The Politics of Citizenship in Europe

In this book, Marc Morjé Howard addresses immigrant integration, one of the most critical challenges facing European countries today, the resolution of which will in large part depend on how foreigners can become citizens. Howard's research shows that despite remarkable convergence in their economic, judicial, and social policies, the countries of the European Union still maintain very different definitions of citizenship. Based on an innovative measure of national citizenship policies, the book accounts for both historical variation and contemporary change.

Howard's historical explanation highlights the legacies of colonialism and early democratization, which unintentionally created relatively inclusive citizenship regimes. The contemporary analysis explores why some of the more restrictive countries have liberalized in recent decades, whereas others have not. Howard's argument focuses on the politics of citizenship, showing in particular how anti-immigrant public opinion – when activated politically, usually by far right movements or public referenda – can block the liberalizing tendencies of political elites. Overall, the book shows the far-reaching implications of this growing and volatile issue.

Marc Morjé Howard is an Associate Professor of Government at Georgetown University. He is the author of *The Weakness of Civil Society in Post-Communist Europe* (Cambridge, 2003), an award-winning book, and he has published numerous articles in a wide array of academic journals.
For my parents, Brigitte and Dick Howard
The Politics of Citizenship in Europe

MARC MORJÉ HOWARD

Georgetown University
Contents

List of Figures                             page vii
List of Tables                             viii
Preface                                     ix

Introduction                               1

PART I: ARGUMENT
1  Citizenship in Cross-National Perspective:     17
   An Empirical Baseline in the EU-15
2  Historical Variation and Legacies: The Impact
   of Colonialism and Early Democratization     37
3  Continuity and Change in the Contemporary
   Period: The Impact of Public Mobilization    52

PART II: CASES
4  Liberalizing Change: Sweden, Finland,       73
   Luxembourg, the Netherlands, and Portugal
5  Restrictive Continuity: Austria, Denmark, Italy,
   Spain, and Greece                            94
6  Partial Liberalization with a Restrictive Backlash:
   Germany                                      119
7  Citizenship Battles in the Historically Liberal
   Countries: France, Belgium, the United Kingdom,
   and Ireland                                  148
8  The New European Frontier: The Accession-12   169

Conclusion                                 193
## Contents

| Appendix I | Detailed Breakdown of the Three CPI Components |
| Appendix II | Naturalization Rates for the EU-15 |
| References | |
| Index | |

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

1.1 Citizenship Policy Index, 1980s and today  page 29
1.2 Comparing the CPI to Koopmans et al.’s measures  34
1.3 Comparing the CPI in 2008 to MIPEX 2006  35
2.1 The relationship between country-level factors and historical CPI scores  48
2.2 What explains different historical patterns of citizenship laws?  50
3.1 Agreement with five anti-immigrant statements  56
3.2 Average agreement rate with five anti-immigrant statements  56
3.3 Perceived consequences of immigrants  58
3.4 Latent pressures on national citizenship policies  60
3.5 A two-part political model for explaining citizenship liberalization  61
3.6 The relationship between country-level factors and CPI change  66
6.1 Annual number of naturalizations of foreigners in Germany  143
## Tables

1.1 The Three Main Components of Citizenship Policies for the EU-15 in the 1980s  
   \[page 27\]

1.2 The Three Main Components of Citizenship Policies for the EU-15 in 2008  
   \[28\]

1.3 Country Groupings Based on Historical Traditions and Recent Changes  
   \[31\]

3.1 Economic and Socio-Economic Factors in Eleven EU Countries  
   \[63\]

3.2 Demographics in Eleven EU Countries  
   \[64\]

4.1 The Electoral Strength of Far Right Parties in the Cases of Liberalizing Change  
   \[93\]

7.1 Demographics in the Historically Liberal Countries  
   \[166\]

8.1 Demographics in the Accession-12  
   \[171\]

8.2 The Three Main Components of Citizenship Policies for the Accession-12 in 2008  
   \[173\]
Preface

This book has an autobiographical back-story. It addresses a topic that has intrigued me since my earliest memories. As now happens with growing frequency, I am a product of parents from different countries. I acquired American citizenship from my father and French citizenship through my mother. In my childhood, I spent more time in the United States, but I regularly enjoyed long summers in Normandy with my French grandparents, as well as the occasional sabbatical year in Paris. Growing up, I had close friends and deep roots in both places that persisted despite the absences in between, and I genuinely felt at home in both countries. This occurred despite the torrent of questions I endured – “do you prefer French or English?” “Is it better here or there?” “Are you more American or more French?” – to which I have never quite known how to respond. The real answer, which still holds today, is that my experiences in both countries have shaped my identity, and I could not be one without the other.

My own experience is far from unique. Millions of other children have been born into two citizenships, and many millions more – including my parents – have acquired a new citizenship later in life by becoming naturalized citizens of another country (though, as shown in this book, not all can keep their prior citizenship). As immigration flows intensify and as the world becomes a smaller, more fluid place, the issue of citizenship has become increasingly timely and relevant.

Indeed, most of the advanced industrialized countries are facing an impending demographic crisis – due to low birth rates and an aging population – and the incorporation of immigrants into their working populations could be an important strategy for averting an eventual collapse of their national pension systems. At the same time, however, anti-immigrant xenophobia has increased significantly over the last two decades, thereby
placing contradictory pressures on political elites, who tend to be more responsive to the short-term demands of the electorate. The demographic problem, however, is a longer-term one, and one of the keys to understanding its eventual resolution will depend on how these countries define and enforce their citizenship policies. Given that countries still vary tremendously in terms of how they attribute and grant citizenship, there is a pressing need to better understand and explain the sources of variation, and the potential for change over time.

This book covers the twenty-seven countries that constitute today’s European Union, though it focuses in particular on the fifteen “older” member-states, which are all net “receiving” countries, facing tremendous pressures of immigration within the shared institutional structure of the EU. Yet it also creates a general framework for empirical analysis that could in principle be applied to other countries of immigration, or even to the entire world. It is my hope that this book will be of interest not only to those who work on Europe, but also to scholars exploring questions of immigration and citizenship in other regions, where the topic is also growing in importance.

The research and writing of this book was hardly a solitary endeavor, and I owe my thanks to several institutions and many friends and colleagues. At its earliest stage, my research was supported by a fellowship from the German Marshall Fund of the United States; several grants and a sabbatical from Georgetown University helped move the project along; and a grant from the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation allowed me to finish writing the book.

In addition to two anonymous reviewers from Cambridge University Press, I am grateful to the following people for their helpful comments on various parts and stages of this project: David Art, Rainer Bauböck, Seyla Benhabib, Nancy Bermeo, Erik Bleich, Mark Blythe, Giovanni Cappocia, Eva Ersbøll, Simon Green, Randall Hansen, Martin Heisler, Dick Howard, Wade Jacoby, Christian Joppke, Evan Lieberman, Adam Luedtke, Willem Maas, Susan Martin, Kathleen McNamara, Anthony Messina, Claus Offe, Craig Parsons, Martin Schain, Rogers Smith, Maarten Vink, Patrick Weil, and Jan Wielgohs. My work benefited from feedback I received after I gave presentations at Princeton, Georgetown, Tufts, Oxford, the American University in Paris, and the Hertie School of Governance in Berlin, as well as at several academic conferences. I apologize to anyone I have forgotten to mention here.

I am particularly grateful to Rainer Bauböck and his colleagues – Eva Ersbøll, Kees Groenendijk, Bernhard Perchinig, Wiebke Sievers, and
Preface

Harald Waldrauch – from the NATAC project, who included me in their 2004–2005 conferences in Vienna and generously provided early and complete access to their extremely comprehensive and helpful publications. And I would also like to thank the individual country chapter authors from the NATAC volumes, many of whom were kind enough to read drafts of my sections about their countries of expertise and to provide thoughtful corrections and feedback.

I was fortunate to have excellent research assistants over the course of this project. Sean Eudaily, Anamaria Dutceac, and Aspen Brinton helped in its earliest stages as I was still forming my ideas, and Hamutal Bernstein, Leah Gilbert, and Sara Beth Wallace Goodman provided prompt, steadfast, and always cheerful research support as the book came together.

For the second time, I have had the pleasure of having a book published by Cambridge University Press. I want to thank my editor, Lew Bateman, for believing in this project and for guiding it through the publication process, as well as Stephanie Sakson, my copy editor and production editor, for her perceptive corrections and suggestions.

Finally, there is my family. I dedicate this book to my parents, Dick Howard and Brigitte Howard (née Delaquaize), who not only provided me with the personal situation that sparked my academic interest in citizenship, but have been my regular confidants (and occasional critics) since Day One. They have supported and inspired me in more ways than I can express, and as a relatively new parent myself, I consider them my role models. My wife, Lise Morjé Howard, shares a personal interest in citizenship, having a French passport through her mother, who immigrated from France to the United States as a child and then later reconnected with her large and welcoming French family. Through our partnership and common passions, we have created a life together that I could never have dreamed of without her. And since this book addresses a topic that will become increasingly important over time, I want to thank our two little bundles of joy, Zoe and Julien (each of whom has two passports as well). As I watch them grow up effortlessly in two languages and cultures, I see them confront the same questions about their identity and belonging that I faced several decades ago. And I know that millions of other children will continue to address these questions long into the future.