Co-Operative Action

*Co-Operative Action* proposes a new framework for the study of how human beings create action and shared knowledge in concert with others by reusing with transformation resources inherited from earlier actors: we inhabit each other’s actions. Goodwin uses videotape to examine in detail the speech and embodied actions of children arguing and playing hopscotch, interactions in the home of a man with severe aphasia, the fieldwork of archaeologists, geologists, chemists and oceanographers, and legal argument in the Rodney King trial. Through ethnographically rich, rigorous qualitative analysis of human action, sociality and meaning making that incorporate the interdependent use of language, the body, and historically shaped settings, the analysis cuts across the boundaries of traditional disciplines. It investigates language-in-interaction; human tools and their use; the progressive accumulation of human cultural, linguistic, and social diversity; and multimodality as different outcomes of common shared practices for building human action in concert with others.

Charles Goodwin, Distinguished Research Professor of Communication Studies, UCLA is the author of “Professional Vision,” the most cited article published to date in the American Anthropologist.
LEARNING IN DOING: SOCIAL, COGNITIVE AND COMPUTATIONAL PERSPECTIVES

SERIES EDITOR EMERITUS
John Seely Brown, *Xerox Palo Alto Research Center*

GENERAL EDITORS
Roy Pea, *Professor of Education and the Learning Sciences and Director, Stanford Center for Innovations in Learning, Stanford University*
Christian Heath, *The Management Centre, King’s College, London*
Lucy A. Suchman, *Centre for Science Studies and Department of Sociology, Lancaster University, UK*

BOOKS IN THE SERIES
*The Construction Zone: Working for Cognitive Change in School*
Denis Newman, Peg Griffin, and Michael Cole

*Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*
Jean Lave and Etienne Wenger

*Street Mathematics and School Mathematics*
Terezinha Nunes, David William Carraher, and Analucia Dias Schliemann

*Understanding Practice: Perspectives on Activity and Context*
Seth Chaiklin and Jean Lave, Editors

*Distributed Cognitions: Psychological and Educational Considerations*
Gavriel Salomon, Editor

*The Computer as Medium*
Peter Bøgh Anderson, Berit Holmqvist, and Jens F. Jensen, Editors

*Sociocultural Studies of Mind*
James V. Wertsch, Pablo del Rio, and Amelia Alvarez, Editors

*Sociocultural Psychology: Theory and Practice of Doing and Knowing*
Laura Martin, Katherine Nelson, and Ethel Tobach, Editors

*Mind and Social Practice: Selected Writings of Sylvia Scribner*
Ethel Tobach et al., Editors

(continued after index)
Co-Operative Action

CHARLES GOODWIN

*University of California Los Angeles*
For Candy
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Figures</th>
<th>page xix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xxvii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 What Is Co-Operative Action, and Why Is It Important?  
1.1 Why Hyphenate Co-Operative?  
   1.1.1 The Conceptualization of Cooperation in Animal Experiments  
1.2 Phenomena Implicated in Co-Operative Action  
   1.2.1 Language  
   1.2.2 Human Sociality  
   1.2.3 Creating Skilled, Competent Members  
1.3 Brief Overview  
   1.3.1 Part I. Co-Operative Accumulative Action  
   1.3.2 Part II. Intertwined Semiosis  
   1.3.3 Part III. Embodied Interaction  
   1.3.4 Part IV. Co-Operative Action with Predecessors: Sedimented Landscapes for Knowledge and Action  
   1.3.5 Part V Professional Vision, Transforming Sensory Experience into Types, and the Creation of Competent Inhabitants  
1.4 Transcription and Presentation of Data  
1.5 Summary  

Part I. Co-Operative Accumulative Action  

2 Co-Operative Accumulation as a Pervasive Feature of the Organization of Action  
   2.1 Building New Action by Reusing with Transformation Materials Provided by Others  
      2.1.1 A Historical Digression
2.2 The Co-Operative Construction of Subsequent Action

2.2.1 Co-Operation(s)

2.2.2 Accumulation

2.2.3 Substrates

2.3 Varied Practices for Co-Operative Accumulation

2.3.1 Symbolic Language Embedded within Indexical and Iconic Forms of Semiosis

2.4 Summary

2.4.1 Building Action Co-Operatively on Substrates That Accumulate Resources

2.5 The Combinatorial Organization of Language and Action as Visible Public Practice

2.6 The Dialogic Syntax of John Du Bois

2.7 The Extraordinarily Rich Language of Poor African-American Children

3 The Co-Operative Organization of Emerging Action

3.1 The Emergence of Objects within Lived Time

3.2 Multiparty Co-Operative Accumulation within Noun Phrases

3.3 Competing Tellings

3.4 Inhabiting a Different World

4 Chil and His Resources

4.1 Chil’s Resources

4.1.1 Chil’s Life after His Stroke and How I Recorded His Interaction

5 Building Complex Meaning and Action with a Three-Word Vocabulary: Inhabiting and Reshaping the Actions of Others through Accumulative Transformation

5.1 Incorporating Rich Language Structure Produced by Others

5.2 Incorporating Talk Produced by Others While Transforming It

5.2.1 Indexical Incorporation

5.2.2 Symbols

5.2.3 Chains of Interpretants

5.3 Two Practices for Reusing, with Transformation, Materials Created Earlier by Others
Contents

6 The Distributed Speaker 80
   6.1 The Distributed Organization of Both Speakers and Their Utterances 80
   6.2 An Example of Cooperation 83
   6.3 Symbols That Lack Necessary Indexical Grounding 84
   6.4 Ideal, Self-Contained Fully Competent Actors, or Distributed Interactive Fields Encompassing Participants with Different Abilities? 88

Part II. Intertwined Semiosis 91
7 Intertwined Knowing 93
   7.1 Differential Knowledge States as a Constitutive Feature of Human Action 94
      7.1.1 Actively Sustaining a Complementary Distribution of Knowledge 96
   7.2 Multiple Transformations within a Single Sentence 98
   7.3 Conclusion 101
      7.3.1 The Ongoing Organization of Awareness That Others Have Knowledge That Differs from Our Own through Co-Operative Action 101
      7.3.2 The Interpreting Self as Unfolding Co-Operative Practice 103
      7.3.3 The Shaping of Utterances, Actions, and Sentences within Interaction 103
      7.3.4 Simultaneous Co-Operative Action 104

8 Building Action by Combining Different Kinds of Materials 105
   8.1 Building Action by Joining Together Different Kinds of Resources 107
   8.2 The Laminated Organization of Spoken Action 108
      8.2.1 Inflecting Stance 110
   8.3 Using Prosody to Build Varied Action with a Limited Lexicon 110
      8.3.1 Saying Something Different by Building a New Contextual Configuration 115
   8.4 Building Action through Use of Varied, Distributed Resources 117
   8.5 Chil’s Timing 118
      8.5.1 Exploiting Rhythm and Timing in American Football 119
   8.6 Conclusion 120
9 Intertwined Actors
  9.1 The Laminated Organization of Human Action
     9.1.1 Delaminating Talk and Action Provided by Others
     9.2 Laminated Co-Operative Action That Spans Centuries
  9.3 Visible Co-Operations on Another's Emerging Talk
     9.3.1 A Silent, though Visible Principal Character
     9.3.2 Building Action by Performing Structure Preserving
          Visible Transformations on a Public Substrate
  9.4 The Visible Cognitive Life of the Hearer
  9.5 Temporally Unfolding Participation Central to the
     Organization of Human Action
  9.6 Human Tools
  9.7 The Combinatorial Organization of Human Tools as
     a Matrix for the Constitution of Human Social and
     Economic Organization
  9.8 Conclusion

10 Projection and the Interactive Organization of
    Unfolding Experience
  10.1 Assessments
     10.1.1 Embodied Responses by Recipients to Assessments
  10.2 Assessment Adjectives as Guides for Hearers
  10.3 Monitoring the Experiential Displays of Others
     10.3.1 Bringing Assessment Activity to a Close
  10.4 Conclusion

11 Projecting Upcoming Events to Accomplish
    Co-Operative Action
  11.1 Movement to a Different Kind of Activity
  11.2 Projecting the Loci for Collaborative Activity in Talk
     11.2.1 Extended Overlap
     11.2.2 Differential Access as an Organizing Feature of
          Concurrent Assessments
     11.2.3 Making Visible Congruent Understanding
     11.2.4 Erroneous Projection
     11.2.5 Simultaneous Vocal and Nonvocal Heightened
          Involvement
     11.2.6 Exiting from the Collaborative Assessment
     11.2.7 Laminating Inconsistent Displays to Create Delicate
          Withdrawals

Contents
xii

9 Intertwined Actors 122
  9.1 The Laminated Organization of Human Action 122
     9.1.1 Delaminating Talk and Action Provided by Others 124
  9.2 Laminated Co-Operative Action That Spans Centuries 129
  9.3 Visible Co-Operations on Another's Emerging Talk 131
     9.3.1 A Silent, though Visible Principal Character 131
     9.3.2 Building Action by Performing Structure Preserving
          Visible Transformations on a Public Substrate 132
  9.4 The Visible Cognitive Life of the Hearer 133
  9.5 Temporally Unfolding Participation Central to the
     Organization of Human Action 135
  9.6 Human Tools 136
  9.7 The Combinatorial Organization of Human Tools as
     a Matrix for the Constitution of Human Social and
     Economic Organization 139
  9.8 Conclusion 140

10 Projection and the Interactive Organization of
    Unfolding Experience 142
  10.1 Assessments 143
     10.1.1 Embodied Responses by Recipients to Assessments 143
  10.2 Assessment Adjectives as Guides for Hearers 144
  10.3 Monitoring the Experiential Displays of Others 147
     10.3.1 Bringing Assessment Activity to a Close 149
  10.4 Conclusion 149

11 Projecting Upcoming Events to Accomplish
    Co-Operative Action 151
  11.1 Movement to a Different Kind of Activity 153
  11.2 Projecting the Loci for Collaborative Activity in Talk 153
     11.2.1 Extended Overlap 155
     11.2.2 Differential Access as an Organizing Feature of
          Concurrent Assessments 156
     11.2.3 Making Visible Congruent Understanding 157
     11.2.4 Erroneous Projection 158
     11.2.5 Simultaneous Vocal and Nonvocal Heightened
          Involvement 160
     11.2.6 Exiting from the Collaborative Assessment 161
     11.2.7 Laminating Inconsistent Displays to Create Delicate
          Withdrawals 162
Contents

Part III. Embodied Interaction 167

12 Action and Co-Operative Embodiment in Girl's Hopscotch 169
  12.1 Semiotic Structure in the Environment 171
  12.2 Talk-in-Interaction 173
  12.3 Changing Contextual Configurations 180
  12.4 Conclusion 186

13 Practices of Color Classification 189
  13.1 Mapping a Feature 190
  13.2 Semiotic Structure in the Environment 190
  13.3 The Munsell Chart as a Historically Shaped Field for the Production of Action 195
  13.4 Heterotopias 198
  13.5 Building Action within Talk-in-Interaction with the Munsell Chart 200
  13.6 The Intersubjective Constitution of the Objects That Animate the Work of a Community 205
    13.6.1 The Intelligible Body: Embodied Stance and the Constitution of Action 208
  13.7 Using Graphic Fields to Build Action 210

14 Highlighting and Mapping the World as Co-Operative Practice 212
  14.1 Highlighting 212
  14.2 Graphic Representations as Embodied Practice 214
  14.3 Co-Operative Action as a Framework for Making Public Another's Understanding 216
  14.4 Calibrating Professional Vision through Embodied Co-Operative Action within a Relevant Environment 217

15 Environmentally Coupled Gestures 221
  15.1 Juxtaposing Multiple Semiotic Fields to Accomplish Pointing 222
  15.2 Gestures Tied to the Environment 227
  15.3 The Communicative Status of Environmentally Coupled Gestures 232
    15.3.1 Embedding Gesture within Participation Frameworks 234
    15.3.2 Multiple Forms of Embodied Semiosis Operate Simultaneously 235
  15.4 The Accumulative Power of the Laminated Structure of Human Action 236
  15.5 Conclusion 240
xiv

Contents

Part IV. Co-Operative Action with Predecessors:
Sedimented Landscapes for Knowledge and Action 243

16 Co-Operative Action with Predecessors 245

16.1 The Consequential Presence of Absent Predecessors within Local Face-to-Face Interaction 246

16.1.1 The Special Character of Copresence 248

16.2 My Use of the Term “Predecessor” 250

16.3 Co-Operative Action with Absent Predecessors 251

16.3.1 Substrate Created Co-Operatively by Actors Distributed in Space and by Task 251

16.3.2 Transforming a Scene into Action-Relevant Objects 252

16.4 Organizing the Work-Relevant Perception of the Environment 255

16.5 Co-Operative Accumulation Both with Those Who Are Present, and with the Materials Provided by Predecessors 257

16.6 The Schedule as a Cultural Umwelt 259

16.7 The Schedule Organizing Work-Relevant Perception within an Umwelt 261

17 The Accumulation of Diversity through Co-Operative Action 263

17.1 The Accumulative Power of Environmental Laminations as Components of Action 263

17.2 The Accumulation of Diversity 265

17.2.1 The Co-Operative Organization of Interaction with Predecessors 267

17.2.2 The Prospective Organization of Action through Substrates 268

17.3 Co-Operative Accumulation with Predecessors vs. Those Who Share Space and Time with Us in an Unfolding Present 269

17.3.1 Accumulation Sustained through Co-Operative Action 271

17.4 Conclusion 272

18 Seeing in Depth 275

18.1 The Sampling Grid 279

18.1.1 Convergent Diversity 284

18.2 Tools 286

18.2.1 The CTD as a Tool for Perception 288

18.2.2 Multiple Perceptual Frameworks 290

18.2.3 Articulating the Document Surface 295
Contents

18.3 Seeing in Common 300
18.4 Hybrid Spaces: Space as Locally Organized, Historically Situated Practice 302

19 Co-Operative Action as the Source of, and Solution to, the Task Faced by Every Community of Creating New, Culturally Competent Members with Specific Forms of Knowledge and Skill 307
  19.1 Pedagogy a Human Universal 307
  19.2 Repairs and the Display of Language Structure 309
  19.3 The Accumulative Diversity of Settings and Communities and the Construction of Skilled Inhabitants 312
  19.4 Creating Skilled Actors through Co-Operative Action 314
    19.4.1 Seeing an Inappropriate Action and Intercepting It Before It Can Occur 318
  19.5 Co-Operatively Breaking an Egg 319
  19.6 Summary 323

Part V. Professional Vision, Transforming Sensory Experience into Types, and the Creation of Competent Inhabitants 325
20 The Emergence of Conventionalized Signs within the Natural World 329
  20.1 Symbols 330
    20.1.1 How Did Symbols Emerge in the Natural World? 331
    20.1.2 Gesture as Precursor to Language? 333
  20.2 The Inherent Indeterminacy of Gesture 333
  20.3 Gesture First Theories of Language Origins 335
  20.4 The Transparency of Gesture? 337
  20.5 Action Consequences of the Indeterminacy of Gesture 341
  20.6 Co-Operative Action as an Environment Promoting the Evolution of Arbitrary Signs 342
    20.6.1 An Environment of Rich Relevant Resources 343
  20.7 Conclusion 346

21 Calibrating Experience and Knowledge by Touching the World Together 348
  21.1 Calibrating Professional Vision 349
  21.2 Transforming Embodied Experience into a Category 350
## Contents

21.3 The Interplay between Objects of Experience and Abstract Types 356
  21.3.1 An Ethnomethodological Perspective 358
  21.3.2 Conventionalized Signs as Active Co-Operative Work 359
  21.3.3 Building a World of Public Shared Forms from the Co-Operative Organization of Experience 361

22 The Blackness of Black: Color Categories as Situated Practice 363
  22.1 Overview 363
  22.2 Color Categories as Cognitive Universals: Divorcing Cognition from Practice 364
    22.2.1 Situated Activity Systems 366
  22.3 Scientific Description as Embodied, Situated Knowledge 369
  22.4 Seeing Jet Black as a Problematic, Situated Task 372
    22.4.1 Situated Activities as Frameworks for Motivation and Precision 373
  22.5 The Social Organization of Practice and Apprenticeship within Situated Processes of Human Interaction 374
    22.5.1 Inventing New Category Systems Tailored to the Local Setting 376
  22.6 Highlighting and Positioning for Perception 377
  22.7 Seeing Activities 379
    22.7.1 Embodied Cognition 379
    22.7.2 Using Diverse, Serendipitous Criteria to Constitute a Category 381
  22.8 The Social and Practical Constitution of Accountable Knowledge 383
  22.9 Conclusion 384
    22.9.1 The Methodology of Berlin and Kay 385
    22.9.2 Phenomena Made Available for Analysis by a Situated Activity System 386
    22.9.3 Using General Structures to Build Locally Relevant, Situated Action 388

23 Building Skilled, Knowing Actors and the Phenomenal Objects They Are Trusted to Know 391
  23.1 Tracing and Inscribing 393
  23.2 Progressive Reformulation through Changing Points to a Common Target 396
    23.2.1 Pointing as Action 396
    23.2.2 Learning to See as a Professional through Pointing 398
    23.2.3 Pointing as Demonstration 400
Contents

23.3 Co-Operative Pointing 401
23.4 Conclusion 404

24 Professional Vision 407
24.1 Contested Vision 409
24.2 Coding Aggression as Professional Practice 411
24.3 Expert Testimony: An Ethnography of Seeing 414
24.4 Graphic Demonstrations and Material Artifacts: The Birth of Rodney King as a Visible Actor 419
24.5 The Power to Speak as a Professional 422
24.6 Conclusion 424

25 Conclusion 429
25.1 Co-Operative Action 430
25.2 Accumulation 431
25.3 Cooperation and Co-Operative Action 432
25.4 Language from the Perspective of Co-Operative Action 433

25.4.1 A Diagrammatic Inflection 436
25.4.2 Indexical Incorporation 437
25.4.3 Combining Different Kinds of Materials 438
25.4.4 Distributed Actors and Utterances 440
25.4.5 Action Organized through and within a Dynamic Ecology of Meaning Making Practices 441
25.4.6 A Perspective on the Phenomenology of Language 445

25.5 Co-Operative Action as an Environment That Would Promote and Then Sustain the Emergence of Peircian Symbols in the Natural World 447
25.5.1 Language as Symbol Use Rooted in Public Practice? 447
25.5.2 The Emergence of Symbols within Co-Operative Action 449

25.5.2.1 Chil’s Restriction to Indexical and Iconic Signs Systematically Delays Movement to a Next Action 450
25.5.2.2 Navigating Multiple Possibilities for Future Action 451
25.5.2.3 Symbols as a Solution to the Problem of Moving Action Forward within Co-Operative Action 452
25.5.2.4 Combining Symbols Once They Have Emerged 453
25.5.3 Symbols as Co-Operative Action within Communities 454

25.6 Phenomena That Emerge from Co-Operative Action 455
25.6.1 Accumulative Diversity 455
25.6.2 Creating Skilled, Competent Inhabitants 456
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25.6.3 Constituting Symbols through Public Practice within a Community</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.7 The Public Organization of Co-Operative Action</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.8 Time, Experience, and Language as Lived Practice</td>
<td>464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.8.1 The Intertwining of Knowledge and Experience with</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative Semiotic Resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.8.2 Chronotopes</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.8.3 The Life Cycle</td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.9 Summary Overview</td>
<td>474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References Cited</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

1.1 Building new action by decomposing and reusing materials created by earlier actors.  
1.2 Building new action by performing accumulative transformations on materials created by earlier actors.  
1.3 Transcription system for talk.  
2.1 The collaborative construction of a sentence.  
2.2 Reuse with transformation.  
2.3 Building action through accumulative co-operations.  
2.4 Reuse with transformation.  
2.5 Interlocking phenomena that contribute to the organization of accumulative co-operative action.  
3.1 Incorporating another's contribution into a mutable noun phrase.  
3.2 Competing perspectives within a noun phrase.  
3.3 Iwasaki (2011): The interactive constitution of units within Japanese.  
3.4 Hayashi (1997): Using a particle to incorporate with transformation a noun from another's talk.  
4.1 Chil's semiotic resources in which a limited lexicon is supplemented by gesture and rich prosody.  
5.1 Incorporating with transformation language structure created by another.  
5.2 Filling Chil's impoverished lexicon with Candy's rich language.  
5.3 Combining different forms of semiosis to reuse materials created by another, while transforming them into something new.  
5.4 Chains of accumulative transformations.  
5.5 Pervasive reuse with transformation to build subsequent action.  
6.1 The distributed organization of utterances and speakers.
List of Figures

6.2 Recognizing what a symbol signifies NOT adequate to establish relevant meaning or action. 85
6.3 Language and the speaker as a distributed interactive field. 89
7.1 Intertwined, differential knowing built into the formal organization of action. 95
7.2 Speaker modifies her displayed knowledge to sustain the appropriateness of her action for a knowing addressee. 96
7.3 Intertwined knowing as a public feature of the unfolding organization of accumulative, adaptive co-operative action. 99
8.1 Intertwining different kinds of semiosis to build a single action. 109
8.2 Building varied action by combining different kinds of meaning making materials. 112
8.3 Varied prosody over the same lexical items. 114
8.4 An overview of how Chil's actions are constructed through intertwined semiosis. 117
9.1 Chil builds an action by attaching his prosody to rich language structure created by someone else. 125
9.2 Action built through the intertwined semiosis of actors living four hundred years apart. 130
9.3 A single laugh constructed by two separate actors, each using different semiotic materials. 132
9.4 Projecting upcoming events so as to accomplish co-operative action. 134
9.5 Tools have combinatorial organization that leads to accumulation with transformation through co-operative action. 137
9.6 The combinatorial organization of co-operative action provides an armature for human social and economic organization. 140
10.1 Assessment examples. 143
10.2 Displaying congruent stance in the midst of an ongoing telling. 144
10.3 Change in alignment immediately after assessment adjective. 145
10.4 Different operations and stance on the same entity in the midst of an unfolding unit, and after the unit has reached completion. 146
10.5 Speaker monitoring and guiding addressee's stance. 148
11.1 Simultaneous co-operative assessments. 152
11.2 The organization of clauses used to construct postpositioned assessments. 153
List of Figures

11.3 Projection and differential positioning in the midst of simultaneous talk. ... 163
11.4 Embodied display of agreement. ... 164
11.5 Erroneous projection. ... 172
11.6 Vocal and embodied concurrent mutual involvement at the height of activity. ... 174
11.7 Modulated withdrawal. ... 175
11.8 Exiting while showing appreciation by laminating different displays. ... 177
11.9 Withdrawing by reusing with transformation embodied resources used to build prior action. ... 181
12.1 The hopscotch grid. ... 182
12.2 A dispute in hopscotch. ... 191
12.3 Parallelism in prosody. ... 192
12.4 Gesture and talk within an embodied participation framework. ... 195
12.5 Carla leans toward Diana. ... 196
12.6 Addressee dismantles facing formation by withdrawing gaze. ... 197
12.7 Deictic stomp. ... 200
13.1 Mapping a feature. ... 201
13.2 Building action by attending to a special semiotic field inherited from predecessors. ... 203
13.3 Classifying color as professional practice. ... 204
13.4 Architectures for perception within chains of accumulative action. ... 205
13.5 Diverse sign systems for the classification of the same color. ... 206
13.6 Co-operative action with predecessors: interpreting the environment through an inherited environmental lamination. ... 207
13.7 Co-operative calibration of perception with those who are present while incorporating materials provided by predecessors. ... 208
13.8 Action and perception built through the sequential intertwining of talk, tools, and bodies. ... 209
13.9 Intertwining actors, objects inherited from predecessors, and the embodied practices required to know something competently. ... 210
13.10 Compromise touched off by materials being intently scrutinized. ... 211
### List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>Outlining a feature.</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>Measurement, talk, and entering coordinates within co-operative mapmaking.</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>Seeing that a request has not been properly carried out.</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>Talk and gesture mutually elaborate each other.</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>Multiple targets.</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>Talk alone.</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>Gesture alone.</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>Object incorporated into gesture.</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.5</td>
<td>Categorization linked to what is being categorized through gesture.</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>Multimodal organization of action.</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>Utterances presuppose gesture.</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>Addressee gaze toward gesture.</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.9</td>
<td>Participation framework creates frame for other sign exchange processes.</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.10</td>
<td>The laminated structure of human action.</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>Co-operative action constituted through intersecting consciousnesses moving through time, while working with resources provided by absent predecessors.</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>The schedule as a substrate for accumulative operations and for the organization of work-relevant perception.</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>Organizing action-relevant perception of the current environment through co-operative, accumulative transformations on resources inherited from others.</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>Use of co-operative accumulation to build action with both those who are present and resources inherited from predecessors.</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>Accumulative co-operative action creates a multitude of diverse cultural umwelts for human beings.</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.1</td>
<td>Seeing the same world through different inscriptions.</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>The sampling grid.</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>Convergent diversity.</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>The CTD: tools from different disciplines converging on the same platform.</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>Different kinds of water in the water column.</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>Physical oceanographer’s instruments provide a picture of the water column that can be used by the geochemist.</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>Multiple perceptual frameworks.</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

18.8 A measurement of depth that juxtaposes the CTD to the bottom. 292
18.9 Intersecting Umwelts. 294
18.10 Distances on the border of the screen are spatially far from the features visible in the graph. 295
18.11 Working to render phenomena visible on a document surface. 296
18.12 The intertwining of interactive and graphic spaces. 301
18.13 Recognizing what another is seeing. 301
18.14 Seeing the action suggested by an approximate number. 301
18.15 A family of accumulative hybrid spaces. 304
19.1 Displaying slots and alternatives. 310
19.2 Combinatorial and grammatical possibilities of a noun phrase. 311
19.3 Accumulative co-operative action creates an unfolding diversity of settings, each populated by highly distinctive phenomena and objects (A: kitchen in America; B: kitchen in Mayan Mexico; C: chemistry lab; D: Munsell chart; E: hopscotch grid). 312
19.4 Accumulative co-operative action creates an unfolding diversity of settings, each populated by highly distinctive phenomena and objects (F: oceanographic ship; G: airport; H: surgical operating theater; I: geology field school; J: archaeological excavation). 314
19.5 Opaque tools in a dense, opaque environment. 315
19.6 Building knowing, competent, skilled actors by co-operatively constructing the same action. 316
19.7 Building action co-operatively provides a framework for monitoring and correcting the actions of a newcomer before they are actually performed. 318
19.8 Mother co-operatively organizes environment for daughter’s action. 320
19.9 Acquiring skill through co-operative action. 321
20.1 Combining symbolic with iconic and indexical signs. 330
20.2 Addressee cannot recover either referent or action being done with linked pointing gestures. 337
20.3 Co-operative action as an environment for the emergence of symbols. 344
21.1 Transforming experience of an object in the world into an action-relevant category through co-operative action. 350
21.2 Endogenously creating the sensorium of a geologist through accumulative, co-operative action. 352
List of Figures

21.3 Building, through the public regimentation of embodied experience in a consequential environment, both skilled, knowing bodies and the distinctive discursive objects that are the focus of their work. 358
22.1 Berlin and Kay’s universal sequence of color terms. 365
22.2 Work in a geochemistry lab. 371
22.3 Not even close. 375
22.4 Fibers in a vat of chemicals. 378
22.5 Positioning fibers to judge their color. 378
22.6 Synesthesia – texture tied to color. 380
22.7 The emergence of serendipitous criteria. 382
22.8 Mastering the embodied skill required for a competent judgment. 384
23.1 Mapping a feature. 392
23.2 From gesture to durable marks in the environment. 393
23.3 Calibrating professional vision through a dialogue of co-operative environmentally coupled gestures. 395
23.4 Guided seeing through incremental reformulation. 397
23.5 Incremental shaping of an object to be recognized through categorization and gesture. 399
23.6 Using gesture to show past motion demonstrated through color patterning in dirt. 400
23.7 Demonstrating embodied understanding through co-operative pointing. 402
23.8 Demonstrating professional vision and embodied understanding through co-operative pointing. 403
23.9 The mutual constitution of skilled, knowing actors and the phenomena they know. 405
23.10 Co-operative regimentation of experience to create a community’s professional vision and the skilled sensorium that makes possible the work of its members. 406
24.1 Coding scheme transforms events. 412
24.2 Violence described through neutral language drawn from the social sciences. 412
24.3 Kicks as tools. 413
24.4 See blows as reasonable by adding expert’s perceptions. 414
24.5 Rodney King in control of situation. 414
24.6 Sergeant Duke analyzes the Rodney King videotape. 415
24.7 Using a coding scheme to transform minute body movement by Rodney King into a display of aggression. 415
List of Figures

24.8 Sergeant Duke shows display of aggression by Rodney King. 416
24.9 Use of white lines to highlight King’s body. 421
24.10 Concern from a situated perspective. 422
24.11 Situated perception and asymmetrical rights to be heard. 423
24.12 Instruction by experts: Sergeant Duke showing police officer’s perspective; archaeologist showing measurement technique. 427
25.1 Building new action by performing accumulative transformations on materials created by earlier actors. 431
I am lucky to be indebted to so many people who have guided me from the time I began to work with Gail Jefferson through my current colleagues and students, many of whom have also made most insightful comments on earlier versions of the analysis presented here. More crucially, throughout my career, I have been able to learn and grow through wonderful discussions and seminars with an extraordinary range of colleagues and students. I feel privileged to have spent my academic career in such company.

I am very deeply indebted to Peter Auer, Asta Cekaite, Eton Churchill, Betty Couper-Kuhlen, David DeLiema, Arnulf Deppermann, Sandro Duranti, Cre Engelke, Yrjö Engestroem, Don Everhart, Don Favareau, Candy Goodwin, Anthony Graesch, Christian Heath, Edwin Hutchins, Darrell Henry, Shimako Iwasaki, Gail Jefferson, Niels Nørkjaer Johannsen, Chris Johnson, Timo Kaukomaa, Leelo Keevallik, Jeremy Kelly, Adam Kendon, Tim Koschman, Lourdes de León Pasquel, Oskar Lindwall, Per Linell, Helen Joe Manson, Numa Markee, Melandar, Brandon Mells, Dave Mogk, Lorenza Mondada, Billy Moore, Keith Murphy, Elinor Ochs, Susan Perry, Johanne Sege Philapsen, Federica Raia, Harvey Sacks, Fritjof Sahlström, Emanuel Schegloff, John Schumann, Margaret Selting, Mick Smith, Monica Smith, Jürgen Streeck, Danjie Su, Lucy Suchman, Akira Takada, Angela Tán, Daniela Veronesi, Johannes Wagner, and Ray Wilkinson for most insightful and helpful comments on an earlier version of this analysis. I owe a great debt to Gail Wagner, the students at her archaeological field school, Chil and his family, the children recorded by Candy Goodwin as they played on the street in Philadelphia, the families who participated in the UCLA Sloan Center on the Everyday Lives of Families organized by Elinor Ochs, professors and students in the geological field schools organized by Dave Mogk and Darrell Henry and Willard Moore, and the participants on the oceanographic
Acknowledgments

research vessel, for allowing actual events in their lives to be recorded. Gail Wagner, Dave Mogk, Darrell Henry, and Willard Moore, and Kim Kastens opened up new intellectually rich worlds for me through most enlightening discussions about their work.

I am especially indebted to the participants in my Co-Operative Action Lab, especially Johanne Stege Philipsen, Michael Smith, Federica Raia, Brandon Mells, David DeLiema, Don Everhart, Virginia Flood, and Sara Merlino.

My thinking has been immensely stimulated by discussions about the work presented here during long bike rides with Sandro Duranti.

My debt to all those who have taken the time to make such insightful comments is deep and genuine. It is not just that I am responsible for the problems that remain, but rather that within the limits of this book I cannot adequately explore the richness of what they have given me.

Candy Goodwin has been my greatest intellectual companion and partner throughout my career. I am so lucky to have shared all of my intellectual journeys with her, and to have been so stimulated by her own. We have lived an extraordinary forty-eight years together as partners both in life, and in the exploration of the rich world of human interaction.

Earlier Versions of Some of the Analysis

Within a new theoretical framework and frequently with important revisions, this volume includes work done at different points throughout my career (it was originally solicited as a collection of papers about my research in scientific and technical environments), as well as new analysis. I happily thank the original publishers for permission to reuse it here.


An earlier version of Chapter 2 appeared as a section of “Children's Arguing” by Marjorie Harness Goodwin and Charles Goodwin in Language, Gender and Sex in Comparative Perspective, edited by Susan Steele and Christine Tanz (1997 Cambridge University Press). It is used here in substantially modified form with the permission of Cambridge University Press. Parts of Chapters 13 and 23 were earlier published in “Things and Their Embodied Environments” in The Cognitive Life of Things: Recasting the
Acknowledgments


Chapters 21 and 24 were published as “Professional Vision” in the American Anthropologist 96(3), 1994. The copyright for the images from the Rodney King videotape is owned by George Holliday. They are used here with his permission.


Chapters 12 and 13 were published as “Action and Embodiment within Situated Human Interaction” in the Journal of Pragmatics 32, 2000. Parts of Chapters 1, 8, 9, 15 and 23, as well as an earlier version of my analysis of co-operative action, appeared in “The Co-Operative, Transformative Organization of Human Action and Knowledge” in the Journal of Pragmatics 46(1), 2012. They are used here with permission of the Journal of Pragmatics.

Chapter 18 was originally published as “Seeing in Depth” in Social Studies of Science 25, 1995. It is republished here with the permission of Sage Publications.

Chapter 22 was earlier published as “The Blackness of Black: Color Categories as Situated Practice” in Discourse, Tools and Reasoning: Essays on Situated Cognition edited by Lauren B. Resnick, Roger Säljö, Clotilde
Abridged version

Acknowledgments

Pontecorvo, and Barbara Burge (1997 Springer). It is published here with the permission of Springer.