

# A Global History of History

A global history of historical writing, thought and the development of the historical discipline from the ancient world to the present. This is a definitive guide to human efforts to recover, understand and represent the past, bringing together different historical traditions and their social, economic, political and cultural contexts. Daniel Woolf offers clear definitions of different genres and forms of history and addresses key themes such as the interactions between West and East, the conflict of oral, pictographic and written accounts of the past and the place of history in society and in politics. Numerous textual extracts and illustrations in every chapter capture the historical cultures of past civilizations and demonstrate the different forms that historical consciousness has taken around the world. This book offers unique insights into the interconnections between different historical cultures over 3,000 years and relates the rise of history to key themes in world history. Special attention is paid to connections between the modern dominance of Western forms of historical consciousness and the impact of European empires on other parts of the world.

**Daniel Woolf** is Professor of History at Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario where he is currently also Principal and Vice-Chancellor. His previous publications include *Reading History in Early Modern England* (Cambridge, 2000) and the two-volume *Global Encyclopedia of Historical Writing* (1998). He is also general editor of the *Oxford History of Historical Writing* (2010–).





# A Global History of History

**Daniel Woolf** 

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY
KINGSTON, ONTARIO, CANADA





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

#### www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521699082

© Daniel Woolf 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87575-2 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-69908-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For JAGW



# **CONTENTS**

	List of illustrations	page viii
	List of text extracts	xiv
	List of subject boxes	xvi
	Preface and conventions	xix
	Acknowledgments	XXV
	Introduction	1
1	Foundations	23
2	History during the First Millennium AD	<b>7</b> 5
3	An Age of Global Violence, c. 1000 to c. 1450	119
4	History in the Early Modern Empires: Europe, China, Islam	177
5	Transatlantic Histories: Contact, conquest and cultural exchange 1450–1800	233
6	Progress and History in the Eurasian Enlightenments	281
7	The Broken Mirror: Nationalism, romanticism and professionalization in the nineteenth-century West	345
8	Clio's Empire: European historiography in Asia, the Americas and Africa	399
9	Babel's Tower? History in the Twentieth Century	457
	Epilogue	509
	Further reading Index	515 553



# **ILLUSTRATIONS**

## Chapter 1

	The state of the s		
1	Clio, the Muse of History. Roman marble figure, c. AD 130–40, here		
	depicted as a Roman lady; the missing left hand may have held a scroll.	a scroll.	
	Museum, Cyrene, Libya. Copyright Gilles Mermet/Art Resource, NY. page	24	
2	The Palermo stone, one of five fragments of a stele known as the		
	Royal Annals of the Old Kingdom, other parts of which are kept		
	in Cairo and London. All are part of a rectangular stele of black		
	amphibole diorite with names of pre-dynastic rulers, levels of Nile		
	floods and royal protocols. Engraved in the twenty-fifth century		
	BC. Museo Archeologico, Palermo, Italy. Photo credit: Erich		
	Lessing/Art Resource, NY.	25	
3	Cuneiform tablet with part of the Babylonian Chronicle		
	(605–594 BC), obverse of tablet. Neo-Babylonian, c. 550–400 BC.		
	British Museum, London. Copyright British Museum/Art Resource, NY.	29	
4	The Cyrus cylinder, 530s BC. An account by Cyrus of Persia of		
	his conquest of Babylon and the capture of Nabonidus, the last		
	Babylonian king. British Museum, London. Photo credit: Erich		
	Lessing/Art Resource, NY.	30	
5	Double-headed herm of the Greek historians Herodotus and Thucydides		
	from the Farnese Collection. Hellenistic sculpture. Museo Archeologico		
	Nazionale, Naples, Italy. Photo credit: Alinari/Art Resource, NY.	35	
6	Chinese oracle bone. Shang dynasty (1650–1066 BC). Musée des		
	Arts Asiatiques-Guimet, Paris. Photo: Thierry Ollivier. Photo credit:		
	Réunion des Musées Nationaux/Art Resource, NY.	52	
7	The Qin book-burning under the Emperor Shi Huangdi, late third		
	century BC, depicted in a seventeenth-century history of the lives of		
	Chinese emperors. Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris. Photo credit:		
	Snark/Art Resource, NY.	60	
8	Rajput school (sixteenth to nineteenth centuries). Hanuman, King of		
	the Monkeys, goes to Ceylon. Episode from the Bhāgavata Purāṇa,		
	Hindu miniature, seventeenth century, from the court of Malwa. National		
	Museum, New Delhi, India. Photo credit: Borromeo/Art Resource, NY.	68	



List of illustrations

ix

9	Sanskrit text written in Devanagari script, with illustrations of Hindu stories; border of floral designs on a gold background. British Library, London. Photo credit: HIP/Art Resource, NY.	69
10	Chapter 2 Opening leaf of Book I of a ninth-century manuscript of Bede's Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum. British Library, London,	
11	shelfmark Cotton Tib. C II, fo. 5v. Photo credit: HIP/Art Resource, NY. Excerpt from the text of the <i>Anglo-Saxon Chronicle</i> . This manuscript was probably copied at Abingdon Abbey c. 1046; the last paragraph	86
	describes King Alfred the Great's defeat of the Danes at Edington in AD 878. British Library, London, shelfmark Cotton Tib. B I, fo. 132. Photo credit: HIP/Art Resource, NY.	111
	Chapter 3	
12	At the Court of the Khan. Double-page miniature (left half). Illuminated manuscript page from Rashīd al-dīn's <i>Jāmi 'al-tawārīkh</i> ('Compendium of Chronicles'), a universal history. Manuscript dates <i>c</i> . 1330 AD. Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin, Germany. Photo credit: Bildarchiv	
	Preussischer Kulturbesitz/Art Resource, NY.	127
13	Genghis Khan dividing his empire among his sons. From a Mughalage manuscript of Rashīd al-dīn's <i>Jāmi 'al-tawārīkh</i> ('Compendium of Chronicles'), <i>c.</i> 1596. Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. Image	
14	copyright: The Metropolitan Museum of Art/Art Resource, NY.  Various episodes from French history in a fourteenth-century manuscript of the <i>Chroniques de Saint-Denis/Grandes Chroniques de France.</i> Scenes include the coronation of Pharamond, the Battle of the Franks vs the Romans and the baptism of Clovis. Musée Condé,	128
15	Chantilly, France. Photo credit: Bridgeman-Giraudon/Art Resource, NY.	141
16	shelfmark Royal 20 C VII, fo. 34. Photo credit: HIP/Art Resource, NY. Sigurd kills Regin, detail from the Saga of Sigurd Favnesbane, twelfth century. Wood carving from the Hylestad stave church, Setesdal, Norway. Universitetets Oldsaksamling, Oslo, Norway. Photo credit:	142
		147
17	Illustration from the collection of Icelandic sagas, the <i>Flateyjarbók</i> , from the Saga of Olaf Tryggvason, here depicted killing a wild boar and a sea-ogress. Late fourteenth-century manuscript. Stofhun Arna	



Χ

## List of illustrations

	Magnussonar a Islandi, Reykjavik, Iceland. Photo credit: Werner	
	Forman/Art Resource, NY.	148
18	Genealogical table of the Saxon kings and emperors (top row: Dukes	
	Brun, Ludolf and Otto of Saxony), from Ekkehard von Aura, Chronicon	
	Universale. Miniature on parchment, c. 1100-50, Corvey, Germany.	
	Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin, Germany. Photo credit: Bildarchiv	
	Preussischer Kulturbesitz/Art Resource, NY.	150
19	Family tree of the royal Nemanjic dynasty, Serbia. Byzantine fresco,	
	1346-50. Decani Monastery, Decani, Kosovo. Photo credit: Erich	
	Lessing/Art Resource, NY.	151
20	Caesar landing in Britain, from an illuminated Flemish manuscript	
	of Jean Mansel, La fleur des histoires, c. 1454-60. Bibliothèque	
	de l'Arsenal, Paris, MS 5088, fo. 112. Photo credit: Erich Lessing/Art	
	Resource, NY.	152
21	Civil service examinations under the Song dynasty. Manuscript page	
	from a seventeenth-century history of the lives of Chinese emperors.	
	Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris. Photo credit: Snark/Art Resource, NY.	157
	Chapter 4	
22	Die Alexanderschlacht, or 'The Battle of Alexander at Issus', 333 BC.	
	Painting by Albrecht Altdorfer, 1529. Alte Pinakothek, Munich. Photo	
	credit: Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY.	182
23	Sallust, depicted in fresco, c. 1500–3, by Luca Signorelli (1441–1523).	
	Duomo, Orvieto, Italy. Photo credit: Scala/Art Resource, NY.	186
24	Francesco Guicciardini. Nineteenth-century statue of the Florentine	
	historian sculpted by Luigi Cartei. Uffizi, Florence, Italy. Photo credit:	
	Vanni/Art Resource, NY.	189
25	The humanist Antoine Macault reads from his translation of Diodorus	
	Siculus in the presence of Francis I, king of France. From <i>Les trois</i>	
	premiers livres de Diodore de Sicile, trans. A. Macault, 1534, parchment.	•
	Musée Condé, Chantilly, France. Photo credit: Réunion des Musées	100
26	Nationaux/Art Resource, NY.  The Powier Sheb Tehmingher receives the Muschel Emperer Humanuum	198
26	The Persian Shah Tahmāhsb receives the Mughal Emperor Humayyun. Safavid mural, mid-seventeenth century. Chihil Sutun (Pavilion of	
	Forty Columns), Isfahan, Iran. Photo credit: SEF/Art Resource, NY.	212
27	Babur leaving Kabul to attack Kandahar. Miniature from an early	212
27	seventeenth-century manuscript of the <i>Akbarnama</i> . British Library,	
	London. Photo credit: HIP/Art Resource, NY.	219
28	Surrender of Belgrade, 1521. From Lokmān, <i>Hunername</i> , on the	213
20	military campaigns of Suleyman the Magnificent. Ottoman, 1588.	



List of illustrations

xi

	Topkapi Palace, Istanbul. Photo credit: Bridgeman-Giraudon/Art	
	Resource, NY.	224
	Chapter 5	
29	The arrival of Cortés in Mexico depicted in Codex Azcatitlan.	
	Manuscript Mexicains n 59–64. Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris.	
	Photo credit: Snark/Art Resource, NY.	241
30	Lunar goddesses, Mayan manuscript, twelfth century. From the	_ 11
30	Dresden Codex, fo. 20. Saechsische Landesbibliothek, Dresden,	
		249
31	Wooden calendrical slit drum ( <i>teponaztli</i> ), Mixtec, Mexico. The scene	
	depicts a battle between two cities and is carved with figures	
	and calendrical inscriptions in the same style as used in Mixtec	
	screenfold codices. British Museum, London. Copyright British	
	Museum/Art Resource, NY.	250
32	Codex Zouche-Nuttall. Facsimile of codex, a forty-seven-leaf screenfold	
	paper manuscript, painted, after 1320; Mixtec late post-classic period,	
	1200–1521. This contains two narratives: one side relates the history	
	of important centres in the Mixtec region; the other, starting at the	
	opposite end, records the genealogy, marriages and political and	
	military feats of the Mixtec ruler Eight Deer Jaguar-Claw. British	
	Museum, London. Copyright British Museum/Art Resource, NY.	251
33	Massacre of the Aztecs. Miniature from Fray Diego Durán, History	
	of the Indies of New Spain, fo. 211, 1579. Biblioteca Nacional,	
	Madrid. Photo credit: Bridgeman-Giraudon/Art Resource, NY.	252
34	Inca quipu, a series of knotted strings on a carved wooden stick.	
	Peru or Bolivia, 1400–1532. Ethnologisches Museum, Staatliche	
	Museen zu Berlin, Germany. Photo credit: Bildarchiv Preussischer	
	,	259
35	The Quipucamayoc ('Keeper of the Quipu'), from Felipe Guaman Poma	
	de Ayala, El primer nueva corónica y buen gobierno, c. 1600-15. Royal	
	Library, Copenhagen, Denmark. Photo credit: Nick Saunders/Barbara	
	Heller Photo Library, London/Art Resource, NY.	269
	Chapter 6	
36	J. B. Belley, deputy of Santo Domingo, next to a bust of Guillaume T. F.	
,	Raynal, philosopher and historian who criticized French policies in the	
	colonies. Painting on canvas by Anne Louis Girodet de Roussy-Trioson,	
	1797. Chateaux de Versailles et de Trianon, Versailles, France. Photo	
		286



xii

## List of illustrations

David Hume (1711–76), Scottish philosopher and historian; engraved	287
	288
eighteenth-century amateur archaeological activity. Dunham Massey,	
Cheshire, Great Britain. Photo credit: National Trust/Art Resource, NY. Confucius thanking the heavens for his being given the time to write his six books. An illustration of eighteenth-century Sinophilia. Isidore 5. H. Helman (1743–1809), engraving from Abrégé historique des principaux traits de la vie de Confucius, célèbre philosophe chinois, l'après des dessins originaux de la Chine envoyés à Paris par M. Amiot, missionnaire à Pékin. Paris, 1788. Private Collection. Photo	304
rredit: Snark/Art Resource, NY.	315
A First Reading of 'The Orphan of China' by Voltaire, 1755. Painting on canvas by Anicet Charles Gabriel Lemonnier (1743–1824). Musée les Beaux-Arts, Rouen, France. Photo Credit: Erich Lessing/Art	
Resource, NY.	316
Scenes from the life of a <i>yangban</i> , by one of Korea's best-known painters, Kim Hong-do (c. 1745 to c. 1806). Eight-panel folding screen. Korean, Yi Dynasty (1392–1910). Musée des Arts Asiatiques-Guimet, Paris. Photo: Thierry Ollivier. Photo credit: Réunion des Musées Nationaux/Art Resource, NY.	319
Chapter 7	
past as subsequently described by Shakespeare and others, whereby the sons of King Edward IV were murdered in the Tower by their uncle, King Richard III, who then usurped the throne. By the German painter Theodor Hildebrandt (1804–74). Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-	
Resource, NY.	348
The Death of the Venerable Bede in Jarrow Priory, by William Bell Scott (1811–90). From a set of murals illustrating Anglo-Scottish border history, designed in 1856, now found in the Central Hall at Wallington Hall. Photo: Derrick E. Witty. Wallington, Northumberland, Great	
	349
Adoc-photos/Art Resource, NY.	354
	antiquaries at Pola, Italy, by Thomas Patch (1725–82), illustrating ighteenth-century amateur archaeological activity. Dunham Massey, heshire, Great Britain. Photo credit: National Trust/Art Resource, NY. onfucius thanking the heavens for his being given the time to write is six books. An illustration of eighteenth-century Sinophilia. Isidore . H. Helman (1743–1809), engraving from Abrégé historique des rincipaux traits de la vie de Confucius, célèbre philosophe chinois, 'après des dessins originaux de la Chine envoyés à Paris par M. amiot, missionnaire à Pékin. Paris, 1788. Private Collection. Photo redit: Snark/Art Resource, NY.  1. First Reading of 'The Orphan of China' by Voltaire, 1755. Painting in canvas by Anicet Charles Gabriel Lemonnier (1743–1824). Musée es Beaux-Arts, Rouen, France. Photo Credit: Erich Lessing/Art esource, NY.  1. cenes from the life of a yangban, by one of Korea's best-known ainters, Kim Hong-do (c. 1745 to c. 1806). Eight-panel folding screen. Grean, Yi Dynasty (1392–1910). Musée des Arts Asiatiques-Guimet, aris. Photo: Thierry Ollivier. Photo credit: Réunion des Musées lationaux/Art Resource, NY.  1. hapter 7  1. The Princes in the Tower. An episode from England's late medieval ast as subsequently described by Shakespeare and others, whereby ne sons of King Edward IV were murdered in the Tower by their uncle, ing Richard III, who then usurped the throne. By the German ainter Theodor Hildebrandt (1804–74). Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-Westfalen, Düsseldorf, Germany. Photo credit: Erich Lessing/Art esource, NY.  1. the Death of the Venerable Bede in Jarrow Priory, by William Bell cott (1811–90). From a set of murals illustrating Anglo-Scottish border istory, designed in 1856, now found in the Central Hall at Wallington (1811. Photo: Derrick E. Witty. Wallington, Northumberland, Great ritain. Photo credit: National Trust Photo Library/Art Resource, NY. (2011). Photo credit: National Trust Photo Library/Art Resource, NY. (2011).



List of illustrations

xiii

46	Jules Michelet, by Thomas Couture (1815–79). Musée Renan Scheffer,	
	Paris. Photo Credit: Bridgeman-Giraudon/Art Resource, NY.	355
47	Portrait of Washington Irving and his Literary Friends at Sunnyside,	
	Irving's Tarrytown, New York home, by Christian Schussele (1824–79),	
	1864. The painting is a 'Who's Who' of the antebellum American	
	literary elite which included popular historians: W. H. Prescott is	
	seated centrally in profile, George Bancroft at far right. Irving is seated	
	centrally, facing the viewer, to the right of Prescott; James Fenimore	
	Cooper, the historical novelist, sits to the left of Bancroft. National	
	Portrait Gallery, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, DC. Photo credit:	
		363
48	<i>Teaching.</i> A nineteenth-century fresco in the Sorbonne featuring some	
	of France's greatest historians, including Renan, Quinet and Guizot.	
	Michelet is standing, holding papers. Sorbonne, Paris, France. Photo	
	credit: Snark/Art Resource, NY.	365
49	'How the Danes came up the Channel a thousand years ago', 1925. An	
	example of pictorial illustrations in history textbooks from a frequently	
	reprinted early twentieth-century series, Highroads of History. This	
	scene comes from Book II: 'Stories from British History', published by	
	Thomas Nelson and Sons (London, Edinburgh, New York, 1925). The	
	Print Collector, Great Britain. Photo credit: HIP/Art Resource, NY.	366
50	Berlin savants. Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel (top centre) depicted	
	with several stars of the early nineteenth-century Berlin intellectual	
	firmament, including Wilhelm and Alexander von Humboldt.	
	Lithograph, c. 1810, by Julius Schoppe. Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche	
	Museen, Berlin. Photo: Joerg P. Anders. Photo credit: Bildarchiv	
	Preussischer Kulturbesitz/Art Resource, NY.	383
51	Johann Gustav Droysen. Anonymous photograph, c. 1870. A product	
	of the University of Berlin, where Ranke presided, Droysen authored	
	works of both history and the philosophy of history, including his	
	influential Outline of the Principles of History. Photo credit:	
	Adoc-photos/Art Resource, NY.	386
	Charter 0	
F-0	Chapter 8	
52	Solomon grasping the hand of the Queen of Sheba. Illuminated page	
	from <i>The History of the Queen of Sheba</i> . Ethiopia, late nineteenth century, text in Ge'ez and Amharic. Manuscript division, Staatliche	
	Museen zu Berlin, Germany. Photo credit: Bildarchiv Preussischer	
	Kulturbesitz/Art Resource, NY.	441
	Kulturocsitz/Art resource, 1v1.	441



# TEXT EXTRACTS

	Chapter 1	
1	Assyrian historical propaganda: the Synchronistic History	page 28
2	Thucydides on his own historical methods	37
3	Early Chinese historical writing: the Zuozhuan	58
4	Annalistic writing in the Vamsas: the reign of Vijayabahu I	
	(r. 1056–1111)	71
	Chapter 2	
5	Bede's Ecclesiastical History	88
6	Isidore of Seville on history	90
7	Islamic historical writing in the tenth century: al-Ṭabarī	97
8	History in early Japan: Nihon Shoki on the Emperor Temmu	107
	Chapter 3	
9	Mongol historical writing: Altan Tobči	124
10	The Crusades from a Muslim perspective: the Chronicle of	
	Ibn al-Qalānisī	126
11	Norse historical writing: Snorri Sturluson's Heimskringla	138
12	History in medieval Russia: the Chronicle of Novgorod	146
13	Fourteenth-century Japanese historical epic: Taiheiki	162
14	Historical writing in thirteenth-century Korea: Ilyŏn's Samguk Yusa	167
	Chapter 4	
15	The spread of humanist history in northern Europe: Fenton's	
	translation of Guicciardini	190
16	Bossuet on the uses of universal history	194
17	Persian historical writing under the Safavids: Iskandar Beg Munshī	213
18	A Mughal princess writes history: Gul-Badan Begam's The History of	f
	Humāyūn	218
19	Mustafa Na'îmâ on how and why to write history	226
	Chapter 5	
20	Alva Ixtlilxóchitl's account of the coming of the Spanish	258



List of text extracts

χV

21	A Spanish missionary on Mesoamerican indigenous histories:  Motolinía	262
22	Guaman Poma de Ayala on the origins of the Incas	266
23	Mercy Otis Warren on history	275
	Chapter 6	
24	Russian historical writing westernizes: Karamzin on the Kiev and	
	Mongol periods	291
25	Voltaire on the necessity of doubt	305
26	0 1	330
27	Herder on the succession of cultures	338
	Chapter 7	
28	Geijer on Swedish medieval history	361
29	Ranke on Guicciardini's History of Italy	369
30	History as a sentimental observer: Carlyle on the struggles of	
	the Girondins and Montagnards	379
31	Positivism and history: Buckle on historiography	380
32	Nietzsche on the characteristics of the historian	393
	Chapter 8	
33	Europe and the awakening of Indian national self-consciousness: K. M. Panikkar	405
34	Barbarism and civilization: Domingo Faustino Sarmiento	408
35	The boundaries of history and fiction: José Milla (1822–82)	409
36	Burmese history: the Glass Palace Chronicle	414
37	A Javanese babad: Babad ing Sangkala	418
38	Sějarah Mělayu: the 'Malay Annals'	420
39	A Sumatran <i>Hikayat</i>	421
40	Early historical writing in Ethiopia	442
41	Napoleon in Egypt: al-Jabartī's Chronicle	447
	Chapter 9	
42	The relations of geography and history: Henri Berr	465
43	Stalin on historical science	478
44	The education of a Marxist historian: Halvdan Koht	484
45	An early postcolonial critic of history: Eric Williams on British	
	historians and imperialism	498
46	The North American indigenous past: Anna Lee Walters	505



# SUBJECT BOXES

	Chapter 1	
1	King lists, annals and chronicles	page 27
2	Xenophon	40
3	Julius Caesar	46
	Chapter 2	
4	Isidore of Seville	89
5	Ta'rīkh al-rusul wa'l-mulūk	96
6	Huayang guozhi	101
	Historical encyclopedias	103
	Rikkokushi ('Six National Histories')	108
	Chapter 3	
9	Mongol chronicles	123
	Historical speculation in the medieval West	132
11	Urban chronicles	149
	Chapter 4	
12	Women and history in Renaissance Europe	181
13	The Donation of Constantine	183
14	The ars historica	197
15	Mustafa Âli's Essence of History	228
	Chapter 5	
16	Las Casas' History of the Indies	245
17	Guaman Poma's El primer nueva corónica y buen gobierno	268
	Chapter 6	
18	Historical writing in Russia	292
	Pietro Giannone's Civil History of the Kingdom of Naples	294
	Charles-Louis de Secondat, baron de Montesquieu	298
21	Henry St John, Viscount Bolingbroke	308



> List of subject boxes xvii 22 William Jones, language and Indian historicity 314 23 Justus Möser 333 Chapter 7 24 Nationalism and the oral past 357 25 Ranke's disciples 372 26 Henri de Saint-Simon 381 Chapter 8 27 Settler historiographies 411 28 Truth and fiction in the babads 417 29 The Kume affair 431 30 The Hamitic hypothesis 444 Chapter 9 31 Relativism 460 32 The Fischer controversy and Historikerstreit 474 33 Hayden White and Metahistory 494 34 The new oral history 503

35 Indigenous historicity

504



# PREFACE AND CONVENTIONS

The purpose of this book, in brief, is to provide a history of history, suitable for undergraduates, faculty members seeking a relatively concise introduction to the subject and the interested general reader. Many years of teaching courses on historiography, and the prescription of several different textbooks for the students in those courses, convinced me that a further work was needed, but most of all I have been struck for many years by the relative dearth of studies of 'historiography' (a term for discussion of which see below, in the introduction) which covered the entire span of human efforts to recover, understand and represent the past, from earliest known times to the present, and that did so in a geographically inclusive manner. There are several books covering very long time spans, and one or two with a global reach, but none in English, of which I am aware, that do both. A conviction that students ought to be exposed to the 'historical cultures' of other civilizations than their own has thus informed my choice of subject; a strong sense that there is a story to be told about the development of historical thought, historical writing and the modern historical discipline, and that it relates directly to some of the larger movements of world history (in particular the global engagement of different peoples and cultures over several millennia), provides the 'plot', if a work on historiography can be said to have a plot.

The years of teaching various aspects of the subject have also convinced me that students, especially those in compulsory courses on historiography, dislike most textbooks because they consist of a parade of names of great historians, most of whom the student has never heard of, and will in all likelihood never read, unless they go on to advanced study in the field. I have therefore tried to avoid creating such a parade, though the necessity of inclusiveness and breadth means that I may not always have succeeded. I have found that students unnecessarily fear historiography as 'difficult' or 'dull' (though it is not always clear what they mean by either word). Since the first time I heard the term 'historiography' as an undergraduate and began to write papers of various sorts (and ultimately a doctoral thesis) on historiographic topics, I have had a fascination with how we have, as a species, come to terms with the past. I find the great works of historiography as intellectually exciting and riveting as many great works of literature, though it is true that very few historians have written works that command a wide readership today. Many other past historical works, of lesser literary merit, can nonetheless



ΧХ

#### Preface and conventions

provide us with windows into past cultures' ideas about their own pasts, and with traces of now-vanished notions about scholarship and truth. A broadening of my own horizons in the past fifteen years has not changed my attitude to the 'classic' histories, but it has led me to many non-Western works of historiography and thus to a different perspective on the more familiar 'canon' of great historians from Thucydides to the present. Many of these non-Western works are, happily, gradually becoming more readily available in English and other European languages.

While the chapters of this book are free-standing and can be assigned separately, the reader will derive more from the book if he or she reads them in order: there is, again, an argument and a story, and there is a continuity of themes between chapters.

In order to make the book more accessible, and allow it to serve multiple purposes, I have introduced a few features that are not normally found in texts on historiography. These are connected to, but can again, stand apart from, the main narrative. Four features in particular require explanation.

- The first is a series of 'Subject Boxes'. These provide additional detail on particular episodes or important points in the history of history, and sometimes on individual historians, approaches or 'schools'. They can be read on their own and are separated from the main narrative both in order to highlight them and not to distract from the account in the chapter itself.
- The second is a parallel series of offset 'Extracts', in addition to the quotations that appear in the main text. These are designed to provide illustrative examples, principally of lesser-known histories or historians, and often of non-European historical works (or works indicating historical consciousness even if they do not fit the normal expectations of what a history should look like). Quotations in the text proper routinely illustrate a point being made in the book; the offset extracts, while generally illustrative, can be detached and analysed separately. Instructors may, of course, find these too brief, and wish to prescribe separate, lengthier extracts from other works, or even the complete text by a particular historian, a Herodotus or Voltaire. In my experience, there is relatively little time in a twelve-week or even twenty-four-week course for students to read very many complete works, though it is certainly hoped that some will be sufficiently excited by the topic that they wish to pursue it on their own, or in further courses.
- The third is an annotated 'Further Reading' section for each chapter (rather than a single amalgamated bibliography), which can be found at the end of the book. On occasion, where two or more sections share several titles in common, their further reading sections have been combined; and in Chapter 8, an additional bibliographical appendix has been supplied, arranged by nation or region, reflecting



Preface and conventions

xxi

one important theme (the connection between history and modern nationalism) of that chapter. In the case of books for which there are multiple editions I have listed the edition which I have consulted, while sometimes noting for clarity the original year in which the work was published. This is especially necessary with some secondary works widely available in modern paperback editions but in fact authored many years or even decades ago and thus likely to have been superseded or at least modified by subsequent scholarship.

• The fourth feature is the inclusion of a number of pictures. With a few exceptions, these avoid the 'portrait gallery' (to go along with the textual 'parade') of famous historians. On rare occasions where images of individual historians are included it is typically in order to reveal something about contemporary (or later) perceptions of them. In several instances, the pictures are intended to help illustrate a particular point or to give the reader a clearer idea of the actual appearance of an object referred to, especially where dealing with physical forms of history other than the book (for instance, Inca quipus and Mesoamerican pictorial histories).

## Diacriticals and transliteration

In a work such as this where many languages and scripts come into play, a balance needs to be struck between fidelity to the original and readability for the nonexpert. I have thus in several instances adopted a 'minimal-diacritical' approach.

For Arabic the full standard system which I have followed in other works is unnecessarily elaborate in a book such as this which is intended for the relative novice. I have followed the usage and spellings in C. F. Robinson, *Islamic Historiography* (Cambridge, 2003), including dots above and below letters and bars above, but dispensing with underlined characters. With familiar proper or family names that are frequently used in English (such as 'Abbasid', 'Mamluk' or 'Muhammad'), diacriticals have been dispensed with.

In Arabic, the mark 'denotes a letter ('ayn) often transliterated as an inward facing single quotation mark; 'denotes a quite distinct character, hamza. Hamzas and 'ayns have generally been retained, using this form of transliteration.

Indian names and words are also heavily accented, especially those from earlier periods, but these marks have normally been discarded in sections on modern India and modern Indian historians, in keeping with current scholarly practice on the subcontinent.

Roman alphabet titles of books are not adjusted but appear as they would in normal bibliographical records.

Chinese names and words are rendered according to the pinyin system, which has supplanted the older Wade-Giles system as the standard protocol for



xxii

#### Preface and conventions

transliteration: thus Mao Zedong not Mao Tse-tung. Certain exceptions to this rule apply for historians with established Western names, such as Confucius, whose Chinese name was either Kong Qiu or Kong Zi (Master Kong). The names of Chinese historians publishing in Western languages, and the titles of books originally issued in those languages, follow the actual spelling of the author or title, whether Wade-Giles or pinyin.

Korean words and names are more problematic, as no system has yet achieved dominance, including the long-standing McCune-Reischauer system, and romanization practices thus vary. I have therefore often provided alternative spellings of a word or name.

Chinese, Korean and Japanese names appear with the family name first followed without a comma by the given name. This is well-known and common practice for Chinese and Korean, but in the case of Japanese, Western journalistic practice has tended to invert the name order according to North American usage, a practice that we have not followed: thus a reference to Ienaga Saburō denotes a historian whose surname is Ienaga. Occasional exceptions, mainly historians whose names appear Western-style on their English-language publications, are indexed with commas to avoid confusion; a few Japanese historians (Motoori Norinaga and Hayashi Razan for instance) are by convention referred to by their given names, e.g. Norinaga. As with Arabic, where a word has become commonplace in English usage (for instance 'shogun'), the diacriticals are omitted.

Adjectives or adverbs constructed out of foreign terms, usually for the purpose of grouping a category of person or text, dispense with diacriticals. Thus we write on India about  $pur\bar{a}na$  (the noun), but about puranic texts.

Where the system of transliteration in a quoted or extracted text differs from my own usage (as for instance in the case of Chinese, where most translations until recently followed the Wade-Giles method, while I have used the now-standard pinyin system), I have maintained the spelling as it is in the source of the extract or quotation, and of course in actual titles of modern books and articles. Thus the historian referred to by me as 'Sima Qian' is the same individual referred to by earlier authors as 'Ssu-ma Ch'ien', which is simply the same name in Wade-Giles transliteration; Ban Gu is Pan Ku, and so on; the Qing dynasty is the same as the Ch'ing; and Mao Zedong is Mao Tse-tung. Occasionally where I have felt more explicit signposting is justified I have inserted the pinyin spelling in square brackets.

## Citations and quotations

In an effort to maximize readability, footnotes have been kept to a minimum and are used to document very specific points and quotations or, on occasion, to add a detail of interest but not essential to the main narrative. Where a fact or point



Preface and conventions

xxiii

is uncontroversial, well known or contained in many other books, no footnote is provided. Bibliographic references for primary quotations and the longer extracts that accompany the main text are given in full. Not every item cited in a footnote is included in the 'Further reading' section.

Titles of historical works cited within the main text are routinely given in their original language (transliterated if in a non-Roman script) with an English translation of that title following in quotation marks, within parentheses; such translated titles are generally not italicized except where used subsequently in the main text or, naturally, if a particular edition of the work is cited, as in the footnotes and bibliography. The purpose of this somewhat cumbersome practice is to provide an understandable translation (typically one used in the secondary works on which I have relied) to English-speaking readers while also easing reference back to the work in its original language for those willing and able to read it. Where the meaning of a title seems reasonably obvious, or is cited fully in a note, no parenthetical translation is provided, and in some instances I have, for the sake of brevity, simply referred to a work by its most familiar English title. The foreign names of journals and periodicals are not normally translated, e.g. *Historische Zeitschrift*.

## **Dates**

A multitude of calendars have been used by various peoples in the course of the past five thousand years. Full compliance with the non-Eurocentric principles of this book would suggest that dates be recorded as the authors being described recorded them, for instance using the Hijri year of the Muslim calendar. However, this would be far more confusing than helpful. While a compromise might have been to use dates in the format of Common Era (CE)/Before the Common Era (BCE), I have opted for familiarity and simplicity and used the more conventional 'BC' and 'AD'.

Vital dates (where known) for most historians (and many who were not historians but nonetheless figure in the narrative) are provided in the main text. Certain abbreviations for dates have been used:

- b. = born, in the case of historians still living as of mid-2010.
- c. = *circa*, approximate year where no firm year is known or agreed upon. comp. = composed during or complete by.
- d. = died. Used where a firm death year is known (or approximate, in which case noted as 'd. c.').
- est. = established, for instance, a journal or historical society.
- fl. = 'floruit', that is 'flourished': generally used in relation to authors for whom birth and death dates are entirely unknown or highly obscure; indicates active period.



xxiv

#### Preface and conventions

r. = 'reigned'. When a monarch is noted, his or her regnal years, not years of birth and death, are noted in parentheses. The same applies to non-monarchical but significant officials, for instance popes.

In some cases alternative dates are used either because of lack of agreement in scholarship as to a single date, or in some instances because the date itself is tied to a particular chronological scheme which itself is ambiguous.



# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The many historians mentioned in the next several hundred pages often acknowledged patrons, employers, monarchs and those who provided them with information or correction. It is both appropriate and a pleasure for me to do so in the case of this book.

My various undergraduate instructors (at Queen's University, to which I have recently returned) and graduate mentors at Oxford encouraged my early interest in historiography. They are too numerous to name individually, as are the dozens of colleagues in both early modern British/European history and, latterly, the broader history of historiography, whom I have met and profited from over several decades. Colleagues at the several other institutions in which I have worked generously provided references and suggestions. I have similarly learned a great deal from the many contributors to the Global Encyclopedia of Historical Writing, which I edited in the 1990s, and to its more recent successor, still in the process of appearing, The Oxford History of Historical Writing. I would, however, like to thank by name (though some of them have not always agreed with me on particular points or even approach), Michael Aung-Thwin, Michael Bentley, Stefan Berger, Peter Burke, William Connell, Antoon De Baets, Ewa Domańska, Georg Iggers, Donald R. Kelley, Ann Kumar, the late Joseph Levine, Fritz Levy, Chris Lorenz, Juan Maiguashca, Allan Megill, J. G. A. Pocock, Attila Pók, José Rabasa, Jörn Rüsen, Dominic Sachsenmaier, Masayuki Sato, Axel Schneider, Romila Thapar, Edoardo Tortarolo, Markus Völkel, Q. Edward Wang and Hayden White. Several institutions have invited me to lecture on historiography in the past few years and I have profited from questions and criticisms received on those occasions; in particular, a workshop on global historiography at the University of Vienna in April 2010, organized by Professor Deborah Klimburg-Salter, allowed me a dry run of the book's introduction. I must also acknowledge my debt to the work of two historiographers a generation senior to me (and whom I have corresponded with but regrettably never met in person), Ernst Breisach and the late John Burrow, both authors of surveys of Western historiography. If my book differs substantively from their own, especially in its geographic scope, it is the better for having obliged me to think carefully about the basis of that difference.

Maryanne Cline Horowitz, general editor of the *New Dictionary of the History of Ideas*, invited me in 2002 to write an essay on historiography for that publication.



xxvi

#### Acknowledgments

The present book is an expansion of that essay, and I thank Michael Watson at Cambridge University Press both for encouraging me to write it and for his patience through many revisions. I thank Rosina di Marzo at the Press for having shepherded the book through production and Rose Bell for exemplary copyediting. I am grateful to the Board of Governors at my former institution, the University of Alberta, for providing me with a year's leave during which a (much longer) first draft of the book was written, and to the University of Alberta's Vice-President (Research) and Provost and Vice-President (Academic) for funding that allowed, among other things, the acquisition of the many illustrations and the hiring of graduate research assistance. Among my own graduate students at Alberta and (after 2009) Queen's, principally in the area of early modern England, who have put up with my digressions into global historiography, and often provided perceptive feedback, I thank Matthew Neufeld, Sarah Waurechen and Jane Wong Yeang-Chui. Other graduate students have assisted in other ways (including summarizing for me books in languages which I do not read), in particular Tanya Henderson, Carolyn Salomons, Tony Maan and Nina Paulovicova. The experience of teaching historiography to many students at all levels at Queen's (during an earlier, postdoctoral, stage of my career), Bishop's, Dalhousie, McMaster and the University of Alberta added immeasurably to my sense of what I liked in other textbooks and what I did not, which was of course not always the same as what the students liked.

Ian Hesketh, my research associate at Queen's, took time out from his other duties to provide a ruthlessly sharp critique and meticulous editing of the first version of the manuscript, shrinking it down from its previously unmanageable size. His ability to turn five words into two without loss of clarity is enviable. But for his assistance, the book would have been much later to appear, and unnecessarily long. He also provided invaluable assistance in the home stretch by compiling the timelines of key texts and events included in each chapter.

Several historians (including some already named above) provided extra assistance in the form of bibliographic references, clarification of particular points and readings of parts or whole of the manuscript. Apart from three anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press, all of whom provided commentary and suggestions for improvement, I thank for reading significant chunks of the book Donald Baker, John Bentley, Adam Budd (an exacting stylistic critique of the last four chapters), Fernando Cervantes, Tarif Khalidi and Baki Tezcan; and (again) Q. Edward Wang, José Rabasa, Juan Maiguashca, Romila Thapar, Dominic Sachsenmaier and Michael Aung-Thwin. Georg Iggers, who has been an ally for nearly twenty years in my conviction that historiography needed to be globalized, carefully read the entire manuscript. He alerted me very late in the process that my interpretation of



Acknowledgments

xxvii

twentieth-century trends, and my assessment of the current state of the discipline, had become more negative than I in fact intended.

As is customary, I preserve my greatest debts for last. My three children, Sarah, Samuel and David, have provided great joy and pride from their early childhood into adulthood; they have been among the rare class of pre-schoolers able to pronounce the word 'historiography'. My parents continue into their eighties to convey a convincing interest in and understanding of what I do for a living. Above all, my wife Julie Anne Gordon-Woolf, health administrator, part-time professional harpist and latterly spouse of a university vice-chancellor, has accompanied me on both my geographical and intellectual peregrinations, and has been a voice of encouragement, patience and reason throughout the project – a gift this tribute cannot remotely repay. It is to her that I dedicate this book.

And, as is also customary, none of the persons thanked here is responsible for the errors of fact or judgment that may remain.

DRW

Kingston, Ontario, April 2010