

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism explores the tensions that arise when culturally diverse democratic states pursue both justice for religious and cultural minorities and justice for women. Sarah Song provides a distinctive argument about the circumstances under which egalitarian justice requires special accommodations for cultural minorities while emphasizing the value of gender equality as an important limit on cultural accommodation. Drawing on detailed case studies of gendered cultural conflicts, including conflicts over the “cultural defense” in criminal law, aboriginal membership rules, and polygamy, Song offers a fresh perspective on multicultural politics by examining the role of intercultural interactions in shaping such conflicts. In particular, she demonstrates the different ways that majority institutions have reinforced gender inequality in minority communities and, in light of this, argues in favor of resolving gendered cultural dilemmas through intercultural democratic dialogue.

SARAH SONG is Assistant Professor of Law and Political Science at the University of California, Berkeley.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contemporary Political Theory***Series Editor**

Ian Shapiro

Editorial Board

Russell Hardin

Stephen Holmes

Jeffrey Isaac

John Keane

Elizabeth Kiss

Susan Okin

Phillipe Van Parijs

Philip Pettit

As the twenty-first century begins, major new political challenges have arisen at the same time as some of the most enduring dilemmas of political association remain unresolved. The collapse of communism and the end of the Cold War reflect a victory for democratic and liberal values, yet in many of the Western countries that nurtured those values there are severe problems of urban decay, class and racial conflict, and failing political legitimacy. Enduring global injustice and inequality seem compounded by environmental problems, disease, the oppression of women, racial, ethnic, and religious minorities, and the relentless growth of the world's population. In such circumstances, the need for creative thinking about the fundamentals of human political association is manifest. This new series in contemporary political theory is needed to foster such systematic normative reflection.

The series proceeds in the belief that the time is ripe for a reassertion of the importance of problem-driven political theory. It is concerned, that is, with works that are motivated by the impulse to understand, think critically about, and address the problems in the world, rather than issues that are thrown up primarily in academic debate. Books in the series may be interdisciplinary in character, ranging over issues conventionally dealt with in philosophy, law, history, and the human sciences. The range of materials and the methods of proceeding should be dictated by the problem at hand, not the conventional debates or disciplinary divisions of academia.

*Other books in the series*Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.) *Democracy's Value*Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.) *Democracy's Edges*Brooke A. Ackerly *Political Theory and Feminist Social Criticism*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Clarissa Rile Hayward *De-Facing Power*

John Kane *The Politics of Moral Capital*

Ayelet Shachar *Multicultural Jurisdictions*

John Keane *Global Civil Society?*

Rogers M. Smith *Stories of Peoplehood*

Gerry Mackie *Democracy Defended*

John Keane *Violence and Democracy*

Kok-Chor Tan *Justice without Borders*

Peter J. Steinberger *The Idea of the State*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521874878

© Sarah Song 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Justice, gender, and the politics of multiculturalism / Sarah Song.

p. cm. – (Contemporary political theory)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87487-8 (hardback)

ISBN 978-0-521-69759-0 (pbk.)

1. Sex discrimination against women. 2. Women's rights. 3. Minorities – Civil rights. 4. Multiculturalism. 5. Pluralism (Social sciences) 6. Culture conflict. 7. Social Justice. I. Song, Sarah, 1973– II. Title. III. Series.

HQ1237.J87 2007

305.48'8 – dc22 200700749

ISBN 978-0-521-87487-8 hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-69759-0 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2008

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For my parents

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
1 Introduction	1
The problem of internal minorities	2
Reframing the debate	4
Justice and the claims of culture	8
Outline of the book	11
 Part I	 15
2 The concept of culture in political theory	17
Culture as an “irreducibly social good”	17
Culture as a “primary good”	22
The structure of identity	29
The constructivist challenge	31
3 Justice and multiculturalism: an egalitarian argument for cultural accommodation	41
Why equality?	43
Rights-respecting accommodationism	46
Present discrimination	51
Historical injustice	53
State establishment of culture	61
The role of deliberation	68
 Part II	 85
4 The “cultural defense” in American criminal law	87
“Marriage by capture” and the law of rape	89
“Wife murder” and the doctrine of provocation	93
A qualified defense of the “cultural defense”	100
Potential boomerang effects	109
Conclusion	112
5 Tribal sovereignty and the Santa Clara Pueblo case	114
Tribal sovereignty and gendered rules of tribal membership	115
	ix

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism
Sarah Song
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

x	Contents	
	The state’s role in the politics of tradition formation	120
	Intercultural congruence and the accommodation of tribal practices	127
	The limits of tribal sovereignty	131
6	Polygamy in America	142
	The rise and fall of Mormon polygamy	143
	The antipolygamy movement and the diversionary effect	145
	Mormon polygamy today	156
	A case for qualified recognition	160
	Conclusion	165
7	Epilogue	169
	<i>References</i>	178
	<i>Index</i>	192

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

I have acquired many debts to people and institutions while writing this book, and it is a pleasure to acknowledge them here. I am thankful for the generous funding and support that enabled me to revise and complete this book, from the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation, the Visiting Scholars Program at the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, and the Department of Political Science at MIT.

I presented earlier versions of parts of this book at conferences and colloquia, and I thank the audiences at the following places for their thoughtful comments and suggestions: at Yale, the Department of Political Science, the political theory workshop, and the Center for Race, Inequality, and Politics; at MIT, the political philosophy workshop, the Workshop on Gender and Philosophy, and the Women's Studies Intellectual Forum; the Harvard political theory colloquium; the University of Maryland Democracy Collaborative; the Brandeis colloquium on democracy and cultural pluralism; the University of Wisconsin political philosophy colloquium; Annual Meetings of the American Political Science Association and the Western Political Science Association; and the American Academy of Arts and Sciences research presentation series.

An earlier version of chapter 4 was published in *Critique internationale* 28 (2005) and several passages of chapters 2, 4, 5, and 6 were first published in the *American Political Science Review* 99, no. 4 (2005). I thank Presses de Sciences Po and Cambridge University Press for permission to reprint these.

Several people deserve special thanks. Rogers Smith read many versions of the manuscript and offered judicious guidance; I am deeply grateful for his generosity of spirit and for his steadfast support throughout this project. Ian Shapiro's keen insights compelled me to stay focused on concrete problems while making my arguments about justice and democracy. Jennifer Pitts asked some of the hardest and most important questions, which challenged me to make fruitful connections and expansions. Seyla Benhabib read an early version of the manuscript and offered

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii Acknowledgments

helpful suggestions for its improvement. I am also grateful to her for inspiring my interest in political theory while I was an undergraduate in Social Studies at Harvard. Joshua Cohen, Daniel Sabbagh, and Jeff Spinner-Halev read different versions of the manuscript and offered many thoughtful suggestions for its improvement. My debt to all of them is profound.

At the earliest stages of this project, I benefited from the constructive criticism and friendship of my fellow graduate students at Yale: Alissa Ardito, Mayling Birney, Rebecca Bohrman, Brenda Carter, Elizabeth Cohen, Raluca Eddon, Chinyelu Lee, Serena Mayeri, Naomi Murakawa, Amy Rasmussen, Dara Strolovitch, and Dorian Warren.

I found a congenial intellectual home at MIT in the Political Science Department and in the Women's Studies Program. I am grateful to Suzanne Berger, Adam Berinsky, Chris Capozzola, Kanchan Chandra, Rebecca Faery, Chappell Lawson, Daniel Munro, Melissa Nobles, Jonathan Rodden, Emma Teng, Lily Tsai, Elizabeth Wood, and especially Joshua Cohen and Sally Haslanger for their intellectual camaraderie and support. I thank the Political Science Department for their generosity with leave time and research funding.

I am also indebted to a community of political theorists and philosophers who think and write about identity, ethnicity, nationalism, and multiculturalism. Seyla Benhabib, Avigail Eisenberg, Vicki Hsueh, Will Kymlicka, Anne Phillips, Rob Reich, Ayelet Shachar, Rogers Smith, and Jeff Spinner-Halev have all read and commented on parts of the book. I am also thankful to David Miller, whose scholarship and seminars fostered my interest in political theory during my time at Oxford.

I am especially grateful to friends, colleagues, and teachers who have commented on parts of the manuscript and with whom I have had valuable conversations about its themes: Karim Abdul-Matin, Brooke Ackerly, Seyla Benhabib, Richard Boyd, Kanchan Chandra, Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, Joshua Cohen, Michael Ferguson, Hawley Fogg-Davis, Erik Freeman, Sally Haslanger, Vicki Hsueh, Chris Lebron, Theresa Lee, Eric MacGilvray, Jane Mansbridge, Daniel Munro, Tamara Metz, Ethan Nasr, Melissa Nobles, Frank Pasquale, Anne Phillips, Jennifer Pitts, Jennifer Ratner-Rosenhagen, Nancy Rosenblum, Daniel Sabbagh, Ayelet Shachar, Ian Shapiro, Marion Smiley, Rogers Smith, Verity Smith, Jiewuh Song, Jeff Spinner-Halev, Dara Strolovitch, Robin West, Elspeth Wilson, and Bernard Yack.

At Cambridge University Press, I wish to thank my editors John Haslam and Carrie Cheek and my production editor Rosina Di Marzo for their patient guidance, Jacqueline French for scrupulous copyediting, and Marie MacCullum for preparing the index.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87487-8 - Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Sarah Song

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

xiii

For encouragement I thank my parents, my brother Samuel Song, and Gabriel Schnitzler, whose love and good humor enrich my life in immeasurable ways.

This book is dedicated to my parents, Byoung Hyuk Song and Young Il Song, my first teachers of justice.