Uncertain Demographics and Fiscal Sustainability

There is widespread acceptance that much of the developed world faces a potential pensions and welfare crisis as a result of declining birth rates and an ageing population. However, there is considerable uncertainty about the specifics of demographic forecasting and this has significant implications for public finances. Uncertain Demographics and Fiscal Sustainability addresses the economic consequences of uncertainty and, with particular reference to European economies, explores the impact of demographic risks on public finances, including pension systems, health care and old-age care expenditures. Covering a spectrum of theoretical and empirical approaches, different types of computational models are used to demonstrate not only the magnitudes of the uncertainties involved but also how these can be addressed through policy initiatives. The book is divided into four parts covering demographic, measurement, policy and methodological issues. Each part is followed by a discussion essay that draws out key elements and identifies common themes.

JUHA M. ALHO is Professor of Statistics at the University of Joensuu, Finland. He is the author (with Bruce D. Spencer) of *Statistical Demography and Forecasting* (2005) and a former president of the Finnish Society of Biostatistics.

SVEND E. HOUGAARD JENSEN is Managing Director of the Copenhagen-based Centre for Economic and Business Research (CEBR), Professor of Economics at Copenhagen Business School and a member of the Danish Council for Research Policy.

JUKKA LASSILA is Research Director at the Research Institute of the Finnish Economy (ETLA) in Helsinki. He has co-ordinated several international research projects concerning population ageing and was scientific co-ordinator in the EU Fifth Framework research project 'Demographic Uncertainty and the Sustainability of Social Welfare Systems'.

Uncertain Demographics and Fiscal Sustainability

Edited by

Juha M. Alho, Svend E. Hougaard Jensen and Jukka Lassila



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87740-4 - Uncertain Demographics and Fiscal Sustainability Edited by Juha M. Alho, Svend E. Hougaard Jensen and Jukka Lassila Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521877404

© Cambridge University Press 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87740-4 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	List of figures List of tables List of contributors Preface	page vii xi xiv xiv xvi
1	Introduction Juha M. Alho, svend E. Hougaard Jensen And Jukka lassila	1
Part I	Uncertain demographics	
2	Changing views of future demographic trends NICO KEILMAN, HARRI CRUIJSEN AND JUHA M. ALHO	11
3	Empirically based specification of forecast uncertainty JUHA M. ALHO, HARRI CRUIJSEN AND NICO KEILMAN	34
	Comment: The UPE forecasts: strengths, innovations, developments SHRIPAD TULJAPURKAR	55
Part Il enviro	Measuring sustainability in a stochastic nment	
4	Fiscal implications of demographic uncertainty: comparisons across the European Union MARTIN WEALE	65
5	Demographic uncertainty and pension projections JUKKA LASSILA AND TARMO VALKONEN	82

vi	Contents	
6	Demographic uncertainty and health care expenditure NAMKEE AHN	94
	Comment: Assessing the uncertainty in long-term fiscal projections PABLO ANTOLIN	109
Part Il	II Enhancing sustainability	
7	Evaluating pension reforms in the German context HANS FEHR AND CHRISTIAN HABERMANN	117
8	Longevity adjustment of pension benefits JUKKA LASSILA AND TARMO VALKONEN	137
9	Ageing, demographic uncertainty and optimal fiscal policy ALEX ARMSTRONG, NICK DRAPER, ANDRÉ NIBBELINK AND ED WESTERHOUT	161
	Comment: Computable equilibrium models in policy analysis: future directions D. PETER BROER	184
Part I	V Extensions	
10	Macro-economic consequences of demographic uncertainty in world regions VLADIMIR BORGY AND JUHA M. ALHO	195
11	Informational assumptions, aggregate mortality risk and life-cycle saving JUHA M. ALHO AND NIKU MÄÄTTÄNEN	219
12	Uncertain demographics, longevity adjustment of the retirement age and intergenerational risk-sharing SVEND E. HOUGAARD JENSEN AND OLE HAGEN JØRGENSEN	239
13	A general equilibrium analysis of annuity rates in the presence of aggregate mortality risk JUSTIN VAN DE VEN AND MARTIN WEALE	258
	Comment: The economics of demographic uncertainty MARTIN FLODÉN	270
	Index	275

Figures

2.1	Forecasts of average annual rate of population growth	
	in EEA+ countries to 2050. Averages across eighteen	
	EEA+ countries (UN, UPE) and fifteen EU-15	
	countries (Eurostat)	page 15
2.2	Total fertility rate assumptions in EEA+ countries,	
	2045–2049. Averages across eighteen EEA+ countries	
	(UN, UPE) and fifteen EU-15 countries (Eurostat)	16
2.3	Total fertility rate in eighteen EEA+ countries,	
	1900–2000	18
2.4	Life expectancy assumptions in EEA+ countries,	
	2045–2049. Averages across eighteen EEA+ countries	
	(UN, UPE) and fifteen EU-15 countries (Eurostat)	22
2.5	Life expectancy at birth in eighteen EEA+ countries,	
	1900–2000	23
2.6	Net migration assumptions in EEA+ countries,	
	2045–2049. Averages across eighteen EEA+ countries	
	(UN, UPE) and fifteen EU-15 countries (Eurostat)	26
3.1	Scales for age-specific mortality in forecast year 1 and	
	forecast year 47	46
3.2	Relative standard deviation of age-specific mortality for	
	ages 40+	47
3.3	Distribution of gross migration by age: males and	
	females	49
IC.I	Volatility of birth cohorts: Sweden, 1900–2005	57
IC.2	Growth of 1–5 cohort: Sweden, 2010–2020	58
IC.3	Growth of 1–5 cohort: Sweden, 2040–2050	59
IC.4	UPE assumptions for distribution of age at death:	(0)
4 1	Sweden, 2002 and 2048	60
4.1	Frequency distribution of the tax increase needed to	
4.0	restore long-term fiscal balance: Belgium	70
4.2	requency distribution of the tax increase needed to	70
	restore long-term fiscal balance: Finland	76
		vii

viii List of figures

4.3	Frequency distribution of the tax increase needed to	
1.5	restore long-term fiscal balance: in Germany	77
44	Frequency distribution of the tax increase needed to	
1.1	restore long-term fiscal balance: The Netherlands	78
45	Frequency distribution of the tay increase needed to	10
1.5	restore long-term fiscal balance: Spain	78
46	Frequency distribution of the tax increase needed to	10
1.0	restore long-term fiscal balance: United Kingdom	79
61	Per-capita public health expenditure (as % of	.,
0.1	GDP/capita) by age	96
62	Forecast of old-age dependency ratio in Spain	98
6.3	Forecasted public health expenditure $(2004=1)$ in	20
0.5	Snain	99
64	Effect of distinguishing survival status on health	
0.1	expenditure: 50% prediction interval of public hospital	
	expenditure $(2004=1)$	103
65	Importance of cost pressure in health expenditure	105
0.5	(2004=1): effect of additional 1% annual increase in	
	age-specific health expenditure (+)	105
IIC.1	Histogram: increase in age-related spending in 2050	205
	(percentage points of GDP)	111
7.1	Total population	121
7.2	Old-age dependency ratio (population aged 65–100/	
	population aged 20–64), 2004–2050	122
7.3	Pension contribution rates, 2004–2050	127
7.4	Health care contribution rates, 2004–2050	128
7.5	Consumption tax rates, 2004–2050	129
7.6	Replacement rates of reform options, 2004–2050	130
7.7	Contribution rates of reform options, 2004–2050	131
7.8	Expected welfare effects of the pension reforms (as	
	percentage of remaining lifetime resources)	132
7.9	Intergenerational risk-sharing implications (normalized	
	ratio of standard deviation)	134
8.1	Pension contribution and replacement rates in Finland	
	in 2030 and 2050	151
8.2	Sustainability and adequacy	153
8.3	The effect of longevity adjustment on the actuarity rates	
	of three cohorts	155
9.1	Optimal tax policy curve in the deterministic scenario	170
9.2	Stochastic distribution of the total dependency ratio	172
9.3	Distribution of required labour income tax increases	173

	List of figures	ix
9.4	Optimal tax policy curves in the deterministic and	175
9.5	Demographic uncertainty and household risk aversion	175
9.6	Ontimal fiscal policy and the long-run budget	170
210	constraint under certainty and uncertainty	178
10.1	Point forecast of the dependency ratio (retired persons	110
	divided by total working-age population), 2000–2050	198
10.2	Point forecast of the high saver population (age-group	
	45-69 years) as percentage of the total population,	
	1960–2050	199
10.3	Stochastic forecasts of the world population,	
	2000–2050: independence of interregional forecast	
	errors	201
10.4	World interest rate as a function of the G3 dependency	
	ratio in 2030 under the assumption that interregional	
10 5	forecast errors are independent	208
10.5	World interest rate as a function of the G3 dependency	
	ratio in 2030 under the assumption that interregional	200
10.6	We while a set of the	209
10.0	1005 2050, difference from baseline scenario	210
10.7	Evolution of net saving (as percentage of GDP)	210
10.7	1995–2045: difference from baseline scenario	210
10.8	Evolution of current account balance in the INGENUE	210
1010	2 model (percentage of world GDP), 2000–2050	212
10.9	Current account as a function of saving in Western	
	Europe in 2025 under the assumption that interregional	
	forecast errors are independent	212
10.10	Current account as a function of saving in Western	
	Europe in 2025 under the assumption that interregional	
	forecast errors are perfectly correlated	213
10.11	Current accounts as a function of saving in the Indian	
	region in 2025 under the assumption that interregional	
	forecast errors are independent	214
10.12	Current account as a function of saving in the Indian	
	region in 2025 under the assumption that interregional	
	forecast errors are perfectly correlated	215
11.1	Histogram of average lifetimes in 10,000 simulations	224
11.2	wentare costs of using period 1 point forecast vs rational	220
11 2	Welfare costs of constant expectations vs rational	449
11.5	expectations as a function of average lifetime	230
	expectations as a remember of average methic	250

x	List of figures	
11.4	Welfare costs of updated point forecasts vs rational	
	expectations	231
11.5	Welfare costs of updated point forecasts vs rational	
	expectations as a function of average lifetime	231
11.6	Welfare gains of perfect foresight vs rational	
	expectations	233
11.7	Welfare gains of perfect foresight vs rational	
	expectations as a function of average lifetime	233
11.8	Average welfare gains of perfect foresight vs rational	
	expectations (upper curve), and average welfare gains of	
	using updated point forecasts vs rational expectations	
	(lower curve) as a function of average lifetime	235
12.1	Adult lifetime, work and retirement	242
13.1	Supply and demand for annuities	
	$(\gamma = 0.3; \sigma^2 = 0.01, 0.04)$	264

Tables

2.1	Predictions of the old-age dependency ratio in 2050:	
	selected countries	page 12
2.2	Country-specific predictions for the total fertility rate in	
	2050: UN, Eurostat and UPE forecasts	17
2.3	Country-specific predictions for life expectancy in 2050:	
	UN, Eurostat and UPE forecasts	20
2.4	Country-specific predictions for net migration (per	
	thousand of the population in 2000) in 2050: UN,	
	Eurostat and UPE forecasts	25
3.1	Relative uncertainty as expressed by high and low	
	forecasts of the United Nations (2004) and Eurostat	
	(2005), the relative standard deviation derived by the	
	UPE project (UPE) and as estimated from the empirical	
	errors of the UN forecasts in the period 1970–1990	
	(EMP), for the total population in 2050	37
3.2	The standard deviation of the relative error of total	
	fertility during first and last forecast years as specified by	
	the UPE project, and relative uncertainty as expressed by	
	high and low forecasts of the United Nations (2004) and	
	Eurostat (2005)	45
3.3	The half-width of one-sigma intervals for life expectancy	
	at birth as specified by the UPE project for the year	
	2049, and the half-width of the high-low interval of	
	Eurostat (2005) for the year 2050	48
3.4	Scale of total net migration in 2003 and 2049 per	
	thousand of population in year 2000, the estimated	
	autocorrelation κ as specified by the UPE project and the	
	half-width of the high-low interval of Eurostat (2005),	
	per population in year 2005	50
3.5	Comparison of properties of conventional and stochastic	
	population forecasts	52

xi

xii List of tables

4.1	Summary statistics for tax increases needed to restore	
	fiscal balance	79
5.1	Pension expenditure as percentage of GDP in 2003 and	
	2050	83
5.2	80% predictive ranges of pension expenditure and	
	old-age ratio, as percentage of the median in 2050	84
5.3	Pension expenditure as percentage of GDP in 2050: the	
	EPC's central projection and its sensitivity range	88
6.1	Summary statistics of uncertainty in old-age dependency	
	ratio and health expenditure in 2050	100
7.1	Parameter values of the model	125
7.2	The initial year 2004	126
7.3	Sustainable consumption tax rate (per cent)	129
8.1	Contribution and replacement rates and longevity	
	adjustment	149
8.2	Sustainability and adequacy gaps and longevity	
	adjustment	154
8.3	Actuarity rates and generational equality	157
9.1	Parameters in the GAMMA model	164
9.2	Key indicators under the baseline scenario with	
	unchanged policies	166
9.3	Fiscal and macro-economic development under labour	
	income tax smoothing	168
9.4	Labour income tax rate increases in the deterministic	
	policy scenarios	169
9.5	Labour income tax rate increases in the stochastic policy	
	scenarios	173
10.1	Coefficients of variation used for the calibration of the	
	uncertainty scale parameters	200
10.2	Quantiles of the predictive distribution of world	
	population in 2050 (billions)	201
10.3	Quantiles of the predictive distribution of the	
	dependency ratio in Western Europe in 2010, 2030 and	
	2050	202
10.4	Quantiles of the predictive distribution of the	
	dependency ratio in the Russian region in 2010, 2030	
	and 2050	202
10.5	Quantiles of the predictive distribution of GDP growth	
	in Western Europe in 2010, 2030 and 2050	205
10.6	Quantiles of the predictive distribution of GDP growth	
	in the Russian region in 2010, 2030 and 2050	205

List of tables	xiii
10.7 Quantiles of the predictive distribution of the world interest rate, 2010–2050	206
10.8 Dependence of standard deviation of world interest rate on interregional correlation of population uncertainty	207
11.1 Parameter values for the mortality process and the median survival probabilities	223
11.2 The welfare cost of not taking aggregate mortality risk into account under low information alternatives	228
11.3 The welfare gain of having perfect foresight vs rational expectations	232
12.1 Calibration of the model	246
12.2 Economic effects of a fertility shock	247
12.3 Economic effects of a longevity shock	248
12.4 Economic effects of delayed retirement	249
13.1 Effects of aggregate mortality risk on the annuity market	266

Contributors

- NAMKEE AHN Fundacion de Estudios de Economia Aplicada (FEDEA), Spain
- JUHA M. ALHO University of Joensuu, Finland
- PABLO ANTOLIN OECD
- ALEX ARMSTRONG Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis (CPB), The Netherlands
- VLADIMIR BORGY Centre d'Etudes Prospectives et d'Informations Internationales (CEPII), France
- D. PETER BROER Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis (CPB), The Netherlands
- HARRI CRUIJSEN Democast, The Netherlands
- NICK DRAPER Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis (CPB), The Netherlands
- HANS FEHR University of Würzburg, Germany
- MARTIN FLODÉN Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden
- CHRISTIAN HABERMANN University of Würzburg, Germany
- SVEND E. HOUGAARD JENSEN Centre for Economic and Business Research (CEBR), Denmark
- OLE HAGEN JØRGENSEN Centre for Economic and Business Research (CEBR), Denmark
- NICO KEILMAN University of Oslo, Norway
- JUKKA LASSILA Research Institute of the Finnish Economy (ETLA), Finland

xiv

List of contributors

xv

- NIKU MÄÄTTÄNEN Research Institute of the Finnish Economy (ETLA), Finland
- ANDRÉ NIBBELINK Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis (CPB), The Netherlands
- SHRIPAD TULJAPURKAR Stanford University, USA
- TARMO VALKONEN Research Institute of the Finnish Economy (ETLA), Finland
- JUSTIN VAN DE VEN National Institute of Economic and Social Research (NIESR), UK
- MARTIN WEALE National Institute of Economic and Social Research (NIESR), UK
- ED WESTERHOUT Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis (CPB), The Netherlands

Preface

This book arose from two research projects, 'Demographic Uncertainty and the Sustainability of Social Welfare Systems' (DEMWEL) and 'Uncertain Population of Europe' (UPE).

DEMWEL was carried out between January 2003 and March 2006 by research teams from the following nine institutes: CEBR, the Centre for Economic and Business Research, Copenhagen, Denmark; CEPII, Centre d'Etudes Prospectives et d'Informations Internationales, Paris, France; CEPS, the Centre for European Policy Studies, Brussels, Belgium; CPB, the Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis, The Hague, The Netherlands; ETLA, the Research Institute of the Finnish Economy, Helsinki, Finland; FEDEA, Fundacion de Estudios de Economia Aplicada, Madrid, Spain; FPB, the Belgian Federal Planning Bureau, Brussels, Belgium; NIESR, the National Institute for Economic and Social Research, London, UK; and the University of Würzburg, Germany.

DEMWEL utilized results produced in UPE. The latter ran from September 2001 to August 2004 and was carried out by researchers from the Central Bureau of Statistics, The Netherlands; the Central Bureau of Statistics, Norway; NIDI, The Netherlands; Statistics Finland; and the University of Joensuu, Finland.

Both DEMWEL and UPE were funded by the EU's Fifth Framework Programme. A grant from the Yrjö Jahnsson Foundation for editing this book is also gratefully acknowledged.