This book examines the possibilities for the rehabilitation of Hegelian thought within current analytic philosophy. From its inception, the analytic tradition has in general accepted Bertrand Russell's hostile dismissal of the idealists, based on the claim that their metaphysical views were irretrievably corrupted by the faulty logic that informed them. But these assumptions are challenged by the work of such analytic philosophers as John McDowell and Robert Brandom, who while contributing to core areas of the analytic movement, nevertheless have found in Hegel sophisticated ideas that are able to address problems which still haunt the analytic tradition after a hundred years. Paul Redding traces the consequences of the displacement of the logic presupposed by Kant and Hegel by modern post-Fregean logic, and examines the developments within twentieth-century analytic philosophy which have made possible an analytic re-engagement with a previously dismissed philosophical tradition.

PAUL REDDING is Professor, School of Philosophical and Historical Inquiry, University of Sydney. He is author of *The Logic of Affect* (1999) and *Hegel's Hermeneutics* (1996).
MODERN EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHY

General Editor
ROBERT B. PIPPIN, University of Chicago

Advisory Board
GARY GUTTING, University of Notre Dame
ROLF-PETER HORSTMANN, Humboldt University, Berlin
MARK SACKS, University of Essex

Some recent titles
Daniel W. Conway: Nietzsche's Dangerous Game
John P. McCormick: Carl Schmitt's Critique of Liberalism
Frederick A. Olafson: Heidegger and the Ground of Ethics
Günther Zöller: Fichte's Transcendental Philosophy
Warren Breckman: Marx, the Young Hegelians, and the Origins of Radical Social Theory
William Blattner: Heidegger's Temporal Idealism
Charles Griswold: Adam Smith and the Virtues of Enlightenment
Gary Gutting: Pragmatic Liberalism and the Critique of Modernity
Allen Wood: Kant's Ethical Thought
Karl Ameriks: Kant and the Fate of Autonomy
Alfredo Ferrarin: Hegel and Aristotle
Cristina Lafont: Heidegger, Language, and World-Disclosure
Nicholas Wolsterstorff: Thomas Reid and the Story of Epistemology
Daniel Dahlstrom: Heidegger's Concept of Truth
Michelle Grier: Kant's Doctrine of Transcendental Illusion
Henry Allison: Kant's Theory of Taste
Allen Speight: Hegel, Literature, and the Problem of Agency
J. M. Bernstein: Adorno
Will Dudley: Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy
Taylor Carman: Heidegger's Analytic
Douglas Moggach: The Philosophy and Politics of Bruno Bauer
Rüdiger Bubner: The Innovations of Idealism
Jon Stewart: Kierkegaard's Relations to Hegel Reconsidered
Michael Quante: Hegel's Concept of Action
Wolfgang Detel: *Foucault and Classical Antiquity*
Robert M. Wallace: *Hegel’s Philosophy of Reality, Freedom, and God*
Johanna Oksala: *Foucault on Freedom*
Béatrice Longuenesse: *Kant on the Human Standpoint*
Wayne Martin: *Theories of Judgment*
Heinrich Meier: *Leo Strauss and the Theologico-Political Problem*
Otfried Hoefle: *Kant’s Cosmopolitan Theory of the Law and Peace*
Béatrice Longuenesse: *Hegel’s Critique of Metaphysics*
Rachel Zuckert: *Kant on Beauty and Biology*
Andrew Bowie: *Music, Philosophy and Modernity*
ANALYTIC PHILOSOPHY AND THE RETURN OF HEGELIAN THOUGHT

PAUL REDDING

University of Sydney
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: analytic philosophy and the fall and rise of the Kant–Hegel tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 McDowell, Sellars and the myth of the perceptually given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Brandom, Sellars and the myth of the logical given</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Individuation and determinate negation in Kant and Hegel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The Kantian route to Hegel's inferentialism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Aristotelian <em>Phronesis</em> and the perceptual discernment of value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Kant, Hegel and the dynamics of evaluative reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Hegel and contradiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Hegel, analytic philosophy and the question of metaphysics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bibliography**  
237

**Index**  
245
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My thanks must go first to Robert Brandom and John McDowell and, coming from the other direction, Robert Pippin and Terry Pinkard, who have all demonstrated in their own ways the classically Hegelian truth that there is unity to be found between philosophies usually taken to be antithetical. For the example, and for the help, feedback and encouragement provided by each in their different ways, I am extremely grateful. Earlier in my career, the late Bill Bonney had introduced me to the contemporaneity of Kant, and György Markus, to the timelessness of Hegel. I am particularly grateful to have had teachers such as these.

The Sydney region has attractions beyond those of sun and surf – for one, it has a lively and diverse philosophical community. I have benefited from conversations with too many to thank individually, but would have to mention Rick Benitez, David Braddon-Mitchell, Bruin Christensen, Jean-Philippe Deranty, Moira Gatens, Stephen Gaukroger, John Grumley, Duncan Ivison, Jane Johnson, Simon Lumsden, David Macarthur, Justine McGill, Melissa McMahon, Paul Patton, Huw Price, Philip Quadrio, Robert Sinnerbrink, Nick (Nicholas H) Smith and Nick (Nicholas J. J.) Smith. Among those from further afield, I would like to thank Jim Kreines, Graham Priest, Marcelo Stamm, Bob Stern, Bob Wallace, Ken Westphal, Robert Williams and Günter Zöller. At different phases of the project I greatly benefited from the assistance of Kim Frost, Rachel Goodman, Melissa McMahon and Nandi Theunissen. Late in
the project I received excellent feedback from Francesco Berto, who clearly has been down many of the paths I have wandered into here. Wherever I have failed to take advantage of the good advice offered by all above, I have only myself to thank.

Two readers for Cambridge University Press (I can thank by name Robert Hanna, who outed himself as one of these) provided invaluable feedback on an earlier (larger, messier) incarnation, as did Robert Pippin, this time in his role of series editor. I also wish to thank Hilary Gaskin for her help with bringing the project to fruition, and Sara Barnes. Large parts of this project were undertaken with the assistance of a Discovery Grant from the Australian Research Council, for which I am most grateful.

Vicki Varvaressos, my life-partner, has been the sustaining source of spiritual support and love that for me is the absolute condition for doing anything whatever.