

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

Index

- 1979 Constitution. *See* Constitution, Nigeria
 1988 Constitution. *See* Constitution, Brazil
- ação civil pública* (Public class action), 125, 339, 340
- Ação Educativa*, 311
- Access to public goods, rationed by courts, 221
- Access to justice
 Brazil, 111, 112, 142, 143
 India, 154
- Accountability
 courts as agents of, 33, 323, 346
 Nigeria, 184
- Acquired immune deficiency syndrome. *See* HIV/AIDS
- Activism, 147
- Adewole & Others v. Alhaji Jakande & Others*, 203
- Adeyinka A. Badejo v. Federal Minister for Education & 2 Others*, 205, 222
- Advocacy organizations, 313
- Affirmative action, 115
- Affordable Medicines Trust v. Minister of Health*, 58
- African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 187, 188, 194, 195, 202, 209, 212, 213, 317
- African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 187
- African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, 32, 187, 212, 219, 221
- African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights, 194, 195
- African National Congress (ANC), 346
- Afrox Healthcare* case, 46, 53, 60, 61, 69, 293
- AIDS. *See* HIV/AIDS
- Air and water pollution. *See* Pollution
- Alexy, Robert, 282
- Alternative dispute resolution procedures,
 medical malpractice and right to health, 333
- ANC (African National Congress), 346
- Antiretroviral treatment (ART)
 Brazil, 120, 122, 136, 144
 effects of litigation on access to, 83
 India, 161, 326
 Interim Procurement case, effect on availability, 93
 South Africa, 53, 56, 79, 84, 93
- Apartheid, courts' action during, ix
- Archbishop Okogie & Others v. Attorney-General of Lagos State*, 203, 204, 219, 221
- ART or ARV. *See* Antiretroviral treatment (ART)
- Asia Foundation, 225, 226, 227
- Ashiddiqie, Jimlie, 288
- Association of Judges for Democracy, 106
- Association of Legal Aid, Indonesian, 248
- Asylum seekers, and right to education, 63, 341
- Attitudes, judicial, 315
- Attitudinal model, 17, 317
- Attorneys, private, 310, 337
- Autonomous courts, 18
- Backlash in Brazil, 136
- Barak, Justice Aharon, 283, 285
- Bar association, Indonesian, 248
- Basil Ukaegbu v. Attorney-General of Imo State*, 205
- Beatty, David M., 270
- Bel Porto School Governing Body v. Premier, Western Cape*, 46, 66
- Beneficiary inequality, 335
- Bentham, Jeremy, 33
- Bhagwati, P. N., 149, 153
- Bhopal, 159
- BIMARU states, 3, 31, 152, 155, 164, 167, 308
- Binding precedent
 Brazil, 103, 136
 India, 148
- Boehringer Ingelheim, 57, 87, 96
- Bonded labor, protection from, 2
- Brandeis briefs, need for in South Africa, xii

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

354

Budget cases
 Brazil, 120
 Indonesia, 32, 258, 319, 322, 324
 Budget, effect of legalization on, 139
 Buyat Bay case, 247, 248, 255

Caseload in India, 152
 Child labor, 2, 341
 Chirzinhas, Habib, 242
Christian Education South Africa v. Minister of Education, 65
Chukwunyere v. Commissioner of Police, 211
 Citizen lawsuit, in Indonesian law, 251
 Citizenship, not required in South Africa, 49
 Civil law tradition, effect of, 314
 Civil Liberties Organization, Nigeria, 191
 Civil society organizations. *See*
 Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)
 Civil society, role of, 67, 90, 143
 Claimants, lack of input into strategies, 88
 Collective and individual actions, 104, 106, 127, 312
 Commercial vehicles, pollution from, 325
 Commission for the Rational Use of Medicines, 137
 Common law
 Constitution affecting development of, South Africa, 69
 effect of, 314
 rights affecting the development of, 271
 SE rights as modifying, 298
 Competition Commission of South Africa, 45, 57, 58
 Compliance
 as Achilles' heel of justiciability, 18
 Brazil, 116, 129, 133, 134
 and civil society monitoring, 80
 fines for failure, 125
 India, 158, 159, 174
 Nigeria, 190
 South Africa, 80
Conselhos de Educação, 109
Conselhos de Saúde, 109
 Consequences, unintended, ix, x
Constituição Federal. *See* Constitution, Brazil
 Constitution
 Brazil, 101
 India, 148
 Indonesia, 228, 231, 233, 251
 Nigeria, 188, 192, 193, 194
 South Africa, 40
 Constitutional Court, Indonesia, 240
 Constitutional history
 Indonesia, 231
 Nigeria, 192

Index

Constitutional structure
 Brazil, 102
 India, 148
 Indonesia, 232
 Nigeria, 191
 South Africa, 40
 Consumer protection, 333
 Contract law and constitutional norms, 290
 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 194
 Corporal punishment in education, 65
 Corruption, 224, 225, 239, 256, 316
 Countermajoritarianism, 28, 344
 Country and National Solidarity (Indonesia), 287
 Courts
 access to public goods, rationed by, 221
 action during apartheid, ix
 African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights, 194, 195
 autonomous, 14, 17
 confidence in, 190, 229, 264
 Constitutional Court, Indonesia, 240
 as forums for debate, 71
 Human Rights Court, Indonesia, 234
 as pro-majoritarian actors, 28, 344
 risk taking by, 319
 role of, 26, 27, 137, 346
 United States Supreme Court, and rights to education, 2
 as venues for deliberation, 322
 Culture
 judicial, Brazil, 127, 143
 knowledge of rights, as fostering legalization, 90
 legal, Brazil, 105, 127
 right to, South Africa, 62, 64
 Customary law
 Nigeria, 196, 199, 316, 317
 South Africa, 69

Danjuma Ibrahim & 5 Others, Federal Republic of Nigeria v., 211
 Davis, Dennis, 273
 decentralization, Indonesia, 232
Defensoria Pública (Public Defender [Brazil]), 104, 111, 112, 129, 133, 134, 142, 143, 304
 Delays, judicial, in Nigeria, 189, 222
 Delhi Network of Positive People, 161
 Demand side
 factors as constraint, 313
 and supply side, as interrelated, 18
 variables required for legalization, 15
 Democracy, 14
 and judicial intervention, 306
 and legalization, 342, 345

- Demographics, Nigeria, 192
- Deontological logic, courts as using, 5
- Destabilization model, 323
- Dialogical behavior, 306
observed, 323, 329
South Africa, express recognition by Court, 52
- Dialogical decisions, and compliance, 322
- Direct effects
Brazil, 132
and equity, 21, 22, 314
India, 161
- Directive principles, India, 150
- Discretion, administrative, as objection to judicial review, 121
- Dreze, Jean, 162, 176
- Duchenne's Muscular Dystrophy, 132
- Due process, and right to education, 333
- Du Plooy* case, 46, 53, 61
- Dworkin, Ronald, 336
- Education Councils, Brazil, 109
- Education policy
compared to health policy, 311
Indonesia, 228, 234
Nigeria, 202, 203, 204
- Education, right to, 2
and access to schools, 168
admission standards, 206
Brazil, 30, 108, 120, 124
cases, 8
compared to health, 328
in constitutions, 1, 317
and corporal punishment, 168
and cultural rights, 318
degrees, right to, 207
and due process, 206, 207, 220, 257, 333
effect on private orderings, 285
and expulsion, 206
and freedom of expression, 258
and freedom of religion, 64, 65
impact on budget, 171
India, 146, 151, 163, 164, 166, 167, 171
Indonesia, 231, 233, 255, 258, 262, 319
inmates, 63
lack of teachers, 125
litigation rates, compared to health, 308
and midday meals, 176
minimum budget provisions, 124, 317
Nigeria, 201, 203, 208, 219, 220
and "own language", 318
and parental rights, 203
patterns across cases, 308
and private schools, 172, 203, 219, 292
and private universities, 205
provision and financing cases, 62
quality of, 125, 164
and quotas, 205
and right to culture, 65, 81, 86, 168
Right to Education Bill, India, 151
and right to language, 65, 168
and right to strike, 170
South Africa, 61, 63, 66, 86, 318
and special-needs students, 125, 169
and teachers, 167, 169, 172
and tertiary education, 163, 171, 201
and transportation, 139
types of claims advanced, 86
as unconditional, 318
- ED-U-College, Permanent Secretary, Department of Education and Welfare, Eastern Cape v.*, 46, 63
- Effectiveness of judicial interventions, 345
- Effects, 305 *See-also* Indirect effects
Brazil, 133
India, 161
Indonesia, 250, 265
of legalization, and equity, 334
- Emergency period, India, 149, 346
- Enforcement, 69. *See-also* Compliance
- Environment, and right to health. 25 *See* Pollution
- Epp, Charles, 2, 14, 15, 16, 19, 23, 26, 35, 149, 153, 177, 305, 306, 309, 310, 313, 319, 321, 335
- Equity, results of legalization, 6
- Esiaga v. University of Calabar*, 208
- Esping-Anderson, 333
- European Commission for Social Rights, 2
- expansive compliance, 24, 321, 345
- Fabre, Cecile, 275
- Federal Constitution, Brazil, 101
- Federalism
India, 155, 323
Indonesia, 246
Nigeria, 191, 195, 202
South Africa, 323
- Festus Odafe & 3 Others v. AG Federation & 3 Others*, 213
- Financing cases. *See* Provision cases
- Fire alarm monitoring, 137, 346
- First Certification case, South Africa, 41
- Follow up litigation, x, 19, 20
- Food, right to
impact, 328
India, 7, 150, 152, 162, 176, 177, 304, 319, 322, 348
nature of state obligation, 284
Right to Food Campaign, India, 322
- Formal rights, defined, 7

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

356

Index

- Friedman, Barry, 282
- Fund for the Maintenance and Development of Basic Education and the Strengthening of the Teaching Profession (FUNDEB), Brazil, 108
- Fund for the Maintenance and Development of Elementary School Teaching (FUNDEF), 108
- Gani Fawehinmi v. State*, 211
- Garba v. University of Maiduguri*, 206
- Gauteng case, 62
- Generalization of judicial orders, 345. *See-also* Indirect effects
- Generics, compulsory licensing of, Brazil, 126
- Georgina Ahamefulé v. Imperial Medical Centre & Dr. Alex Molokwu*, 214
- GlaxoSmithKline, 57, 58, 87, 96
- Governance, xv, 148, 183, 185, 186, 191, 202, 306
- Grootboom* case, x, xi, 2, 20, 28, 30, 43, 45, 46, 48, 68, 74, 75, 76, 77, 80, 82, 83, 87, 88, 89, 94, 95, 319, 321, 323, 324, 338, 339
- effects of, 81, 310
- implementation, 310
- Group Areas Act, ix
- Hamilton, Alexander, 18
- Hayek, Friedrich, 275
- Hazel Tau v. GlaxoSmithKline South Africa (Pty) Ltd and Boehringer Ingelheim (Proprietary) Limited*, 46, 57, 84, 86, 87, 92, 96, 331
- Health Card for Poor Families, Indonesia, 235
- Health care conditions, Indonesia, 235
- Health Councils, Brazil, 109
- Health insurance, private, 30, 290, 333
- Health Insurance Scheme, National, Nigeria, 210
- Health Legal Aid Bureau, Indonesia, 243, 244, 245, 247, 248, 253
- Health Maintenance Organizations (HMOs), Nigeria, 210
- Health policy
- compared to education policy, 311
- Indonesia, 235
- Nigeria, 209
- Health, right to
- access, rationed by courts, 221
- adulterated food as violation of, 157
- blood bank regulation, 162
- Brazil, 107, 119, 120, 121, 138, 279
- cases, 8
- compared to education, 308, 328
- in constitutions, 317
- cost as affecting, 213
- effect on private orderings, 285
- and environment, 177
- included in constitutions, 1
- India, 31, 150, 325
- Indonesia, 231, 243, 246, 252, 279
- and inmates, 210, 213, 214, 220
- justiciability, 121
- and liability limiting clauses, 293
- and licensing of medical practitioners, 289
- mental health, 214
- and migrant workers, 252
- minimum budget provisions, 138
- and natural resource extracting, 212
- and negligence, 293
- Nigeria, 209, 210, 212, 213, 220, 279
- patterns across cases, 308
- and pollution, 162, 247, 325
- and private health insurance, 290, 333
- and public health decisions, 325
- smoking as violation of, 162
- South Africa, 279, 318
- vaccines, 32, 158, 243, 264
- Health System, Brazil, 107, 108, 109, 122, 127, 130, 136, 137
- High Tension Power Lines case, 249
- Hills, Roderick M., Jr, 279
- HIV/AIDS,
- antiretroviral treatment, 53
- Brazil, 100, 113, 114, 120, 122, 126, 131, 132, 136, 140, 144, 310, 318, 321, 339, 340
- Costa Rica, 2, 342
- and courts, 342
- effect of courts on reducing, 162
- exclusion from courtroom of affected person, 214
- and generalization, 340
- India, 146, 155, 159, 160, 161, 162, 178, 326, 339
- indirect effects of litigation, 339
- influence on legalization, 113
- job protection, 160
- Nigeria, 209, 211, 213, 220, 222
- Prevention of mother-to-child transmission (PMTCT), 55, 72, 75, 80, 83, 87, 92
- South Africa, x, 30, 53, 77, 83, 84, 87, 90, 94, 310, 329, 338, 339, 346
- sub-Saharan Africa, 269
- treatment for, 160
- HMOs (Health Maintenance Organizations), Nigeria, 210
- Horizontal application of social and economic rights, 60, 69, 282, 283, 285, 289, 294, 301
- Housing, right to, x, 2
- Nigeria, 189
- and property rights, 295

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

Index

357

- South Africa, 45, 49, 324
- Human immunodeficiency virus. *See* HIV/AIDS
- Human Rights Commission
- Indonesia, 233, 236, 240, 256
 - Nigeria, 197, 215, 216, 222, 307, 316
- Human Rights Court, Indonesia, 234
- Human Rights Law Network, 161
- Immunizations. *See* Vaccines
- Impact
- Brazil, 132
 - on education, 166
 - India, 155, 166, 328
 - Indonesia, 265
 - of legalization, 78, 326, 334
 - measurement formula, applied, 327
 - measurement issues, 325
 - midday meals cases, 328
 - summarized and compared, 329
- Incomplete commitments, resolution of, 346
- Indigent claimants, Brazil, 143
- Indirect effects, 6, 21, 25, 29, 76, 320, 326, 327, 336
- Brazil, 135, 136, 314
 - compared to direct effects, 338
 - in countries with weak legalization, 339
 - equity of, 23, 24
 - external, example of, 83
 - generalization of judicial orders, 340
 - of government conduct, as warranting constitutional intervention, 276
- India, 163
- Indonesia, 250, 252, 253
- and inequality, 339
 - internal, example of, 84
 - and litigant resources, 339
 - and public policy logic, 340
- Individual and collective actions, 104, 106, 127, 312
- Indonesian Legal Aid and Human Rights Association, 248, 287
- Indonesian Legal Aid Foundation, 247, 265
- Indonesian Legal and Human Rights Consultants' Association, 287
- Inequality
- beneficiary, 335
 - and indirect effects, 339
 - and legalization, 334
 - policy area, 335, 340, 341
- Injunctions, Brazil, 104, 106
- Inmates, rights of
- education, 63
 - health, 210
 - medical treatment, 54, 61
- Inquérito administrativo*, 104
- Insurance, private, Brazil, 115
- Interim Constitution, South Africa, 40, 41, 62, 64, 65
- Interim Procurement case*, 46, 55
- Interlocutory appeals, Nigeria, 188, 189
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 228
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, vii, 95, 98, 186, 194, 228, 262
- International covenants, India, 148
- International human rights treaties, 33
- Ishmael Azubuike & 3 Others v. Attorney-General of the Federation & 3 Others*, 214
- Islamic law. *See* Sharia
- Iyer, Krishna, 149
- Jakarta Legal Aid Bureau, 247, 249, 251, 253, 264
- JATAM (*Jaringan Advokasi Tambang*), 247, 248, 249, 253, 255, 264
- Jayiya v. Member of the Executive Council for Welfare, Eastern Cape*, 46, 51, 52, 73, 81, 82, 88, 89
- Judicial appointments, Indonesia and South Africa, 315
- Judicial attitudes, 315
- Judicial autonomy
- compared, 344
 - need for, across types of cases, 316
- Judicial behavior
- and appointments process, 316
 - explained, 315
 - strategic model, 320
- Judicial careers, Indonesia, 255
- Judicial culture, Brazil, 127, 143
- Judicial decisions
- and compliance, 322
 - dialogical nature of, 306, 323, 329, 343
 - logic of, 5
- Judicial effectiveness, India, 161
- Judicial independence, compared, 344
- Judicialization, 2, 127, 142, 147, 335
- in Brazil medication cases, 322
 - defined, 342
 - distinguished, 304, 322, 342
 - and separation of powers, 4
- Judicial populism, India, 149
- Judicial preferences, and appointment, 316, 320
- Judicial review
- Brazil, 102
 - and just society, 336
 - powers, by country, 3
 - South Africa, 40
- Judicial Services Commission, South Africa, 315

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

358

Judicial structure
 Brazil, 102
 India, 148
 Indonesia, 230, 236, 239
 Nigeria, 196
 South Africa, 45

Judicial support
 as essential to legalization, 18
 explaining, 17

Justiciability of social and economic rights, 279 .
See-also Objections to justiciability
 and allocation of resources, 74
 benefits conditional on other factors, 350
 Brazil, 106, 121
 criticisms of, 342
 and government failure to act, 68
 India, viii, 146, 317
 Indonesia, 228
 judicial attitudes toward, 68
 Nigeria, 193, 218, 317
 normative considerations, 349
 objections to, viii, 34, 121
 reasons given for,
 South Africa, 42, 68
 US-based debate, v. global reality, 270

Kaletra, 132
Kartu Kesehatan Keluarga Miskin, 235
Kate, Member of the Executive Council Welfare v.,
 12, 46, 52, 73, 94, 322
Khosa v. Minister of Social Development, 45, 325
 Knowledge of Trights, Indonesia, 226
 Kordana, Kevin, 301
 Kronman, Anthony, 301
 Kyalami Ridge case, 12, 45, 46, 48, 69, 295, 301

Labor
 bonded, 2
 child, 2, 341
Laerskool Middelburg v. Departementshoof,
Mpumalanga Departement van Onderwys,
 46, 65
 Land tenure, Nigeria, 200
 Language rights, South Africa, 62, 64
 Latent capacity, 15, 19, 306, 319, 320
 Lawyers, private, 310, 337
 Legal Aid Bureau (LBH), Jakarta, 247, 249, 251,
 253, 264
 Legal assistance
 Brazil, 112
 Nigeria, 198
 public, 337
 Legal culture, Brazil, 105, 127
 Legalization
 authority to act, 48

Index

beneficiaries of, 337
 as collaborative rather than adversarial, 345
 compared to other demand channels, 305
 conditions for, 14, 26, 28
 as continuous, 5
 defined, 4, 304
 and democracy, 343, 345
 diffusion of benefits, 24
 as displacing legislative judgments, 343
 distinguished from judicialization, 4
 distinguished from legislation, 5
 distribution of benefits, 334
 effects of, 21, 83, 142, 305, 329, 335, 340, 344
 effects of losing, 24
 empirical evidence for, in contrast to
 judicialization, 343
 end results of, 303
 as enhancing democratic debate, 71
 and equity, 6, 88, 305, 334
 exponential growth of, 20
 four stages to, viii, 4, 14
 India, 151
 and inequality, 335, 340
 and legislation, 87, 333
 measurement, 325
 and middle class, 142, 337
 and modernization, 345
 modes of, and equity, 336
 and neoliberalism, 331
 objections to, 345
 as part of democratic debate, 343
 and the poor, 337, 338, 340, 341
 potential regressive effect of, 21
 and primary care, 341
 and primary education, 341
 role of settlements in, 29, 55
 and wealthy elites, 337

Legal mobilization. *See also* Litigation rates
 compared and explained, 306
 explaining variation, 309
 in health compared to education, 311
 measuring, 28
 subnational comparisons, 308

Legal pluralism, 316
 Legal Resources Centre, 38, 81
 Legal services, access to, 337
 Legal training, need for, xii, xiii

Legislation
 and legalization, 87, 333
 and litigation, 318, 344
 logic of decisions, 5

Lester, Anthony, 184
 Leukemia, 137
 Life, right to
 Brazil, 120

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

Index

359

- India, 154
 - in India constitution, 279
 - life with dignity, 154
 - South Africa, 54
- Litigant calculus, 306
- Litigants
 - characterized, 337
 - strategies, Indonesia, 255
 - threats to, 257
- Litigation
 - and accountability, 85
 - follow up, x, 19, 20
 - as forcing states to justify conduct, 85
 - as last resort, 92
 - and legislation, 318, 344
 - as locus for deliberation, 322
 - “me too”, 23
 - as political cover for officials, 94
 - as political strategy, 263, 312
 - South Africa, 85, 87
 - strategies used, 87
- Litigation rates
 - Brazil, 109
 - compared, 307, 308
 - Indonesia, 229
 - per capita, Brazil, 117
- Local power relations, 316

- Mahlaule v. Minister of Social Development*, 45, 325
- Malay Ganguly* case, 163
- Malpractice, medical. *See* Medical malpractice
- Mandado de segurança*. *See* injunctions, Brazil
- Mandela, Nelson, 315
- Mashavha v. President of the RSA*, 46, 51
- Mbeki, Thabo, 320
- McCann, Michael, 310
- Meals, midday. *See* Midday meals
- Measurement issues, legalization, 325
- Medical malpractice, 6, 7, 156, 242, 243, 252, 253, 286, 307, 312
 - alternative dispute resolution procedures, 333
 - Indonesia, 244, 245
- Medical treatment, right to for inmates, 54, 61
- Medication, access to
 - Brazil, 123, 321
 - cost as factor, 123
 - India, 160
- Medication, right to
 - Brazil, 30, 122, 131, 137, 309
 - cost of, 140
 - failure to comply, 79
 - and generics, 158
 - impact on budget, 140
 - implications for private ordering, 284

- India, 158, 160
 - and ordinary procurement process, 126, 130, 138
 - price controls, 59
 - reliance on prescribing physician, 127, 131
 - South Africa, 58, 59, 79
 - and TRIPS, 158
- Medicines and Related Substances Act, South Africa, 57
- Melawai State Junior High School case, 256
- Midday meals
 - beneficiaries of, 338
 - implementation, 304
 - India, 162, 176, 304, 319, 325, 328
- Middle class
 - capture, Brazil, 142
 - and legalization, 337
- Migrant workers, and right to health, 252
- Mikro* case. *See* *Western Cape Minister of Education v. Governing Body of Mikro Primary School*
- Minimum core, xii, 68, 75, 76
- Minimum wage, 122
- Ministério Público*. *See* Public Prosecutor, Brazil
- Minister of Education v. Harris*, 46, 63
- Modderklip Boerdery case, 38, 45, 46, 49, 50, 68, 69, 76, 77, 81, 89, 296, 298, 299
- Modernization, and legalization, 345
- Mohammed Abacha v. The State*, 211
- Monitoring by civil society, 80
- Movimento sanitarista*, 321
- Mpumalanga, premier v. Executive Committee, Association of State-Aided Schools, Eastern Transvaal*, 46, 62, 80, 98
- Musyawarah*, 225, 264, 333

- National Human Rights Commission Nigeria, 191
- Natural resource extraction, Nigeria, 200
- Negligence, medical, 156. *See also* Medical malpractice
- Nevirapine, x, 79, 340
- New Clicks South Africa (Pty) Ltd, Minister of Health v.* 8, 46, 59, 69, 79, 93, 331
- Newmont mining company, 247, 249
- NGOs. *See* Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)
- Ngxuza, Permanent Secretary, Department of Welfare, Eastern Cape v.* 38, 46, 50, 51, 78, 81, 85, 87, 88, 89, 91, 92
- Niger Delta, 200
- Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)
 - Brazil, 114, 130, 310, 313, 321
 - India, 153, 154, 161, 164, 313
 - Indonesia, 230, 247, 253, 264, 313

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

360

Index

- Non-Governmental Organizations (*cont.*)
 influence on legalization, 114, 130
 relationship to government, 321
 role of, 153, 154, 161, 164, 230, 247, 253, 264, 310, 313
 strategic choice, 153
 success rate, 164
Nunukan case, 250, 265, 338
Nyathi v. Member of the Executive Council for the Department of Health Gauteng, 73
- Obasanjo, Olusegun, 199
 Objections to justiciability, vii
 empirical foundation of, 350
 judicial lack of legitimacy, 270
 separation of powers, xi, 3, 34, 75, 85, 106, 120, 127, 146, 271, 297, 300
 Objections to legalization, 345
 Obligation cases, 316
 Brazil, 117, 118
 defined, 308
 India, 152, 164, 170
 Indonesia, 243, 255
 Nigeria, 207
 summarized and compared, 332
 and supply side factors, 315
 O'Connell, Colm, 184
 Official Secrets Act, Nigeria, 198
 Ogoni, Nigeria Delta litigation, 32
Ogunmadeji & Other v. Moshood Abiola Polytechnic, 206
 Oil and Natural Gas privatization, 287
 Ombudsman, Nigeria, 197
Omodolapo Adeyanju v. West African Examinations Council, 207
Oranje Vrystaatse Vereneging case, 46, 62
- Patent protections, and rights, 342
 Patents Act, as violation of right to medication, 57
 Pedro, Lawal, 188
 People-centered development, 183
People of Buyat v. Newmont. See *Buyat Bay* case
 People's Union for Civil Liberties, India, 176, 318
 Perry, Michael J., 274
 Personal liability of state officials, South Africa, 73
 Petroleum extraction, and right to health, 212
 Pharmaceutical companies
 Brazil, 114
 India, 161
Pharmaceutical Manufacturers' Association of South Africa v. President of the Republic of South Africa (PMA), 46, 56, 57, 92, 332
 PIL (Public Interest Litigation), 6, 16, 23, 149, 150, 152, 153, 154, 158, 159, 160, 162, 163, 169, 171, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 289, 315, 340, 349
 Pitkin, Hannah, 14
PMA (Pharmaceutical Manufacturers' Association of South Africa v. President of the Republic of South Africa), 46, 56, 57, 92, 332
 PMTCT (Prevention of mother-to-child transmission), 55, 72, 75, 80, 83, 87, 92
 Policy area inequality, 335, 340, 341
 Policy effects of judicial orders, 345
 Policy infrastructure
 as condition for legalization, 19
 need for, 318
 Policy provision models, 333
 Political cover, officials welcoming litigation as, 94
 Political history, Indonesia, 224
 Political instability, Nigeria, 191
 Political support, need for, 306, 345
 Pollution, 31, 247, 249
 Pompe, Sebastiaan, 230
 Power and liability approach to rights, 298
 Powers, separation of, xi, 3, 4, 34, 75, 85, 106, 120, 128, 146, 271, 297, 300, 345
 Preferences, judicial, 315
 Preliminary injunctions, Brazil, 106
 Preschool, right to, 121
 Prevention of mother-to-child transmission (PMTCT), 55, 72, 75, 80, 83, 87, 92
 Price controls
 constitutionality of, for drugs, 59
 and rights, 342
 Prisoners. See *Inmates*, rights of
 Private attorneys, 310, 337
 Private health insurance, 30, 290, 333
 Private obligations cases, 11
 Private orderings, 272, 276
 Private schools
 freedom to set fees, 293
 and right to education, 292, 332
 and right to health, 292
 Privatization, 221
 and natural resources, 287
 and rights, 287, 331, 342
 Pro bono culture, Brazil, 112
 Pro bono lawyers, 321
 Procedure for constitutional claims, Indonesia, 240
 Procedure, Judicial, 197
 Programmatic rights, 186
 Progressive realization, 107, 300

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

Index

361

- Property rights
 distributional effects of, 295, 298
 and social and economic rights, 294
- Protective welfare state, 333
- Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, 187
- Providers, defined, 9, 308
- Provision cases, 316
 Brazil, 117, 118, 319
 defined, 10, 307
 India, 152, 164, 319
 Indonesia, 250
 overview, 329
- Public class action, Brazil, 125, 339, 340
- Public defender
 Brazil, 104, 111, 112, 129, 133, 134, 142, 143, 304
 Nigeria, 198
- Public education, funding for, 338
- Public Health Acts, India, 155
- Public Health cases, India, 159
- Public Interest Litigation (PIL), 6, 16, 23, 149, 150, 152, 153, 154, 158, 159, 160, 162, 163, 169, 171, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 289, 315, 340, 349
- Public interest organizations, 16
- Public opinion, and legalization, 91
- Public-private distinction, blurred, 278, 298
- Public prosecutor, Brazil, 103, 104, 105, 111, 112, 113, 114, 115, 116, 117, 120, 121, 123, 124, 125, 127, 128, 130, 131, 133, 134, 135, 138, 139, 142, 143, 144, 309, 311, 321, 339
- Punishment, corporal, 65
- Punjab Voluntary Health Association, 161
- Puskemas*. *See* Health policy, Indonesia
- Racial segregation, ix
- Radiating effect
 of constitutional norms, 286
 of SE rights, 281, 299
- Reasonableness review standard, South Africa, 68
- Reduction of Government Subsidy on Oil Program, Indonesia, 235
- Refugees. *See* Asylum seekers, and right to education
- Regulation cases
 Brazil, 118, 124
 defined, 10, 307
 and implementation, 331
 India, 152, 153, 157, 163, 164, 332
 Indonesia, 246
 summarized and compared, 331
- Rehnquist, Justice William, 277
- Remedies
 cases, 70
 cautious nature of, 70
 coercing state officials, 73
 complexity, as affecting compliance, 80
 detailed orders, 70
 modifying statute, 70
 personal liability of state officials, 73
 South Africa, 69, 70
 structural interdict, 71
 supervisory interdict, 71
 supervisory jurisdiction, 71
- Reporting decisions, Indonesia, 230
- Response side
 factors, 320
 variables required for legalization, 15
- Rights. *See also* Social and Economic (SE) rights;
 Education, right to; Food, right to; Health, right to; Housing, right to
 awareness, 312
 defined, 7
 and duties vs power and liability approach, 298
 as property, 13
 as rules, 13
- Rights bearers, 88
- Rights discourse, 312
- Right to Information Act, India, 150
- Risk taking, by courts, 319
- Role of courts, 26, 27
 in democracies, 6, 346
 fire alarm monitoring, 137, 346
 incomplete commitments, resolution of, 346
 resolving political roadblocks, 346
- Rosenberg, Gerald, 18, 320, 345
- Rosenfeld, Michel, 277
- Sabel, Charles, 144, 323, 346
- Sampling method
 Brazil, 115
 effect of, 327
 Indonesia, 230
 Nigeria, 191
- Santos, Alvaro, 290
- Sarva Shiksha Abhigyan, 167, 178
- Sathe, 146, 149, 181
- Scheduled Castes and education, India, 167
- Scheduled Tribes and education, India, 167
- Scheingold, Stuart, 309
- Schwartz, Herman, 275
- Sen, Amartya, 25
- Separation of powers, xi, 3, 4, 34, 75, 85, 106, 120, 128, 146, 271, 297, 300, 345

- SERAC (Social and Economic Rights Action Centre), 187, 191, 195, 200, 212, 219, 221, 222
- SE rights. *See* Social and Economic rights
- Settlements
- Brazil, 128, 131, 135, 138, 144, 322
 - Indonesia, 244, 253
 - as part of legalization phenomenon, 29
 - as preferred outcome, 92
 - state refusal prompting litigation, 92
- Shapiro, Martin, 278
- Sharia, 196, 197, 233, 316
- Shell Petroleum Development Corporation, 212
- Simon, William, 144, 323, 346
- Singh, Kuldip, 177
- Singh, Manmohan, 146
- Sistema Único de Saúde* (Health System, Brazil), 107, 108, 109, 122, 127, 130, 136, 137
- Smoking, as violation of right to health, 162
- Social and Economic (SE) rights
- as absolute priorities, 74
 - approaches to, 121
 - Brazil, 106, 107, 115, 116, 141
 - cases classified, 46
 - cases filed, 242
 - and common law, 281
 - compared to civil and political rights, 187, 204, 275, 300
 - compliance, 141
 - in constitutions, xv, 1, 294
 - as constitutive of social relations, 281
 - countries, 293
 - defensive use of, 67, 86
 - distinguished from civil and political rights, vii, 43, 44, 87
 - effect on regulatory landscape, 286
 - effects in private law, 273
 - enforcement of, 48, 141, 297
 - and equity, 88, 142, 305
 - horizontal application of, 272, 274, 282, 283, 285, 289, 293, 294, 301
 - impact, 116, 324
 - Indonesia, 242
 - interrelated with civil and political rights, 43
 - judicial approach to, 106
 - justiciability of, 106, 279
 - and natural resources, 287
 - Nigeria, 193
 - non-fulfillment of, globally, 268
 - private obligations, 60
 - and privatization, 287
 - as programmatic, 106
 - and property rights, 294
 - radiating effects of, 281, 286, 299
 - South Africa, 42, 43, 44, 46, 48, 60, 67, 88
 - as supporting popular struggles, 83
 - theory of, 297
 - and tradeoffs, 74
- Social and Economic Rights Action Centre (SERAC), 187, 191, 195, 200, 212, 219, 221, 222
- Social and Economic Rights Initiative, Nigeria, 222
- Social assistance, 338, 341
- effect of rulings, 82
 - South Africa, 49, 82, 318, 332
- Social Jurist, India, 177
- Social Security Agency, South Africa, 82
- Soeharto, 224, 226, 228, 232, 239, 240
- Soekarno, 224, 231, 232
- Soobramoney v. Minister of Health, KwaZulu-Natal*, 8, 45, 46, 54, 74, 82, 300
- South Africa, constitution of, 40
- South African Competition Authority, 58
- South African Human Rights Commission, 38, 73, 77, 90
- Specialized legal training, need for, xii, xiii
- Standing to sue
- effect of rules, 314
 - Nigeria, 188, 198, 220
- Stare decisis*, 102
- State authority to act, 48
- State capacity
- India, 149
 - Indonesia, 262
- STF (*Supremo Tribunal Federal*), 101, 102, 103, 106, 116, 117, 122, 124, 126, 128, 130, 131, 135, 137, 138, 145
- STJ (Superior Justice Tribunal [*Superior Tribunal de Justiça*]), 101, 103, 116, 117, 123, 126, 138
- Strategic behavior
- by all actors in legalization process, 4, 14, 15
 - by courts, 70, 345
- Strategic interaction, 319
- Strategic model, 17, 319, 320
- Strategies used by SA lawyers, 85
- Subnational comparisons, 317
- Súmula vinculante*. *See* Binding precedent, Brazil
- Sunstein, Cass, 273
- Superior Justice Tribunal (*Superior Tribunal de Justiça* [STJ]), 101, 103, 116, 117, 123, 126, 138
- Supply side
- factors, as constraint, 314
 - variables required for legalization, 15
- Support structure, 306
- as consequence of litigation strategy, 311
 - extent required, 15, 309
 - impact on compliance, 321
 - India, 313

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87376-5 - Courting Social Justice: Judicial Enforcement of Social and Economic Rights in the Developing World

Edited by Varun Gauri and Daniel M. Brinks

Index

[More information](#)

Index

363

- need for, 305
 presence of, across countries, 313
 as requirement, 15
 Supreme Federal Tribunal (*Supremo Tribunal Federal* [STF]), 101, 102, 103, 106, 116, 117, 122, 124, 126, 128, 130, 131, 135, 137, 138, 145
 Sutardjo, Untung Suseno, 248
- Tabachnick, David, 301
 TAC case, 82. *See also* Treatment Action Campaign
 Technical expertise, courts' lack of, Brazil, 131
Termo de ajustamento. *See* Settlements, Brazil
 Tertiary education, India, 163
 Text of laws, 16, 317
 Threats to litigants, 257
Thukwane v. Minister of Correctional Services, 46, 63
 Time to trial, Nigeria, 189
 Tort, in Indonesia, 243
 Tradeoffs, and SE rights, 74
 Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), 126, 158
 Treatment Action Campaign, x, xi, 38, 46, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 59, 60, 70, 71, 72, 73, 75, 78, 80, 82, 83, 84, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94, 95, 310, 311, 318, 319, 321, 325, 329, 338, 341
 Tribe, Laurence H., 274
 TRIPS (Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights), 126, 158
 Trubek, David, 290
 Tuberculosis, India, 155
 Tushnet, Mark, , xv, 26, 37, 147, 174, 300, 342, 343, 344
 Typology of social and economic rights cases
 alternative approaches, 13
 application of, 11
 Brazil, 117, 122
 defined, 307
 explained, 280
 figure illustrating, 12
 relationship to implementation difficulties, 19
 triangle, 8, 9, 10
- Unintended consequences, ix, x
 Union Carbide, 159
 United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, xiii, 284
 United States Supreme Court, and rights to education, 2
 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, vii, 33, 148, 150, 186, 268, 291
 Unnikrishnan, 146, 151, 178
- Vaccines, 32, 243
Van Biljon v. Minister of Correctional Services, 46, 53
 Vehicles, pollution from, 325
 Viability reservation, Brazil, 107
- Watchenuka, Minister of Home Affairs v.*, 46, 63, 78
 Water, privatization of, 288 . *See-also* Pollution
 Welfare models, Brazil and South Africa, 333
Western Cape Minister of Education v. Governing Body of Mikro Primary School, 66, 80
Westville case, South Africa, 46, 56, 77, 78, 81, 82, 84, 89, 91, 92, 93, 94
 Wiranto, General, 234
Wittmann v. Deutscher Schulverein, Pretoria, 64
- Zen, Patra M., 265