

Co-Operative Action

Co-Operative Action proposes a new framework for the study of how human beings create action and shared knowledge in concert with others by reusing with transformation resources inherited from earlier actors: we inhabit each other's actions. Goodwin uses videotape to examine in detail the speech and embodied actions of children arguing and playing hopscotch, interactions in the home of a man with severe aphasia, the fieldwork of archaeologists, geologists, chemists and oceanographers, and legal argument in the Rodney King trial. Through ethnographically rich, rigorous qualitative analysis of human action, sociality and meaning making that incorporate the interdependent use of language, the body, and historically shaped settings, the analysis cuts across the boundaries of traditional disciplines. It investigates language-in-interaction; human tools and their use; the progressive accumulation of human cultural, linguistic, and social diversity; and multimodality as different outcomes of common shared practices for building human action in concert with others.

Charles Goodwin, Distinguished Research Professor of Communication Studies, UCLA is the author of "Professional Vision," the most cited article published to date in the *American Anthropologist*.

LEARNING IN DOING: SOCIAL, COGNITIVE AND
COMPUTATIONAL PERSPECTIVES

SERIES EDITOR EMERITUS

John Seely Brown, *Xerox Palo Alto Research Center*

GENERAL EDITORS

Roy Pea, *Professor of Education and the Learning Sciences and Director,
Stanford Center for Innovations in Learning, Stanford University*
Christian Heath, *The Management Centre, King's College, London*
Lucy A. Suchman, *Centre for Science Studies and Department of
Sociology, Lancaster University, UK*

BOOKS IN THE SERIES

The Construction Zone: Working for Cognitive Change in School
Denis Newman, Peg Griffin, and Michael Cole

Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation
Jean Lave and Etienne Wenger

Street Mathematics and School Mathematics
Terezinha Nunes, David William Carraher, and
Analucia Dias Schliemann

Understanding Practice: Perspectives on Activity and Context
Seth Chaiklin and Jean Lave, Editors

Distributed Cognitions: Psychological and Educational Considerations
Gavriel Salomon, Editor

The Computer as Medium
Peter Bøgh Anderson, Berit Holmqvist, and Jens F. Jensen, Editors

Sociocultural Studies of Mind
James V. Wertsch, Pablo del Rio, and Amelia Alvarez, Editors

Sociocultural Psychology: Theory and Practice of Doing and Knowing
Laura Martin, Katherine Nelson, and Ethel Tobach, Editors

Mind and Social Practice: Selected Writings of Sylvia Scribner
Ethel Tobach et al., Editors

(continued after index)

Co-Operative Action

CHARLES GOODWIN

University of California Los Angeles



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521866330

DOI: 10.1017/9781139016735

© Charles Goodwin 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Goodwin, Charles, author.

Title: Co-operative action / Charles Goodwin, University of California Los Angeles.

Description: New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. |

Series: Learning in doing: social, cognitive and computational perspectives |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017034299 | ISBN 9780521866330 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Social interaction. | Cooperativeness. | Social psychology.

Classification: LCC HM1111 .G66 2018 | DDC 302—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017034299>

ISBN 978-0-521-86633-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Candy

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxvii
1 What Is Co-Operative Action, and Why Is It Important?	1
1.1 Why Hyphenate Co-Operative?	5
1.1.1 <i>The Conceptualization of Cooperation in Animal Experiments</i>	7
1.2 Phenomena Implicated in Co-Operative Action	9
1.2.1 <i>Language</i>	9
1.2.2 <i>Human Sociality</i>	11
1.2.3 <i>Creating Skilled, Competent Members</i>	12
1.3 Brief Overview	12
1.3.1 <i>Part I. Co-Operative Accumulative Action</i>	12
1.3.2 <i>Part II. Intertwined Semiosis</i>	13
1.3.3 <i>Part III. Embodied Interaction</i>	14
1.3.4 <i>Part IV. Co-Operative Action with Predecessors: Sedimented Landscapes for Knowledge and Action</i>	15
1.3.5 <i>Part V Professional Vision, Transforming Sensory Experience into Types, and the Creation of Competent Inhabitants</i>	16
1.4 Transcription and Presentation of Data	17
1.5 Summary	20
Part I. Co-Operative Accumulative Action	21
2 Co-Operative Accumulation as a Pervasive Feature of the Organization of Action	23
2.1 Building New Action by Reusing with Transformation Materials Provided by Others	23
2.1.1 <i>A Historical Digression</i>	27

2.2	The Co-Operative Construction of Subsequent Action	28
2.2.1	<i>Co-Operation(s)</i>	30
2.2.2	<i>Accumulation</i>	31
2.2.3	<i>Substrates</i>	32
2.3	Varied Practices for Co-Operative Accumulation	33
2.3.1	<i>Symbolic Language Embedded within Indexical and Iconic Forms of Semiosis</i>	36
2.4	Summary	37
2.4.1	<i>Building Action Co-Operatively on Substrates That Accumulate Resources</i>	37
2.4.1.1	<i>Accumulation</i>	38
2.4.1.2	<i>Substrates</i>	38
2.5	The Combinatorial Organization of Language and Action as Visible Public Practice	40
2.6	The Dialogic Syntax of John Du Bois	42
2.7	The Extraordinarily Rich Language of Poor African-American Children	44
3	The Co-Operative Organization of Emerging Action	46
3.1	The Emergence of Objects within Lived Time	47
3.2	Multiparty Co-Operative Accumulation within Noun Phrases	48
3.3	Competing Tellings	53
3.4	Inhabiting a Different World	55
4	Chil and His Resources	59
4.1	Chil's Resources	60
4.1.1	<i>Chil's Life after His Stroke and How I Recorded His Interaction</i>	62
5	Building Complex Meaning and Action with a Three-Word Vocabulary: Inhabiting and Reshaping the Actions of Others through Accumulative Transformation	68
5.1	Incorporating Rich Language Structure Produced by Others	68
5.2	Incorporating Talk Produced by Others While Transforming It	71
5.2.1	<i>Indexical Incorporation</i>	73
5.2.2	<i>Symbols</i>	74
5.2.3	<i>Chains of Interpretants</i>	76
5.3	Two Practices for Reusing, with Transformation, Materials Created Earlier by Others	79

<i>Contents</i>	xi
6 The Distributed Speaker	80
6.1 The Distributed Organization of Both Speakers and Their Utterances	80
6.2 An Example of Cooperation	83
6.3 Symbols That Lack Necessary Indexical Grounding	84
6.4 Ideal, Self-Contained Fully Competent Actors, or Distributed Interactive Fields Encompassing Participants with Different Abilities?	88
Part II. Intertwined Semiosis	91
7 Intertwined Knowing	93
7.1 Differential Knowledge States as a Constitutive Feature of Human Action	94
7.1.1 <i>Actively Sustaining a Complementary Distribution of Knowledge</i>	96
7.2 Multiple Transformations within a Single Sentence	98
7.3 Conclusion	101
7.3.1 <i>The Ongoing Organization of Awareness That Others Have Knowledge That Differs from Our Own through Co-Operative Action</i>	101
7.3.2 <i>The Interpreting Self as Unfolding Co-Operative Practice</i>	103
7.3.3 <i>The Shaping of Utterances, Actions, and Sentences within Interaction</i>	103
7.3.4 <i>Simultaneous Co-Operative Action</i>	104
8 Building Action by Combining Different Kinds of Materials	105
8.1 Building Action by Joining Together Different Kinds of Resources	107
8.2 The Laminated Organization of Spoken Action	108
8.2.1 <i>Inflecting Stance</i>	110
8.3 Using Prosody to Build Varied Action with a Limited Lexicon	110
8.3.1 <i>Saying Something Different by Building a New Contextual Configuration</i>	115
8.4 Building Action through Use of Varied, Distributed Resources	117
8.5 Chil's Timing	118
8.5.1 <i>Exploiting Rhythm and Timing in American Football</i>	119
8.6 Conclusion	120

xii	<i>Contents</i>
9 Intertwined Actors	122
9.1 The Laminated Organization of Human Action	122
9.1.1 <i>Delaminating Talk and Action Provided by Others</i>	124
9.2 Laminated Co-Operative Action That Spans Centuries	129
9.3 Visible Co-Operations on Another's Emerging Talk	131
9.3.1 <i>A Silent, though Visible Principal Character</i>	131
9.3.2 <i>Building Action by Performing Structure Preserving Visible Transformations on a Public Substrate</i>	132
9.4 The Visible Cognitive Life of the Hearer	133
9.5 Temporally Unfolding Participation Central to the Organization of Human Action	135
9.6 Human Tools	136
9.7 The Combinatorial Organization of Human Tools as a Matrix for the Constitution of Human Social and Economic Organization	139
9.8 Conclusion	140
10 Projection and the Interactive Organization of Unfolding Experience	142
10.1 Assessments	143
10.1.1 <i>Embodied Responses by Recipients to Assessments</i>	143
10.2 Assessment Adjectives as Guides for Hearers	144
10.3 Monitoring the Experiential Displays of Others	147
10.3.1 <i>Bringing Assessment Activity to a Close</i>	149
10.4 Conclusion	149
11 Projecting Upcoming Events to Accomplish Co-Operative Action	151
11.1 Movement to a Different Kind of Activity	153
11.2 Projecting the Loci for Collaborative Activity in Talk	153
11.2.1 <i>Extended Overlap</i>	155
11.2.2 <i>Differential Access as an Organizing Feature of Concurrent Assessments</i>	156
11.2.3 <i>Making Visible Congruent Understanding</i>	157
11.2.4 <i>Erroneous Projection</i>	158
11.2.5 <i>Simultaneous Vocal and Nonvocal Heightened Involvement</i>	160
11.2.6 <i>Exiting from the Collaborative Assessment</i>	161
11.2.7 <i>Laminating Inconsistent Displays to Create Delicate Withdrawals</i>	162

<i>Contents</i>	xiii
Part III. Embodied Interaction	167
12 Action and Co-Operative Embodiment in Girl's Hopscotch	169
12.1 Semiotic Structure in the Environment	171
12.2 Talk-in-Interaction	173
12.3 Changing Contextual Configurations	180
12.4 Conclusion	186
13 Practices of Color Classification	189
13.1 Mapping a Feature	190
13.2 Semiotic Structure in the Environment	190
13.3 The Munsell Chart as a Historically Shaped Field for the Production of Action	195
13.4 Heterotopias	198
13.5 Building Action within Talk-in-Interaction with the Munsell Chart	200
13.6 The Intersubjective Constitution of the Objects That Animate the Work of a Community	205
13.6.1 <i>The Intelligible Body: Embodied Stance and the Constitution of Action</i>	208
13.7 Using Graphic Fields to Build Action	210
14 Highlighting and Mapping the World as Co-Operative Practice	212
14.1 Highlighting	212
14.2 Graphic Representations as Embodied Practice	214
14.3 Co-Operative Action as a Framework for Making Public Another's Understanding	216
14.4 Calibrating Professional Vision through Embodied Co-Operative Action within a Relevant Environment	217
15 Environmentally Coupled Gestures	221
15.1 Juxtaposing Multiple Semiotic Fields to Accomplish Pointing	222
15.2 Gestures Tied to the Environment	227
15.3 The Communicative Status of Environmentally Coupled Gestures	232
15.3.1 <i>Embedding Gesture within Participation Frameworks</i>	234
15.3.2 <i>Multiple Forms of Embodied Semiosis Operate Simultaneously</i>	235
15.4 The Accumulative Power of the Laminated Structure of Human Action	236
15.5 Conclusion	240

Part IV. Co-Operative Action with Predecessors: Sedimented Landscapes for Knowledge and Action	243
16 Co-Operative Action with Predecessors	245
16.1 The Consequential Presence of Absent Predecessors within Local Face-to-Face Interaction	246
16.1.1 <i>The Special Character of Copresence</i>	248
16.2 My Use of the Term “Predecessor”	250
16.3 Co-Operative Action with Absent Predecessors	251
16.3.1 <i>Substrate Created Co-Operatively by Actors Distributed in Space and by Task</i>	251
16.3.2 <i>Transforming a Scene into Action-Relevant Objects</i>	252
16.4 Organizing the Work-Relevant Perception of the Environment	255
16.5 Co-Operative Accumulation Both with Those Who Are Present, and with the Materials Provided by Predecessors	257
16.6 The Schedule as a Cultural <i>Umwelt</i>	259
16.7 The Schedule Organizing Work-Relevant Perception within an <i>Umwelt</i>	261
17 The Accumulation of Diversity through Co-Operative Action	263
17.1 The Accumulative Power of Environmental Laminations as Components of Action	263
17.2 The Accumulation of Diversity	265
17.2.1 <i>The Co-Operative Organization of Interaction with Predecessors</i>	267
17.2.2 <i>The Prospective Organization of Action through Substrates</i>	268
17.3 Co-Operative Accumulation with Predecessors vs. Those Who Share Space and Time with Us in an Unfolding Present	269
17.3.1 <i>Accumulation Sustained through Co-Operative Action</i>	271
17.4 Conclusion	272
18 Seeing in Depth	275
18.1 The Sampling Grid	279
18.1.1 <i>Convergent Diversity</i>	284
18.2 Tools	286
18.2.1 <i>The CTD as a Tool for Perception</i>	288
18.2.2 <i>Multiple Perceptual Frameworks</i>	290
18.2.3 <i>Articulating the Document Surface</i>	295

<i>Contents</i>	xv
18.3 Seeing in Common	300
18.4 Hybrid Spaces: Space as Locally Organized, Historically Situated Practice	302
19 Co-Operative Action as the Source of, and Solution to, the Task Faced by Every Community of Creating New, Culturally Competent Members with Specific Forms of Knowledge and Skill	307
19.1 Pedagogy a Human Universal	307
19.2 Repairs and the Display of Language Structure	309
19.3 The Accumulative Diversity of Settings and Communities and the Construction of Skilled Inhabitants	312
19.4 Creating Skilled Actors through Co-Operative Action	314
19.4.1 <i>Seeing an Inappropriate Action and Intercepting It Before It Can Occur</i>	318
19.5 Co-Operatively Breaking an Egg	319
19.6 Summary	323
Part V. Professional Vision, Transforming Sensory Experience into Types, and the Creation of Competent Inhabitants	325
20 The Emergence of Conventionalized Signs within the Natural World	329
20.1 Symbols	330
20.1.1 <i>How Did Symbols Emerge in the Natural World?</i>	331
20.1.2 <i>Gesture as Precursor to Language?</i>	333
20.2 The Inherent Indeterminacy of Gesture	333
20.3 Gesture First Theories of Language Origins	335
20.4 The Transparency of Gesture?	337
20.5 Action Consequences of the Indeterminacy of Gesture	341
20.6 Co-Operative Action as an Environment Promoting the Evolution of Arbitrary Signs	342
20.6.1 <i>An Environment of Rich Relevant Resources</i>	343
20.7 Conclusion	346
21 Calibrating Experience and Knowledge by Touching the World Together	348
21.1 Calibrating Professional Vision	349
21.2 Transforming Embodied Experience into a Category	350

21.3	The Interplay between Objects of Experience and Abstract Types	356
21.3.1	<i>An Ethnomethodological Perspective</i>	358
21.3.2	<i>Conventionalized Signs as Active Co-Operative Work</i>	359
21.3.3	<i>Building a World of Public Shared Forms from the Co-Operative Organization of Experience</i>	361
22	The Blackness of Black: Color Categories as Situated Practice	363
22.1	Overview	363
22.2	Color Categories as Cognitive Universals: Divorcing Cognition from Practice	364
22.2.1	<i>Situated Activity Systems</i>	366
22.3	Scientific Description as Embodied, Situated Knowledge	369
22.4	Seeing <i>jet Black</i> as a Problematic, Situated Task	372
22.4.1	<i>Situated Activities as Frameworks for Motivation and Precision</i>	373
22.5	The Social Organization of Practice and Apprenticeship within Situated Processes of Human Interaction	374
22.5.1	<i>Inventing New Category Systems Tailored to the Local Setting</i>	376
22.6	Highlighting and Positioning for Perception	377
22.7	Seeing Activities	379
22.7.1	<i>Embodied Cognition</i>	379
22.7.2	<i>Using Diverse, Serendipitous Criteria to Constitute a Category</i>	381
22.8	The Social and Practical Constitution of Accountable Knowledge	383
22.9	Conclusion	384
22.9.1	<i>The Methodology of Berlin and Kay</i>	385
22.9.2	<i>Phenomena Made Available for Analysis by a Situated Activity System</i>	386
22.9.3	<i>Using General Structures to Build Locally Relevant, Situated Action</i>	388
23	Building Skilled, Knowing Actors and the Phenomenal Objects They Are Trusted to Know	391
23.1	Tracing and Inscribing	393
23.2	Progressive Reformulation through Changing Points to a Common Target	396
23.2.1	<i>Pointing as Action</i>	396
23.2.2	<i>Learning to See as a Professional through Pointing</i>	398
23.2.3	<i>Pointing as Demonstration</i>	400

<i>Contents</i>	xvii
23.3 Co-Operative Pointing	401
23.4 Conclusion	404
24 Professional Vision	407
24.1 Contested Vision	409
24.2 Coding Aggression as Professional Practice	411
24.3 Expert Testimony: An Ethnography of Seeing	414
24.4 Graphic Demonstrations and Material Artifacts: The Birth of Rodney King as a Visible Actor	419
24.5 The Power to Speak as a Professional	422
24.6 Conclusion	424
25 Conclusion	429
25.1 Co-Operative Action	430
25.2 Accumulation	431
25.3 Cooperation and Co-Operative Action	432
25.4 Language from the Perspective of Co-Operative Action	433
25.4.1 <i>A Diagrammatic Inflection</i>	436
25.4.2 <i>Indexical Incorporation</i>	437
25.4.3 <i>Combining Different Kinds of Materials</i>	438
25.4.4 <i>Distributed Actors and Utterances</i>	440
25.4.5 <i>Action Organized through and within a Dynamic Ecology of Meaning Making Practices</i>	441
25.4.6 <i>A Perspective on the Phenomenology of Language</i>	445
25.5 Co-Operative Action as an Environment That Would Promote and Then Sustain the Emergence of Peircian Symbols in the Natural World	447
25.5.1 <i>Language as Symbol Use Rooted in Public Practice?</i>	447
25.5.2 <i>The Emergence of Symbols within Co-Operative Action</i>	449
25.5.2.1 <i>Chil's Restriction to Indexical and Iconic Signs Systematically Delays Movement to a Next Action</i>	450
25.5.2.2 <i>Navigating Multiple Possibilities for Future Action</i>	451
25.5.2.3 <i>Symbols as a Solution to the Problem of Moving Action Forward within Co-Operative Action</i>	452
25.5.2.4 <i>Combining Symbols Once They Have Emerged</i>	453
25.5.3 <i>Symbols as Co-Operative Action within Communities</i>	454
25.6 Phenomena That Emerge from Co-Operative Action	455
25.6.1 <i>Accumulative Diversity</i>	455
25.6.2 <i>Creating Skilled, Competent Inhabitants</i>	456

25.6.3	<i>Constituting Symbols through Public Practice within a Community</i>	459
25.7	The Public Organization of Co-Operative Action	462
25.8	Time, Experience, and Language as Lived Practice	464
25.8.1	<i>The Intertwining of Knowledge and Experience with Alternative Semiotic Resources</i>	467
25.8.2	<i>Chronotopes</i>	469
25.8.3	<i>The Life Cycle</i>	472
25.9	Summary Overview	474
	<i>References Cited</i>	479
	<i>Index</i>	511

Figures

1.1	Building new action by decomposing and reusing materials created by earlier actors.	<i>page 3</i>
1.2	Building new action by performing accumulative transformations on materials created by earlier actors.	4
1.3	Transcription system for talk.	18
2.1	The collaborative construction of a sentence.	25
2.2	Reuse with transformation.	28
2.3	Building action through accumulative co-operations.	29
2.4	Reuse with transformation.	34
2.5	Interlocking phenomena that contribute to the organization of accumulative co-operative action.	38
3.1	Incorporating another's contribution into a mutable noun phrase.	51
3.2	Competing perspectives within a noun phrase.	54
3.3	Iwasaki (2011): The interactive constitution of units within Japanese.	56
3.4	Hayashi (1997): Using a particle to incorporate with transformation a noun from another's talk.	56
4.1	Chil's semiotic resources in which a limited lexicon is supplemented by gesture and rich prosody.	61
5.1	Incorporating with transformation language structure created by another.	69
5.2	Filling Chil's impoverished lexicon with Candy's rich language.	73
5.3	Combining different forms of semiosis to reuse materials created by another, while transforming them into something new.	75
5.4	Chains of accumulative transformations.	77
5.5	Pervasive reuse with transformation to build subsequent action.	78
6.1	The distributed organization of utterances and speakers.	82

6.2	Recognizing what a symbol signifies NOT adequate to establish relevant meaning or action.	85
6.3	Language and the speaker as a distributed interactive field.	89
7.1	Intertwined, differential knowing built into the formal organization of action.	95
7.2	Speaker modifies her displayed knowledge to sustain the appropriateness of her action for a knowing addressee.	96
7.3	Intertwined knowing as a public feature of the unfolding organization of accumulative, adaptive co-operative action.	99
8.1	Intertwining different kinds of semiosis to build a single action.	109
8.2	Building varied action by combining different kinds of meaning making materials.	112
8.3	Varied prosody over the same lexical items.	114
8.4	An overview of how Chil's actions are constructed through intertwined semiosis.	117
9.1	Chil builds an action by attaching his prosody to rich language structure created by someone else.	125
9.2	Action built through the intertwined semiosis of actors living four hundred years apart.	130
9.3	A single laugh constructed by two separate actors, each using different semiotic materials.	132
9.4	Projecting upcoming events so as to accomplish co-operative action.	134
9.5	Tools have combinatorial organization that leads to accumulation with transformation through co-operative action.	137
9.6	The combinatorial organization of co-operative action provides an armature for human social and economic organization.	140
10.1	Assessment examples.	143
10.2	Displaying congruent stance in the midst of an ongoing telling.	144
10.3	Change in alignment immediately after assessment adjective.	145
10.4	Different operations and stance on the same entity in the midst of an unfolding unit, and after the unit has reached completion.	146
10.5	Speaker monitoring and guiding addressee's stance.	148
11.1	Simultaneous co-operative assessments.	152
11.2	The organization of clauses used to construct postpositioned assessments.	153

<i>List of Figures</i>	xxi
11.3 Projection and differential positioning in the midst of simultaneous talk.	156
11.4 Embodied display of agreement.	158
11.5 Erroneous projection.	159
11.6 Vocal and embodied concurrent mutual involvement at the height of activity.	161
11.7 Modulated withdrawal.	162
11.8 Exiting while showing appreciation by laminating different displays.	163
11.9 Withdrawing by reusing with transformation embodied resources used to build prior action.	164
12.1 The hopscotch grid.	172
12.2 A dispute in hopscotch.	174
12.3 Parallelism in prosody.	175
12.4 Gesture and talk within an embodied participation framework.	177
12.5 Carla leans toward Diana.	178
12.6 Addressee dismantles facing formation by withdrawing gaze.	181
12.7 Deictic stomp.	182
13.1 Mapping a feature.	191
13.2 Building action by attending to a special semiotic field inherited from predecessors.	192
13.3 Classifying color as professional practice.	195
13.4 Architectures for perception within chains of accumulative action.	196
13.5 Diverse sign systems for the classification of the same color.	197
13.6 Co-operative action with predecessors: interpreting the environment through an inherited environmental lamination.	199
13.7 Co-operative calibration of perception with those who are present while incorporating materials provided by predecessors.	200
13.8 Action and perception built through the sequential intertwining of talk, tools, and bodies.	201
13.9 Intertwining actors, objects inherited from predecessors, and the embodied practices required to know something competently.	203
13.10 Compromise touched off by materials being intently scrutinized.	210

14.1	Outlining a feature.	214
14.2	Measurement, talk, and entering coordinates within co-operative mapmaking.	215
14.3	Seeing that a request has not been properly carried out.	216
14.4	Talk and gesture mutually elaborate each other.	218
15.1	Multiple targets.	223
15.2	Talk alone.	228
15.3	Gesture alone.	228
15.4	Object incorporated into gesture.	229
15.5	Categorization linked to what is being categorized through gesture.	230
15.6	Multimodal organization of action.	231
15.7	Utterances presuppose gesture.	232
15.8	Addressee gaze toward gesture.	234
15.9	Participation framework creates frame for other sign exchange processes.	236
15.10	The laminated structure of human action.	237
16.1	Co-operative action constituted through intersecting consciousnesses moving through time, while working with resources provided by absent predecessors.	247
16.2	The schedule as a substrate for accumulative operations and for the organization of work-relevant perception.	253
16.3	Organizing action-relevant perception of the current environment through co-operative, accumulative transformations on resources inherited from others.	256
16.4	Use of co-operative accumulation to build action with both those who are present and resources inherited from predecessors.	258
16.5	Accumulative co-operative action creates a multitude of diverse cultural <i>umwelts</i> for human beings.	261
18.1	Seeing the same world through different inscriptions.	278
18.2	The sampling grid.	280
18.3	Convergent diversity.	285
18.4	The CTD: tools from different disciplines converging on the same platform.	287
18.5	Different kinds of water in the water column.	288
18.6	Physical oceanographer's instruments provide a picture of the water column that can be used by the geochemist.	290
18.7	Multiple perceptual frameworks.	290

<i>List of Figures</i>	xxiii
18.8 A measurement of depth that juxtaposes the CTD to the bottom.	292
18.9 Intersecting <i>Umwelts</i> .	294
18.10 Distances on the border of the screen are spatially far from the features visible in the graph.	295
18.11 Working to render phenomena visible on a document surface.	296
18.12 The intertwining of interactive and graphic spaces.	301
18.13 Recognizing what another is seeing.	301
18.14 Seeing the action suggested by an approximate number.	301
18.15 A family of accumulative hybrid spaces.	304
19.1 Displaying slots and alternatives.	310
19.2 Combinatorial and grammatical possibilities of a noun phrase.	311
19.3 Accumulative co-operative action creates an unfolding diversity of settings, each populated by highly distinctive phenomena and objects (A: kitchen in America; B: kitchen in Mayan Mexico; C: chemistry lab; D: Munsell chart; E: hopscotch grid).	313
19.4 Accumulative co-operative action creates an unfolding diversity of settings, each populated by highly distinctive phenomena and objects (F: oceanographic ship; G: airport; H: surgical operating theater; I: geology field school; J: archaeological excavation).	314
19.5 Opaque tools in a dense, opaque environment.	315
19.6 Building knowing, competent, skilled actors by co-operatively constructing the same action.	316
19.7 Building action co-operatively provides a framework for monitoring and correcting the actions of a newcomer before they are actually performed.	318
19.8 Mother co-operatively organizes environment for daughter's action.	320
19.9 Acquiring skill through co-operative action.	321
20.1 Combining symbolic with iconic and indexical signs.	330
20.2 Addressee cannot recover either referent or action being done with linked pointing gestures.	338
20.3 Co-operative action as an environment for the emergence of symbols.	344
21.1 Transforming experience of an object in the world into an action-relevant category through co-operative action.	350
21.2 Endogenously creating the sensorium of a geologist through accumulative, co-operative action.	352

21.3	Building, through the public regimentation of embodied experience in a consequential environment, both skilled, knowing bodies and the distinctive discursive objects that are the focus of their work.	358
22.1	Berlin and Kay's universal sequence of color terms.	365
22.2	Work in a geochemistry lab.	371
22.3	Not even close.	375
22.4	Fibers in a vat of chemicals.	378
22.5	Positioning fibers to judge their color.	378
22.6	Synesthesia – texture tied to color.	380
22.7	The emergence of serendipitous criteria.	382
22.8	Mastering the embodied skill required for a competent judgment.	384
23.1	Mapping a feature.	392
23.2	From gesture to durable marks in the environment.	393
23.3	Calibrating professional vision through a dialogue of co-operative environmentally coupled gestures.	395
23.4	Guided seeing through incremental reformulation.	397
23.5	Incremental shaping of an object to be recognized through categorization and gesture.	399
23.6	Using gesture to show past motion demonstrated through color patterning in dirt.	400
23.7	Demonstrating embodied understanding through co-operative pointing.	402
23.8	Demonstrating professional vision and embodied understanding through co-operative pointing.	403
23.9	The mutual constitution of skilled, knowing actors and the phenomena they know.	405
23.10	Co-operative regimentation of experience to create a community's professional vision and the skilled sensorium that makes possible the work of its members.	406
24.1	Coding scheme transforms events.	412
24.2	Violence described through neutral language drawn from the social sciences.	412
24.3	Kicks as tools.	413
24.4	See blows as reasonable by adding expert's perceptions.	414
24.5	Rodney King in control of situation.	414
24.6	Sergeant Duke analyzes the Rodney King videotape.	415
24.7	Using a coding scheme to transform minute body movement by Rodney King into a display of aggression.	415

<i>List of Figures</i>	xxv
24.8 Sergeant Duke shows display of aggression by Rodney King.	416
24.9 Use of white lines to highlight King's body.	421
24.10 Concern from a situated perspective.	422
24.11 Situated perception and asymmetrical rights to be heard.	423
24.12 Instruction by experts: Sergeant Duke showing police officer's perspective; archaeologist showing measurement technique.	427
25.1 Building new action by performing accumulative transformations on materials created by earlier actors.	431

Acknowledgments

I am lucky to be indebted to so many people who have guided me from the time I began to work with Gail Jefferson through my current colleagues and students, many of whom have also made most insightful comments on earlier versions of the analysis presented here. More crucially, throughout my career, I have been able to learn and grow through wonderful discussions and seminars with an extraordinary range of colleagues and students. I feel privileged to have spent my academic career in such company.

I am very deeply indebted to Peter Auer, Asta Cekaite, Eton Churchill, Betty Couper-Kuhlen, David DeLiema, Arnulf Deppermann, Sandro Duranti, Cre Engelke, Yrjö Engeström, Don Everhart, Don Favareau, Candy Goodwin, Anthony Graesch, Christian Heath, Edwin Hutchins, Darrell Henry, Shimako Iwasaki, Gail Jefferson, Niels Nørkjaer Johannsen, Chris Johnson, Timo Kaukoma, Leelo Keevallik, Jeremy Kelly, Adam Kendon, Tim Koschman, Lourdes de León Pasquel, Oskar Lindwall, Per Linell, Helen Joe Manson, Numa Markee, Melandar, Brandon Mells, Dave Mogk, Lorenza Mondada, Billy Moore, Keith Murphy, Elinor Ochs, Susan Perry, Johanne Sege Philapsen, Federica Raia, Harvey Sacks, Fritjof Sahlström, Emanuel Schegloff, John Schumann, Margaret Selting, Mick Smith, Monica Smith, Jürgen Streeck, Danjie Su, Lucy Suchman, Akira Takada, Angela Tan, Daniela Veronesi, Johannes Wagner, and Ray Wilkinson for most insightful and helpful comments on an earlier version of this analysis. I owe a great debt to Gail Wagner, the students at her archaeological field school, Chil and his family, the children recorded by Candy Goodwin as they played on the street in Philadelphia, the families who participated in the UCLA Sloan Center on the Everyday Lives of Families organized by Elinor Ochs, professors and students in the geological field schools organized by Dave Mogk and Darrell Henry and Willard Moore, and the participants on the oceanographic

research vessel, for allowing actual events in their lives to be recorded. Gail Wagner, Dave Mogk, Darrell Henry, and Willard Moore, and Kim Kastens opened up new intellectually rich worlds for me through most enlightening discussions about their work.

I am especially indebted to the participants in my Co-Operative Action Lab, especially Johanne Stege Philipsen, Michael Smith, Federica Raia, Brandon Mells, David DeLiema, Don Everhart, Virginia Flood, and Sara Merlino.

My thinking has been immensely stimulated by discussions about the work presented here during long bike rides with Sandro Duranti.

My debt to all those who have taken the time to make such insightful comments is deep and genuine. It is not just that I am responsible for the problems that remain, but rather that within the limits of this book I cannot adequately explore the richness of what they have given me.

Candy Goodwin has been my greatest intellectual companion and partner throughout my career. I am so lucky to have shared all of my intellectual journeys with her, and to have been so stimulated by her own. We have lived an extraordinary forty-eight years together as partners both in life, and in the exploration of the rich world of human interaction.

Earlier Versions of Some of the Analysis

Within a new theoretical framework and frequently with important revisions, this volume includes work done at different points throughout my career (it was originally solicited as a collection of papers about my research in scientific and technical environments), as well as new analysis. I happily thank the original publishers for permission to reuse it here.

An earlier version of the analysis of language repair in the beginning of Chapter 19 was originally published in “Human Sociality as Mutual Orientation in a Rich Interactive Environment: Multimodal Utterances and Pointing in Aphasia” in *Roots of Human Sociality* edited by Nick Enfield and Stephen C. Levinson, 2006, Berg Publishers, used by permission of Bloomsbury, Publishing Plc.

An earlier version of Chapter 2 appeared as a section of “Children’s Arguing” by Marjorie Harness Goodwin and Charles Goodwin in *Language, Gender and Sex in Comparative Perspective*, edited by Susan Steele and Christine Tanz (1997 Cambridge University Press). It is used here in substantially modified form with the permission of Cambridge University Press. Parts of Chapters 13 and 23 were earlier published in “Things and Their Embodied Environments” in *The Cognitive Life of Things: Recasting the*

Acknowledgments

xxix

Boundaries of the Mind, edited by Lambros Malafouris and Colin Renfrew, 2010, McDonald Institute Monographs, Cambridge University Press. They are used here with modification with the permission of Cambridge University Press. Parts of Chapters 2, 8, and 12 appeared in “Contextures of Action” in *Embodied Interaction: Language and the Body in the Material World*, edited by Jürgen Streeck, Charles Goodwin, and Curtis D. LeBaron (2011 Cambridge University Press). They are used here in modified form with permission of Cambridge University Press.

Chapters 21 and 24 were published as “Professional Vision” in the *American Anthropologist* 96(3), 1994. The copyright for the images from the Rodney King videotape is owned by George Holliday. They are used here with his permission.

Chapter 20 was earlier published, in very slightly different form, as “The Intelligibility of Gesture within a Framework of Co-Operative Action” in *From Gesture in Conversation to Visible Action in Utterance* edited by Mandana Seyfeddinipur, and Marriane Gullberg (2014 John Benjamins). Central components of the analysis in Chapter 8 appeared in “Constructing Meaning through Prosody in Aphasia” in *Prosody in Interaction* edited by Dagmar Barth-Weingarten, Elisabeth Reber, and Margaret Selting (2010 John Benjamins). An earlier version of the analysis in Chapter 15 appeared in “Environmentally Coupled Gestures” in *Gesture and the Dynamic Dimension of Language* edited by Susan Duncan, Justine Cassell, and Elena Levy John Benjamins. An earlier version of Chapters 10 and 11 appeared as “Concurrent Operations on Talk: Notes on the Interactive Organization of Assessments” by Charles Goodwin and Marjorie Harness Goodwin in *IPrA Papers in Pragmatics* 1(1) 1987. All of these are used here, frequently with modifications, with the permission of John Benjamins.

Chapters 12 and 13 were published as “Action and Embodiment within Situated Human Interaction” in the *Journal of Pragmatics* 32, 2000. Parts of Chapters 1, 8, 9, 15 and 23, as well as an earlier version of my analysis of co-operative action, appeared in “The Co-Operative, Transformative Organization of Human Action and Knowledge” in the *Journal of Pragmatics* 46(1), 2012. They are used here with permission of the *Journal of Pragmatics*.

Chapter 18 was originally published as “Seeing in Depth” in *Social Studies of Science* 25, 1995. It is republished here with the permission of Sage Publications.

Chapter 22 was earlier published as “The Blackness of Black: Color Categories as Situated Practice” in *Discourse, Tools and Reasoning: Essays on Situated Cognition* edited by Lauren B. Resnick, Roger Säljö, Clotilde

Pontecorvo, and Barbara Burge (1997 Springer). It is published here with the permission of Springer.

Earlier version of parts of Chapters 15 and 23 appeared in “Pointing as Situated Practice” In *Pointing: Where Language, Culture, and Cognition Meet* edited by Sotaro Kita (2003 Lawrence Erlbaum Associates). Reproduced by permission of Taylor and Francis Group, LLC, a division of Informa plc.