War Beyond Words

What we know of war is always mediated knowledge and feeling. We need lenses to filter out some of its blinding, terrifying light. These lenses are not fixed; they change over time, and Jay Winter’s panoramic history of war and memory offers an unprecedented study of transformations in our imaginings of war, from 1914 to the present. He reveals the ways in which different creative arts have framed our meditations on war, from painting and sculpture to photography, film, and poetry, and ultimately to silence, as a language of memory in its own right. He shows how these highly mediated images of war, in turn, circulate through language to constitute our “cultural memory” of war. This is a major contribution to our understanding of the diverse ways in which men and women have wrestled with the intractable task of conveying what twentieth-century wars meant to them and mean to us.

War Beyond Words

Languages of Remembrance from the Great War to the Present

Jay Winter
Yale University
Monash University
For Petra
And who will remember the rememberers?

... 

How does a monument come into being?

... 

And what is the best time for remembering? At noon when shadows are hidden beneath our feet, or at twilight when shadows lengthen like longings that have no beginning, no end, like God?

_Yehuda Amichai, “And who will remember the rememberers?”_\(^1\)

---

\(^1\) Yehuda Amichai, _Open closed open_, trans, by Chana Block (New York: Mariner Books, 2006)
Contents

List of Illustrations  page x
List of Figures and Tables  xvi
Acknowledgments  xviii

Introduction  1

Part I: Vectors of Memory  7

1 Configuring War: The Changing Face of Armed Conflict  9
   Mediations: Otto Dix and the Great War  17
   Death Descends from the Skies  18
   Empty Spaces  21
   Blurred Faces: Gerhard Richter  27

2 Photographing War: Soldiers’ Photographs and the
   Revolution in Violence since 1914  35
   Photographing the New Face of War  39
   1914: The Pocket Camera Arrives  41
   Cadavers  44
   War Photography after the Great War  59
   The Studium and the Punctum: Frameworks of Meaning  61
   Captions  67
3 Filming War 69
   Phases of War Film History 70
   Metonym or Metaphor 73
   Silent Film 76
   Trajectories 82
   Dignity without Voyeurism 88

4 Writing War 92
   Paths of Glory 92
   Contrasts 100
   The Afterlife of Glory 110

Part II: Frameworks of Memory 119

5 Memory and the Sacred: Martyrdom in the Twentieth Century and Beyond 121
   Memory Regimes 122
   Divergences and Convergences 127
   Martyrdom after the Holocaust 129

6 The Geometry of Memory: Horizontality and War Memorials in the Twentieth Century and After 143
   Gazing Downward: From Mantegna to Kollwitz 145
   Horizontality and the Unknown Soldiers of the Great War 150
   The Second World War and Civilian Deaths 153
   Maya Lin and the Vietnam Veterans Memorial 159
   Horizontality and European Pacifism 161

7 War Beyond Words: Shell Shock, Silence, and Memories of War 172
   Frameworks of Silence 172
   Shell Shock 174
   Case Studies 187
   Silence and Remembrance 201

   Conclusion 203
Illustrations

1.8 A London library after the Blitz (1940). Black Star / Alamy.
xi / List of Illustrations


2.1 Kodak vest pocket camera, advertisement for the Italian market (1915). Fototeca Storica Nazionale. / Getty Images.


2.4 Dr. Beurier, “Ile de Vido,” photo album cover. Collection: BDIC, Nanterre.

2.5 Beurier album, “Un serbe mourant” (a dying Serbian). Collection: BDIC, Nanterre.

2.6 Beurier album, “La barque a Caron” Collection: BDIC, Nanterre.

2.7 Beurier album, “La barque a Caron” (close-up). Collection: BDIC, Nanterre.

2.8 Beurier album, “The St. Francis of Assisi coming to collect the dead.” Collection: BDIC, Nanterre

2.9 Bardach album cover. Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

2.10 Bardach album, old man with a sack. Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

2.11 Bardach album, prostitutes. Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

2.12 Bardach album, field cinema. Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

2.13 Bardach album, “Corpse robber.” Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

2.14 Bardach album, airplane hauled by horses, Zwierow. Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

2.15 Bardach album, morning prayers in a field near Lublin. Courtesy of the Leo Baeck Institute, New York.

List of Illustrations

2.17 “Starved boy.” Armenian National Institute, Wegner Collection.
2.18 “Foraging for grain” Armenian National Institute, Wegner Collection.
4.1 Epigraph on tombstone of J. M. Browne, Suvla Bay, Gallipoli. Photograph: the author.
5.2 Umschlagplatz memorial, Warsaw. Photograph: the author.
5.3 Monument to the Murdered and Fallen in the East, Warsaw. Photograph: the author.
5.4 Railway carriage with crosses, Monument to the Murdered and Fallen in the East, Warsaw. Photograph: the author.
5.5 “In memory of the Armenian-American volunteer,” Arlington National Cemetery. Photograph: The author.
6.1 Karl and Käthe Kollwitz with workers installing her statues, German military cemetery, Roggevelde, Belgium (1932). Photo courtesy of the In Flanders Fields Museum, Ypres.
6.2 German military cemetery, Roggevelde, Belgium (1932). Copyright: De Klaproos Editions.
xiii / List of Illustrations

6.3 Stone crosses and WW1 tombstones at German First World War One military cemetery in the Praatbosforest, Vladslo, Belgium, with Kollwitz statues in the rear. Artterra Picture Library / Alamy Stock Photo.

6.4 Slab bearing the name of Peter Kollwitz, German military cemetery, Vladslo, Belgium (2014). Photograph: the author.


6.7 Andrea Mantegna, The Dead Christ and the Three Mourners (c. 1480). Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan, Italy / Bridgeman Images.

6.8 Vittore Carpaccio, The Dead Christ ca. 1520. Artexplorer / Alamy Stock Photo.


6.11 Käthe Kollwitz, “From many wounds, you bleed, O People!” between 1893 and 1897, etching (c) Käthe Kollwitz Museum Köln.


6.14 George W. Lambert, Recumbent Figure of a Soldier (Unknown Soldier), St. Mary’s Cathedral, Sydney (1927). Photograph: the author.


6.16 The Poppies on display at the Tower of London commemorating the anniversary of the First World War. Photo: Jamie Garbutt / Getty Images.
xvi / List of Illustrations

6.17 Monument to the Heroic Defenders of Leningrad (1970), Ploshchad Popedy, Victory square, Moskovsky district, St. Petersburg, Russia. Peter Forsberg / Europe / Alamy.

6.18 St. Petersburg, Further Afield, Piskarevskoye cemetery. Dorling Kindersley Ltd / Alamy Stock Photo.


6.20 Valle de los Caídos (Valley of the Fallen), Spain. YAY Media AS / Alamy Stock Photo.


6.24 Micha Ullman, Versunkene Bibliothek (Sunken Library), Bebelplatz (formerly known colloquially as Opernplatz), Berlin. Lothar Steiner / Alamy Stock Photo.


6.27 Memorial to the Murdered Jews of Europe, Berlin, Germany. Julie G. Woodhouse / Alamy.


6.29 The Vietnam Veterans’ Memorial, with the names of those who died in this war carved in a black, granite wall, in Washington DC (2015). Monica Wells / Alamy Stock Photo.


7.3 Afyon Karahissar, Turkish prisoner-of-war settlement (1918). Chronicle / Alamy Stock Photo.

7.4 Sylvia Plath, Ted Hughes, William Hughes and Edith Hughes (1956).
Figures and Tables

Figures

4.1 Google n-gram of Glory and Glorious in British English books, 1900–1930. \(\text{page } 115\)

4.2 Google n-gram of Gloire and Glorieux in French books, 1900–1930. 115

4.3 Google n-gram of Glory and Glorious in British English books, 1800–2000. 116

4.4 Google n-gram of Gloire and Glorieux in French books, 1800–2000. 116

4.5 Google n-gram of Duty, Honour, Glory in British English books, 1900–1950. 116


4.7 Google n-gram of Devoir, Honneur, Gloire, Courage in French books, 1800–2000. 117

4.8 Google n-gram of Dienst, Ehre, Ruhm, Tapferkeit (Duty, Honour, Glory, Courage) in German books, 1800–2000. 117

5.1 Google n-gram of Martyr and Martyrdom in British English books, 1800–2000. 141

5.2 Google n-gram of Martyr and Martyre in French books, 1800–2000. 141

5.3 Google n-gram of Martyrer and Martyrtum in German books, 1800–2000. 142
List of Figures and Tables

5.4 Google n-gram of Martyr (הֶנּועְמׁשֹודָק) and Martyrdom (ם׳ִׁשֹודְקַהחֶ׀ָמ) in Hebrew books, 1900–2000. 142

Tables

7.1 Allied casualties at Gallipoli, 1915–16 183
7.2 Estimates of the incidence of shell shock, under different assumptions, at Gallipoli, 1915–16, and throughout the 1914–18 war 183
Acknowledgments

In my academic life, I have been very fortunate to work with many colleagues who share my commitment to collective history, that form of scholarship written by individuals working and writing in groups, and benefiting from a kind of subtle inspiration unknown to many scholars working in peaceful isolation alone in their studies. The importance of public history – that directed to the public outside universities – and the tempestuousness of the world of cultural history are discoveries directly due to my work with colleagues in the Research Centre of the Historial de la grande guerre, Péronne, Somme, from the moment it was conceived in 1986, through its design until its inauguration in 1992, and in the decades which have followed. Listening to, disputing with, and reading the work of my partners in the Comité directeur of the Research Centre has been an education all of its own. The thinking of the founding generation of Stéphane Audoin-Rouzeau, Annette Becker, Jean-Jacques Becker, and Gerd Krumeich is writ large on every page of this book. When John Horne fortified the Comité directeur by his presence, he added his name to the unacknowledged authors of a kind of cultural history of war of which the present book is but one example. Working with Caroline Fontaine in the Research Centre over two decades has been similarly fruitful. Understanding that objects have narratives imbedded in them has made my history different, and I hope deeper, than it would have been had I stayed outside the orbit of the museum and its Research Centre. A big thank you is due to you all.

In France, my closest interlocutor, coauthor and friend has been Antoine Prost. Our friendship, and the hospitality he and Paulette Prost
Acknowledgments

have offered me, dates from before I started to work on the Historial. His lapidary prose and immense knowledge have inspired me for more than thirty years. Further east, Helmut Konrad has welcomed me to his center for the study of contemporary history at the University of Graz. There I have benefited from inspiration and wonderful forays into the Slovenian vineyards. Colleagues in Jewish history there, in particular, the late Petra Ernst, helped make Graz a haven and a home for this peripatetic scholar.

The Master and Fellows of Pembroke College, Cambridge, provided me with a congenial home and wonderful students over more than two decades. The same is true with respect to my colleagues and students at Yale, where I have spent the last fifteen years. It is a simple fact that teaching the cultural history of war in these wonderful institutions has enabled me to write about it. Teaching with gifted colleagues such as David Blight, Ute Frevert, Jonathan Spence, and Bruno Cabanes was a privilege. Jim and Ilana Ponet were my students and teachers in ways they almost certainly do not acknowledge. My initial attempt to draw my thinking together on languages of memory came from an invitation to give the Humanitas Lectures at Cambridge in 2012. A delightful stay in 2012 at Aleida Assmann’s Centre for the study of history and memory at the University of Konstanz brought me into fruitful contact with many scholars in this field. But the sheer intellectual authority and originality of Aleida and Jan Assmann are something to behold. Their generosity and openness of mind and spirit are unique. Walking into their home in Konstanz and hearing Jan and their daughter Carina playing a duet enchanted me; their family has continued to do so until this day.

The coincidence that the centenary of the outbreak of the Great War occurred while I was writing this book enabled me to speak about it and receive thoughtful responses to various parts of it not only in Europe and North America, but in venues spanning from Ecuador and Chile to Singapore, Hong Kong, China, and Japan. In particular, two separate stays for a month at the University of Hong Kong in 2014 and at the National University of Singapore in 2015 gave me the time to complete the text of this book.

The centenary of the outbreak of war contributed to the drafting of this book in yet another way. I was commissioned by Cambridge University Press to edit the three-volume Cambridge History of the Great War, and with the Comité directeur of the Research Centre
of the Historial de la grande guerre as my editorial committee, we managed to complete and publish these massive volumes both in French and English in 2014. A Chinese translation is en route. Yet another instance of the value of collective history, these volumes not only present state-of-the-art interpretations of every facet of the war, but also offered me the chance to think hard about the cultural history of the Great War from a transnational and global perspective. I am grateful too to Queens’ University, Belfast, for inviting me to give the Wiles lectures in 2016, which enabled me to try out some of these ideas in extremely congenial company.

Archivists and librarians have made this book possible in ways of which most are unaware. Aside from finding a home away from home in both the Archives nationales in Pierrefitte-sur-Seine and at the Bibliothèque nationale de France in Paris, I also must thank in particular Benjamin Gilles of the Bibliothèque de documentation internationale contemporaine for his generosity and advice. The staff of both Yale University Library and the Yale Center for British Art were more than helpful in the fifteen years I taught there; they followed in the footsteps of staff of the Cambridge University Library and Pembroke College library, who made my two decades and more there so agreeable. William Spencer of the National Archives, in Kew, went out of his way to help; what a model he is for his profession.

My appointment as a recurrent visiting professor at Monash University in Melbourne was of great importance in the development of my thinking about the cultural history of the Great War. I owe much to Rae Frances and Bruce Scates, who have made Monash a center for cultural history in general and for the cultural history of the Great War in particular. Corrie McKee found ways to make things happen with astonishing efficiency. Rebecca Wheatley was a constant help and a loyal friend. My debt to Ken Inglis is of an entirely different order. He has taught me more about the English language than anyone else, and serves still as a guide to civility. When I am puzzled about how to respond to a colleague or student, I think, what would Ken do in this situation? Rai and Yael Gaita provided hospitality and a kind of peace that only they know how to create. Al Thomson, Seumas Spark, and Mark Baker welcomed me to Melbourne in different ways, but with the same congeniality. Australian archives are superbly organized and very rich in their coverage not only of the war but of its long aftermath. The National Archives of Australia and the archives of the Australian
Acknowledgments

War Memorial are treasure troves, and their staff courteous and unfailingly helpful. In sum, Melbourne is an oasis in the academic world, and I am very grateful for the opportunity to enjoy it. Not far are the Adelaide Hills, where Robert Dare time and again dispensed his unique brand of generous hospitality and shrewd advice. In the vicinity, Robin Prior, savant and wit, offered sage advice on demand.

And then there are the unsung heroes I need to thank—the friends who could not say no when I asked them to read the whole thing: Rebecca Wheatley, Rae Frances, Bruce Scates, Antoine Prost, Kolleen Guy, Jennifer Wellington, John Horne, Harvey Mendelssohn, Astrid Erll, Sasha Etkind, Robert Dare, Helmut Konrad, and Petra Ernst. For help with individual chapters, I want to thank in particular Santanu Das, Alice Kelly, Alan Trachtenberg, Martin Jay, David Kennedy, Giacomo Lichtner, Sarah Cole, Marzena Sokolowska-Paryz, Marc Saperstein, William Spencer, Robin Prior, Paul Lancaster, and Sandy McFarlane.

As to the list of colleagues who read preliminary drafts, or responded in seminars or in academic meetings I addressed, it is sufficiently long to enable me to hide under the cover of age, and to ask you to accept as a senior moment your being placed anonymously in the collective category of my benefactors. I offer heartfelt thanks to each and every one of you.

Michael Watson and his colleagues at Cambridge University Press have been wonderful in the work they have done to steer this project to its destination. I have worked with Cambridge for more than two decades, as editor of their series in the social and cultural history of modern war, and can only express my delight in the professionalism and care they have shown in every facet of their work. Bravo.

There are other acknowledgments which are important to register at this point. I have been the fortunate beneficiary of a grant from the Hilles Fund of Yale University, which has helped defray production costs. I am grateful for permissions to reproduce material previously published in the following works: For material in Chapter 1: “Beyond glory: First World War poetry and cultural memory,” in Santanu Das (ed.), The Cambridge companion to the poetry of the First World War (Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 242–56; for material in Chapter 2: “Faces, voices, and the shadow of catastrophe,” in Estela Schindler and Pamela Colombo (eds.), Spaces and the memories of violence (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), pp. 77–90; for material in Chapter 3: “Filming war,” in David M. Kennedy (ed.),
xxii / Acknowledgments