Remastering Morals with Aristotle and Confucius

Aristotle and Confucius are pivotal figures in world history; nevertheless, Western and Eastern cultures have in modern times largely abandoned the insights of these masters. *Remastering Morals with Aristotle and Confucius* is the first book-length scholarly comparison of the ethics of Aristotle and Confucius. May Sim’s comparisons of the ethics of Aristotle and Confucius offer fresh interpretations of the central teachings of both men. More than a catalog of similarities and differences, her study brings two great traditions into dialogue so that each is able to learn from the other. This is essential reading for anyone interested in virtue-oriented ethics.

May Sim is associate professor of philosophy at The College of the Holy Cross. She is contributing editor of *The Crossroads of Norm and Nature: Essays on Aristotle’s Ethics and Metaphysics* and *From Puzzles to Principles? Essays on Aristotle’s Dialectic.* She has also contributed to *International Philosophical Quarterly, Journal of Chinese Philosophy, History of Philosophy Quarterly,* and *Dao: A Journal of Comparative Philosophy.*
For

Aris Ezra Sim Chieun Liang DeMarco

and

Ambrose Yosha Sim Chieun Siang DeMarco
## Contents

**Acknowledgments** pages ix  
**Abbreviations** xiii  
**Introduction** 1  
1 Aristotle in the Reconstruction of Confucian Ethics 23  
2 Categories and Commensurability in Confucius and Aristotle: A Response to MacIntyre 49  
3 Ritual and Realism in Early Chinese Science 72  
4 Harmony and the Mean in the *Nicomachean Ethics* and the *Zhongyong* 100  
5 The Moral Self in Confucius and Aristotle 134  
6 Virtue-Oriented Politics: Confucius and Aristotle 166  
7 Making Friends with Confucius and Aristotle 194  

**Glossary of Chinese Terms** 213  
**Name Index** 217  
**Subject Index** 219
Acknowledgments

This book would not have been possible were it not for the generosity and encouragement from so many colleagues and friends over the past eight years. The research for several chapters in this book was conducted during a semester-long sabbatical from Oklahoma State University in 1999. For that sabbatical, I am grateful. I am indebted to Professor Tu Weiming for the enlightening conversations on the Zhongyong and for the use of the Harvard-Yenching Library during my sabbatical. My gratitude also goes to Professor Kurt Pritzl for enabling me to use the Mullen Library at The Catholic University of America when I was in Maryland during that same sabbatical. Thanks are due to the College of Arts and Sciences at Oklahoma State University for an Arts & Sciences Summer Research Grant in 2003 that supported my research on “A Confucian Approach to Human Rights,” History of Philosophy Quarterly 21(4) (October 2004): 337–56. I retain this view of human rights in Chapter . For Chapter I am heavily indebted to the National Endowment for the Humanities for a Summer Stipend Award in 2004. For a Research and Publication Grant from The College of the Holy Cross that supported the preparation of my index, I am deeply grateful.

My gratitude goes to the participants of the Society for Asian and Comparative Philosophy and the International Institute for Field Being for their helpful comments and encouragement when I presented the materials from many of these chapters before them.
David Jones, Robin Wang, Ronnie Littlejohn, and Lik Kuen Tong are friends from these societies who inspired me to develop a number of chapters into their present shape. For their inspiration and encouragement, I am most thankful.


In spite of the fact that the topics in this volume are extremely fascinating, making work on them a pleasure, I very much appreciated the beachfront condo in Ocean City that my parents-in-law, Charles and Doris DeMarco, so generously offered during my sabbatical. By the same token, I am grateful to The College of the Holy Cross for welcoming my move to campus in the early summer of 2004.

As in my past projects, my husband, C. Wesley DeMarco, has been most supportive in this one and has played a key role in shaping my thoughts on many of these chapters. He may not always succeed in persuading me on certain issues, but our conversations always lead me to a better position. I am deeply indebted to Wes for his tempering effect on this whole project. Professors Alasdair C. MacIntyre and Roger T. Ames have also been extremely influential and inspiring in my attempts to compare Aristotle and Confucius. Both of them read many of these chapters while they were still drafts, and...
I have benefited tremendously from my discussions with them. I know that I have grown since the first time I read Confucius’ *Analects* eight years ago because he no longer reads like Aristotle. Similarly, Aristotle also speaks quite differently after my seven years of dialoguing with Confucius. I am truly grateful to Wes, Alasdair, and Roger for helping me find the voices of these two masters.
Abbreviations

APo  Aristotle, Posterior Analytics
Cat.  Aristotle, Categories
CC   Tu Weiming, Centrality and Commonality
DA   Aristotle, De Anima
DM   Confucius, The Doctrine of the Mean
FF   Roger Ames and David Hall, Focusing the Familiar
Met.  Aristotle, Metaphysics
NE   Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics
Pol.  Aristotle, Politics
RR&R  Mary I. Bockover (ed.), Rules, Rituals and Responsibility
TFFS Roger Ames, “The Focus-Field Self in Classical Confucianism”
TTC  David Hall and Roger Ames, Thinking through Confucius
Zy   Confucius, Zhongyong