Index

References in brackets following page numbers are to footnotes.

accessory liability see aiding and abetting
accomplice liability see complicity in genocide accused
aiding and abetting by
presence at committing of crime, need for 316–17
scope for 315–16
anticipation of committing crime as mental element of JCE 70–83
authority of, as element in ordering of crime 367–70
effective control by 184–6
cumulative effect of functions 194–5
mutual understanding with distant perpetrator in JCE 41–2, 84–104, 417
participation in JCE as physical element 34–5
acquittal JCE 32–3, 91(n497)
superior responsibility 197
action in unison, sufficiency as proof of JCE 41
actual knowledge of criminal conduct 203–5
inferred, distinguished from ‘reason to know’ 221
ad hoc Tribunals (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) and International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR))
aiding and abetting genocide under 280–90
relationship with complicity in genocide 291–303
choice of form of responsibility 381–406
prosecution, by 382–5
reliance on JCE 420–1
restriction of (Blaškic rule) 396–404, 423–4
trial chamber, by 385–8
commission liability, emphasis on 421–3
complicity and aiding and abetting of genocide under 280–90
relationship between 291–303
concurrent convictions 381–93
dolus eventualis (recklessness)
definition of 349
use of 350
forms of responsibility, development of 416–18
genocide, punishable acts under ICTY 280
impact on international criminal law 424–5
individual criminal responsibility 280
JCE, usage by ICTR 28–33
model of physical elements of JCE 34–5
new forms of responsibility, attitude to introducing 417–18
planning, instigating and ordering crimes under 344–5, 379–80
recklessness see dolus eventualis (recklessness) above
sentencing 406–14
superior responsibility under 151, 416–17
failure to punish and prevent crimes 262–4
mental element 169
subordinate–superior relationship 158–9
Agius, Judge Carmel
on whether physical perpetrator must be participant in JCE 100
aiding and abetting 278–80, 341–2
accused’s presence at crime, need for 316–17
ad hoc Tribunals, under 280–90
after the fact 315, 317(n235)
co-perpetration, distinguishing from 12–13
complicity in genocide, relationship to 291–303
ECCC, under 338–9
elements see elements of aiding and abetting genocide 280–90
ICC, under 330–4
JCE, distinction from 11–13, 55
 omission, by,
 existence in international law 310–15
 perpetrator/co-perpetration, distinguishing from 12–13
 SCSL, under 334–7
 SICT, under 339–40
 SPSC, 337
 Akhavan, Payam
 on distinction between inchoate crimes and forms of responsibility in genocide 282

430
anticipation of committing crime as mental element of JCE 70–83
Appeals Chamber
binding nature of decisions 26(n94)
armed conflicts, superior responsibility in 150, 175–6
Article 7(6)(1) form of responsibility, concurrent convictions under
Article 7(6)(3), and 393–406
restriction on choice (Blaskic rule) 423–4
more than one 388–93
Article 7(6)(3) form of responsibility, concurrent convictions under
Article 7(6)(1), and 393–406
authority of accused as element in ordering of crime 367–70
awareness of crime as mental element aiding and abetting genocide 321–4
complicity in genocide 329–30
Blaskic rule 396–404, 423–4
Bonomy, Judge Iain
indirect co-perpetration, on 421
jurisdiction of Tribunal to impose JCE, on 123–4
whether physical perpetrator must be participant in JCE, on 98–9, 101–2, 104
Cambodia see Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC)
choice of form of responsibility 381–406
reliance on JCE 420–1
restriction of (Blaskic rule) 396–404, 423–4
civilian superiors, criminal liability of superior responsibility 154–8, 191–3, 253–60
co-perpetration see also perpetrator
aiding and abetting, distinguishing from 12–13
application 14
elements see elements of co-perpetration
indirect see indirect co-perpetration
JCE applied instead of 115, 121
liability for origin of 10–14
requirement for arising of 14
precedents for 113–4, 119–20
Rome Statute as to 18
validity in law 114
commission / committing
aiding and abetting 305–7, 316–19, 328–9
anticipation of 70–83
commission liability
complicity, in relation to 421–3
meaning genocide, as to 116–21, 124
JCE, as to 23–4, 106
statutory basis for JCE within 15, 33
common criminal design/plan/purpose, etc., see joint criminal enterprise (JCE)
common plan, design or purpose as element of JCE 34–5
complicity in genocide 279, 341–2
ad hoc Tribunals, under 280–90
aiding and abetting, relationship to 291–303
commission liability, in relation to 421–3
definition 286, 289–90
ECCC, under 338–9
elements 327–30
genocide, distinction from 286–8
ICC, under 330–4
JCE, through 287–8
SCSL, under 334–7
SICt, under 339–40
SPSC, under 337
concurrent convictions 387–8
Article 7(6)(1) and 7(6)(3) 393–406
more than one Article 7(6)(1) form of responsibility 388–93
restriction on choice (Blaskic rule) 423–4
crime conspiracy
JCE, distinction from 25(n91), 283(n13)
whether inchoate crime or form of responsibility 283(n13)
constructive knowledge of criminal conduct 205–21
contours of forms of responsibility 98, 123(n713)
culpability principle 9(n6)
cumulative convictions, distinction from concurrent convictions 388
cumulative effect of accused’s functions in gauging effective control 194–5
de facto authority as basis for effective control 155(n60), 182(n210), 186–9
de jure authority as basis for effective control 184–6, 195
defective indictment 36, 109(n618), 118(n679)
design of criminal conduct as element of planning 354–7
deviatory crime within JCE 72–3, 75–9, 81–4
direct and substantial contribution as element of ordering crime 370–1
direct intent, definition of 344, 351(n53)
direct responsibility for crimes see ordering crimes
do ilas eventualis (recklessness) definition of 349
use of 350
domestic criminal law
co- and indirect perpetration within 120
comparison with forms of responsibility 2–3
need for support for existence of JCE within 22–3
reliance on, by international law 415–16
duty of commanders in Geneva Conventions 150
duty to punish subordinates 172–3
East Timor Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC)
complicity in and aiding and abetting genocide under 337
forms of responsibility under 133–6
planning, instigating and ordering crime under 376–7
superior responsibility under 268–71
ECCC see Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
effective control see under superior responsibility
  elements of aiding and abetting 303–4, 428
  mental 319
  awareness of crime 321–4
  intentional action 319–21
  requisite intent 325–7
  physical 304
  practical assistance, encouragement or moral support
  aiding and abetting by omission in international criminal law 310–15
  physical perpetrator of crime, to 305–7
  presence at scene of crime, by 307–10
  need for 316–17
  scope for 315–16
  substantial effect 317–19
  elements of co-perpetration
  mental 108
  physical 107
  elements of complicity in genocide 327–8
  intentional action and awareness (mental elements) 329–30
  physical elements
  practical assistance, encouragement or moral support
  physical perpetrator of crime, to 328
  substantial effect 328–9
  elements of instigating crime 428
  mental elements, definition of 344
  prompting of crime, act or omission 358–62
  substantial contribution to crime 362–4
  elements of JCE 13–14, 33–4, 426
  framework see Three-category framework for JCE
  mental, 34–5
  1st category
    shared intent 52–6
    voluntary participation 51–2
  2nd category
    intent to further criminal purpose 59–67
    personal knowledge 57–9
    shared intent for specific intent crimes 67–8
  3rd category (‘extended’)
    accused anticipates committing crime 70–83
    intent to participate and further criminal purpose 68–70
  physical
    ad hoc model 34–5
    ICC model 126–8
    elements 34–5
  elements of ordering crime 428
  authority of accused 367–70
  direct and substantial contribution 370–1
  instruction to engage 364–7
  mental elements, definition of 344
  elements of planning crime 428
  design of criminal conduct, act or omission 354–7
  mental elements, definition of 344
  substantial contribution to crime 357–358
  elements of superior responsibility 152, 174–80, 276, 427
failure to prevent or punish element 221–4
  failure to prevent 227–9, 262–4, 277
  failure to punish 229–37, 262–4, 277
  failure to take necessary and reasonable measures 223–7
  historical development 170–4
  duty to punish subordinates 172–3
  mental element 200–3
  actual knowledge 203–5
  ad hoc Tribunals, under 169
  civilian liability under ICC 253–8
  constructive knowledge 205–21
  historical development 159–70
  ICC, under 169–70, 253–60
  terminology, need for clear 277
  subordinate–superior relationship element 158–9,
  181–200 see also superior responsibility
  historical development 152–8
  encouragement of crime as physical element
  aiding and abetting genocide 305–17
  complicity in genocide 328
  espousal of JCE 86–8
  expansion of criminal means of JCE 43–4
  explanation for choice of form of responsibility by
  support 386–7
  extended category of JCE see elements of JCE, 3rd
  category
  Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of
  Cambodia (ECCC)
  complicity in and aiding and abetting genocide
  under 338–9
  forms of responsibility under 136–7
  planning, instigating and ordering crime under
  377–8
  superior responsibility under 271–2
  ‘Failure to Act’ in Geneva Conventions 150
  failure to prevent or punish subordinate criminal
  conduct 221–4, 227–37, 262–4, 276–7
  foreseeability of crime 73–82
  form of indictment 382–8
  forms of responsibility see also specific headings
  choice of 381–406
  prosecution, by 382–5
  restriction of (Blaskić rule) 396–404, 423–4
  trial chamber, by 385–8
  concurrent convictions 423–4
  Article 7(6)(1) 388–406
  Article 7(6)(3) 393–406
  contours of 98, 123(713)
  development by ad hoc Tribunals 416–18
  domestic criminal law, comparison with 2–3
  ECCC, under 136–7
  explanation of trial chamber’s choice of
  386–7
  ICTY, under 124–8
  ICTY Statute, listed in 2
  inchoate crimes, or 280–90
  international law, basis in 415–16
  mental states required for imposition of
  liability 429
Index

- ICC, under 124–8
- precedents for 113–14, 119–20, 122
- indirect instigation 360(n110)
- indirect intent, definition of 344
- individual criminal responsibility
- ad hoc Tribunals, under 280
- culpability principle 9(n6)
- superior responsibility as form of 330(n327)
- UNTAET Regulations, under 337
- inferred actual knowledge 204–5
- distinguished from ‘reason to know’ 221
- influence over subordinates as indicator of effective control 189–90, 197
- instigating crimes
- ad hoc Tribunals, under 344–54, 379–80
- definition
- ICTR 346
- SCSL 375
- ECCC, under 377–8
- elements 346, 358–64
- ICC, under 371–3
- indirect instigation 360(n110)
- SCSL, under 373–6
- ICT, under 378–9
- SPSC, under 376–7
- instruction to engage in criminal conduct as element of ordering 364–7
- intent, meaning of 127(n731)
- intent to further criminal purpose of JCE as mental element 68–70
- intention action as mental element
- aiding and abetting genocide 319–21
- complicity in genocide 329–30
- interlinked JCEs 88–9
- international crimes, nature of basis for imposing liability for JCE 16
- International Criminal Court (ICC) see also Rome Statute
- aiding and abetting and complicity under 330–4
- forms of responsibility under 124–8
- indirect co-perpetration under 124–8
- instigating crime under 371–3
- model of physical elements of JCE 126–8
- ordering crime under 371–3
- planning crime under 371–3
- superior responsibility under 152, 252–64
- failure to prevent or punish subordinate criminal conduct 227–37, 262–4
- mental element 169–70, 258–60
- civilian superiors
- development of 253–8
- omission of control by superior as causation 260–2
- international criminal law
- ‘aiding and abetting by omission’ in 310–15
- domestic law, reliance on 415–16
- emphasis on forms of responsibility arising from 415–16
- forms of responsibility, separateness of 416

new forms, ad hoc Tribunals’ attitude to introducing 417–18
prosecution pleading, principles and practice for 382–5
purpose of 2
SCSL, under 128–33
sentence, effect on 406–14
separateness within international criminal law 416
SICT, under 137–40
SPSC, under 133–6

Geneva Conventions
duty of commanders under 150
‘Failure to Act’ under 150
precedent for JCE 27
superior responsibility under 148–50, 152, 157–8
mental element 159–67
necessary and reasonable measures element 173–4
subordinate–superior relationship 157–8

genocide
3rd-category JCE, relating to 92–3
accomplice, definition of 286
aiding and abetting 280–90
committing, definition of 116–21, 124
complicity see complicity in genocide conspiracy, whether inchoate crime or form of responsibility 283
conviction under JCE 29–30, 56
3rd category 82–3
challenge to 26–8
ICTY, under 280
liability, extent of 286
punishable acts 280
whether inchoate crime or form of responsibility 280–90

Genocide Convention 1948 as precedent for existence of JCE 27
Güney, Judge Mehmet, on committing genocide 116, 117, 118, 119, 121
Gustafson, Katrina
interlinked JCEs, on 88–9
‘he who acts through others is regarded as acting himself’ application to JCE 13
higher-ranking officials, liability of civilians for superior responsibility 258–60
development under ICC 253–8
JCE, for 49, 84–104, 420

ICC see International Criminal Court (ICC)
ICTR see ad hoc Tribunals
ICTY see ad hoc Tribunals

inchoate crimes, whether activities constitute forms of responsibility or 280–90
independent action by participants in JCE 102
indictment, principles for pleading 382–5
indirect co-perpetration 104–124
challenge to 112–14
international criminal law (cont.)

impact of ad hoc Tribunals on 424–5

JCE in 16–28

International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) see ad hoc Tribunals

International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) see ad hoc Tribunals

International Law Commission Draft Code of Offences

superior responsibility under 151

Iraqi Special Tribunal (IST) see Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT)

Israel Commission of Inquiry (Kahan Report)

mental element of superior responsibility, as to 168–9

joint criminal enterprise (JCE)

3rd category, in relation to genocide 92–3

acquittal 32–3, 91 (n497)

acting together in, requirement to prove 41–2

aiding and abetting, distinction from 11–13, 55

alternative terms for 9 (n4)

applicability 27–8

disregarded 28–9

instead of co-perpetration 115, 121

assertion of 23–5

categories

definitions 16–17, 34

development of three-category framework 14–23

first, precedent for 17–18

first and second

conviction under 60–3

similarity 60–1

coop- perpetration, applied instead of 115, 121

commission, meaning 23–4, 106

conspiracy, distinction from 25 (n91), 283 (n13)

contours of responsibility 98, 123 (n713)

defective indictment 36, 109 (n618), 118 (n679)

definition and purpose 8–9

deviant crime within 72–3, 75–9, 81–4

distance between accused and non-participant perpetrator 97–103, 417

ECCC, under 136–7

elements see elements of JCE

espousal of 86–7

expansion of means 43–4

extended category see elements of JCE, 3rd category

first category

precedents in post-Second World War war crimes trials for 17–18

genocide, conviction under see under genocide higher-ranking members, liability of 84–104, 420

ICC, under 124–8

ICTR, usage by 28–33

independent action by participants 102

indirect co-perpetration see indirect co-perpetration

infringement of nullem crimen sine lege by applying 24

Index

intent, meaning of 127 (n731)

interlinked JCE 88–9

international criminal law, basis in 16–28

war crimes judgments post-Second World War 27, 60–1

knowledge, meaning of 127 (n731)

large criminal enterprises, application to 26–7, 84–104

limiting application of 84–104

materialise extemporaneously, definition of 38–9

membership of a criminal enterprise, distinction from 46

mens rea, requirements for 71–2, 79

mutual understanding between accused and perpetrator 84–104, 417

need to identify individuals within 36

notice of charge, need for adequate 30–3

opinio juris requirement to support existence of 21–2

origins and development 10–27

parameters for applicability 25–8

participation see participation in JCE

perpetrator participating in 97–103

preference over other forms of responsibility 421–3

prior agreement for JCE, requirement to prove 38–41

prosecution pleading

refused 30–2

successful 32–3

quis per alium facta per se ipsum facere videtur, application of 13, 126

rejection of JCE 30–1

reliance on JCE by prosecution 420–1

SCSL, under 128–33

sentencing for lower-level participation 50–1

SICT, under 137–40

SPSC, under 128–33

statutory basis within commission 15, 33

three-category framework see Three-category framework for JCE

vast scope of 92 (n306), 97, 101

judgments, recent and expected (list) 6

Kahan Report 168–9

knowledge, meaning of 127 (n731)

large criminal enterprises, application of JCE to 26–7, 84–104

liability

accessory see aiding and abetting

accomplice see complicity in genocide

civilian 253–60

coop- perpetration 12

commission, emphasis by ad hoc Tribunals on 421–3

higher-ranking officials 49, 84–104

international criminal law, basis in 16, 415–16

omission liability

superior responsibility as 171

required mental states for imposition of 429
materialise extemporaneously, definition for JCE 38–9
membership of a criminal enterprise, distinction from JCE 46
mens rea, requirements for JCE 71–2, 79
mental elements of forms of responsibility see under specific entries beginning ‘elements of’ mental states required for imposition of liability 429
modes of participation in genocide whether inchoate crimes or forms of responsibility 280–90
moral support for crime as physical element aiding and abetting genocide, 305–17
complicity in genocide 328
mutual understanding between accused and perpetrator in JCE 84–104

necessary and reasonable measures see also under elements of superior responsibility definition 225(n479)
negligence by superiors, exclusion as basis for superior responsibility 275–6
notice of charge of JCE, need for adequate 30–3
nullem crimen sine lege (‘no crime without a law’) infringement by application of JCE 24, 106

omission of control by superior as cause of crime 260–2

opinio juris
co- and indirect perpetration 120
JCE, requirement for 21–2

ordering crimes ad hoc Tribunals, under 344–54, 379–80
definition (SCSL) 376
ECCC, under 377–8
elements 346, 364–71
ICC, under 371–3
SCSL, under 373–6
SICT, under 378–9
SPSC, under 376–7

plurality of persons in JCE as physical element 34–5
practical assistance to crime as physical element aiding and abetting genocide 305–17
complicity in genocide 328
presence at scene of crime, aiding and abetting by 307–17
prior agreement for JCE, requirement to prove 38–41
promotion of accused as indicator of effective control 195–6
prompting of criminal conduct as element of instigating 358–62

prosecution
pleading forms of responsibility, principles and practice 382–5
pleading JCE 30–3
reliance on JCE by 420–1

quis per alium facit per se ipsum facere videtur, application to JCE 13, 126

reason to know 205–21
reasonably foreseeable 77
recklessness (dolus eventualis) definition of 349
use of 350
requisite intent for aiding and abetting genocide 325–7
Rome Statute see also International Criminal Court (ICC)
forms of responsibility under 124–8
JCE, under 24
co-perpetration 18
distinction between ‘participation’ and ‘aiding and abetting’ 12
individual criminal responsibility under 119–20
precedent for JCE 12
state practice, evidence of 22

scene of crime, aiding and abetting by presence at 307–10

Schomburg, Judge Wolfgang
choice of form of responsibility, on effect of 406–14
lower-level participation in JCE, for 50–1
committing genocide, on 116, 119–20
conviction for ordering and aiding and abetting the same crimes, on 389–91
Index

436

Shahabudden, Judge Mohamed
awareness of JCE, on 93
committing of genocide, on 116, 118, 120
concurrent and cumulative convictions, on 391, 400
shared intent for JCE as mental element 52–6
shared intent for specific intent crimes in JCE as mental element 67–8
Short, Judge Emile Francis
on complicity in genocide in JCE 288–9
SICT see Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT)
significant participation in JCE, definition of 48
simultaneous charge of forms of responsibility 383–5
Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL)
aiding and abetting and complicity under 334–7
forms of responsibility under 128–33
planning, instigating and ordering crime under 373–6
superior responsibility under 264–8
specificity by prosecution in pleading form of responsibility 383–5
SPSC see East Timor Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC)
state practice see domestic criminal law
subordinate criminal conduct
failure to prevent 227–9
failure to punish 229–37
leading to superior responsibility 237–52
subordinate–superior relationship element of superior responsibility see under elements of superior responsibility
subordinates, duty to punish 172–3
substantial contribution to crime
instigating crime 362–4
ordering of crime 370–1
planning of crime 357–8
substantial effect
aiding and abetting genocide 317–19
complicity in genocide 328–9
‘sufficient authority’ as test for superior responsibility 155
superior responsibility 274–8
acquittal 197
actual knowledge 203–5, 221
ad hoc Tribunals, under 151, 416–17
armed conflicts, in 150, 175–6
civilian superiors, liability of 154–8, 191–3, 253–60
definition 143–4, 208
direct responsibility see ordering crimes
ECCC, under 271–2
effective control
cumulative effect of functions 194–5
de facto authority, need for 155(n50), 182(n210), 186–9
de jure authority, need for 184–6, 195
definition of 152, 158, 183
factors against finding of 200
indicia 195–200
influence over subordinates, importance of 189–90, 197
lack of 186
presumption of 186–8
relationship to subordinate, nature of 190–1
elements see elements of superior responsibility
Geneva Conventions, under 148–50, 152, 157–8
historical origins
before Second World War 145–8
post-Second World War 148–57
ICC, under 151, 252–64
individual criminal responsibility, as form of 330(n327)
International Law Commission Draft Code of Offences, under 151
negligence by superiors, rejection as basis 275–6
omission liability, as 177
perpetrators, need to identify 194
SCSL, under 264–8
SICT, under 272–4
SPSC, under 268–71
subordinate criminal conduct leading to 237–52
‘sufficient authority’ as test for 155
vicarious liability, distinction from 177–8, 189
Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT)
compliety in and aiding and abetting genocide under 339–40
forms of responsibility under 137–40
planning, instigating and ordering crime under 378–9
superior responsibility under 272–4
Three-category framework for JCE see also elements of JCE
definition of categories 16–17, 34
development 14–23
similarity of first and second categories 60–3
United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET) Regulations
individual criminal responsibility under 337
JCE under 133, 135
vast scope of JCE 92(n506), 97, 101
vicarious liability
distinction from superior responsibility 177–8, 189
voluntary participation in JCE as mental element 51–2
war crimes, superiors’ responsibility for see superior responsibility
Yugoslavia see ad hoc Tribunals