Reading Herodotus represents a new departure in Herodotean scholarship: it is the first multi-authored collection of scholarly essays to focus on a single book of Herodotus’ Histories. Each chapter covers a separate logos in Book 5 and proposes an original thesis about the political, historical, and cultural significance of the subjects that Herodotus treats in this section of the narrative. In addition, each chapter analyses the connections and continuities between its logos and the overarching structure of Herodotus’ narrative. This collection of twelve essays by internationally renowned scholars represents an important contribution to existing scholarship on Herodotus and will serve as an essential research tool for all those interested in Book 5 of the Histories, the interpretation of Herodotean narrative, and the historiography of the Ionian Revolt.

Elizabeth Irwin is Assistant Professor of Classics at Columbia University. She is the author of Solon and Early Greek Poetry. The Politics of Exhortation (2005).

Emily Greenwood is Lecturer in Greek at the University of St Andrews. She is the author of Thucydides and the Shaping of History (2006) and co-editor, with Barbara Graziosi, of Homer in the Twentieth Century. Between World Literature and the Western Canon (2007).
READING HERODOTUS

A Study of the logoi in Book 5 of Herodotus’ Histories

EDITED BY

ELIZABETH IRWIN
Columbia University

and

EMILY GREENWOOD
University of St Andrews
To those who have helped
us read Herodotus
## Contents

| Acknowledgements | xi |
| List of contributors | xiv |
| List of abbreviations | |

### Introduction: reading Herodotus, reading Book 5

*Elizabeth Irwin and Emily Greenwood*

1 ‘What’s in a name?’ and exploring the comparable: onomastics, ethnography and *kratos* in Thrace

*Elizabeth Irwin*

2 The Paeonians (5.11–17)

*Robin Osborne*

3 Narrating ambiguity: murder and Macedonian alliance

*David Fearn*

4 Bridging the narrative (5.23–7)

*Emily Greenwood*

5 The trouble with the Ionians: Herodotus and the beginning of the Ionian Revolt (5.28–38.1)

*Rosaria Munson*

6 The Dorieus episode and the Ionian Revolt (5.42–8)

*Simon Hornblower*

7 Aristagoras (5.49–55, 97)

*Christopher Pelling*

8 Structure and significance (5.55–69)

*Vivienne Gray*
Contents

9 Athen and Aegina (5.82–9)
   Johannes Haubold 226

10 ‘Saving’ Greece from the ‘ignominy’ of tyranny? The
   ‘famous’ and ‘wonderful’ speech of Socles (5.92)
   John Moles 245

11 Cyprus and Onesilus: an interlude of freedom (5.104, 108–16)
   Anastasia Serghidou 269

12 The Fourth Dorian Invasion and the Ionian Revolt
   (5.76–126)
   John Henderson 289

Bibliography 311
Index locorum 330
General index 336
Acknowledgements

The editors have incurred many fortunate debts in the preparation of this volume. The Colloquium on which this volume is based was held in the Faculty of Classics at Cambridge University (July 2002) and was made possible by a generous grant from the Faculty of Classics. We would like to thank the then Faculty Board for supporting the Colloquium. Liz Irwin would like to thank the AHRB-sponsored project 'The Anatomy of a Cultural Revolution: 430–380 BC', directed by Robin Osborne, for supporting her decision to organize a Colloquium on Herodotus and to undertake joint editorship of the subsequent volume. She would also like to thank Girton College, which was her home from the Colloquium’s conception to its realization as an edited volume. Emily Greenwood would like to thank St Catharine’s College, Cambridge, where she was a research fellow at the time of the Colloquium, and the School of Classics at the University of St Andrews. Both editors are indebted to the Classics Department of Columbia University for the generosity of the Lodge Fund in helping to defray some of the costs involved in the publication of this volume.

All of the speakers at the Colloquium benefited from an astute and engaging audience composed of members of the Faculty of Classics at Cambridge; we regret that we cannot name participants individually but would like to thank those who took part for their contribution to Reading Herodotus. We would also like to record particular thanks to Tom Harrison, Rosalind Thomas, and Hans van Wees, who acted as general respondents to the papers and helped us to articulate themes and questions.

We happily acknowledge how much we owe to our contributors; without them we could not have realized this experiment of reading Herodotus in the round. On a practical level they have made our work easy in submitting chapters so expertly, promptly and graciously. It is a privilege to have the opportunity to publish their work in this volume.

As editors we have been blessed with unstinting criticism, advice and encouragement from Paul Cartledge, Pat Easterling, Robin Osborne, and
Acknowledgements

John Henderson. They have shown us great generosity in commenting on successive drafts.

In the final stages of preparing this volume we were fortunate to work with Mr Bernard Dod, who has been an astute and congenial copy-editor in spite of being confronted with a bulky typescript. We would like to express our gratitude for the benefit of his editorial expertise, which has saved us from many errors and oversights. Alan Fishbone was also of great assistance in ridding the typescript of errors, and to him we offer our thanks. We have been very lucky to have Rosina di Marzo as our production editor and thank her for her patience and support. After all the help that we have received, we bear responsibility for any errors that remain.

Last but by no means least, we are especially grateful to Michael Sharp who has been a patient and judicious adviser throughout the development of this volume. We have had the benefit of no fewer than five different anonymous readers whose rigorous criticism and tough questioning has improved the final volume.
Contributors


Vivienne Gray is Professor of Classics and Ancient History at the University of Auckland. She has published extensively on Herodotus and Xenophon, and her commentary entitled Xenophon on Government (on Xenophon’s Hiero and Lacedaemoniorum Respublica and the anonymous Atheniensium Respublica) was published in April 2007 in the Cambridge Greek and Latin Classics series. Her recent publications on Herodotus include ‘Herodotus’ Short Stories’, in Egbert J. Bakker, Irene de Jong and Hans van Wees (eds.) Brill’s Companion to Herodotus (Leiden, 2002), and ‘Herodotus in two minds’, in John Davidson (ed.) Theatres of Action, (Auckland, 2003). She is currently writing a monograph entitled Xenophon Reassessed.

Emily Greenwood is Lecturer in Greek at the University of St Andrews. Her recent publications include Thucydides and the Shaping of History (London, 2006) and articles on Greek historiography and the reception of Classics in the Caribbean. She is co-editor, with Barbara Graziosi, of Homer in the Twentieth Century: between World Literature and the Western Canon (Oxford, 2007), and is also writing a book entitled Afro-Greeks: Dialogues between Classics and Caribbean Literature.

Johannes Haubold is Leverhulme Lecturer in Greek Literature at the University of Durham. He is the author of Homer’s People: Epic Poetry and Social Formation (Cambridge, 2000) and co-author, with Barbara
List of contributors


John Henderson is Professor of Classics at the University of Cambridge. His most recent books are The Triumph of Art at Thorvaldsens Museum: Love in Copenhagen (Museum Tusculanum Press, Copenhagen, 2005), The Medieval World of Isidore of Seville: Truth from Words (Cambridge, 2006), Oxford Reds: Classic Commentaries on Latin Classics (London, 2006), and Plautus, Asinaria: The One About the Asses (Madison, 2006). He is currently working on the following books: Sculpture and People in Vigeland Park at Frogner: Oslo’s Monster, Brothers Keepers: Cicero’s Letters to Cicero, and Terence, Getting Your Own Back on Yourself (Hautontimorumenus).

Simon Hornblower teaches at University College London, where he is Grote Professor of Ancient History and Professor of Classics. His most recent book is Thucydides and Pindar: Historical Narrative and the World of Epinikian Poetry (Oxford, 2004). He is now working on the third volume of a large-scale Thucydides commentary for Oxford University Press (previous volumes 1991 and 1996). This will include books 6 and 7, the Sicilian Expedition.

Elizabeth Irwin is Assistant Professor of Classics at Columbia University. She has published mainly on archaic Greek poetry, including her recent book, Solon and Early Greek Poetry: the Politics of Exhortation (Cambridge, 2005). She is now devoted to political readings of fifth-century literature.

John Moles is Professor of Latin at the University of Newcastle-upon-Tyne. His most recent publication is ‘The Thirteenth Oration of Dio Chrysostom’, JHS 125 (2005) 112–38. He has published extensively on Greek and Latin literature and Greek philosophy and is currently preparing articles on Virgil and the Acts of the Apostles and a commentary on Plutarch’s Life of Brutus.

Rosaria Munson is Professor of Classics at Swarthmore College. She is the author of numerous articles on Herodotus and two books: Telling Wonders: Ethnographic and Political Discourse in the Work of Herodotus (Ann Arbor, 2001) and Black Doves Speak: Herodotus and the Languages of Barbarians (Cambridge, Mass., 2005). She is currently co-authoring (with Carolyn Dewald) a commentary to Book I of Herodotus’ Histories to be published by Cambridge University Press.
List of contributors


CHRISTOPHER PELLING is Regius Professor of Greek at the University of Oxford. His most recent books are Literary Texts and the Greek Historian (London, 2000) and Plutarch and History (Swansea and London, 2002). He is currently working on a commentary on Plutarch’s Life of Caesar and on a number of papers on Herodotus and other Greek historians; his next project will be a work on ideas of historical explanation in Greek historiography.

ANASTASIA SERGHIDOU is Lecturer in Greek History at the Department of History and Archaeology at the University of Crete and an associate member of the research division Phécie EA 3563 at the University of Paris I and VII. She specializes in Greek cultural history with a particular focus on social, cultural and affective dependencies. Her current research project is ‘Aspects of affective and social dependencies in Herodotus’. She is also editing a volume entitled Fear of Slaves—Fear of Enslavement in the Ancient Mediterranean, based on the Proceedings of the 29th Conference of the Groupement International de Recherches sur l’Esclavage Antique that she organized in Rethymnon in November 2004 (forthcoming in 2007, Presses Universitaires de Franche-Comté).
Abbreviations

All Greek passages quoted in this volume are taken from the latest Oxford Classical Texts edition of each author or, occasionally, the latest Teubner edition (where the Teubner edition is used, this is mentioned in the text).

The following abbreviations are used in this work:

AAA Archaiologika Analekta ex Athenon
AAntHung. Acta Antiqua Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae
ABSA Annual of the British School at Athens
AION Annali dell’Istituto Orientale di Napoli
AJPh American Journal of Philology
AncSoc Ancient Society
AncW Ancient World
ASNP Annali della Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa
BCH Bulletin de correspondance hellénique
BICS Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies
CAH Cambridge Ancient History
ClAnt Classical Antiquity
CJ Classical Journal
CPh Classical Philology
CQ Classical Quarterly
CR Classical Review
DK H. Diels and W. Kranz (eds.) Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker (Berlin, 1952)
EMC Echos du monde classique
FGrH F. Jacoby, Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker, 15 vols. (Berlin and Leiden, 1923–58)
GRBS Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies
### List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G&amp;R</td>
<td>Greece and Rome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSCPh</td>
<td>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>Illinois Classical Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IG</td>
<td>Inscriptiones Graecae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JHS</td>
<td>Journal of Hellenic Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JRS</td>
<td>Journal of Roman Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MH</td>
<td>Museum Helveticum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAPS</td>
<td>Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBA</td>
<td>Proceedings of the British Academy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCA</td>
<td>Proceedings of the Classical Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCPS</td>
<td>Proceedings of the Cambridge Philological Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLLS</td>
<td>Proceedings of the Leeds Latin Seminar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUCC</td>
<td>Quaderni urbinati di cultura classica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDAC</td>
<td>Report of the Department of Antiquities, Cyprus (Nicosia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REA</td>
<td>Real-Encyclopädie der klassischen Altertumswissenschaft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REG</td>
<td>Revue des études grecques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RhM</td>
<td>Rheinisches Museum für Philologie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEG</td>
<td>Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIMA</td>
<td>Studies in Mediterranean Archaeology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAPhA</td>
<td>Transactions of the American Philological Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YCS</td>
<td>Yale Classical Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZPE</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>