Urban Protest in Mexico and Brazil

Why do social organizations decide to protest instead of working through institutional channels? This book draws hypotheses from three standard models of contentious political action – POS, resource mobilization, and identity – and subjects them to a series of qualitative and quantitative tests. The results have implications for social movement theory, studies of protest, and theories of public policy and agenda setting. The characteristics of movement organizations – type of resources, internal leadership competition, and identity – shape their inherent propensity to protest. Party alliance does not constrain protest, even when the party ally wins power. Instead, protest becomes a key part of organizational maintenance, producing constant incentives to protest that do not reflect changing external conditions. Nevertheless, organizations do respond to changes in the political context, governmental cycles in particular. In the first year of a new government, organizations have strong incentives to protest in order to establish their priority in the policy agenda.

Kathleen Bruhn is a leading expert on the Mexican Left. Her first book, *Taking on Goliath*, analyzes the emergence and early consolidation of the primary Leftist party in Mexico, the PRD. She is also the author, with Daniel C. Levy, of a textbook on Mexican politics, *Mexico: The Struggle for Democratic Development*. She has lived for extended periods in both Mexico and Brazil. She has three times won fellowships to write at the Center for U.S.–Mexico Studies at the University of California, San Diego, and once won a fellowship at the Kellogg Center at the University of Notre Dame, also to write. Her research has been supported by the Stanford Institute for International Studies, the MacArthur Foundation, the UC Council on Research, the UC Faculty Senate, and the Institute for Social and Behavioral Research at the University of California, Santa Barbara. She is currently an associate professor of political science at UC Santa Barbara.
in loving memory of William Harry Bruhn
Urban Protest in Mexico and Brazil

Kathleen Bruhn

University of California, Santa Barbara
Contents

List of Tables  vi
List of Figures  vii
List of Abbreviations  ix
Acknowledgments  xi

1 Riding the Tiger: Popular Organizations, Political Parties, and Urban Protest  1
2 Setting the Stage: Research Design, Case Selection, and Methods  20
3 The Limits of Loyalty  40
4 A Union Born Out of Struggles: The Union of Municipal Public Servants of São Paulo  62
5 Partisan Loyalty and Corporatist Control: The Unified Union of Workers of the Government of the Federal District  90
6 Clients or Citizens? Neighborhood Associations in Mexico City  114
7 Favelas and Cortiços: Neighborhood Organizing in São Paulo  138
8 The Dynamics of Protest  162

Appendix  173
Selected Sources  182
Index  209
List of Tables

1.1 Main Independent Variables ........................................ page 16
2.1 Legislative Seats in Municipal Legislatures .................. 29
2.2 Municipal Administrations and Economic Conditions .... 35
2.3 Aggregate Levels and Characteristics of Protest ........... 36
3.1 Operationalization of Key Variables: Quantitative Models . 49
3.2 Number of Protests: Local Government Target ............. 50
3.3 Level of Disruption: All Targets ................................. 57
3.4 Summary of Results: Quantitative Models of Protest Rates . 58
5.1 Number of Protests, Mexico City: All Targets ................ 108
5.2 Number of Protests, São Paulo: All Targets ................. 109
5.3 Number of Protests, Brasilia: All Targets .................... 110
5.4 Summary of Results: Unions and Protest ..................... 112
7.1 Number of Protests, Urban Popular Movements: Local Government Target ............ 156
7.2 Summary of Results: Urban Popular Movements and Protest .................................................... 160
8.1 Summary of Results ................................................ 163
### List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Protest over Time</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Municipal Employee Protests</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Urban Popular Movement Protest</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Protest over Time: Mexico City</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Protest over Time: São Paulo</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

AB
Asamblea de Barrios

AP
Antorcha Popular

ARENA
Aliança Renovadora Nacional

CEB
Comunidades Ecclesiais de Base

CGH
Consejo General de Huelga

CMP
Central de Movimentos Populares

CNBB
Conferencia Nacional dos Bispos de Brasil

CT
Congreso del Trabajo

CTM
Confederación de Trabajadores de México

FPFV
Frente Popular Francisco Villa

FSTSE
Federación de Sindicatos de Trabajadores al Servicio del Estado

MMC
Movimento de Moradia do Centro

MOCO
Sindicato dos Motoristas e Cobradores

MST
Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra

PCB
Partido Comunista Brasileiro

PCdoB
Partido Comunista do Brasil

PMDB
Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro

POS
Political Opportunity Structures

PPB
Partido Popular Brasileiro

PRD
Partido de la Revolución Democrática

PRI
Partido Revolucionario Institucional

PT
Partido dos Trabalhadores

SINDSEP
Sindicato dos Servidores Públicos Municipais de São Paulo
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SUTGDF</td>
<td>Sindicato Único de los Trabajadores del Gobierno del Distrito Federal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ULC</td>
<td>Unificação das Lutas de Cortiço</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMM</td>
<td>União de Movimentos de Moradia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNT</td>
<td>Unión Nacional de Trabajadores</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

Like all books, this one could never have been written without the help of many people and multiple academic institutions. Portions of the research were funded by the Institute for Social and Behavioral Research, the UC Council on Research, and the UCSB Faculty Senate. During the initial writing phase, I was supported by a fellowship at the UCSD Center for Mexican Studies and a Kellogg Fellowship at the University of Notre Dame; UCSB also helped by making up the difference between the fellowship and my normal salary. In Mexico, Celia Toro and Soledad Loaeza at different times made it possible for me to have access to the library at El Colegio de Mexico. In Brazil, George Avelino at the Fundação Getúlio Vargas and Fernando Limongi of the Universidade de São Paulo and CEBRAP made it possible for me to get academic visas and were generous with their knowledge, their contacts, and their time, all without laughing once at my evolving Portuguese. I am deeply indebted to – and spent a great deal of time with – the professional archivists working at the National Autonomous University of Mexico’s hemeroteca, the Biblioteca Nacional de México, the Arquivo do Estado de São Paulo, and the congressional hemeroteca of the Congresso Nacional de Brasil.

Several people tried very hard to keep me from making mistakes and to point me in the right direction. To all of them, I owe my thanks, but especially to Michael Coppedge, Wayne Cornelius, Cynthia Kaplan, Scott Mainwaring, Luis Hernandez Navarro, Sidney Tarrow,
Jeff Weldon, Chris Woodruff, the Fellows at the Center for U.S.–Mexican Studies and the Kellogg Institute, and the two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press. I have seldom received such thorough, thoughtful, and constructive critiques, and I am sure the book is much better for their advice. Several graduate students also commented on portions of the book or project design or provided research assistance, including Joe Gardner, Richard Huizar, Stuart Kasdin, Russell Kellogg, April Rapp, and Patricia Rodriguez. None of these people can be held responsible for any errors that remain.

Indispensable to the project were the activists and organizers who shared their thoughts and experiences with me, allowed me to attend their meetings, and even invited me into their homes. I wish I could list them all by name, but I promised I wouldn’t.

Finally, I want to thank those whose support and encouragement have made this journey not only bearable, but enjoyable. In particular, I want to extend a long-overdue thanks to Maria Celia Toro, for her steadfast friendship over these nearly twenty years since I first showed up in Mexico City to start my dissertation research. My thanks go also to the entire familia Navarro, who took me into their hearts and their home more than fifteen years ago, and especially to Doña Michelle, mi mama mexicana. Last but not least, I must recognize the unfaltering love, support, and encouragement of my mother, Charlotte Bruhn, and my father, Bill Bruhn. I was too slow: he saw the beginning of this book but not the ending. I dedicate this book to his memory.