# Statistical Principles for the Design of Experiments

This book is about the statistical principles behind the design of effective experiments and focuses on the practical needs of applied statisticians and experimenters engaged in design, implementation and analysis. Emphasising the logical principles of statistical design, rather than mathematical calculation, the authors demonstrate how all available information can be used to extract the clearest answers to many questions. The principles are illustrated with a wide range of examples drawn from real experiments in medicine, industry, agriculture and many experimental disciplines. Numerous exercises are given to help the reader practise techniques and to appreciate the difference that good design can make to an experimental research project.

Based on Roger Mead's excellent *Design of Experiments*, this new edition is thoroughly revised and updated to include modern methods relevant to applications in industry, engineering and modern biology. It also contains seven new chapters on contemporary topics, including restricted randomisation and fractional replication.

R. MEAD is Emeritus Professor of Applied Statistics at the University of Reading.

S. G. GILMOUR is Professor of Statistics in the Southampton Statistical Sciences Research Institute at the University of Southampton.

A. MEAD is Senior Teaching Fellow in the School of Life Sciences at the University of Warwick.

#### CAMBRIDGE SERIES IN STATISTICAL AND PROBABILISTIC MATHEMATICS

Editorial Board Z. Ghahramani (Department of Engineering, University of Cambridge) R. Gill (Mathematical Insitute, Leiden University) F. P. Kelly (Department of Pure Mathematics and Mathematical Statistics, University of Cambridge) B. D. Ripley (Department of Statistics, University of Oxford) S. Ross (Department of Industrial and Systems Engineering, University of Southern California) M. Stein (Department of Statistics, University of Chicago)

This series of high-quality upper-division textbooks and expository monographs covers all aspects of stochastic applicable mathematics. The topics range from pure and applied statistics to probability theory, operations research, optimisation and mathematical programming. The books contain clear presentations of new developments in the field and also of the state of the art in classical methods. While emphasising rigorous treatment of theoretical methods, the books also contain applications and discussions of new techniques made possible by advances in computational practice.

A complete list of books in the series can be found at www.cambridge.org/statistics. Recent titles include the following:

- 10. Data Analysis and Graphics Using R, by John Maindonald and John Braun
- 11. Statistical Models, by A. C. Davison
- 12. Semiparametric Regression, by David Ruppert, M. P. Wand and R. J. Carroll
- 13. Exercises in Probability, by Loïc Chaumont and Marc Yor
- 14. Statistical Analysis of Stochastic Processes in Time, by J. K. Lindsey
- 15. Measure Theory and Filtering, by Lakhdar Aggoun and Robert Elliott
- 16. Essentials of Statistical Inference, by G. A. Young and R. L. Smith
- 17. Elements of Distribution Theory, by Thomas A. Severini
- 18. Statistical Mechanics of Disordered Systems, by Anton Bovier
- 19. The Coordinate-Free Approach to Linear Models, by Michael J. Wichura
- 20. Random Graph Dynamics, by Rick Durrett
- 21. Networks, by Peter Whittle
- 22. Saddlepoint Approximations with Applications, by Ronald W. Butler
- 23. Applied Asymptotics, by A. R. Brazzale, A. C. Davison and N. Reid
- 24. *Random Networks for Communication*, by Massimo Franceschetti and Ronald Meester
- 25. Design of Comparative Experiments, by R. A. Bailey
- 26. Symmetry Studies, by Marlos A. G. Viana
- 27. Model Selection and Model Averaging, by Gerda Claeskens and Nils Lid Hjort
- 28. Bayesian Nonparametrics, edited by Nils Lid Hjort et al.
- 29. From Finite Sample to Asymptotic Methods in Statistics, by Pranab K. Sen, Julio M. Singer and Antonio C. Pedrosa de Lima
- 30. *Brownian Motion*, by Peter Mörters and Yuval Peres
- 31. Probability, by Rick Durrett
- 32. Analysis of Multivariate and High-Dimensional Data, by Inge Koch
- 33. Stochastic Processes, by Richard F. Bass
- 34. Structured Regression for Categorical Data, by Gerhard Tutz
- 35. Exercises in Probability (Second Edition), by Loïc Chaumont and Marc Yor

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86214-1 - Statistical Principles for the Design of Experiments R. Mead, S. G. Gilmour and A. Mead Frontmatter More information

# Statistical Principles for the Design of Experiments

# R. Mead University of Reading

S. G. Gilmour University of Southampton

A. Mead University of Warwick



Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86214-1 - Statistical Principles for the Design of Experiments R. Mead, S. G. Gilmour and A. Mead Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521862141

© R. Mead, S. G. Gilmour and A. Mead 2012

Based on *The Design of Experiments* by R. Mead. © Cambridge University Press 1988

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Mead, R. (Roger) Statistical principles for the design of experiments : applications to real experiments / R. Mead, University of Reading, S.G. Gilmour, University of Southampton, A. Mead, University of Warwick. pages cm. – (Cambridge series in statistical and probabilistic mathematics) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-86214-1 (hardback) 1. Experimental design. I. Gilmour, S. G. II. Mead, A. (Andrew) III. Title. QA279.M38825 2012 001.4'34 – dc23 2012023181

#### ISBN 978-0-521-86214-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

# Contents

## Preface

# *page* xi

Part	I	Overture

1	Introduction	3
1.1	Why a statistical theory of design?	3
1.2	History, computers and mathematics	4
1.3	The influence of analysis on design	5
1.4	Separate consideration of units and treatments	6
1.5	The resource equation	7
2	Elementary ideas of blocking: the randomised complete	
	block design	9
2.1	Controlling variation between experimental units	9
2.2	The analysis of variance identity	12
2.3	Estimation of variance and the comparison of treatment means	18
2.4	Residuals and the meaning of error	22
2.5	The random allocation of treatments to units	24
2.6	Practical choices of blocking patterns	26
3	Elementary ideas of treatment structure	29
3.1	Choice of treatments	29
3.2	Factorial structure	20
		29
3.3	Models for main effects and interactions	29 30
3.3 3.4	Models for main effects and interactions The analysis of variance identity	
		30
3.4	The analysis of variance identity	30 33
3.4 3.5	The analysis of variance identity Interpretation of main effects and interactions	30 33 36
3.4 3.5 3.6	The analysis of variance identity Interpretation of main effects and interactions Advantages of factorial structure	30 33 36 38
3.4 3.5 3.6 3.7	The analysis of variance identity Interpretation of main effects and interactions Advantages of factorial structure Treatment effects and treatment models	30 33 36 38
3.4 3.5 3.6 3.7	The analysis of variance identity Interpretation of main effects and interactions Advantages of factorial structure Treatment effects and treatment models <b>General principles of linear models for the analysis of</b>	30 33 36 38 40
3.4 3.5 3.6 3.7 <b>4</b>	The analysis of variance identity Interpretation of main effects and interactions Advantages of factorial structure Treatment effects and treatment models General principles of linear models for the analysis of experimental data	30 33 36 38 40 42

vi

## Contents

Overparameterisation, constraints and practical solution of least	
squares equations	49
Subdividing the parameters; extra SS	55
Distributional assumptions and inferences	60
Contrasts, treatment comparisons and component SS	62
Covariance – extension of linear design models	66
Computers for analysing experimental data	79
Appendix to Chapter 4	87
Least squares estimators for linear models	87
Properties of least squares estimators	88
Overparameterisation and constraints	90
Partitioning the parameter vector and the extra SS principle	94
Distributional assumptions and inferences	96
Treatment comparisons and component SS	100
The general theory of covariance analysis	102
	Subdividing the parameters; extra SS Distributional assumptions and inferences Contrasts, treatment comparisons and component SS Covariance – extension of linear design models Computers for analysing experimental data Appendix to Chapter 4 Least squares estimators for linear models Properties of least squares estimators Overparameterisation and constraints Partitioning the parameter vector and the extra SS principle Distributional assumptions and inferences Treatment comparisons and component SS

# Part II First subject

5	Experimental units	107
5.0	Preliminary examples	107
5.1	Different forms of basic experimental units	109
5.2	Experimental units as collections	113
5.3	A part as the unit and sequences of treatments	115
5.4	Multiple levels of experimental units	118
5.5	Time as a factor and repeated measurements	120
5.6	Protection of units, randomisation restrictions	121
6	Replication	124
6.0	Preliminary example	124
6.1	The need for replication	124
6.2	The completely randomised design	125
6.3	Different levels of variation	128
6.4	Identifying and allowing for different levels of variation	132
6.5	How much replication?	136
7	Blocking and control	142
7.0	Preliminary examples	142
7.1	Design and analysis for very simple blocked experiments	143
7.2	Design principles in blocked experiments	146
7.3	The analysis of block-treatment designs	153
7.4	BIB designs and classes of less balanced designs	159
7.5	Orthogonality, balance and the practical choice of design	164
7.6	Experimental designs for large-scale variety trials	173

	Contents	vii
8	Multiple blocking systems and cross-over designs	182
8.0	Preliminary examples	182
8.1	Latin square designs and Latin rectangles	182
8.2	Multiple orthogonal classifications and sequences of experiments	186
8.3	Row-and-column designs with more treatments than replicates	188
8.4	Three-dimensional designs	199
8.5	The practical choice of row-and-column design	201
8.6	Cross-over designs – time as a blocking factor	204
8.7	Cross-over designs for residual or interaction effects	207
9	Multiple levels of information	218
9.0	Preliminary examples	218
9.1	Identifying multiple levels in data	218
9.2	The use of multiple levels of information	220
9.3	Random effects and mixed models	227
9.4	Analysis of multiple level data using REML	229
9.5	Multiple blocking systems	230
10	Randomisation	233
10.1	What is the population?	233
10.2	Random treatment allocation	234
10.3	Randomisation tests	236
10.4	Randomisation theory of the analysis of experimental data	241
10.5	Practical implications of the two theories of analysis of	
	experimental data	246
10.6	Practical randomisation	248
11	Restricted randomisation	256
11.0	Preliminary example	256
11.1	Time-trend resistant run orders and designs	256
11.2	Modelling spatial variation	257
11.3	Neighbour balance	260
11.4	Advantages and disadvantages of restricting randomisation	261
11.5	Ignoring blocking in the data analysis	263
11.6	Covariance or blocking	264
11.7	Sequential allocation of treatments in clinical trials	266
Part	III Second subject	
12	Experimental objectives, treatments and treatment structures	275
12.0	Preliminary examples	275

viii		Contents	
	12.4	Qualitative or quantitative factors	283
	12.5	Treatment structures	289
	12.6	Incomplete structures and varying replication	294
	12.7	Treatments as a sample	298
	12.8	Screening and selection experiments	299
	13	Factorial structure and particular forms of effects	305
	13.0	Preliminary example	305
	13.1	Factors with two levels only	305
	13.2	Improved yield comparisons in terms of effects	310
	13.3	Analysis by considering sums and differences	315
	13.4	Factors with three or more levels	319
	13.5	The use of only a single replicate	324
	13.6	Analysis of unreplicated factorials	327
	14	Fractional replication	334
	14.0	Preliminary examples	334
	14.1	The use of a fraction of a complete factorial experiment	335
	14.2	Half-replicates of $2^n$ factorials	336
	14.3	Simple fractions for factors with more than two levels	340
	14.4	Smaller fractions for $2^n$ structures	345
	14.5	Irregular fractions for $2^n$ structures	349
	14.6	Other fractions for three-level factors and for mixed levels	353
	14.7	Very small fractions for main effect estimation	359
	15	Incomplete block size for factorial experiments	363
	15.0	Preliminary examples	363
	15.1	Small blocks and many factorial combinations	363
	15.2	Factors with a common number of levels	370
	15.3	Incompletely confounded effects	375
	15.4	Partial confounding	378
	15.5	Confounding for general block size and factor levels	389
	15.6	The negative approach to confounding for two-level factors	396
	15.7	Confounding theory for other factorial structures	402
	15.8	Confounding in fractional replicates	412
	15.9	Confounding in row-and-column designs	417
	16	Quantitative factors and response functions	425
	16.0	Preliminary examples	425
	16.1	The use of response functions in the analysis of data	425
	16.2	Design objectives	429
	16.3	Specific parameter estimation	430
	16.4	Optimal design theory	437
	16.5	Discrimination	439

Contents			
16.6	Designs for competing criteria	440	
16.7	Systematic designs	443	
17	Multifactorial designs for quantitative factors	448	
17.0	Preliminary examples	448	
17.1	Experimental objectives	448	
17.2	Response surface designs based on factorial treatment		
	structures	451	
17.3	Prediction properties of response surface designs	456	
17.4	Lack of fit and confirmatory runs	460	
17.5	Blocking response surface designs	461	
17.6	Experiments with mixtures	464	
17.7	Non-linear response surfaces	468	
18	Split-unit designs	475	
18.0	Preliminary examples	475	
18.1	The practical need for split units	475	
18.2	Advantages and disadvantages of split-unit designs	482	
18.3	Extensions of the split-unit idea	484	
18.4	Identification of multiple strata designs	493	
18.5	Systematic treatment variation within main units	496	
18.6	The split-unit design as an example of confounding	498	
18.7	Non-orthogonal split-unit designs	502	
18.8	Linked experiments	506	
Part	IV Coda		
19	Multiple experiments and new variation	513	
19.1	The need for additional variation	513	
19.2	Planned replication of experiments	514	
19.3	Introducing additional factors in experiments	521	
19.4	Practical context experiments	523	
19.5	Combined experimental analysis	525	
20	Sequential aspects of experiments and experimental		
	programmes	528	
20.1	Experimentation is sequential	528	
20.2	Using prior information in designing experiments	529	
20.3	Sequences of experiments in selection programmes	530	
20.4	Sequences of experiments in screening programmes	532	
20.5	Sequences of experiments in pharmaceutical trials	532	
20.6	Sequential nature within clinical trials	534	

20.6	Sequential nature within clinical trials	534
20.7	Sequences of experiments in response optimisation	535
20.8	Continuous on-line experimentation	537

ix

х

Contents		
0	Designing useful experiments	538
0.0	Some more real problems	538
0.1	Design principles or practical design	539
0.2	Resources and experimental units	540
0.3	Treatments and detailed objectives	542
0.4	The resource equation and the estimation of the error variance	545
0.5	The marriage of resources and treatments	546
0.6	Three particular problems	551
0.7	Computer design packages and catalogues of designs	558
Refer	ences	565
Index		568

# Preface

Our aim in this book is to explain and illustrate the fundamental statistical concepts required for designing efficient experiments to answer real questions. This book has evolved from a previous book written by the first author. That book was based on 25 years of experience of designing experiments for research scientists and of teaching the concepts of statistical design both to statisticians and to experimenters. The present book is based on approximately a combined 100 years of experience of designing experiments for research scientists and to experiments for research scientists.

The development of statistical philosophy about the design of experiments has always been dominated by mathematical theory. In contrast the influence of the availability of vastly improved computing facilities on teaching, textbooks and, most crucially, practical experimentation has been relatively small. The existence of statistical programs capable of analysing the results from any designed experiment does not imply any changes in the main statistical concepts of design. However, developments from these concepts have often been restricted by the earlier need to develop mathematical theory for design in such a way that the results from the designs could be analysed without recourse to computers. The fundamental concepts continually require reexamination and reinterpretation outside the limits implied by classical mathematical theory so that the full range of design possibilities may be considered. The result of the revolution in computing facilities is that the design of experiments should become a much wider and more exciting subject. We hope that this book will display that breadth and excitement.

The original development of the earlier book was particularly motivated by teaching postgraduate students specialising in statistics. However, the intention of this book is to reach a much wider audience. Understanding the fundamental concepts of design is essential for everybody involved in programmes of research and experimentation. In addition to this general need for an understanding of the philosophy of designing experiments there are particular aspects of design, such as the definition of experimental units (Chapter 5) or levels of replication (Chapter 6), which are relevant to virtually all research disciplines in which experimentation is required. Because of the concentration on basic concepts and their implications the book could be used for courses for final-year undergraduates provided such courses allow sufficient time for the concepts to be thoroughly discussed.

Parts of the book could also be used as text support for various tertiary education courses or short courses. Thus a course on linear models with an emphasis on data from designed studies could use Chapters 4, 9 and 18, with some examples taken from other chapters. An introductory course on the design of experiments could use Chapters 1, 2 and 3, followed by some small initial parts of Chapters 7, 8, 13 and 16. A course for final-year undergraduates xii

## Preface

could include Chapters 5 and 6, followed by large parts of Chapters 7, 8, 10, 12, 13, 15 and 16. It would even be possible to construct a course on advanced design by including the later parts of Chapters 7 and 8, with Chapters 11, 13, 17, and some parts of 19 and 20, before presenting Chapter 0.

This book concentrates on the ideas of design rather than those of analysis, on the statistical concepts rather than the mathematical theory and on designing practically useful experiments rather than on developing classes of possible design structures. Obviously it is also necessary to consider how the data from designed experiments will be analysed and the philosophy and methods of analysis are discussed in the introductory first part of the book. There is a further chapter, 9, concerned with the analysis of data from experiments with multiple levels of information, once the ideas of designs with information at multiple levels have been considered in Chapters 7 and 8. Of course, examples of analysis punctuate many later chapters of the book. However, in all the development of design ideas, it is assumed that the analysis of data from designed experiments is not difficult when good designs and modern computing facilities are used. Consequently ideas of analysis are introduced only when they illuminate or motivate the design concepts.

The formal language of statistics is mathematical. Thus it is not possible to discuss the design of experiments without some mathematically complex formulation of models and ideas. Some of the mathematical language used in the book requires a sound mathematical background beyond school level. However, in all parts of the book it is the statistical concepts which are important, and the structure of the book hopefully allows the less-mathematical reader to bypass the more complex mathematical details. Throughout the book the development of concepts relies on many examples. We hope that readers will consider the detailed arguments of these examples. By trying to solve the problems which underlie the examples before reading through the explanation of the solutions, we believe that readers will start to develop the intuitive understanding of design concepts which is essential to good design. For the mathematically sophisticated reader the mathematical details provide additional support for the statistical concepts.

Most importantly, the book is intended to show how practical problems of designing real experiments should be solved. To stimulate this practical emphasis real examples of design problems are described at the beginning of most chapters of the book. The final chapter of the book attempts an overall view of the problem-solving aspects of design.

The areas of application used in examples in this book inevitably reflect the personal experience of the three authors. The earlier book had a strong bias towards agricultural experimentation, but we believe that that bias is much reduced in this new book and that the examples and the approach to design is much broader than previously. Whether or not that belief is justified, all the examples are intended to illustrate particular forms of problem that will be relevant in many fields of application. We hope that statisticians and research scientists in a wide range of experimental disciplines will be able to interpret and adapt the concepts discussed in the book to their own requirements through the use of analogy when the examples discussed are not directly relevant to their discipline.

For those readers familiar with the earlier book it may be helpful to explain where this new book is clearly different. Compared to the previous book, there are several new chapters, 5 on 'Experimental units', 9 on 'Multilevel analysis', 11 on 'Restricted randomisation', 14 on 'Fractional replicates', 19 on 'Multiple experiments and new variation' and 20 on 'Sequential

#### Preface

aspects of experiments'. Some chapters in the earlier book have disappeared, some of their material being included in a shortened form in the new book; these include 'Covariance' and 'Computer analysis programs' as sections in Chapter 4, and 'Mathematical theory for confounding and fractional replication', some parts of which appear in the new Chapters 14 and 15. The chapter on model assumptions and general models has been omitted, being not strictly relevant to a book on designing experiments.

The book is divided into an overture and two main subjects with a final coda to bring together all the previous material. Chapters 1–4 constitute the overture, providing a general introduction and the basic theory necessary for analysis of experimental data. Chapters 1, 2 and 3 should be familiar to readers who have taken an elementary course in the design of experiments. Alternatively, for those readers without any previous training in this topic, these three chapters provide an introductory presentation of the two most important ideas, blocking and factorial structure. Chapter 4 is the mathematically heavy chapter, providing the necessary theory for general linear models and the analysis of data from designed experiments, with an initial explanation of the important results at a rather simpler level. Chapter 4 also explores the universal use of computer programs and packages for the analysis of data from designed experiments.

The first main subject is unit variation and control. In Chapter 5 we examine the concept of an experimental unit, and the diverse forms of experimental units. The fundamental concepts of replication, and blocking (with either one or two systems of control) are developed in depth in Chapters 6, 7 and 8. The ideas of randomisation and restricted randomisation are explored thoroughly in Chapters 10 and 11. Our aim throughout these chapters is to distinguish the purposes and practical relevance of each concept and to eliminate the confusion about these concepts which seems to be common in the minds of many of those needing to design effective experiments. The need for analysis methods and computer programs to cope with data from designed experiments with variation occurring at more than one level is explored in Chapter 9 of this part.

The second main subject is treatment questions and structure. Chapter 12 presents an overview of the need for statisticians to be involved in all stages of discussions about the choice of treatments and the interpretation of results. The classical ideas of factorial structure and multiple and single replicates are presented in Chapter 13. In Chapter 14 we explore the uses of fractions of full factorial structures. Chapter 15 examines the combination of factorial structures with the need for units to be grouped into relatively small blocks. The choice of experimental treatments for the investigation of the responses to quantitative factors is discussed in Chapters 16 (mainly for single factor response functions) and 17 (for multifactorial response surfaces). In Chapter 18 we investigate a variety of design approaches in which different levels of experimental units are deliberately used to investigate different sets of treatment factors.

Finally in the coda, Chapter 19 explores the use of sets of experiments, often in multiple locations or at different times, and also the deliberate introduction of additional variation in experimental programmes. Chapter 20 explores various sequential aspects of experiments and experimental programmes, in particular focussing on the concept that individual experiments do not exist in isolation from past and future experimentation. Finally Chapter 0 seeks to draw the concepts of the two main subjects together to provide guidance on designing effective experiments to satisfy particular practical requirements. A book on the practical design of

xiii

xiv

#### Preface

experiments should start with the approach of Chapter 0 but this chapter requires knowledge from the previous chapters before it can be read and understood. Hence the number and position of this chapter.

We owe a considerable debt to many consultees and collaborators, both for the stimulus to consider why the problems they presented should be covered by a book on designing experiments and also for the many examples they have provided. There are too many for us to thank them individually here for their stimulating requests and they therefore remain anonymous (some should prefer it that way, and others are too distant in the mists of time for anything else). We have also benefitted from many discussions with colleagues at Reading and elsewhere and particularly wish to thank Richard Coe, Robert Curnow, John Fenlon, Geoff Freeman, Peter Goos, Derek Pike, Roger Stern and Luzia Trinca, without whom this book would have had a more stunted growth.