THE STRUGGLE FOR CONSTITUTIONAL POWER

For nearly three decades, scholars and policymakers have placed considerable stock in judicial reform as a panacea for the political and economic turmoil plaguing developing countries. Courts are charged with spurring economic development, safeguarding human rights, and even facilitating transitions to democracy. How realistic are these expectations, and in what political contexts can judicial reforms deliver their expected benefits? In this book, Tamir Moustafa addresses these issues through an examination of the politics of the Egyptian Supreme Constitutional Court, the most important experiment in constitutionalism in the Arab world.

The Egyptian regime established a surprisingly independent constitutional court to address a series of economic and administrative pathologies that lie at the heart of authoritarian political systems. Although the Court helped the regime to institutionalize state functions and attract investment, it simultaneously opened new avenues through which rights advocates and opposition parties could challenge the regime. The book examines the dynamics of legal mobilization in this most unlikely political environment.

Standing at the intersection of political science, economics, and comparative law, The Struggle for Constitutional Power challenges conventional wisdom and provides new insights into perennial questions concerning the barriers to institutional development, economic growth, and democracy in the developing world.

Tamir Moustafa is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Wisconsin–Madison. He teaches and writes in the areas of comparative law and society, religion and politics, and politics of the Middle East. He was the recipient of the Edward S. Corwin Award for the Best Dissertation in Public Law from the American Political Science Association (2004) and the Best Dissertation Award from the Western Political Science Association (2004).
The Struggle for Constitutional Power

LAW, POLITICS, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN EGYPT

Tamir Moustafa
University of Wisconsin
# Contents

*List of Figures and Tables*  
*Acknowledgments*  
1 Introduction: Law versus the State  
2 The Politics of Domination: Law and Resistance in Authoritarian States  
3 The Establishment of the Supreme Constitutional Court  
4 The Emergence of Constitutional Power (1979–1990)  
7 Law, Development, and Democracy: A Critical Appraisal  

**APPENDIX A:** SCC Justices and Commissioners  
**APPENDIX B:** The Egyptian Constitution  
**APPENDIX C:** Law 48 of 1979 Governing the Operations of the Supreme Constitutional Court of Egypt  
**APPENDIX D:** Figures on Supreme Constitutional Court Rulings  

*Bibliography*  
*Index*
Figures and Tables

**FIGURES**

1.1 Rulings of unconstitutionality by the Egyptian Supreme Constitutional Court, 1980–2004  
1.2 Supreme Constitutional Court – judicial support network synergy  
4.1 Egyptian law school graduates by year, 1948–1996  
A1 Volume of petitions reaching the Supreme Constitutional Court by year, 1979–2005  
A2 Volume of Supreme Constitutional Court rulings by year, 1980–2003  
A3 Percentage of SCC rulings by chief justice

**TABLES**

3.1 Distribution of capital by sector and source in Law 43 projects underway as of December 31, 1980  
3.2 Growth of the Egyptian bureaucracy, 1952–1987  
4.1 Egyptian political parties in 1990  
5.1 Leading human rights organizations by year of establishment  
5.2 Egyptian political parties in 1995  
6.1 New rights organizations by year of establishment
Acknowledgments

This book was made possible with the assistance and support of many colleagues, friends, and institutions. I was fortunate to have the advice and support of outstanding mentors at the University of Washington. Joel Migdal’s thoughtful and sustained guidance was extraordinarily helpful at all stages of the project, from the first tentative discussions to revisions of the final book manuscript years later. Michael McCann helped to broaden my project from one that was initially concerned with a peculiar aspect of Egyptian political life to a project engaged with a broader field of public law scholars. Ellis Goldberg helped me to think about my work in new ways by raising weighty questions without easy answers. Anthony Gill was more than generous with his time and guidance. I am also thankful to James Caporaso, Rachel Cichowski, Reşat Kasaba, the late Dan Lev, Margaret Levi, John Mercer, and Susan Whiting at the University of Washington.

Funding from the Fulbright Commission, the Social Science Research Council, the American Research Center in Egypt, and the National Science Foundation made possible the fieldwork for this book in Cairo. There I received valuable input from Mustapha Kamal al-Sayyid, professor of political science at Cairo University; Mohamed Badran, professor of law at Cairo University; Hossam ‘Eissa, professor of law at ‘Ain Shams University; Sa’ad Eddin Ibrahim at the American University of Cairo; Baudouin Dupret and Nathalie Bernard-Maugiron at the Centre d’Etudes et de Documentation Economiques, Juridiques, et Sociales (CEDEJ); and the late Ibrahim Shihata, former general counsel of the World Bank. Justice Adel Omar Sherif deserves special thanks for his assistance over the years. Human rights activists Gasser ‘Abd al-Raziq and Atef Shehata Said were both generous with their time and assistance. I also wish to thank Hoda Harb, Isis Hakim, and Zineb Davis for their helpful research assistance.
Acknowledgments

Fellowships at Berkeley and Princeton provided me with the time and facilities to revise the manuscript. At Berkeley, I wish to thank Martin Shapiro and Michael Watts. At Princeton University, I am particularly grateful to Kim Lane Scheppele, director of the Law and Public Affairs Program, for her support and hospitality.

I also wish to thank several colleagues for reading and commenting on my work at different stages of the project, including Ceren Belge, Nancy Bermeo, Nathan Brown, Jason Brownlee, Charles Epp, Scott Gehlbach, Roger Hartley, Laura Hatcher, Stan Katz, Arang Keshavarzian, David Leheny, Nancy Maveety, Joe Nevins, Roger Owen, Leigh Payne, Bruce Rutherford, Michael Schatzberg, Miguel Schor, Kristen Stilt, and Jennifer Widner.

I am grateful to a number of colleagues at the University of Wisconsin who were generous in their mentoring, guidance, and friendship. Thanks to Orfeo Fioretos, Hawley Fogg-Davis, Ed Friedman, Paul Hutchcroft, Tony Michels, Joe Soss, and Aili Tripp. Finally, I would like to thank my editor at Cambridge University Press, John Berger, for his superb guidance.

A project of this length requires a good deal of encouragement along the way. Steady and committed moral support was always forthcoming from my mother and father, Margaret and Mohamed Moustafa, and from my brother and sister-in-law, Shereef and Brenda Moustafa. My years in Cairo would not have been the same without the support of family and friends. I am grateful to the entire Eid, Abu Senna, and Ashour families for their endless hospitality and affection. I also want to thank Sara Zaghlul, Magda Aboulfadl, Wilson Jacob, and Kareem Shalaby for their companionship in Cairo. Nawartu misr! Finally, I wish to thank Leila Harris, Justin Lin, Nina Lobo, Pat and Lisa Nelson, and Phil Shekleton.

This book is dedicated to my mother and father, Margaret and Mohamed Moustafa.