islam with that in the West; and, shortly before the publication of his fine book on John Milton, Andrew Marvell, and Marchamont Nedham, Blair Worden generously shared with me the page proofs, enabling me to add citations and make small adjustments in the copyedited manuscript of this work. Eldon Eisenach, who was my colleague many years ago at Cornell University and later at the University of Tulsa, read and commented on an early draft; Erik Midelfort read and commented on the first chapter; Charles Butterworth read and commented on the second and fourth chapters; Nicholas von Maltzahn, Martine Watson Brownley, Colleen Sheehan, Lars Engle, and Paulina Kewes read and commented on an early version of the third chapter; Paul Cantor read and commented on the third and fourth chapters; Timothy Fuller read and commented on the eighth through tenth chapters; and John Headley read and commented on the book in its entirety. My wife, Laura, more than once went over every word.

While on sabbatical in 2005–2006, I received generous support from the Research Office at the University of Tulsa and from Thomas Benediktson, dean of Henry Kendall College of Arts and Sciences at that institution. I also had the privilege of spending Michaelmas term in 2005 and Hilary term in 2006 in congenial company at All Souls College, Oxford – where, as a Visiting Fellow, I took ample advantage of library facilities unequalled anywhere else in the world and profited from conversations with Jeremy Butterfield, who suggested the title of this volume; with Noel Malcolm and Sir Keith Thomas,
Acknowledgments

who were generous in sharing their encyclopedic knowledge of this period; and with Fergus Millar, John Robertson, Peter Ghosh, Ian Maclean, Eleanor Dickey, Robert Maltby, Patrick Finglass, Andrei Rossius, James Adams, Myles Burnyeat, Gerald Cohen, Wolfgang de Melo, Simon Green, Alison Brown, and Magnus Ryan, who went very far out of his way to be helpful to an itinerant scholar. I owe a particular debt to the generations of librarians responsible for the collection and safekeeping of the books lodged in the Bodleian Library, the Codrington Library, the Taylorian Institution, and the library at Balliol College. This book was finished late in March 2006 during my last week in residence at All Souls.

In the notes, I have adopted the standard abbreviations for classical texts and inscriptions and for books of the Bible provided in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, third edition revised, ed. Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2003), and in *The Chicago Manual of Style*, 15th edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003), 15.50–3. Where possible, the ancient texts and medieval and modern works of similar stature are cited by the divisions and subdivisions employed by the author or introduced by subsequent editors (that is, by book, part, chapter, section number, paragraph, act, scene, line, Stephanus page, or by page and line number). In some cases, where further specification is needed to help the reader to locate a particular passage, I have included as the last element in a particular citation the page or pages of the pertinent volume of the edition used. For modern works frequently cited, the following abbreviations and short titles have been employed:


Abbreviations and Brief Titles

JHO James Harrington’s Oceana, ed. S. B. Liljegren (Heidelberg: C. Winter, 1924).
Machiavelli, AG Niccolò Machiavelli, Dell’arte della guerra, in Machiavelli, Opere, 301–89, to which, where appropriate, I have added the sentence numbers supplied in Niccolò Machiavelli, Art of War, ed. and tr. Christopher Lynch (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003).
_____ Discorsi Niccolò Machiavelli, Discorsi sopra la prima deca di Tito Livio, in Machiavelli, Opere, 75–254, to which, where appropriate, I have added the paragraph numbers supplied in Niccolò Machiavelli, Discourses on Livy, ed. and tr. Harvey C. Mansfield and Nathan Tarcov (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996).
MP Mercurius Politicus