

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Patrick Lee and Robert P. George

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Body–Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Profoundly important ethical and political controversies turn on the question of whether biological life is an essential aspect of a human person or is only an extrinsic instrument. Patrick Lee and Robert P. George argue that human beings are physical, animal organisms – albeit essentially rational and free – and examine the implications of this understanding of human beings for some of the most controversial issues in contemporary ethics and politics. The authors argue that human beings are animal organisms and that their personal identity across time consists in the persistence of the animal organisms they are; they also argue that human beings are essentially rational and free and that there is a radical difference between human beings and other animals; furthermore, they criticize hedonism and hedonistic drug-taking, present detailed defenses of the pro-life positions on abortion and euthanasia, and defend the traditional moral position on marriage and sexual acts.

Patrick Lee is Director of the Bioethics Institute and Professor of Bioethics at Franciscan University of Steubenville. He is the author of *Abortion and Unborn Human Life* (1996), and his articles and review essays have appeared in *American Journal of Jurisprudence*, *Bioethics*, *Faith and Philosophy*, *Philosophy*, *The Thomist*, *International Philosophical Quarterly*, and other scholarly journals, as well as popular journals and online magazines.

Robert P. George is McCormick Professor of Jurisprudence and Director of the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions at Princeton University. He is a member of the President's Council on Bioethics and the Council of Foreign Relations, as well as a former member of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. He is the author of numerous books, articles, and essays, including *In Defense of Natural Law* (1999) and *The Clash of Orthodoxies* (2001). He has also written for the *New York Times*, *Washington Post*, *Wall Street Journal*, *First Things*, *Boston Review*, *New Criterion*, and the *Times Literary Supplement*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Patrick Lee and Robert P. George

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Body–Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

PATRICK LEE

Franciscan University of Steubenville

ROBERT P. GEORGE

Princeton University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics
 Patrick Lee and Robert P. George
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA
www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521882484

© Patrick Lee and Robert P. George 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Lee, Patrick, 1952–
 Body–self dualism in contemporary ethics and politics / Patrick Lee,
 Robert P. George.
 p. cm.
 ISBN-13: 978-0-521-88248-4 (hardback)
 ISBN-10: 0-521-88248-6 (hardback)
 1. Philosophical anthropology. 2. Ethics. I. George, Robert P. II. Title.
 BD450.L3735 2007
 171'.2–dc22 2007020753

ISBN 978-0-521-88248-4 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Patrick Lee and Robert P. George

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For Germain Grisez

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Patrick Lee and Robert P. George

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> ix
Introduction	I
1 Human Beings Are Animals	4
I. <i>Main Challenges to Establishing the First Premise</i>	5
II. <i>Animals are Enduring Agents</i>	6
III. <i>Sensation is a Bodily Act</i>	10
IV. <i>In Human Being the Agent that Performs the Act of Sensing Is Identical with the Agent that Performs the Act of Understanding</i>	15
V. <i>An Argument from the Nature of Human Intelligence</i>	16
VI. <i>On Privileged Access and the Modal Argument for Substance Dualism</i>	19
VII. <i>Human and Personal Identity: The Psychological Continuity View</i>	22
VIII. <i>Against Constitutionalism</i>	38
IX. <i>Conjoined Twins and Organic Unity and Distinctness</i>	44
2 Human Beings Are Persons	50
I. <i>The Difference in Kind between Human Beings and Other Animals</i>	52
A. <i>Conceptual Thought</i>	52
B. <i>Free Choice, Moral Agency</i>	59
II. <i>Survival after Death</i>	66
A. <i>The Human Soul after Death</i>	66
B. <i>Resurrection of the Body</i>	74
III. <i>Personhood and Human Dignity</i>	81
3 Hedonism and Hedonistic Drug-Taking	95
I. <i>What Hedonism Is</i>	95

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Patrick Lee and Robert P. George

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Contents

	II. <i>Preliminary Arguments against Psychological and Ethical Hedonism</i>	98
	III. <i>An Argument against Hedonism from Qualitative Differences among Pleasures</i>	100
	IV. <i>Hedonism and Dualism</i>	103
	V. <i>Pleasures Are Good Only as Aspects of Real Perfections</i>	108
	VI. <i>Hedonistic Drug-Taking</i>	115
4	Abortion	118
	I. <i>The Biological Issue: Human Embryos or Fetuses Are Complete (Though Immature) Human Beings</i>	119
	II. <i>No-Person Arguments: The Dualist Version</i>	130
	III. <i>No-Person Arguments: The Evaluative Version</i>	133
	IV. <i>The Argument that Abortion Is Justified as Nonintentional Killing</i>	140
5	Euthanasia	151
	I. <i>Human Life and Personhood Near the End of Life</i>	152
	II. <i>The Human Individual Remains a Person during His or Her Whole Duration</i>	154
	III. <i>Why Suicide and Euthanasia Are Morally Wrong</i>	155
	IV. <i>Intentional Killing versus Causing Death as a Side Effect</i>	157
	V. <i>Human Life Is an Intrinsic Good</i>	160
	VI. <i>The Definition of Death</i>	163
	VII. <i>The Criterion of Death</i>	165
	VIII. <i>Human Life and Dignity</i>	169
6	Sex and the Body	176
	I. <i>Sex and Marriage</i>	179
	II. <i>Sex and Pleasure</i>	185
	III. <i>Sex, Love, and Affection</i>	193
	A. <i>Sodomy</i>	194
	B. <i>Fornication</i>	196
	IV. <i>Objections</i>	197
	V. <i>Nonmarital Sexual Acts, Multiple Partners, Incest, Bestiality...</i>	209
	<i>Index</i>	219

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88248-4 - Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics

Patrick Lee and Robert P. George

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The authors have benefited from the assistance, advice, criticism, and support of many people. They wish particularly to thank the Earhart Foundation, the National Catholic Community Foundation, and Witherspoon Institute as well as Ryan Anderson; Luis Tellez; Carlos Cavalle; Herbert W. Vaughan, Esq.; Roger and Carol Naill; Howard and Roberta Ahman-son of Fieldstead and Co.; Joe and Debbie Duffy; William Saunders, Esq.; Edward Smith, Esq.; Ward Kischer, PhD; William Hurlbut, MD; Maureen Condic, PhD; Richard Doerflinger; Markus Grompe, MD; Thomas Berg, LC, PhD; Alfonso Gomez-Lobo, PhD; Gilbert Meilaender, PhD; Mary Ann Glendon, LL.M.; Leon Kass, MD, PhD; Edward Furton, PhD; Eric Cohen; Yuval Levin; John Finnis, PhD; Germain Grisez, PhD; Christian Brugger, PhD; Hadley Arkes; Joseph M. Boyle, PhD; John Crosby, PhD; Kevin Flannery, SJ, PhD; Nicanor Austriaco, OP, PhD; Beth Matango; Jane Hale; Bradford Wilson, PhD; Laurie Tollefsen, PhD; and Susan Carstensen.