At a pivotal point in the history of the World Trade Organisation, when development issues are at the heart of negotiations, how the larger and more powerful WTO Members address the legitimate concerns of its poorest and most vulnerable members will shape the perception of the institution throughout much of the century. This book aims not only to document almost ten years of experience of small, vulnerable states with the WTO, but also to explain why these experiences have occurred.

The book takes an evidential theory approach to explaining the inherent features characteristic to the trade and economic development of small island states. It then proceeds to highlight the particular issues of concern to these states in relation to multilateral trade negotiations at the WTO. A section is devoted to discussing the experience of the African Caribbean and Pacific (ACP) countries with the WTO dispute settlement mechanism, in the context of the impact and implications of EU reform in the sugar, banana and tuna industries. The book ends with a discussion of key negotiating issues for the island states and institutional arrangements which will facilitate reform.

**Roman Grynberg** is Advisor and Head of International Trade and Regional Co-operation for the Economic Affairs Division of the Commonwealth Secretariat.
WTO AT THE MARGINS

Small States and the Multilateral Trading System

Edited by

ROMAN GRYNBERG
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of figures and appendices</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of contributors</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roman Grynberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part I – Theory and evidence</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 A theory of trade and development of small vulnerable states</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roman Grynberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Small countries: a survey of the literature</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Weatherhead</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 When comparative advantage doesn’t matter: business costs in small economies</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Alan Winters and Pedro M. G. Martins</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Can small states compete in manufacturing?</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ganeshan Wignaraja and David Joiner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The economics of isolation and distance</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Redding and Anthony J. Venables</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 The trade performance of small states</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roman Grynberg and Mohammad A. Razzaque</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Small economies and special and differential treatment: strengthening the evidence, countering the fallacies</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia Horscroft</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Part II – WTO and small economies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Small vulnerable economy issues and the WTO</td>
<td>Roman Grynberg and Jan Yves Remy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Special and differential treatment for small developing economies</td>
<td>Richard L. Bernal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>A study of alternative special and differential arrangements for small economies</td>
<td>Michael Davenport</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part III – WTO dispute settlement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Small states in the banana dispute</td>
<td>Edwin Laurent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Jamaica and the case in the WTO against the European Communities regime for the importation, sale and distribution of bananas (1992–2001)</td>
<td>Marcia Thomas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>WTO complaints by Australia and Brazil regarding the EU sugar regime</td>
<td>Stephen J. Orava and Carol C. George</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Reform of EU export subsidies on sugar: the legal and economic implications for the ACP countries</td>
<td>Roman Grynberg, Chris Milner, Wyn Morgan and Evious Zgovu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Analysis of the impact of opening up the EU import market for canned tuna on ACP countries</td>
<td>Elizabeth Bennett, Helene Rey-Valette and Zhen Kun Wang</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part IV</td>
<td>Negotiating issues and institutional arrangements</td>
<td>605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>WTO fisheries subsidies negotiations: implications for ACP fisheries access arrangements and sustainable management</td>
<td>607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Roman Grynberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Plurilateral financial standards and their regulation: the experience of small developing states</td>
<td>633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Roman Grynberg, Sacha Silva and Jan Yves Remy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Export processing zones and the WTO Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures</td>
<td>684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David Robertson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>The accession of Vanuatu to the WTO: lessons for the multilateral trading system</td>
<td>693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Roman Grynberg and Roy Mickey Joy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index 715
LIST OF FIGURES AND APPENDICES

Chapter 2
Figure 2.1 Flow diagram of causes of small country disadvantages 33
Figure 2.2 Simple correlation of growth and volatility 41
Figure 2.3 GDP per capita and foreign market access 45
Appendix 2.1 Annotated bibliography 62

Chapter 3
Figure 3.1 Airfreight costs ‘to London’ vs. population 87
Figure 3.2 Shipping costs ‘from Yokohama’ vs. population 91

Chapter 4
Appendix 4.1 Construction of the SSMECI 137

Chapter 5
Figure 5.1 GDP per capita and FMA 152
Figure 5.2 GDP per capita and MA = DMA(3) + FMA 153
Figure 5.3 Relative price of machinery and equipment and FSA 153
Appendix 5.1 Countries in figures 5.1, 5.2 and 5.3 162

Chapter 6
Figure 6.1 Trend growth rates of merchandise exports 169
Figure 6.2 Share of small states in global merchandise exports: 1950–2000 170
Figure 6.3 Growth rates of commercial services exports 173
Figure 6.4 Volume and share of small states in exports of commercial services 174
List of Figures and Appendices

Figure 6.5 Declining importance of small states in world export (merchandise plus services) trade
Figure 6.6 Share of small states in world trade transactions
Figure 6.7 Total exports (merchandise plus commercial services) of individual small states
Figure 6.8 Share of individual small states in global exports of merchandise goods and commercial services (1980 = 1)
Figure 6.9 Marginalisation of individual small states in world merchandise exports, 1970–2000
Figure 6.10 Marginalisation of individual small states in total exports (merchandise plus commercial services): 1980–2000
Figure 6.11 Average net shift in exports of small states in 1995–2000 in comparison with 1980–5
Figure 6.12 Average net shift in total exports of small states in 1995–2000 in comparison with 1990–4 exports
Figure 6.13 Trends in marginalisation and growth of real GDP in small states
Figure 6.14 Share of primary and manufacturing exports in small states
Figure 6.15 Share of agriculture in world exports and world exports–GDP ratio
Figure 6.16 Scatterplot of lnMAR and lnAGX
Figure 6.17 Scatterplot of lnMAR and lnGLO
Figure 6.18 Plot of variables and their correlograms
Figure 6.19 Share of small states in global inflow of FDI
Appendix 6.1 List of small states
Appendix 6.2 Merchandise exports from small states
Appendix 6.3 Commercial services exports from small states
Appendix 6.4 Share of individual small states in world merchandise exports (share in 1970 = 1)
Appendix 6.5 Share of individual small states in world commercial services exports (share in 1980 = 1)
## LIST OF FIGURES AND APPENDICES

### Chapter 7
- Figure 7.1 Openness to trade in small economies 237
- Figure 7.2 Export concentration in small economies 238
- Figure 7.3 Losses from preference erosion as a percentage of merchandise exports 257

### Chapter 8
- Appendix 8.1 Table of other negotiating proposals made or to be made in favour of small developing states in the WTO 294
- Appendix 8.2 Total trade in goods and services sorted by average percentage share 1998–2000 298
- Appendix 8.3 United Nations Economic Vulnerability Index 305

### Chapter 10
- Figure 10.1 Share in world trade (1998–9), selected small states 362
- Figure 10.2 Share in world agricultural trade (1998–9), selected small states 370
- Appendix 10.1 List of small states recognised by the CS–WB Task Force 382
- Appendix 10.2 Cluster and discriminant analysis 383
- Appendix 10.3 Results of line-by-line de minimis analysis 396
- Appendix 10.4 Notes on data sources 418

### Chapter 11
- Figure 11.1 Supplies of bananas to the EU 15, 1990–2002 (thousand tonnes) 437
- Figure 11.2 Number of active growers in the Windward Islands, 1993–2001 438

### Chapter 12
- Figure 12.1 Extent of decline of Windward Islands banana production 464
- Figure 12.2 Extent of decline in active growers of Windward Islands bananas 465
- Figure 12.3 Impact of declining banana industry on regional export revenue 467
Figure 12.4 Banana export revenue decline in individual countries 468
Figure 12.5 Rate of banana export revenue decline in individual countries 469
Figure 12.6 Growth in GDP, Agriculture GDP (AGDP) and Agriculture’s share of GDP (AG/GDP) in St Lucia and Dominica 470
Figure 12.7 Growth in GDP, Agriculture GDP (AGDP) and Agriculture’s share of GDP (AG/GDP) in St Vincent and Grenada 472
Figure 12.8 Contribution of bananas to exports of goods 474
Figure 12.9 Contribution of bananas to exports of goods and non-factor services 474
Figure 12.10 Contribution of bananas to the stability of the current account of the BOP within the Eastern Caribbean Currency Union 475
Figure 12.11 Changes in the number of persons employed in the regional banana industry and an index of employment 476

Chapter 15
Figure 15.1 EU sugar scheme 539
Figure 15.2 Export revenues and income transfers for Sugar Protocol countries 539
Figure 15.3 Summary gross and net income transfer losses for all protocol countries 555

Chapter 16
Figure 16.1 Evolution of ACP production of canned tuna (MT) 563
Figure 16.2 Relative importance of canned tuna suppliers to EU market (2001) 568
Figure 16.3 Evolution of the European canned tuna market (MT) 568
Figure 16.4 Evolution of tuna purchases by Dakar canneries 573
Figure 16.5 Evolution of canned tuna production in Ghana 577
Figure 16.6 Tuna catches landed by Mauritius, 1980–2000 583
LIST OF FIGURES AND APPENDICES

Figure 16.7 Value of canned tuna exports in SR (’000s), 1990–2002 587

Chapter 18
Appendix 18.1 Overlapping memberships in key standard-setting bodies 680
LIST OF TABLES

Chapter 2
Table 2.1 Composite vulnerability index and other indices ordered according to vulnerability score
Table 2.2 The impact of size on growth in four growth regressions

Chapter 3
Table 3.1 Summary statistics of the sample of countries
Table 3.2 Sample countries cross-classified by size, region and insularity
Table 3.3 Correlations between size, region and insularity
Table 3.4 The continuous variables from the survey
Table 3.5 The categorical variables from the survey
Table 3.6 Summary of the size regressions for continuous variables
Table 3.7 Estimates for the ordered logit equations on categorical variables
Table 3.8 Cost structures for electronics and cost disadvantage ratios
Table 3.9 Central case cost inflation factors and income penalties

Chapter 4
Table 4.1 Features of recent competitiveness indices
Table 4.2 Summary of results from MECI
Table 4.3 Country rankings for the three separate variables
Table 4.4 Overall SSMECI ranking
Table 4.5 SSMECI performance by region
Table 4.6 SSMECI performance by income grouping
Table 4.7 SSMECI performance by population size grouping

Table 4.8 Comparison of results from SSMECI, MECI and WEF growth competitiveness index

Table 4.9 T-test to examine significance of determinants

Appendix 4.1

Table 1 Basic profile of small states, most recent estimates

Chapter 5

Table 5.1 Economic interactions and distance

Table 5.2 Percentage change in real income from openness

Table 5.3 Percentage change in real income from border effects

Chapter 6

Table 6.1 Absolute volume of merchandise exports and imports (in billions of US dollars)

Table 6.2 Absolute growth of merchandise exports (in billions of US dollars)

Table 6.3 Exports of commercial services (in billions of US dollars)

Table 6.4 Absolute growth of commercial services (in billions of US dollars)

Table 6.5 Volume of export trade (merchandise plus commercial services) (US $ billion)

Table 6.6 Total trade transactions of different country groups (US $ billion)

Table 6.7 Growth rates of merchandise exports from individual small states

Table 6.8 Growth rates of commercial services exports

Table 6.9 A summary of export performance of small states in the 1990s

Table 6.10 Fall in commodity prices in real terms

Table 6.11 Computed F test statistics and critical values

Table 6.12 DF and ADF tests for unit roots
Table 6.13 PHFMOLS estimates of the long-run relationship 212
Table 6.14 Short-run error correction model 214
Table 6.15 Official financial flows (millions of US dollars) 217

Chapter 7
Table 7.1 Small economies and key economic indicators 229
Table 7.2 Production cost inflation in micro- and small economies 233
Table 7.3 Cost inflation factors in micro- and small economies 234
Table 7.4 Penalties to value-added in micro- and small economies 234
Table 7.5 The extreme vulnerability of small economies to natural disasters (1970–2003) 240
Table 7.6 2002 governance indicators for small economies 244
Table 7.7 Average annual GDP growth (1990–2000) 251
Table 7.8 The major preferential trade arrangements of small economies 254
Table 7.9 Preference margins by product for most vulnerable middle-income countries 256
Table 7.10 Macroeconomic losses from preference erosion in most vulnerable middle-income countries 258

Chapter 9
Table 9.1 Relationship between characteristics of small developing economies and special and differential treatment measures 348

Chapter 10
Table 10.1 Selected export variables 365

Appendix 10.2
table 1 Discriminant analysis: summary results with five groups 386
table 2 Discriminant analysis: summary results with four groups 386
table 3 Discriminant analysis: summary results with three groups 387
LIST OF TABLES

table 4 Country data used in cluster and discriminant analysis

Appendix 10.3

table 1 Small state beneficiaries from de minimis rule (0.3 or 0.5 per cent world trade) applied to agriculture at two-digit level

table 2 Other principal beneficiaries from de minimis rule (0.3 or 0.5 per cent world trade) applied to agriculture at two-digit level

table 3 Coverage of 3 per cent de minimis rule, eight-digit tariff lines in agriculture (HS sections 01-24), EU imports (1998–9)

table 4 Summary results of de minimis analysis: shares of world imports covered by country group

table 5 Results of de minimis analysis: shares of world imports covered by country group

table 6 Principal exports of small states with lowest coverage by 3 per cent de minimis rule

table 7 Principal exports of all developing countries covered by 3 per cent de minimis rule

table 8 Share of major beneficiaries’ total exports of principal non-zero tariff lines covered by 3 per cent de minimis rule

table 9 Impact on other exporters of full utilisation of 3 per cent de minimis rule

table 10 Estimated revenue loss to EU of giving tariff-free access on existing quantities of imports for principal tariff lines covered by 3 per cent de minimis rule

Chapter 11

Table 11.1 Supplies of bananas to the EU 15, 1990–2002 (thousand tonnes)

Table 11.2 Average 1999 fob prices of a sample of suppliers (US $ per tonne)

Table 11.3 Nominal and real retail prices of bananas in the UK, 1990–2003

Table 11.4 Export values (fob) (US $ million)
**LIST OF TABLES**

**Chapter 12**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 12.1</td>
<td>Percentage contribution of bananas to real GDP</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12.2</td>
<td>Banana output as a percentage of agriculture GDP</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12.3</td>
<td>Active growers in the Windward Islands banana industry</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12.4</td>
<td>Banana exports as a percentage of exports of goods</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12.5</td>
<td>Banana exports as a percentage of exports of goods and non-factor services</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12.6</td>
<td>Banana exports as a percentage of exports of goods, non-factor services and private remittances</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 13**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 13.1</td>
<td>Phase I: 1 July–31 December 2001</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 13.2</td>
<td>Phase II: 1 January 2002–31 December 2005</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 15**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.1</td>
<td>ACP export quotas in tonnes (1998–9)</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.2</td>
<td>Estimates of current income transfer (2001)</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.3</td>
<td>Current income transfer relative to trade levels</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.4</td>
<td>Current income transfer to relative domestic and per capita income</td>
<td>544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.5</td>
<td>Summary of the impact of liberalisation on world market prices</td>
<td>547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.6</td>
<td>Exports to third countries by EU countries (three-year average for 1998/99, 1999/00 and 2000/01) (’000 tonnes)</td>
<td>550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.7</td>
<td>Summary of sugar trade policy reform simulations</td>
<td>551</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.8</td>
<td>Estimated change in gross and net income transfer to Sugar Protocol exporters with ‘current WTO case’ (US $ ’000, 2001 prices)</td>
<td>553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15.9</td>
<td>Estimated change in value of sugar exports, imports and net trade of non-protocol ACP countries</td>
<td>557</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 16
Table 16.1 National canned tuna markets within Europe (MT, average 1999–2001) 567
Table 16.2 Main sources and destinations of intra-EU trade in canned tuna 570
Table 16.3 Summary of Senegalese canning sector 572
Table 16.4 Summary of main strengths and constraints in Senegal 575
Table 16.5 Structure of a selection of the Ghanaian canning sector 579
Table 16.6 Strengths and constraints facing the industry in Ghana 581
Table 16.7 Main strengths and constraints on the industry in Mauritius 585
Table 16.8 Strengths and constraints for the Seychelles industry 589
Table 16.9 Case study summary 591
Table 16.10 Possible impacts for Senegal 593
Table 16.11 Summary of possible impacts for Ghana 595
Table 16.12 Summary of impacts for Mauritius 597
Table 16.13 Summary of impacts for the Seychelles 598
Table 16.14 Synthesis of main impacts (potential and actual) 599

Chapter 17
Table 17.1 1999 access fees and gross domestic product 627
Table 17.2 Exports and access fees of selected Pacific countries (1999) 628

Chapter 20
Table 20.1 Duty rates by broad economic classification 699
Table 20.2 Simple average rates of ad valorem duty by HS Chapter, offer of October 1999 706
Table 20.3 Average rate of WTO bound ad valorem tariffs for various Pacific Island WTO members 708
Table 20.4 Service sector commitments by Pacific Island countries 709
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Elizabeth Bennett is a researcher with IDDRA (UK) Ltd.

Richard L. Bernal is the Director General, Caribbean Regional Negotiating Machinery and Hon. Professor, Sir Arthur Lewis Institute of Social and Economic Studies, University of the West Indies, Jamaica.

Michael Davenport is a consultant on international trade based in London.

Carol C. George is currently with the law firm of Baker and McKenzie, London.

Roman Grynberg is the Deputy Director, International Trade and Regional Co-operation Section, Economic Affairs Division, Commonwealth Secretariat.

Virginia Horscroft is a consultant to the Commonwealth Secretariat and a former ODI Fellow, and is based at Queen Elizabeth House and New College, Oxford.

David Joiner is currently Assistant Professor of Computational Finance at the New Jersey Center for Science and Technology Education at Kean University in Union, NJ.

Roy Mickey Joy is the Director of Trade in Port Villa, Vanuatu.

Edwin Laurent is the former Ambassador of Dominica, St Kitts and Nevis, St Vincent and the Grenadines to the European Commission and is now a consultant on international trade, based in Brussels.
**LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS**

**Pedro M. G. Martins** is currently with the School of Social Sciences, University of Sussex.

**Chris Milner** is currently a Professor of International Economics in the School of Economics, and Fellow of the Centre for Research on Economic Development and International Trade (CREDIT), University of Nottingham.

**Wyn Morgan** is currently a Professor in the School of Economics, University of Nottingham.

**Stephen J. Orava** was formerly with the law firm of Baker and McKenzie, London.

**Claudius Preville** is presently the Technical Advisor on Trade Policy to the OECS Secretariat for the Caribbean Regional Negotiating Machinery (CRNM).

**Mohammad A. Razzaque** is currently a Lecturer for the Department of Economics, University of Dhaka.

**Stephen Redding** is with the Department of Economics, London School of Economics.

**Jan Yves Remy** was formerly a Research Assistant with the Economic Affairs Division, Commonwealth Secretariat and is currently a Services Analyst with the Caribbean Regional Negotiating Machinery (CRNM).

**Helene Rey-Valette** is with the University of Montpellier, France.

**David Robertson** is currently a solicitor and a consultant on international trade based in London.

**Sacha Silva** is a consultant on international trade, currently working for the Commonwealth Secretariat.

**Marcia Thomas** is currently the Director of the Foreign Trade Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Foreign Trade, Jamaica.
Anthony J. Venables is with the Department of Economics, London School of Economics.

Zhen Kun Wang is an international trade consultant based in London.

Michael Weatherhead is presently an ODI Fellow, working in Guyana.

Ganeshan Wignaraja is currently with the Asian Development Bank, Manila, Philippines.

L. Alan Winters was formerly a Professor for the School of Social Sciences, University of Sussex and is currently the Director of Research for the World Bank.

Evitous Zgovu is with the School of Economics, University of Nottingham and is a consultant with the Commonwealth Secretariat.