RETHINKING REVOLUTIONS THROUGH ANCIENT GREECE

From the time of the Roman Empire onwards, fifth- and fourth-century Greece has been held to be the period and place in which civilisation as the West knows it developed. Classical scholars have sought to justify these claims in detail by describing developments in fields such as democratic politics, art, rationality, historiography, literature, philosophy, medicine and music, in which classical Greece has been held to have made a revolutionary contribution. In this volume a distinguished cast of contributors offers a fresh consideration of these claims, asking both whether they are well based and what is at stake for their proposers and for us in making them. They look both at modern scholarly argument and its basis and at the claims made by the scholars of the Second Sophistic. The volume will be of interest not only to classical scholars but to all who are interested in the history of scholarship.

SIMON GOLDFILL is Professor of Greek at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of King’s College. He has published widely on all aspects of Greek literature and on ancient culture. His books include Reading Greek Tragedy (1986), The Poet’s Voice (1989), Foucault’s Virginity (1992), Who Needs Greek? (2002), Love, Sex and Tragedy (2004) and The Temple of Jerusalem (2004). He is in demand as a lecturer across Europe and the USA and has appeared regularly on television and radio.

ROBIN OSBORNE is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of King’s College. His numerous publications include Greece in the Making (1996), Archaic and Classical Greek Art (1998), Performance Culture and Athenian Democracy (1999, edited with Simon Goldhill) and Greek Historical Inscriptions from the End of the Peloponnesian War to the Death of Alexander (2003, edited with P. J. Rhodes).
For Geoffrey Lloyd
Contents

List of figures xi
List of contributors xiii
Preface xiv
List of abbreviations xv

Introduction 1

Robin Osborne

1 When was the Athenian democratic revolution? 10

Robin Osborne

2 Revolutions in human time: age-class in Athens and the Greekness of Greek revolutions 29

James Davidson

3 Reflections on the ‘Greek Revolution’ in art: from changes in viewing to the transformation of subjectivity 68

Jai Elsner

4 What’s in a beard? Rethinking Hadrian’s Hellenism 96

Caroline Vout

5 Religion and the rationality of the Greek city 124

Thomas Harrison

6 Rethinking religious revolution 141

Simon Goldhill

7 Paying attention: history as the development of a secular narrative 164

Carolyn Dewald
# Contents

8  Talking about revolution: on political change in fourth-century Athens and historiographic method  
   Danielle Allen  
   183

9  Was there an Eleatic revolution in philosophy?  
   Catherine Osborne  
   218

10 The origins of medicine in the second century AD  
   Helen King  
   246

11 The New Music – so what’s new?  
   Armand D’Angour  
   264

Works cited  
   284

Index  
   315
Figures

2.1 Cup by the Telephos Painter, Attic Red Figure c. 470 BC. Boston Museum of Fine Arts 95.28. Photograph courtesy of Boston Museum of Fine Arts. 56

3.1 Page 100 from Gombrich’s Art and Illusion, showing the Apollo of Tenea, the Apollo of Piombino and the Kritian Boy. 72

3.2 Kroisos, kouros from Anavyssos in Attica. Marble. c. 530 BC. Photograph courtesy of Hirmer Fotoarchiv Munich. 74

3.3 West pediment of the temple of Artemis in Corcyra. Marble. c. 590–580 BC. Photograph courtesy of DAI Athens. 78

3.4 West pediment of the temple of Zeus at Olympia. Marble. c. 470–457 BC. Reconstruction courtesy of John Boardman. 79

3.5 Kritios Youth from the Athenian Acropolis. Marble. c. 480–475 BC. Photograph courtesy of Jeffrey Hurwit. 80

3.6 The Tyrannicides. Roman marble version after the bronze original by Kritios and Nesiotes from Athens. c. 477/476 BC. Photograph courtesy of DAI Rome, Inst. Neg. 58.1789. 82

3.7 Doryphorus. Roman marble copy of the bronze original by Polyclitus. c. 440 BC. Photograph courtesy of DAI Rome, Inst. Neg. 66.1831. 84

4.1 Statue of Hadrian in a himation from Cyrene, British Museum, inv. no. 1381. © The Trustees of the British Museum. 102


4.4 Pericles attributed to Kresilas, Roman copy from Tivoli, original c. 425 BC. London BM 549. Photograph © The British Museum. 108
List of figures


4.8 Diomedes (Roman copy) from Cumae, original c. 420 BC. Naples Museum 144978. Photograph courtesy of DAI Rome (Inst. Neg. 66.1832 – photographer, Koppermann).


4.13 Cast of Hadrian from Hierapytna, Museo Civiltà Romana, EUR, Rome (photo Caroline Vout).
Contributors

Danielle Allen is Professor in the Departments of Classics and Political Science and the Committee on Social Thought and Dean of the Division of Humanities at the University of Chicago. Her publications include The World of Prometheus: the Politics of Punishing in Democratic Athens (2000) and Talking to Strangers: Anxieties of Citizenship since Brown v. Board of Education (2004).

Armand D’Angour is Fellow and Tutor in Classics at Jesus College, Oxford. He has published articles on ancient Greek music, Roman poetry, and innovation in ancient Greece. His ‘Pindaric Ode’ was chosen by the International Olympic Committee to be recited at the Athens Olympics in 2004. Current projects include a book on concepts of novelty in Greek antiquity.

James Davidson is Reader in Ancient History at the University of Warwick. His publications include Courtesans and Fishcakes. The Consuming Passions of Classical Athens (1997).

Carolyn Dewald taught for many years at the University of Southern California, and is now Professor of History and Classics at Bard College. Her publications include the Introduction and Notes to the Oxford World’s Classics translation of Herodotus (1998), the Cambridge Companion to Herodotus (co-edited with John Marincola, 2006), Thucydides’ War Narrative: a Structural Study (2005), and articles on Herodotus and Thucydides.

Jaš Elsner is Humfry Payne Senior Research Fellow in Classical Art and Archaeology at Corpus Christi College, Oxford and Visiting Professor of Art History in the University of Chicago. His publications include Art and the Roman Viewer (1995) and Imperial Rome and Christian Triumph (1998). He is the editor of Art and Text in Roman Culture (1996).
List of contributors

SIMON GOLDFHILL is Professor of Greek at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of King’s College. His publications include Reading Greek Tragedy (1986), The Poet’s Voice (1991), Foucault’s Virginity (1995), Who Needs Greek? (2001), and most recently, Love, Sex and Tragedy, and The Temple of Jerusalem. He and Robin Osborne have also edited together Art and Text in Ancient Greek Culture (1994) and Performance Culture and Athenian Democracy (1999).

THOMAS HARRISON is Rathbone Professor of Ancient History and Classical Archaeology at the University of Liverpool. His publications include Divinity and History. The Religion of Herodotus (2000), The Emptiness of Asia. Aeschylus’ Persians and the History of the Fifth Century (2000) and, as editor, Greeks and Barbarians (2002).

HELEN KING is Professor of the History of Classical Medicine, Department of Classics, University of Reading. Her publications include Hippocrates’ Woman (1998), Greek and Roman Medicine (2001), The Disease of Virgins (2003) and the edited collection Health in Antiquity (2005).


ROBIN OSBORNE is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of King’s College. His publications include Demos: the Discovery of Classical Attica (1985), Greece in the Making, c. 1200–479 B.C. (1996), Greek History (2004). He and Simon Goldhill have also edited together Art and Text in Ancient Greek Culture (1994) and Performance Culture and Athenian Democracy (1999).

CAROLINE VOUT is Lecturer in Classics at the University of Nottingham. Her publications include papers on Nero, Hadrian and Antinous, and she is currently working on a book on the hills of Rome.
In 2001 the Arts and Humanities Research Board agreed to fund a major research project in Cambridge under the title ‘The Anatomy of Cultural Revolution: Athenian art, literature, language, philosophy and politics 430–380 bc’. As part of this project we ran a conference in July 2002 intended to think about what was at stake in making claims that aspects of Greek history were revolutionary. We gathered together a group of scholars whose interests spread across history, literature, medicine, art and philosophy and across the whole of antiquity, and asked them to think not only about whether claims to revolution were justified but about why, both in antiquity and in more modern times, such claims had been made.

The chapters that follow stem from that conference, but have been more or less radically revised as a result of comments made at the time and subsequently by those who took part in the conference, and by the anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press. We are grateful both to the contributors themselves for their lively engagement with the project and with each other, to Ben Akriegl, Elizabeth Irwin, Julia Shear, Claire Taylor, and Rob Tordoff, the researchers associated with the project, and to Kate Cooper, Ann Kuttner, John Moles, and Tim Whitmarsh for their part in the discussions. We are grateful to the Arts and Humanities Research Board for its funding of the conference, and to the Faculty of Classics at Cambridge and King’s College Cambridge for their hospitality.

We dedicate this collection to Geoffrey Lloyd, who has done more than any other living classicist to keep the Greek revolution under critical scrutiny.

SIMON GOLDHILL AND ROBIN OSBORNE

xiii
Abbreviations

ABSA  Annual of the British School at Athens.
AJA  American Journal of Archaeology.
AJPh  American Journal of Philology.
Anc Soc  Ancient Society.
ANRW  Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt (1972–).
AR  Archaeological Reports.
ARV²  Attic Red-Figure Vase Painters, 2nd edn, ed. J. D. Beazley (1963).
BA  Beazley Archive.
CA  Classical Archaeology.
CJ  The Classical Journal.
ClAnt.  Classical Antiquity.
CMG  Corpus Medicorum Graecorum (1908–).
CPh  Classical Philology.
CQ  The Classical Quarterly.
CR  The Classical Review.
GRBS  Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies.
JdAI  Jahrbuch des deutschen archäologischen Instituts.
JHS  Journal of Hellenic Studies.
JRS  Journal of Roman Studies.
LIMC  Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae (1981–).
MEFRA  Mélanges d’Archéologie et d’Histoire de l’École Française de Rome.
PBSR  Proceedings of the British School at Rome.
List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YCS</td>
<td>Yale Classical Studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZPE</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>