Ethics and Criminal Justice

This book examines the main ethical questions that confront the criminal justice system – legislature, law enforcement, courts, and corrections – and those who work within that system, especially police officers, prosecutors, defense lawyers, judges, juries, and prison officers. John Kleinig sets the issues in the context of a liberal democratic society and its ethical and legislative underpinnings, and illustrates them with a wide and international range of real-life case studies. Topics covered include discretion, capital punishment, terrorism, restorative justice, and reentry. Kleinig’s discussion is both philosophically acute and grounded in institutional realities, and will enable students to engage productively with the ethical questions which they encounter both now and in the future – whether as criminal justice professionals or as reflective citizens.

John Kleinig is Director of the Institute for Criminal Justice Ethics and Professor of Philosophy in the Department of Law and Police Science, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, and in the PhD Programs in Philosophy and Criminal Justice, City University of New York. He also holds the Charles Sturt University Chair of Policing Ethics in the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics, Canberra.
For Tziporah
Contents

Acknowledgments                                                               page ix

Introduction                                                               1

Part I  Criminalization                                                      5
  1  Civil society: its institutions and major players                       7
  2  Crime and the limits of criminalization                                 20
  3  Constraints on governmental agents                                    36

Part II  Policing                                                           49
  4  Tensions within the police role                                        51
  5  The burdens of discretion                                              71
  6  Coercion and deception                                                 89

Part III  Courts                                                           111
  7  Prosecutors: seeking justice through truth?                            113
  8  Defense lawyers: zealous advocacy?                                     136
  9  The impartial judge?                                                   155
  10  Juries: the lamp of liberty?                                          175
Contents

Part IV Corrections

11 Punishment and its alternatives 195
12 Imprisonment and its alternatives 212
13 The role of correctional officers 233
14 Reentry and collateral consequences 252

Selected further reading 268
Index 275
Acknowledgments

When Hilary Gaskin of Cambridge University Press approached me to write this volume she encountered several years of resistance to such a project, and suffered a few more. I appreciate her persistence and willingness to listen to my hesitations and expectations. I am also appreciative of the comments of those whom Cambridge approached to review the proposal – constructive, sometimes divergent, but always valuable. Their authors can take some credit for the form of the final version, even though my obduracy prevailed on a number of issues.

Teaching responsibilities help to adjust one’s ear to student needs and to the development of class materials. And so I am grateful for the opportunities that John Jay College of Criminal Justice has provided over the years that I have been working in this area. It has enviable resources and through the Institute for Criminal Justice Ethics I have been able to organize conferences on a number of the topics covered here. But teaching and administrative responsibilities do not provide the extended time one needs to author a book. And so I am particularly appreciative of an arrangement between John Jay College and Charles Sturt University in Australia that has recently enabled my assignment for six months of the year to the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (an Australian Research Council funded Special Research Centre) at Charles Sturt University in Canberra. A genuine sine qua non, but not sufficient. Beyond the institutional provision, Margaret Leland Smith has, by assuming my administrative responsibilities in New York, enabled me to translate the possibility into reality.

Several people have looked over drafts or parts thereof: Andrew Alexandra, Simon Bronitt, Brandon del Pozo, Hilary Gaskin, William Heffernan, Tziporah Kasachkoff, Jess Maghan, Evan Mandery, Haim Marantz, Kevin McCarthy, Candace McCoy, and Adina Schwartz. In addition, students in a Fall 2006 class at John Jay College alerted me to a number of unclarities.
Acknowledgments

and missteps. I have, however, retained and no doubt exercised the right to make my own mistakes.

My greatest thanks go to Tziporah Kasachkoff, to whom I dedicate this volume. Apart from her loving support, she became my Harriet Taylor, clarifying my thoughts, questioning my arguments, and transforming my sparse prose into palatable English.