Hobbes, Bramhall and the Politics of Liberty and Necessity

This is the first full account of one of the most famous quarrels of the seventeenth century, that between the philosopher Thomas Hobbes (1588–1679) and the Anglican archbishop of Armagh, John Bramhall (1594–1663). This analytical narrative interprets that quarrel within its own immediate and complicated historical circumstances, the Civil Wars (1638–1649) and Interregnum (1649–1660). The personal clash of Hobbes and Bramhall is connected to the broader conflict, disorder, violence, dislocation and exile that characterised those periods. This monograph offers not only the first comprehensive narrative of their hostilities over two decades, but also an illuminating analysis of aspects of their private and public quarrel that have been neglected in previous biographical, historical and philosophical accounts, with special attention devoted to their dispute over political and religious authority. This will be essential reading for scholars of early modern British history, religious history and the history of ideas.

Nicholas D. Jackson was a University Fellow at the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University, from 1997 to 2005.
Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History

Series editors

ANTHONY FLETCHER
Emeritus Professor of English Social History, University of London

JOHN GUY
Fellow, Clare College, Cambridge

JOHN MORRILL
Professor of British and Irish History, University of Cambridge, and Fellow, Selwyn College

This is a series of monographs and studies covering many aspects of the history of the British Isles between the late fifteenth century and the early eighteenth century. It includes the work of established scholars and pioneering work by a new generation of scholars. It includes both reviews and revisions of major topics and books which open up new historical terrain or which reveal startling new perspectives on familiar subjects. All the volumes set detailed research into our broader perspectives, and the books are intended for the use of students as well as of their teachers.

For a list of titles in the series, see end of book.
HOBBES, BRAMHALL AND THE POLITICS OF LIBERTY AND NECESSITY
A Quarrel of the Civil Wars and Interregnum

NICHOLAS D. JACKSON
It was . . . the seditious tenets of Mr Hobbes, and such like, which opened a large window to our troubles. . . . They are T. H. his own principles . . . which do serve to involve nations in civil wars.


He [Bramhall] further says that ‘just laws are the ordinances of right reason’; which is an error that hath cost many thousands of men their lives.

Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury (1588–1679) (EW, v, 176)

All books of controversies should be writ in Latin, that none but the learned may read them, and that there should be no disputations but in schools, lest it breed factions amongst the vulgar, for disputations and controversies are a kind of civil war, maintained by the pen, and often draw out the sword after.

William Cavendish, Duke of Newcastle (1592–1676) (Life of Cavendish, 125)
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments ix
List of abbreviations xi
Note on dates and style xvii

Introduction 1

1 Bishop Bramhall, the ‘Great Arminian’, ‘Irish Canterbury’ and ‘Most Unsound Man in Ireland’, 1633–1641 21

2 Bishop Bramhall, the Earl of Newcastle, Thomas Hobbes and the First English Civil War 40

3 Hobbes’s flight to France, De Cive and the beginning of the quarrel with Bramhall, summer 1645 68

4 An epistolary skirmish, 1645–1646: Bramhall’s ‘Discourse’, Hobbes’s ‘Treatise’ and Bramhall’s ‘Vindication’ 100

5 Bramhall and the royalist schemes of 1646–1650 125

6 Hobbes and Leviathan among the exiles, 1646–1651 146


9 The Restoration and death of Bramhall and Hobbes’s last word, 1668 250

Conclusion 276

Bibliography 305
Index 323
No reader of this book’s footnotes will be able to overlook my debt to dozens of scholars. Here, however, I would like to specify those to whom my gratitude is especially great. For my understanding of Bramhall’s career in Ireland in the 1630s I am much indebted to John McCafferty. He allowed me to read a draft of his article on Bramhall for the *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Like so many others who have studied Hobbes in the last decade, my debt to Noel Malcolm is considerable. I thank Nicholas Tyacke, whose scholarship was enormously helpful in sketching the arminian-calvinist context of the Hobbes–Bramhall quarrel. Similarly, I would like to express gratitude to Lisa Sarasohn, whose work on Hobbes and Newcastle proved a good guide. All of the following scholars either answered queries, shared sources and unpublished writings, supplied images or offered advice and encouragement. Some of them did all of the above. They are: Marika Keblusek, Jack Cunningham, Thomas Pink, David Smith, Anthony Milton, Nicole Greenspan, David Sturdy, Nicholas Rogers and Jeffrey Collins. While I have disagreed with the latter in some points, his meticulous Hobbes scholarship has served as a model for my own. Early in this publishing venture, John Morrill’s support and enthusiasm inspired diligent revision. I also thank the Press’s anonymous reader who offered trenchant criticism and constructive suggestions for revision. At Cambridge I was fortunate to have been managed by a talented editor, Michael Watson. His nudging was always experienced as charm for the grace with which it was applied.

This book began as a dissertation. While it was still in that form it benefited from the reading of several historians at Syracuse University. For their perusal and criticism I thank Ralph Ketcham, Chris Kyle and Pamela Edwards. I am even more indebted to one of their fellow examiners, Gordon Schochet. His exceptional generosity began when he agreed to serve as a member of my dissertation committee. Not deserving that, I have been even more undeserving of all the subsequent attention he has paid to my work. My acquaintance with Dr Schochet has allowed me to understand how sincerely Hobbes must have thanked patrons like the Cavendishes.
Acknowledgments

One of the more powerful incentives to publish a book is to obtain the opportunity to thank in public all those who have sustained the writer over many years of toil. I am heavily indebted to an advisor and mentor who has also proved a friend. I thank Joseph Levine not only for his critical tenacity while this was still being written as a dissertation (and before that, a seminar paper), but equally, more generally, for all the personal guidance and care I did not deserve as his graduate student. My gratitude to him is especially great for supporting me on all those occasions when even I would not support myself. My family, too, has supported me many times when I was thoroughly undeserving. I thank Brandon and Mary Jackson, whose hospitality and generosity at Little Spigot in West Witton allowed me to research Bramhall’s career in Yorkshire. To another aunt, Gillian White, and her family in London, I am even more indebted. While my gratitude to her, Deborah, Jonathan, and Daniel is manifold, they shall be most amused for thanking them for pretending that I was not mad to be devoting most of my existence to resuscitating a dead man from Pontefract named John Bramhall. In the same way I must thank all my siblings (JJKLNSMSBG) who have, for so long, suffered a scholar so gladly.

Lastly, and the opposite of leastly, I thank my parents. It would be no exaggeration to say that they have been this book’s and this author’s sine qua non. During its entire existence, first as a dissertation, then as a manuscript, finally as a typescript, this book has benefited from my father’s historical acumen, critical scrutiny and editorial prowess. I wish many others knew what he knows: that such a description only scrapes the surface. Likewise, any description of the love and support my mother has provided would be absurdly insufficient. To state all the things for which I am indebted to my parents would be as difficult – and long – as was the writing of this book. Like all those who cannot find satisfactory words to express gratitude, I dedicate this book to them.
ABBREVIATIONS


Answer to Milleti`ere = Bramhall, An Answer to M. de la Milleti`ere, his impertinent Dedication of his imaginary Triumph (entitled ‘The Victory of Truth’), or his Epistle to the King of Great Britain King Charles II, BW, i, 7–81.


List of abbreviations

Bodl. = Bodleian Library, Oxford University.
BL = British Library, London.


Castigations = Bramhall, Castigations of Mr Hobbes his Last Animadversions in the Case concerning Liberty and Universal Necessity; wherein all his exceptions about the controversy are fully satisfied, BW, iv, 197–506.


CJ = Journals of the House of Commons.
CJI = Journals of the House of Commons, Ireland.


CSP = Calendar of State Papers.
CSPD = Calendar of State Papers, Domestic.
List of abbreviations

CSPI = Calendar of State Papers, Ireland.


Evelyn, Diary and Correspondence = Diary and Correspondence of John Evelyn, F. R. S., to which is subjoined The Private Correspondence between King Charles I and Sir Edward Nicholas and between Sir Edward Hyde, afterwards Earl of Clarendon and Sir Richard Browne, ed. William Bray (London: George Bell & Sons, 1906; 4 vols.).


Fair Warning = Bramhall, *A Fair Warning to take heed of the Scottish Discipline, as being of all others most injurious to the Civil Magistrate, most oppressive to the Subject, most pernicious to both*, *BW*, iii, 237–87.

HJ = *Historical Journal*.


HMC Hastings, iv = *Historical Manuscripts Commission Report* (78) on the Manuscripts of the late Reginald Rawdon Hastings, Esq., of the
List of abbreviations


HPT = History of Political Thought.

JBS = Journal of British Studies.


List of abbreviations

LJI = Journals of the House of Lords, Ireland.


Nicholas Papers = The Nicholas Papers: Correspondence of Sir Edward Nicholas, Secretary of State, ed. G. F. Warner (Camden Society, 1886–1920; 4 vols.).

NYCRO = North Yorkshire County Record Office (Northallerton).


OL = Thomae Hobbes Malmesburiensis Opera Philosophica quae Latine scriptit omnia, ed. William Molesworth (London: J. Bohn, 1839–45; 5 vols.).

OLN = Hobbes, Of Liberty and Necessity: A Treatise, Wherein All Controversy Concerning Predestination, Election, Free-Will, Grace, Merits, Reprobation, &c is fully decided and cleared; in answer to a treatise written by the Bishop of Londonderry, on the same subject, EW, iv, 229–78.


PRO = Public Record Office, London.

PRONI = Public Record Office of Northern Ireland.


Rawdon Papers = The Rawdon Papers, consisting of Letters on Various Subjects, Literary, Political, and Ecclesiastical, to and from Dr John Bramhall, Primate of Ireland, including the Correspondence of Several Most Eminent Men During the Greater Part of the Seventeenth Century, ed. Edward Berwick (London and Dublin: John Nichols and Son and R. Milliken, 1819).
List of abbreviations

Replication to the Bishop of Chalcedon = Bramhall, A Replication to the Bishop of Chalcedon's Survey of the Vindication of the Church of England from Criminous Schism, with an appendix in answer to the exceptions of S. W., BW, ii, 1–335.

Rushworth = John Rushworth, Historical Collections (London, 1659–1701; 7 vols.).


Schism Guarded = Bramhall, Schism Guarded and Beaten Back upon the Right Owners, BW, ii, 339–646.

Serpent-Salve = Bramhall, The Serpent-Salve, or, A Remedy for the Biting of an Asp, BW, iii, 291–496.

Six Lessons = Hobbes, Six Lessons to the Professors of the Mathematics, One of Geometry, the Other of Astronomy, in the Chairs set up by the Noble and Learned Sir Henry Savile, in the University of Oxford, EW, vii, 181–356.

Taylor, ‘Funeral Sermon’ = Jeremy Taylor, A Sermon preached in Christ's Church, Dublin, July 16, 1663; At the funeral of the Most Reverend Father in God, John Late Lord Archbishop of Armagh, and Primate of All Ireland, BW, i, xxxix–lxxvi.

Thurloe State Papers = A Collection of the State Papers of John Thurloe, ed. T. Birch (London, 1742; 7 vols.).


Vindication of Episcopal Clergy = Bramhall, Vindication of Himself and the Episcopal Clergy from the Presbyterian Charge of Popery, BW, iii, 499–586.


NOTE ON DATES AND STYLE

All dates are in Old Style (O.S., Julian), except that the year is taken to begin 1 January, rather than 25 March. However, in many cases I also give the date New Style (N.S., Gregorian), especially in the case of correspondence in which one or both writers were in Europe.

With rare (and obvious) exception, quotations of both seventeenth-century book-titles and texts have been silently modernised.

Derry refers either to the county or diocese of the anglican church in Ireland; Londonderry refers only to the town.