# Index

Abuse of rights, 118-21 application of good faith, as, 119, 140-1 breadth of, 120-1 categories of, 119-20 common law systems, 119 'good faith' efforts, and, 142 meaning, 119 relevant factors in determining, 121 requirements to negotiate, and, 142-3 to whom injury caused, 121 Acquiescence, principle of estoppel, and, 117 Advisory Centre on WTO Law (ACWL), 257 Agricultural products complexity of disputes regarding, 2-3 Amicus curiae briefs, 167 Anti-Dumping Agreement interpretation of provisions, and, 73 Anti-dumping measures, 215 proportionality, and, 228-31 comparability of export transactions, 229 disproportionate duties, 230 dumping, meaning, 228-9 relevant rule of international law, as, 231 'zeroing', 228-31 Appellate Body, 2 abuse of rights, and, 141 applicable law, and, 95 application of estoppel, 132-3 bias rule, and, 154 burden of proof, and, 101 'completing the analysis', 169 consistency and 'correctness', 3 interpretation of provisions, 3 developing countries, and, 257 establishment of procedural rules, 167 failure to accord due process, and, 160

general exceptions, and, 140 good faith, and, 121-2 hearing rule, and, 156 in dubio mitius, and, 52 inherent jurisdiction, and, 100 interpretation and application of agreements, 2 teleological approach, 3 'legitimate expectations', and, 74 Members' dissenting opinions, 2 modification of time periods, 167 nullification or impairment rulings, 222 precautionary principle, and, 131 reciprocity, and, 43 right to representation, and, 168 subject-matter jurisdiction of, 91 suspension of concessions, 218 zeroing, and, 230 Applicable law general principles of law, as, 139 good faith, and, 134 principles as in WTO disputes, 93-7 application of non-WTO law, 93 conflicting principles of law, 96 contested applicable law claims, 93 contracting out of international law, 94 defences to WTO violations, 94 DSU provisions, 95 DSU provisions as conflicts rule, 96 interpretation of DSU provisions, 95 principles of WTO law, 93 Arbitration compliance with DSB recommendations, 92 suspension of concessions, 92 suspension of concessions, and, 213 Audi alteram partem, 148

296 INDEX

Balance of concessions. See Reciprocity Balancing test, 186 Belligerent reprisals proportionality, and, 210 Bias rule Appellate Body members, 154 prohibitions on, 155 disclosure of relevant information, 155 DSB Rules of Conduct, and, 155 due process, and, 147 general exceptions, and, 174 meaning, 148 WTO tribunals, and, 154 Bona fides definition, 107 Burden of proof inherent jurisdiction, and, 101 Capital punishment proportionality, and, 203-4 Compensation expropriation, for, 45-6 Compliance Panels, 92 Confidential information misuse of, 171 Conflicts of interest fair administration, and, 171 Constitution WTO agreement as. See WTO agreements Context treaty interpretation, and, 79 Continuous objector rule, 44 Contract law consideration of binding contracts, 9 good faith, and, 111 Countermeasures for wrongful acts. See Proportionality, principle of Countervailing measures, 215 Cruel and unusual punishment, 203 Customary international law, 43-57 application by international tribunals, 44 application to WTO treaties, 139 assimilation of general principles of law, 61 binding nature of, 44, 83 continuous objector rule, 44 creation of legal rules, and, 43 development of principles role of tribunals, 56 due process. See Due process, principle of effectiveness, principle of, 53-5 correct application of, 54 differing conclusions, 55 independent principle, as, 53 interpretation of Marrakesh Agreement, 53 shortcomings, 54

'unforeseen developments', and, 54 elements for creation of, 43 objective element, 43 subjective element, 43 essential idea behind, 43 estoppel, 117 good faith. See Good faith, principle of in dubio mitius, 52-3 conflict between principles, 53 evidence of existence of, 52 origins of principles, reliability of, 53 interpretative principles, 51-5 meaning of, 44-51 divergent state practice, 47 'constant and uniform usage', 48 degree of compliance, 48 degree of uniformity, 47 'highly selective survey', 48 proof of norm, 48 specially affected states, 48 indeterminate application of, 51 opinio juris, 49 epistemological circle, 49 inadequate evidence, 49 limitations, 50 modern custom, 50 reasonableness of asserted customary rule, 49 'sliding scale', 49 traditional custom, 50 unrelated patterns of behaviour, 50 relevant forms of behaviour, 45 state practice, 45–7 actions of judiciary, 46 acts, 45 any state behaviour, 45 evidence of, 45 flexibility in identifying, 45 material published only in West, 47 material sources establishing, 46 selective use of, 46 treaties, 46 UN resolutions, and, 47 unpublished material, 47 value of national decisions, 46 non-violation remedy, and, 138 ordinary meaning, and, 79 pacta sunt servanda, 114 precautionary principle. See Precautionary principle rules of interpretation codification, 76 rules of treaty interpretation, 73 state responsibility, and, 82 uncertainties, 44

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87326-0 - Legal Principles in WTO Disputes Andrew D. Mitchell Index More information

INDEX 297

Denial of justice, doctrine of, 150 due process, and, 150 errors, 150 forms of, 150 Developing nations distinguishing between, 248-53 non-reciprocity, 43 special and differential treatment, and, See Special and differential treatment Development role in GATT, 238 Dictionaries interpretation of treaties, and, 78 Disclosure adverse material, of, 148 Discrimination 'arbitrary or unjustifiable', 175 denial of justice, and, 151 general exceptions, and, 173 procedural requirements, and, 173-4 protection of foreign litigants, 153 special and differential treatment, and. See Special and differential treatment Doha Declaration object and purpose, and, 80 principles of WTO Law, and, 37 special and differential treatment, and, 243 Due process, principle using in WTO disputes ensuring due process before WTO tribunals. See WTO Tribunals Due process, principle of, 91, 145-76 administrative and judicial systems, 145 conflicting considerations of, 145 customary international law, principle of. as. 149-53 bilateral trade or investment treaties, 151 doctrine of denial of justice, 150 ensuring in proceedings, 149 fair and equitable treatment, 152 gross defects in judgment, 150 human rights treaties, 151 manifest injustice, 153 manifestly unjust judgments, 150 protection of investments, 152 standards of fairness and reasonableness, 150 variations in understanding of concepts, 151 demands of fairness, and, 145 discretion, need for, 145 general principle of law, as, 146-9 Australian definition of, 147

bias rule, 147-8 common law scope, 147 disclosure of adverse material, 148 domestic objectives of principle, 147 English criminal law, 146 hearing rule, 147-9 inherent flexibility of, 149 'law of the land', 146 need for and content of, 149 no evidence rule, 149 origins of, 146 prior notice of decisions, 148 procedural and substantive distinguished, 147 rules of procedure, and, 147 United States, in, 147 US Constitution, 147 good faith, and, 124-5 imposition of requirements on Members, 176 inherent jurisdiction, and, 166-9 amicus curiae briefs, 167 Appellate Body's discretion, 167 'completing the analysis', 169 establishment of procedural rules, 166 exercise of jurisdiction, 168 full exploration of issues, 169 protection of procedural norms, 167 resolution of procedural issues, 166 right to representation, 168 legitimacy of legal systems, and, 146 Members' obligations to accord, 169-75 fair administration. See Fair administration general exceptions, 173-5 need for in WTO, 146 procedural matters, and, 102 requirements of, 145 role, 175 using in WTO disputes, 160-75 WTO law, principle of, as, 153-60 Members' obligations, 157-60 WTO Tribunals. See WTO Tribunals Economic freedom human right, as, 88 Effectiveness, principle of, 53-5 Enabling Clause exception to MFN principle, as, 261 Equality of arms, 148 Equality, principle of, 8 Equity good faith, and, 109 Estoppel, 117-18 application in WTO disputes, 132

conditions for, 117

298 INDEX

Estoppel (cont.) customary rule of interpretation, as, 131 expanded requirement of injury, 118 meaning in law, 131 operation of, 117 Panel definition of, 128 principle of, 3, 118 principle of customary international law, as, 117 principles of acquiescence, and, 117 success of claims of, 127 European Court of Justice (ECJ) proportionality, and, 188 European Union equality, principle of, 8-9 proportionality, 188 Export subsidies credit guarantee programs exemption, 2 Expropriation foreign-owned property, of, 45 Fair administration, 169-73 administering laws, 169 conflicts of interest, 171 limitations on uniformity, 171 misuse of confidential information, 171 procedural fairness, 170 reasonable, meaning, 172 transparency, 170 uniform administration requirement, 171 uniformity, impartiality and reasonableness, 170 WTO and domestic law, consistency with, 172 acts inconsistent with domestic obligations, 173 content and meaning of laws, 173 contradiction of domestic decisions, 173 validity of administration, 173 Fair and equitable treatment, 152 Game theory states' behaviour patterns, and, 50 Gap-filling part of adjudicative process, as, 22 General exceptions due process, and, 173-5 good faith, and, 140 proportionality, and, 191 General principles of law, 57-66 application, 57, 83 defining, 57 due process. See Due process, principle of examples of relevant, 64-6

procedural issues, 65 recognized by ICJ and PCIJ, 65 good faith. See Good faith, principle of identification and use in ICJ and PCIJ, 61-4 acceptability of decisions, 61 ancillary use of, 61 assimilation into customary international law, 61 comparative analysis, 63 comparative analysis of municipal law, 62 descriptive analysis, 63 'general principles of law recognized by civilized nations', 63 guidance on meaning of, 62 inherent unalterable principles, 64 recognised categories of, 63 'recognized by civilized nations', and, 62 references to, 62 shrinking lacunae, 61 specific law prevails over, 61 interpretation of treaties, and, 83 ordinary meaning, and, 79 proportionality. See Proportionality scope, 57 source of law, as, 57 theoretical approaches to identifying, 58-61 categories of approaches, 58 categorist approach, 59 comparative approach, 58 criticisms of, 61 definition, 58 determination of shared principles, 58 failings of comparative approach, 59 international law, and, 59 judges' discretion, and, 59 legitimacy of decisions, and, 59 pacta sunt servanda principle, and, 61 synthesis approach, 60 Good faith, principle of, 3, 106-44 bona fides, 107 defining, 112-14 collision of rights, and, 113 complexity of, 112 development of legal systems, and, 113 general and particular notions of, 114 obligations on states, and, 113 general principle of law, as, 108-10 classes of contracts, 109 common law systems, 109 drafting of PCIJ Statute, 108 equity, and, 109 origins of concept, 108

INDEX 299

performance of contracts, and, 109 recognition in civil codes, 109 United States, in, 109 general rule of conduct, as, 135 inherent jurisdiction, and, 127-33 applying provisions in bad faith, 130 case law as relevant context, 129 elements of estoppel, 132 meaning of estoppel in law, 131 procedural matters, and, 129 rights and obligations of Members, 132 scope of WTO agreements, and, 131 sovereignty of Members, and, 131 interpretation of WTO agreements, and, 77 nebulous nature of, 143 normative appeal of, 107 ordinary meaning, 107 particularisations of, 114-21 abuse of rights. See Abuse of rights estoppel. See Estoppel interpretation of treaties, 116 performance and interpretation, relationship between, 116 performance of treaties. See Pacta sunt servanda scope of equitable principles, 116 principle of customary international law, as, 110-12 gravity of violations, 112 history of, 110 international tribunals recognising, 111 law declaring instruments, 110 performance of contracts, 111 UN Charter, and, 111 violation of treaty provisions, 112 principle of WTO law, as, 121-3 DSU Articles 3.10 & 4.3, 122 examples of, 122 formation of customs unions, and, 123 interpretation of WTO provisions, and, 122 TRIPS Agreement, and, 123 underlying principle, as, 121 WTO provisions referring to, 122 procedural implications of, 123-33 compliance requirements, 125 dispute settlement procedures, 123 DSU Article 3.10, 123 frivolous complaints, 126 Members' rights and obligations, and, 125 performance of treaties, and, 127 principle of due process, and, 124 resorting to dispute settlement, 126

rules of treaty interpretation, and, 125 unilateral action, and, 127 procedural matters, and, 102 substantive implications of, 133–43 balancing requirement, 141 breach of requirements, 138 general exceptions, 140 negotiations requirements, 142 non-violation complaints, 138 non-violation remedy, 138 nullified or impaired benefits, 138 performance of WTO obligations. See Pacta sunt servanda rejection of negotiations, 143 'serious good faith efforts', 142 violation of treaty obligations, and, 139 treaty obligations, and, 77 Gross disproportionality principle, 204 Group of 77 developing countries, 242 Hearing rule due process, and, 147 Panel compliance, 161 equality of arms, 148 meaning, 148 reasonableness, and, 172 responding to adverse evidence, 156 WTO Tribunals, and, 156 Human rights due process obligations, 151 economic freedom as, 88 proportionality, and, 186 Human rights treaties scope of protection, 88 In dubio mitius principle, 52 Incomplete contracts, 13 Intellectual property rights due process, and, 158 International Court of Justice (ICJ) elements of customary international law, 44 estoppel, and, 118 good faith, and, 77, 111 identification of general principles of law. See General principles of law inherent jurisdiction, and, 98 literalist approach to interpretation, 75 pacta sunt servanda, 114 proportionality, and, 208 relevant rules of international law, and, 81 rules and principles distinguished, and, 9

sources of international law, 19 state practice, and, 48

300 INDEX

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia inherent jurisdiction, and, 99 proportionality of punlishments, and, 202 International law content of inherent jurisdiction, and, 99 contracting out of, 94 customary. See Customary international law doctrine of estoppel, and, 133 ordinary meaning, and, 79 principles and rules distinguished, 9 relevant rules of interpretation of treaties, and, 81 will of states, and, 69 WTO within framework of, 16-21 creation of WTO, 17 extent of, 17 interpretation of provisions, 16 interpretation of WTO provisions, 20 references to in agreement provisions, 18 sources of law, 19 substantive law, 18 treaties, 17 WTO obligations, 18 Interpretation application distinguished, 82 construction distinguished, 12 customary rules of, 15 estoppel, and, 131 public international law, of, 68 rights and obligations, and, 75 definitions, 12 good faith, and, 116 interpretative principles, 51 non-violation provisions, of, 139 notion of effective interpretation, 77 prevailing law, 96 relevant rules of international law, and, 81 role of principles, 15 standards, of, 14 supplementary means of, 84 theories of, 68-72 fundamental questions of, 69 judicial discretion, and, 72 literalist approach, 74 purpose of interpretation, and, 68 subjective approach, 69 assumptions, 69 common intention, 69 teleological approach, 71 most normative approach, as, 72 object and purpose of treaty, 71 significance of terms, 71

subjective element to, 72 texts supporting two readings, 71 textual elements to, 72 textual approach, 70 apparent meaning, 70 context of treaty, and, 70 flexibility, and, 70 meaning violates underlying principles, 71 negotiation of treaty, and, 70 plain and ordinary meaning, 70 use of principles, and, 72 Vienna Convention, and, 135 WTO agreements. See WTO agreements WTO Provisions, of, 68 Interpretative maxims, 31 Judicial decisions determination of rules of law, and, 20 principles derived from. See WTO law principles of WTO law, and, 20 state practice, as, 46 Judicial economy due process requirements, and, 163 principle of, 3 Jurisdiction elements of, 89 inherent, 97 due process, and. See Due process, principle of good faith, and. See Good faith, principle of meaning, 89 LDC Members meaning, 248 Least drastic means test, 186 Legal systems composition of, 11 legitimacy, 12 Legal texts inherent uncertainty of. See Principles Legitimate expectations, principle of, 87 Magna Carta due process, and, 146 Marrakesh Agreement principles of WTO law, and, 35 reciprocity, and, 42 trade liberalisation, and, 38 Members' schedules interpretation, 3 Modern custom customary international law, and, 50 Most favoured nation (MFN) obligation, 39 departures from, 244 exceptions to, 40

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87326-0 - Legal Principles in WTO Disputes Andrew D. Mitchell Index More information

INDEX 301

National treatment obligation, 39 No evidence rule due process, and, 149 Panel compliance, and, 164 general exceptions, and, 174 reasonableness, and, 172 WTO Tribunals, and, 157 Non-discrimination, 39 application in WTO disputes, 41 enforcement, 41 exceptions, 40 general principle of law, as, 40 history of, 40 interpretation, 41, 42 justification for, 39 meaning, 39 special and differential treatment, and, 40 standards for, 41 trade liberalising effect of, 39 WTO provisions relating to, 39 Non-intervention, principle of, 9 Non-violation complaints good faith, and, 138 interpretation of provisions, and, 139 meaning, 90 remedy for, 138 Object and purpose treaty interpretation, and, 80 Objective meaning, 36 Opinio juris customary international law, and, 49 Ordinary meaning dictionary definitions, and, 78 establishing, 78 international law, and, 79 treaty interpretation, and, 78 Originalism, theory of interpretation, and, 69 Pacta sunt servanda, 114-16 abuse of rights, and, 115 avoiding or diverting obligations, 115 binding nature of treaties, and, 121 customary international law, 114 interpretation of treaties, and, 116 non-violation complaints, and, 139 origins of, 114 performance of WTO obligations 133-7 applicability, 136 bad faith, presumption of, 133 'general rule of conduct', 135 inherent jurisdiction, and, 136

misapplications of good faith, 136

necessity of violation, 137

object and purpose of provisions, 135 relevance of good faith, 136 source of obligation, 137 substantive principle, 135 'pre-conventional' obligations, 116 principle of, 61 reasonableness, and, 115 Panelists bias, and, 154 developing countries, from, 257 Panels compliance with due process, 160 appreciaton of evidence, 165 basic rationale requirement, 161 conduct for Article 11 violations, 165 consideration of all evidence, 164 de novo reviews of evidence, 166 denial of fundamental fairness, 164 disregarded or distorted evidence, 164 DSU obligations, 160 due process as inherent obligation, 162 egregious errors, 164 failure to address claims, 162 fairness of Panel's decision, 164 false judicial economy, 163 hearing rule, 161 internally contradicting reasons, 165 judicial economy, 163 misinterpretation of evidence, 164 no evidence rule, and, 164 objective, meaning, 164 obligation to address issues raised, 163 obligation to address matter before it, 161 primary due process aspects, 160 reasons for decisions, 163 refusal to consider defence, 162 review of factual findings, 164 right of response, and, 161 standard of review obligations, 166 submissions of interested parties, consideration of, 163 unanswered claims, 163 developing countries, and, 257 establishment of procedural rules, 166 nullification or impairment rulings, 222 private counsel attending, 169 Party definition, 83 Precautionary principle, 55-7 Appellate Body decision regarding, 55 justification of WTO-inconsistent measures, 57 principle of customary international law, whether, 56 SPS Agreement Preamble, and, 56

302 INDEX

Precautionary principles Appellate Body's treatment of, 131 Principles applicable law in WTO disputes, as. See Applicable law basis of claim, as, 89 categories of, 4 categories of relevance to WTO, 31 authenticity and value, 32 interpretative maxims, 31 obligations under non-WTO treaties, 31 context, and, 80 customary international law, of. See Customary international law future of, 272-3 GATT/WTO principles, 37 nature of, 6-10 need for in WTO disputes, 15-23 ambiguity in agreements, 15 assessment of decisions, 16 customary rules of interpretation, 15 general principles of law, 20 intentions of drafters, 15 interpretation and evaluation, 15 intricacy of rules of interpretation, 15 jurisdiction of WTO Tribunals, 21 legitimacy of decisions, and, 21 relevant principles, 15 role of principles in interpretation, 15 normative and descriptive aspects of, 10 - 12determination of principles, 10 European civil law, 11 generalisations of rules, principles as, 10 higher norms, principles as, 10 independent legal content, and, 10 interpretation of legal rules, 12 justification of rules, 10 legitimacy of legal systems, and, 12 ordinary norms distinguished, 10 structure of legal systems, and, 11 underlying logic in rules, and, 11 objectives distinguished, 36 problems with, 21-3 abandonment of rule of law, and, 22 application of policy and principle, 22 fragility of WTO system, and, 23 gap-filling, 22 sovereign will of Members, and, 22 uncritical acceptance, 22 relevance in interpreting WTO agreements. See WTO agreements relevant to WTO, 4 resolving procedural matters, and, 102 resolving WTO disputes using, 88-103

jurisdiction of WTO Tribunals. See WTO Tribunals rules distinguished, 7-10 application of principles, 8 assumptions and precepts, 7 conditions for application of rules, 8 consideration of binding contracts, and, 9 content of principles, 8 development of legal rules, 7 ICJ, and, 9 international law, in, 9 operation of rules, 8 overlap between, 8 principles as guidelines, 8 recognition of principles, 7 'rule answers', 7 species of norms, as, 7 subjective distinction, 8 theories of treaty interpretation, and. 68 uncertainty in, 31 uncertainty of legal texts default rules', 13 incomplete contracts literature, 13 interpretation, definition, 12 legally correct meaning, 14 multiple interpretations, 15 purpose of legal texts, 13 rules and standards literature, 13 WTO agreements provisions, 14 WTO context, 13 uncertainty of legal texts, and, 12-15 use in WTO disputes, 4 WTO law, of. See WTO law Private actions, right to take due process obligations, and, 159 Proportionality, principle of, 177-237 assessing remedies in WTO disputes, 218-36 interpreting provisions on unilateral remedies, 228 anti-dumping, 228 multilateral remedies, 218 absence of trade effects, 223 actionable and prohibited subsidies, 224 assessing level of nullification or impairment, 221 claims based on disproportionality, 220 culpability of actor, 222 general WTO violations, 218 high degree of culpability, 223 interpreting 'nullification or impairment', 220 low degree of culpability, 223

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87326-0 - Legal Principles in WTO Disputes Andrew D. Mitchell Index More information

INDEX 303

measuring unquantifiable factors, 221 penalties exceeding harm caused, 222 purpose of retaliatory measures, 219 relevance of culpability, 222 suspension of concessions, 218 WTO violation presumption, 221 assessment of remedies, 202-17 customary international law, 207 belligerent reprisals, 210 ceiling on severity of countermeasures, 210 commensurate countermeasures, 208 countermeasure and injury suffered, relationship between, 209 countermeasures for wrongful acts, 207 culpability of actor, 210 fairness and retribution, 210 gravity of wrongful act, 209 identification of countermeasures, 209 infringement of rights of states, 207 non-performance of obligations,  $\bar{2}10$ non-utilitarian purposes, 209 objective of imposing countermeasures, 208 retributive countermeasures, 209 states' obligations, and, 208 general principles of law, 202 Australia, in, 205 bail and fines, 203 capital punishment, 204 ceiling on severity of punishment, 207 comparative approach to determining punishment, 206 considerations relevant to sentence setting, 205 cruel and unusual punishment, 203 excessive punlishments, 203 grossly disproportionate sentences, 204 limits of sentencing discretion, 205 manifest injustice, 205 narrow proportionality principle, 204 'objective circumstances', 205 'objective factors', and, 205 objectives of punishment, and, 206 prevention of re-offending, and, 207 previously imposed sentences, and, 207

role of judiciary, and, 204 sentences for terms of years, 204 strict proportionality, 204 test of proportionality, 204 theories of retribution, 206 type of principle applied, 207 United States, in, 203 utilitarian concerns, and, 207 WTO law, 210 aim of WTO dispute settlement system, 212 amount of injury suffered, 213 anti-dumping measures, 215 application of safeguards, 216 countervailing measures, 215 dispute settlement, 211 harm caused, determining, 214 level of suspension of concessions, 213 material breach of treaty, 213 multilateral remedies, 211 multilateral remedies and countermeasures distinguished, 212 nature of rules, 211 'nullification or impairment', 213 operation of multilateral remedies, 212 performance of obligations, 211 proportionate countermeasures, 211 qualitative requirement, 213 retaliatory actions, 213 safeguards, 216 SCM Agreement dispute settlement, 214 suspension of concenssions, 212 suspension of operation of treaties, 211 undesirable act and injury caused, difference between, 216 'unfair' conduct, 215 unliateral remedies, 215 WTO law 'appropriate countermeasures, 214 domestic legal systems, in, 185-7 balancing test, 186 curtailment of rights, and, 186 definitions, and, 185 German administrative law, 185 least drastic means test, 186 reasonableness test, 185 societal costs and benefits, 187 UK, in, 186 US administrative law, 185 forms of, 182 balancing competing rights, 182

304 INDEX

Proportionality, principle of (cont.) distinction between, 183 punishment and crime, relationship between, 183 WTO provisions reflecting, 183 GATT 1994 Article XX, and, 196-200 alternative less restrictive measures, 197 balancing test, 196 'least restrictive means', test for, 199 least trade restrictive test, and, 197 less-trade restrictive approach, 198 level of protection, determination of. 196 measures related to legitimate aim, 200 'measures that are necessary', 197 measures that are related to, 199 measures with lesser impact, 198 Members' interest, and, 199 national policy objectives, and, 196 necessity test, and, 197 'relating to', meaning, 199 relationship of ends and means, 197 'relaxed' necessity test, 198 remedial measures, 197 standard of material contribution, 200 suitability of measures, 197 weighing and balancing approach, 198-9 general principle of law, as, 184-90 application, 185 common uses of, 184 legitimacy of actions, 185 value choices, 184 international legal systems, in, 187-90 adequate levels of consumer protection, and, 189 balancing principle, as, 188 balancing test, and, 190 EC law, 188 least restrictive means test, and, 190 necessity, 188 proportionality stricto sensu, 188 reasonableness test, and, 190 suitability of measures, 188 suitability requirement, 189 interpretation of WTO agreements, 236 non-interpretative use of, 236 principle of WTO law, as, 190-5 arbitrary application of measures, 193 'chapeau', 191 cost-benefit analysis, 195 differing meanings of, 191 exceptions to general obligations, 191 extent of application of measures, 194 incorporation in agreement provisions, 191

justification of measures, 193 'legitimate objective', 195 less trade restrictive alternatives, 194 levels of protection, determination of. 193 necessity test, and, 192 non-trade interests, 192 positive obligations on Members, 193 protection of public morals, 191 reflection of in WTO agreements, 191 standards in domestic regulations, 193 suitability requirement, and, 192 underlying principle, as, 190 WTO objectives, and, 190 procedural matters, and, 103 proportionality, meaning, 177 safeguards, and, 231 absence of culpability, 235 anti-dumping measures compared, 234 application of, 233 countermeasures, whether, 234 culpability, role of, 233 customary international law, 231 exceeding increase in imports, 233 extent of measure, 234 imposition of, 232 interpretation of WTO agreements, 236 MFN rule, and, 232 preventing or remedying serious injury, 234 serious injury caused by increased imports, 235 specific transitional safeguard mechanism, 231 using to 'facilitate adjustment', 235 SPS Agreement, and, 200 clearly disproportionate measures, 201 incorporation of principle, 200 level of protection, 201 measure and objective, relationship between, 201 necessity test, and, 200 procedural requirements, 201 reasonably available alternatives, 201 'significantly less restrictive to trade', 201 suitability requirement, 200 TBT Agreement, and, 202 legitimate interest, 202 legitimate objectives, 202 level of protection, 202 proportionality stricto sensu test, 202 use in WTO disputes, 195-202 interpretation and application of law, 196 opposition to, 195 WTO provisions incorporating, 178

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87326-0 - Legal Principles in WTO Disputes Andrew D. Mitchell Index More information

INDEX 305

Provisions interpretation of WTO provisions, and, 68 Reasonableness due process, and, 150 fair administration, and, 170 good faith, and, 107 misuse of confidential information, and, 172 reasonable, meaning, 172 test for, 185 treaty interpretation, and, 77 Reciprocity, 42 'engine' of WTO, as, 42 impact on trade negotiations, 42 limitations to, 43 meaning, 42 non-reciprocity, principle of, 43 tariff negotiations, 241 WTO agreements, and, 42 Remedies assessment of. See Proportionality, principle of Retribution punishment as, 206 Rules of international law, 83 sources of law, and, 84 Rules of procedure due process, and, 147 Safeguards, 216 proportionality, and, 231 proportionality requirement, 216 Small economies identifying, 249 Sources of law, 3 application of non-WTO, 94 general principles of law, 57 international, 19 hierarchy between, 19 ICJ Statute, 19 international custom, 43 Special and differential treatment, 238-66 conflicting developing country interests, 253-6 developing countries as complainant and respondent, 254 identifying best response, and, 253 import quotas, 255 MFN obligations waiver, 254 textiles and clothing, and, 255 time periods for implementation, 254 discrimination, and, 238 distinguishing between developing countries, 248-53 categories of WTO Members, 248 classification according to criteria, 250

criteria for establishing, 248 determination of criteria for, 251 differentiation among GSP beneficiaries, 252 Doha Declaration, 249 GSP benefits, 251 LDCs, 248 levels of development, 248 needs of individual countries, 250 similarly-situated beneficiaries, 252 small economies, 249 enforcement, 41 GATT, in, 240-4 collaboration with UNCTAD, 242 Doha Declaration, 243 'less-developed contracting parties', 241 GSP schemes, 242 'Group of 77', 242 MFN obligation waiver, 242 non-reciprocity principle, 241 reciprocity principle, 241 special needs of developing countries, 243 terminology, 240 withdrawal or modification of obligations, 241 interpretation of WTO agreements, 259-65 Agreement on Safeguards, and, 262 Anti-Dumping Agreement, and, 263 'development dimension', 265 Enabling Clause as MFN principle exception, 261 exception, as, 259 hierarchy of principles, and, 262 interpretative principle, as, 262 interpreting S&D provisions, 264 Members' rights, and, 262 non-discrimination, and, 259 object and purpose of treaties, 265 significance of S&D, 259 specific S&D provisions, 262 substantive S&D provisions, 264 non-discrimination, and, 244-5 hierarchy of principles, 245 'necessary evil', as, 244 transitory nature of, 244 principle of WTO law, as, 239 procedural matters, and, 102 value of to developing countries 245-8 aims of, 245 coherence and validity, 245 dependence on limited range of products, 246 liberalising markets, 247 right of non-reciprocity, 246

306 INDEX

Special and differential treatment (cont.) securing MFN benefits, 246 tariff preferences, 247 technical assistance, 247 WTO Tribunals' inherent jurisdiction, and, 256-9 additional flexibility, 259 cost of disputes, 256 dispute settlement procedure, 257 impact of measures on economy, 257 implementation of WTO obligations, 258 lack of experience, 256 management of disputes, 256 omissions, and, 258 panelists from developing country Members, 257 procedural limits on, and, 259 suspension of concessions, 258 Tribunals' discretion, and, 259 Special meaning treaty interpretation, and, 78 Standards definition. 14 development of rules, and, 14 interpretation, 14 transfer of power, and, 14 State practice customary international law, and, 45 divergent, 47 Subsidies actionable and prohibited, 224 120% countermeasures, 227 adverse effects, 224 adverse effects need not be demonstrated, 226 appropriate countermeasures, 225 countermeasures beyond degree of harm, 228 culpability, role of, 224 degree of culpability, 225 level of retaliation, 224 meaning of countermeasure, and, 225 potentially relevant factor, as, 226 proscription of disproportionality, 225 strict proportionality requirement, 226 WTO Members challenging, 227 Suspension of concessions arbitration on level of, 92 developing countries, and, 258 inducing compliance, and, 219 interpreting 'nullification or impairment', 220 level of nullification or impairment, 218 maximum level of, 220 proportionality, and, 212 temporary nature of, 219

understanding purpose of, 218

Trade liberalisation, 38 decisions of domestic authorities, and, 39 independent principle, as, 39 non-discrimination, and, 39 reciprocity, and, 42 Traditional custom customary international law, and, 50 Treaty definition, 17 suspension, 211 **TRIPS** Agreement good faith, and, 123 UN Charter good faith, and, 111 UNCTAD, 242 **US** Constitution due process, incorporation of, 147 Vienna Convention pacta sunt servanda, and, 133 principles of interpretation, 135 Violation complaints meaning, 90 World Trade Organization (WTO) agreements ambiguous provisions, 2 Appellate Body. See Appellate Body dispute settlement system, 1 aims, 16, 212 assessment of decisions, 16 inclusion of non-WTO law in, 4 need for principles in. See Principles principles, use of, 4 categories of principles, 4 definition and meaning, 6 relevant principles, 5 recommendations, 1 security and predictability, 20 sources of law, 20 textual answers, absence of, 2 fragility of system, 23 framework of international law, and. See International law importance of, 1 key intellectual foundations of, 33 protection of values, 88 rules of trade, and, 1 underlying principles, 3 WTO agreements constituent instrument or constitution, as, 85 consequences for interpretation, 86 constitutional documents, as, 87

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87326-0 - Legal Principles in WTO Disputes Andrew D. Mitchell Index More information

INDEX 307

differing interpretations, 85 global community, 87 human rights treaties, and, 87 interpretative approaches, 85 objects and purposes, 87 relevance of principles, 88 role of principles, 86 scope of interpretative approach, 86 single undertakings, 85 validation of references to principles, 86 nature of interpretation, and, 68 principles derived from, 32 relevance of principles in interpreting, 72-88 DSU Article 3.2, 72 Anti-Dumping Agreement, and, 73 approaches to interpretation, and, 72 clarification of provisions, 73 customary international law, and, 73 future clarification, 73 guidelines for interpretation, and, 72 interpreter's function, 75 literalist approach to interpretation, 74 objectives of dispute settlement, and, 73 perceived rights and obligations, 74 principles as framework for interpretation, 74 rights and obligations, and, 75 'security and predictability', 74 underlying rationale of provisions, 74 VCLT Articles 31 & 32 and, 73 VCLT Articles 31 & 32, 75 adjuciator's discretion, 76 applicability of rules, 82 context, 80 dictionary definitions, and, 78 general principles of law, 83 'general rule of interpretation', 76 good faith, 77 identification of object and purpose, 80 indeterminate nature of treaty texts, 77 interpretative guidance, 84 notion of effective interpretation, 77 object and purpose, 80 ordinary meaning, 78 principles of customary international law, 83

principles reflected in preambles, 81 reference to principles, 79 relevant rules of international law, 81 rules of international law, 79 special meaning, 78 supplementary means of interpretation, 84 supplementary techniques, 77 textual approach, 78 WTO Tribunals' obligations, 84 WTO law consistency with fair administration, and, 172 defining principles of, 32-5 judicial decisions, derived from, 34 benchmark of principles, 35 evidence of existence of principles, 34 independent source, as, 34 interpretation of provisions, 34 principle of stare decisis, 34 subsequent practice, 34 WTO agreements, derived from, 32 determination of, 33 objectives of rules, 33 preambles, 33 recognition of concept, 33 due process as principle of. See Due process, principle of examples of principles of, 35-43 core principles, 37 Doha Declaration, 37 GATT/WTO law, 37 Marrakesh Agreement, 35 non-discrimination, 39 reciprocity, 42 significance of principles, 37 trade liberalisation, 38 'underlying', 36 good faith as principle of. See Good faith, principle of principles as part of, 90 proportionality, and. See Proportionality, principle of special and differential treatment, 239 supplementary means of interpretation, and, 85 WTO provisions using principles to interpret, 68 WTO Tribunals applicable law. See Applicable law application of non-WTO sources of law, 93 assessment of principles, 22 binding decisions, 34 consistency of decisions, 74

308 INDEX

WTO Tribunals (cont.) due process before, 153-7 appeal and review mechanisms, 159 bias rule, 154 DSB Rules of Conduct, 155 ex parte communications, 155 fair administration of laws, 158 framework for incorporation, 153 hearing rule, 156 imposition of requirements, 157 intellectual property rights, and, 158 no evidence rule, 157 Panel requests, 156 prior notice of case, 156 protection of procedural interests, 153 requests for consultations, 156 responding to adverse evidence, 156 right to take private actions, 159 WTO agreements requirements, 159 ensuring due process before, 160 Panel compliance. See Panels establishing ordinary meaning, 78 establishment of procedural rules, 166 exercise of inherent jurisdiction, 66 resolution of procedural matters, 175 general principles of law, and, 21 interpretation of agreements, and, 4, 15 jurisdiction, 21, 67 non-violation complaints, and, 138 principles of international law, use of, 4 relevance and accuracy, 16 substantive law, 18 principles within inherent jurisdiction of, 97-103 ad-hoc establishment of Panels, 97 applicable law, and, 97 burden of proof, and, 101 decision-making through negative consensus, 98 delineation of inherent jurisdiction, 100 evidentiary issues, 101 guidance from other legal systems, 101 implied powers, and, 98

independence, 97 judicial process, 97 jurisdictional objections, 100 nature of judicial function, 98 necessity of use of principle, 102 non-interpretative use of, 97 procedural matters, 100 'quasi-judicial' bodies, as, 99 refusal to provide information, 101 scope of inherent jurisdiction, 99 source of incidental powers, 98 Tribunals' obligations, 99 principles, use of, 67 interpretative manner, 68 legality of, 67 public international law, use of, 4 response to claims of estoppel, 127 right to representation, 168 rules of international law, 83 subject-matter jurisdiction of, 89-93 Appellate Body, 91 'compliance Panel', 92 DSU provisions delineating, 90 implementation of DSB recommendations, 92 limitations on, 89 non-violation complaints, 90 period of time for compliance with DSB rulings, 92 principle of WTO law, 90 principles as basis of claim, 89 principles incorporated in WTO agreements, 91 restrictions on, 90 suspension of concessions, 92 types of claims, and, 89 types of complaint, 90 violation complaints, 90 suspension of concessions, and, 220 trade liberalisation, and, 38 unestablished principles, and, 56 usurping the will of Members, 74

Zeroing

anti-dumping measures, and, 228