JUSTICE AND RECONCILIATION
IN POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA

Justice and Reconciliation in Post-Apartheid South Africa assesses the transitional processes under way since the early 1990s to create a stable and just society. Change in South Africa is often credited to the efforts of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC), but the work of this institution forms but a facet of a much broader picture. This book looks at the steps which accompanied and followed the TRC’s activities, such as land restitution, institutional reforms, and social and cultural initiatives. Thematically, it interlinks the TRC’s concerns over truth and reconciliation with an analysis of the concepts of justice, accountability, harm and reconciliation, and with competing perceptions of what these notions entail in the South African context. Bringing together international and South African scholars whose work has focused on these themes, the contributions provide a cohesive and inspiring analysis of South Africa’s response to its unjust past.

FRANÇOIS DU BOIS is an associate professor and reader in private law at the University of Nottingham.

ANTJE DU BOIS-PEDAIN is a lecturer in law at the University of Cambridge.
Justice and Reconciliation in Post-Apartheid South Africa

Edited by
François du Bois and Antje du Bois-Pedain
CONTENTS

List of tables and figures page vii
List of contributors viii
Acknowledgements ix
List of abbreviations xi

Introduction 1
(FRANÇOIS DU BOIS AND ANTJE DU BOIS-PEDAIN)

1 Reconciliation as surrender: configurations of responsibility and memory 9
EMILIOS CHRISTODOULIDIS AND SCOTT VEITCH

2 Radical forgiveness: transforming traumatic memory beyond Hannah Arendt 37
PUMLA GOBODO-MADIKIZELA

3 Communicating criminal and political responsibility in the TRC process 62
ANTJE DU BOIS-PEDAIN

4 The contribution of criminal justice 90
VOLKER NERLICH

5 Reparation and the forms of justice 116
FRANÇOIS DU BOIS

6 Land restitution and reconciliation in South Africa 144
THEUNIS ROUX

7 For justice and reconciliation to come: the TRC archive, big business and the demand for material reparations 172
JACO BARNARD-NAUDÉ
## CONTENTS

8 Transition, forgiveness and citizenship: the TRC and the social construction of forgiveness  
   STÉPHANE LEMAN-LANGLOIS AND CLIFFORD SHEARING  
   206

9 The evolving legitimacy of the South African Constitutional Court  
   JAMES L. GIBSON  
   229

10 Drawing the line: justice and the art of reconciliation  
   CARROL CLARKSON  
   267

11 Post-conflict justice and the reconciliatory paradigm: the South African experience  
   FRANÇOIS DU BOIS AND ANTJE DU BOIS-PEDAIN  
   289

Index  
   312
TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 8.1 Four levels of reconciliation in the TRC Report

Table 9.1 Indicators of loyalty toward the South African Constitutional Court and Parliament, attentive publics, 2004

Table 9.2 Change in loyalty toward the South African Constitutional Court, 1997–2004, attentive publics

Table 9.3 Racial differences in loyalty toward the South African Constitutional Court and Parliament, attentive publics, 2004

Figure 9.1 The consequences of positivity bias

Figure 9.2 Cross-national variability in support for constitutional courts, do not do away with the institution

Figure 9.3A Change in support for the Constitutional Court, 2001–2004, by racial group

Figure 9.3B Change in support for the South African Parliament, 2001–2004, by racial group

Figure 9.4 Bivariate connections between institutional awareness, performance satisfaction and loyalty, 2004

Figure 9.5 Bivariate connections between institutional awareness, performance satisfaction and loyalty, 2001
CONTRIBUTORS

Jaco Barnard-Naudé is a senior lecturer in law at the University of Cape Town.

Emilios A. Christodoulidis is professor of legal theory at the University of Glasgow.

Carrol Clarkson is a senior lecturer in English at the University of Cape Town.

François du Bois is associate professor and reader in private law at the University of Nottingham.

Antje du Bois-Pedain is a lecturer in law at the University of Cambridge and a fellow of Magdalene College, Cambridge.

James L. Gibson is Sidney W. Souers Professor of Government at Washington University in St Louis and a Fellow of the Centre for Comparative and International Politics and Professor Extraordinary in Political Science at the University of Stellenbosch.

Pumla Gobodo-Madikizela is associate professor of psychology at the University of Cape Town.

Stéphane Leman-Langlois is assistant professor at the University of Montreal’s School of Criminology.

Volker Nerlich is a legal officer at the International Criminal Court (ICC).

Theunis Roux is director of the South African Institute for Advanced Constitutional, Public, Human Rights and International Law (SAIFAC) in Johannesburg, an honorary professor at the University of the Witwatersrand and extraordinary professor at the University of Pretoria.

Clifford Shearing holds the National Research Foundation Chair in African Security and Justice and the Chair of Criminology at the University of Cape Town.

Scott Veitch is professor of jurisprudence at the University of Glasgow.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The essays in this book were developed through debate and discussion at a workshop held at the University of Cape Town (UCT) in December 2005, and most of them were presented at a conference on Transitional Justice in South Africa that took place at the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law at the University of Cambridge in November 2006. Financially and otherwise, both events were generously supported by the law faculties of the two universities, as well as by the Smuts Memorial Fund, which is gratefully acknowledged. For the support received from UCT we thank especially Professor Hugh Corder and Professor P.J. Schwikkard, then respectively Dean and Director of Research at UCT. For the support received from Cambridge, we are particularly grateful to Professor Christopher Forsyth and the managers of the Smuts Memorial Fund, as well as to the director and deputy director of the Lauterpacht Centre, Professor James Crawford and Dr Roger O'Keefe. The Lauterpacht Centre kindly made available its congenial facilities, and at UCT the impeccable Mandy Bedin ensured that everything went smoothly.

Many others contributed to the final product, and each author is grateful for the advice and support received. Collectively, they benefited from the willingness of participants at the workshops to engage with their work critically. New ideas were generously offered and others kindly laid to rest, and this, too, is acknowledged with gratitude. Two anonymous referees provided further feedback and this helped to structure the book in directions that hopefully broaden its relevance and deepen its interest. In their final form, the essays published here take account of developments and literature up to December 2007.

Cambridge University Press has been supportive throughout. Special mention should be made of Finola O'Sullivan who believed in the project from the start, and of Richard Woodham whose patience allowed it to be brought to fruition.
We would also like to thank Hella Rabbethge-Schiller of the bushman art gallery in Rosenheim, Germany (www.bushman-art.de), for her kind permission to use a painting from her personal collection, ‘kalabash’ by South African artist Andry Kashivi, for the cover.
# ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APLA</td>
<td>Azanian People's Liberation Army (armed wing of the PAC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASGISA</td>
<td>Accelerated Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>askari</td>
<td>former member of a liberation movement forced to work for the state Security Branch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWB</td>
<td>Afrikaner Weerstands beweging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZAPO</td>
<td>Azanian People's Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCB</td>
<td>Civil Co-operation Bureau (an undercover unit of the SADF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSATU</td>
<td>Congress of South African Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth, Employment and Redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>homeland</td>
<td>erstwhile self-governing district allotted to black population group in apartheid South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFP</td>
<td>Inkatha Freedom Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MK</td>
<td>Umkhonto we Sizwe (armed wing of the ANC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Pan-Africanist Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACP</td>
<td>South African Communist Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADF</td>
<td>South African Defence Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>South African Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDU</td>
<td>Self Defence Unit (unofficial local policing structure)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSC</td>
<td>State Security Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

TRC Act  Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act 34 of 1995
Umkhonto we Sizwe  Armed wing of the ANC