Legal Ethics and Human Dignity

David Luban is one of the world’s leading scholars of legal ethics. In this collection of his most significant papers from the past twenty-five years, he ranges over such topics as the moral psychology of organizational evil, the strengths and weaknesses of the adversary system, and jurisprudence from the lawyer’s point of view. His discussion combines philosophical argument, legal analysis, and many cases drawn from actual law practice, and he defends a theory of legal ethics that focuses on the lawyer’s role in enhancing human dignity and human rights. In addition to an analytical introduction, the volume includes two major previously unpublished papers, including a detailed critique of the US government lawyers who produced the notorious “torture memos.” It will be of interest to a wide range of readers in both philosophy and law.

David Luban is University Professor and Professor of Law and Philosophy at Georgetown University.
Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Law

GENERAL EDITOR
Gerald Postema
(University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill)

ADVISORY BOARD
Jules Coleman (Yale Law School)
Antony Duff (University of Stirling)
David Lyons (Boston University)
Neil MacCormick (University of Edinburgh)
Stephen Munzer (U.C.L.A. Law School)
Philip Pettit (Princeton University)
Joseph Raz (University of Oxford)
Jeremy Waldron (Columbia Law School)

Other books in the series:
Jeffrie G. Murphy and Jean Hampton: Forgiveness and Mercy
Stephen R. Munzer: A Theory of Property
R. G. Frey and Christopher W. Morris (eds.): Liability and Responsibility: Essays in Law and Morals
Robert F. Schopp: Automatism, Insanity, and the Psychology of Criminal Responsibility
Steven J. Burton: Judging in Good Faith
Jules Coleman: Risks and Wrongs
Suzanne Uniacke: Permissible Killing: The Self-Defense Justification of Homicide
Jules Coleman and Allen Buchanan (eds.): In Harm’s Way: Essays in Honor of Joel Feinberg
Warren F. Schwartz (ed.): Justice in Immigration
John Fischer and Mark Ravizza: Responsibility and Control
R. A. Duff (ed.): Philosophy and the Criminal Law
Larry Alexander (ed.): Constitutionalism
R. Schopp: Justification Defenses and Just Convictions
Anthony Sebok: Legal Positivism in American Jurisprudence
Arthur Ripstein: Equality, Responsibility and the Law
Steven J. Burton: The Path of the Law and its Influence
Jody S. Kraus and Steven D. Walt: The Jurisprudential Foundations of Corporate and Commercial Law
Brian Leiter: Objectivity in Law and Morals
Christopher Kutz: Complicity
Peter Benson (ed.): The Theory of Contract Law
Walter J. Schultz: *The Moral Conditions of Economic Efficiency*
Stephen R. Munzer: *New Essays in the Legal and Political Theory of Property*
Mark C. Murphy: *Natural Law and Practical Rationality*
Philip Soper: *The Ethics of Deference*
Gerald J. Postema: *Philosophy of the Law of Torts*
Alan Wertheimer: *Consent to Sexual Relations*
Timothy MacKlein: *Beyond Comparison*
Steven A. Ketcher: *Norms in a Wired World*
Mark R. Reiff: *Punishment, Compensation, and Law*
Larry Alexander: *Is There a Right of Freedom of Expression?*
Larry May: *Crimes Against Humanity*
Larry Laudan: *Truth, Error, and Criminal Law*
Mark C. Murphy: *Natural Law in Jurisprudence and Politics*
Douglas E. Edlin: *Common Law Theory*
W. J. Waluchow: *A Common Law Theory of Judicial Review*
Legal Ethics and Human Dignity

David Luban

Georgetown University
for
Deborah Rhode
Contents

Acknowledgments

Introduction

I The ethics in legal ethics

1 The adversary system excuse 19
2 Lawyers as upholders of human dignity (when they aren’t busy assaulting it) 65

II The jurisprudence of legal ethics

3 Natural law as professional ethics: a reading of Fuller 99
4 A different nightmare and a different dream 131
5 The torture lawyers of Washington 162

III Moral complications and moral psychology

6 Contrived ignorance 209
7 The ethics of wrongful obedience 237
8 Integrity: its causes and cures 267

IV Moral messiness in professional life

9 A midrash on Rabbi Shaffer and Rabbi Trollope 301

Index 332
Acknowledgments

The essays in this book were written over many years, and I have presented them to a great many audiences. To acknowledge all the people whose comments, criticisms, and questions improved these papers is impossible. Even those whose names I know would number in the dozens.

Several debts, though, run deeper than help on individual papers. David Wasserman had the biggest philosophical influence on these papers, talking me through many of the arguments and a great deal of the social psychology that figures in the later chapters. Patrick Byrne has doubled as my relentless sparring partner and enthusiastic booster for more than twenty years. Julie O’Sullivan has changed the way I teach and think about law. Robin West has, over many years, become something akin to my alter ego. And Deborah Rhode, to whom this book is dedicated, has been both a great friend and an ideal co-author. Laboring with me through the four editions of our textbook, she has taught me most of the legal ethics I know.

Since I arrived at Georgetown, Carrie Menkel-Meadow and Mike Seidman have been steady sources of ideas and moral support. I’ve also gotten a great deal of help from my other Georgetown legal ethics colleagues Jeff Bauman, Heidi Feldman, Mike Frisch, Mitt Regan, Phil Schrag, and Abbe Smith — and, like all of them, I have drawn inspiration from the late Father Robert Drinan. Among legal ethics scholars elsewhere, Robert Gordon, Michael Kelly, Thomas Shaffer, and William Simon have had particular impact on the ideas in this book, through disagreement as well as agreement.

Equally important have been my clinical colleagues. Mike Millemann, one of the finest and most dynamic lawyers I’ve ever known, first fired my enthusiasm for clinical ethics teaching; at the University of Maryland, I also cut my teeth partnering in clinical ethics classes with Barbara Bezdek and Homer LaRue. At Georgetown, I have done half-a-dozen tours of duty in the Center for Applied Legal Studies (CALS), working side by side with student-lawyers and their advisors on political asylum cases. I owe a great deal to my CALS teammates Karen Bouton, Mary Brittingham, Anna Gallagher, Andrea
Acknowledgments

Goodman, David Koplow, Michele Pistone, Jaya Ramji-Nogales, Phil Schrag, Rebecca Storey, Virgil Wiebe, and Diane Uchimiya, as well as to our amazing students. None of them will take it amiss, I think, if I add that the greatest debt is to CALS’s clients. All of them are human rights refugees, whose dignity, courage, and resourcefulness have opened my eyes to a great deal about my own country, about the wider world, and about what is best and worst in the rule of law. Above all, they have opened my eyes to the resilience of the human spirit.

Several chapters of the book originated during my year as a Fellow of the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars, an ideally collegial host. I wrote chapters 4 and 5 – the two new chapters of the book – during my visiting year at Stanford Law School, where Barbara Fried and Mark Kelman gave me especially helpful comments. Chapter 5 benefited greatly from an ongoing dialogue with Marty Lederman. I also wish to thank Colonel Bill Mayall and Captain John Yeager, who invited me on half-a-dozen occasions to present material from this book to multinational classes of military officers at the Industrial College of the Armed Forces in the National Defense University. The acute comments of the officers worked their way into the final versions of several chapters.

I would also like to thank Judy Areen and Alex Aleinikoff, my deans at Georgetown, for the tremendous support they’ve given me, both institutional and intellectual; Kathleen Sullivan and Larry Kramer for making possible the visit at Stanford Law School during which I finished this book; Gerald Postema, editor of Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Law, who advised me on the early stages of the project; Hilary Gaskin, Cambridge University Press’s philosophy editor, for moving the project along; and two anonymous readers for the Press whose comments helped in the final revisions. Tselane Holloway and Mary Ann Rundell turned the papers into a revisable manuscript.

I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to my students, who have always been my main source of inspiration. Among the Georgetown students, special thanks goes to Brian Shaughnessy, my friend and workout partner.

Above all, I must thank my family – my children, Daniel and Rachel, now old enough to spot the flaws in my arguments, and my wife Judy Lichtenberg, who has tolerated my endless kvetching about writing deadlines with nearly superhuman love and patience. As a philosopher in her own right, Judy read and commented on nearly every chapter in this book, and shared ideas on a daily basis for enough years that I barely know whose are whose. Their love makes everything else possible.

Several of the papers collected here were given as named lectures, and I wish to thank the host institutions and sponsors. I will also give information and acknowledgments for the initial publication of these chapters.

Chapter 1, “The Adversary System Excuse,” was the Catriona Gibbs Memorial Lecture at Queen’s University Law School in Kingston, Ontario.
xii

Acknowledgments


Chapters 4 and 5 were written for this volume, but include brief excerpts from “Liberalism, Torture, and the Ticking Bomb,” in Karen Greenberg, ed., *The Torture Debate in America* (Cambridge University Press, 2005).

Chapter 6, “Contrived Ignorance,” was my inaugural lecture as Frederick J. Haas Professor of Law and Philosophy at Georgetown University Law Center. I also delivered it as the Blankenbaker Lecture at the University of Montana School of Law. It appeared in the Georgetown Law Journal, vol. 87, no. 4, pp. 957–80 (1999).

Chapter 7, “The Ethics of Wrongful Obedience,” originated as the Keck Foundation Award Lecture to the Fellows of the American Bar Foundation; it was also delivered as the Condon-Faulkner Lecture at the University of Washington School of Law and in the Kennedy School lecture series at Harvard University. It appeared in Deborah L. Rhode, ed., *Ethics in Practice* (Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 94–120.
