

## Index

Actual parenting, 70	Annulment
Adaptive rationality	grounds for, 319
Frank, Robert, on, 231	and premarital agreements, 359
Adolphe, Jane	Antenuptial agreements. See Premarital agreements
on premarital agreements under Principles and in	"Approximate time" standard
Canada, 351, 371	generally, 74, 78
Adoption	Bartlett, Katherine, on, 75, 76
Convention on Intercountry Adoption, 399	"best interests of child" standard, relationship with, 74
parental rights of adoptive parents, Constitutional	custodial responsibility, allocation of, 74, 75
deference to state law, 56	exceptions, 76, 78
in Spain, 5	judicial discretion, 76, 78
Adultery	past caretaking standard compared, 449
Cicero on, 43	problems with, 76, 78
and fault, 254, 255	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 74, 444, 449, 454
financial misconduct, relationship to, 246	significant decision-making responsibility, allocation
intentional infliction of emotional distress claims	of, 75, 76
based on, 12	in West Virginia, 74
tort claims for in lieu of spousal support, 253	Aquinas, Saint Thomas
African-Americans	on obligation
cohabitation, growth among, 273	generally, 33
Agency law	in Summa Theologica, 33
doctrine of necessities under	Aristotle
generally, 200	on equality, 292
"compulsory agency" theory, 200	on fairness, 401
Alcohol abuse	on obligation, 33
caretaking requirement for "de facto" parents,	Arizona
exception to in cases of, 96	covenant marriage in, 265, 359
ALI Principles. See specific topic concerned	Arkansas
* * *	
Alimony. See Spousal support Alternating residence. See Joint custody	covenant marriage in, 265, 359
•	Ascription
Alternative dispute resolution	Canada, as legal model for living under "Beyond
in child support	Conjugality" Report in, 368, 369
advantages of, 417, 418	Assisted reproduction
lack of serious use of, 422	and volitional child support obligation, 137, 138
overview, 410	Assumption of parental role
mediation (See Mediation)	agreements, 52
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23	parenthood based on, 53
Amato, Paul	same-sex couples, 52
on divorce, 264	surrogate parents, 52
on shared parenting and parental responsibility, 462	Asymmetric parenthood, 121, 141
American Law Institute Principles. See specific topic	Attempted murder
concerned	division of property, effect on under Principles, 184,
Anderson, Kermyt G.	185
on importance of biological ties to parental	Attorneys
involvement, 102, 106	protection of interests of children by

507

Attorneys (cont.)	Beck, Ulrich
generally, 83	on shared parenting and changes in attitudes of
balancing parental rights with, 83, 84, 87	fathers, 468
child abuse or neglect cases, 86	Beck-Gernsheim, Elisabeth
domestic violence cases, 86	on shared parenting and changes in attitudes of
guardians <i>ad litem</i> compared, 84	fathers, 468
judicial discretion in appointing, 85, 86	Becker, Mary
neutral experts compared, 86, 87	on "maternal deference" standard, 68
in Wisconsin, 83	Belgium
Australia	polygamy in, 1
aboriginal populations, cohabitation among, 314	Benefits of marriage to children, 324
Australian Institute of Family Studies, research on	Berger, Peter L.
parental responsibility, 461	on social institutions, 501
child support in, 411	"Best interests of child" standard
cohabitation in, 5, 314	generally, 49
division of property in, 475	"approximate time" standard, relationship with, 74
Family Law Reform Act 1995, 461	"de facto" parents, inapplicable to continuing contact
joint custody in, 458, 459	with, 94
past caretaking standard in, 451	decline of, 68
recent developments in family law paralleling	flexibility of, 88
Principles, 3	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents,
shared parenting in	presumptions, 145
children, wishes of, 465	nonparents and custody, effect on, 49
community attitudes toward parental	"primary caretaker" doctrine, relationship with, 71
responsibility, changes in, 461, 462	"psychological best interests," 69
fathers, changes in attitudes of, 467	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 441, 442
Austria	and separation agreements, 388
spousal support in, 479	"tender years" doctrine, relationship with, 68
Ayres, Ian	in United Kingdom, 441, 442
on contract law in family law context, 271	"Beyond Conjugality" Report
on penalty default rules in domestic partnerships, 270	Adolphe, Jane, on, 351, 371
	ascription as legal model for living under, 368, 369
Babylon, Ancient	autonomy as philosophy behind Report, 364
contractual aspect of marriage in, 320	bias in, 366, 367
Backward-looking jurisprudence	deconstruction of marriage threatened by, 370
provisions of Principles regarding spousal support	diversity, highlighting of, 363, 364
representing (See Spousal support)	equality as philosophy behind Report
Bacon, Francis	generally, 364
on human understanding, 495	"equality within relationships," 364
Bagley, Christopher	"relational equality," 364
on sexual abuse of children, 109	equivalence of marriage and other relationships
Baker, Katharine A.  "de feete" percents on shild support philipations of 08	under, 366 legal framework for relationships, 365
"de facto" parents, on child support obligations of, 98 on parenthood, 121, 141	legal models for living under, 367, 370
Bala, Nicholas	marriage as legal model for living under, 367, 368
domestic partnerships, on imposition of unwanted	methodology applied to statutes
obligations under Principles, 279	generally, 364, 365
Bankruptcy	alternative proposal, 366
shielding marital wealth from creditors, effect on, 204	overview, 351
Bartholet, Elizabeth	philosophy behind Report, 364
multiple parenthood, arguments against based on	principled approach to protection of other
privacy, 55	relationships by state, 363
Bartlett, Katherine	private contract as legal model for living under, 368
on "approximate time" standard, 75, 76	questions raised in, 363
Battery	registered domestic partnership as legal model for
demise of interspousal immunity, effect of on divorce,	living under, 369, 370
12	role of state in influencing formation of relationships,
effect of availability of claims for on divorce, 12	363
intentional infliction of emotional distress claims	social nature of marriage, obscuring of, 365
combined with, 12	Binary biological ideal
social consensus against, 18	and child support

Index

More information

Index 509

generally, 128, 130 Friedman v. Friedman, 335, 336 behavioral considerations ignored under Principles, Marvin v. Marvin, 333 dilution of parental authority by recognition of new Child Support Formula under Principles, 128 parents in, 65 defined, 121 domestic partnerships in, 277, 278 economic plight of children in single-parent homes fixed-share division of community property not alleviated by focus on, 129, 130 compared to division of marital property empirical evidence of decline of, 129 under Principles, 182 retention for purposes of, 128, 136 imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 155, custody, rejection for purposes of, 128 156 visitation, rejection for purposes of, 128 marital agreements in Biological parents enforceability, 386, 387 Constitutional protection of (See Parenthood) penalty clauses, 384, 386 "most appropriate" parent, determination of in, 62, 63 "de facto" parents, empirical studies comparing generally, 102, 106 multiple parenthood, criticism of in, 54 parental investment, importance of biological ties no-fault divorce, enactment of in, 252 "private ordering" in, 300, 304 to, 102, 106 wellbeing of children, importance of biological ties surrogate parents, recognition as legal parents based on assumption of parental role in, 52 to, 93, 102 Bix, Brian H. unpaid child support in, 419, 420 on domestic violence, 402 Canada ascription as legal model for living under "Beyond on premarital agreements, 358, 372, 391 Conjugality" Report, 368, 369 Blackmun, Harry on international law, 399 "Beyond Conjugality" Report (See "Beyond Blair, Tony Conjugality" Report) and Fathers4Justice, 442 Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, protection Blumberg, Grace of economic rights under, 405 Canadian Law Reform Commission (See "Beyond domestic partnerships, on inadequacy of contract law in, 337, 338 Conjugality" Report) Blumstein, Philip cohabitation in, 313 on financial attitudes in cohabitation, 310, 311 division of property in, 475 Bolen, Rebecca domestic partnerships in Adolphe, Jane, on, 351, 371 on sexual abuse of children, 110 "Bounded rationality" "Beyond Conjugality" Report, as legal model for overstatement of problems with, 379, 380 living under, 369, 370 and premarital agreements, 375 obligations of parties under Principles compared, Brennan, William J. 280 same-sex couples, 281, 283 on decline of family as social institution, 504 Breyer, Stephen underprotection of parties under Principles Grutter v. Bollinger, citation of international law in, compared, 269 399 marriage as legal model for living under "Beyond Brinig, Margaret F. Conjugality" Report, 367, 368 on cohabitation, 276 premarital agreements in on domestic partnerships, 269, 283 Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Burke, Edmund protection of economic rights under, 405 on elitism, 489 not binding in, 403 Bush, George W. private contract as legal model for living under "Beyond Conjugality" Report, 368 interdependence of marriage, 292 Bush, Laura rights of nonresidential parents, United Kingdom interdependence of marriage, 292 compared, 443 same-sex couples in, 1, 281, 283 **Bush Administration** marriage initiatives, Principles neglecting as shared parenting in, 465 alternative to divorce, 24 Carbone, June Buss, Emily on gender wars, 392 child rearing rights of biological parents, on on spousal support, 209, 233 protection of, 54 spousal support, on kinds of compensable losses Constitutional formula for recognition of within, 259 parenthood, on problems with, 60 Care givers acknowledgment of paternity, effect of on custody, 49

as "de facto parents," 50

under existing custody law, 49, 50

California

cohabitation in

Care givers (cont.)	Indiana, proposed rule in, 423
former care givers as "de facto" parents (See "De	interim orders, need for, 423
facto" parents)	legal system, inability of to reform family law, 420,
legal parents, advantages of recognition as, 65, 66	421
past caretaking standard (See Past caretaking	overview, 410, 411
standard)	problem-solving courts, use of, 422
"primary caretaker" doctrine (See "Primary caretaker"	conflict between parents, existing law encouraging,
doctrine)	410
as "psychological parents," 50	Corrigan, Maura D., on, 409, 424
relaxation of traditional preference against in custody	culture of domestic relations litigation, need for
matters, 50	changing, 410
same-sex couples as, 49	custody, differential treatment under Principles
Catholic law	generally, 133
contractual aspect of marriage under, 319	Miller v. Miller, 135, 136
Chambers, David	parents by estoppel defined differently, 124
on changes in family law, 505	"de facto" parents, obligations of, 98
Chaskalson, Arthur	decline of two-parent family
on enforcement of economic rights, 406	failure to address in Principles, 412, 413
Child abuse	Wilson, James Q., on, 413, 414, 415
caretaking requirement for "de facto" parents,	default judgments, problems with
exception to in cases of, 96	generally, 418, 420
protection of interests of children by appointment of	early involvement of fathers as alternative to, 419
attorneys or guardians ad litem, 86	hiding or flight of obligors, encouraging of, 419
Wald, Michael, on, 497	lack of immediate payments under, 418
Child care	overview, 410
imputation of income to stay-at-home parents (See	unemployed fathers, difficulties obtaining money
Imputation of income to stay-at-home	from, 419
parents)	early involvement of fathers as alternative to default
Child custody. See custody	judgments, 419
Child marriage	economic impact of family fragmentation
India, Child Marriage Restraint Act of 1929, 399	generally, 413
UNICEF Report on Child Marriage, 399	demographic statistics, 414
Child neglect	middle class, harm to, 413
caretaking requirement for "de facto" parents,	out-of-wedlock births, statistics on, 414
exception to in cases of, 96	and poverty, 413, 414
protection of interests of children by appointment of	single-parent households and poverty, statistics on
attorneys or guardians ad litem, 86	414
Wald, Michael, on, 497	Ellman, Mark Ira, on child support and spousal
Child support	support, 253
generally, 121, 161	emotional impact of family fragmentation
alternative dispute resolution in	generally, 415, 418
advantages of, 417, 418	alternative dispute resolution, advantages of, 417,
lack of serious use of, 422	418
mediation	children blaming selves for dissolution, 415
Indiana, proposed rule in, 423	empirical research on, 415
lack of mention in Principles, 417	guidance for parents, need for, 418
slowness of, 423	and lingering conflict, 417
overview, 410	mediation, lack of mention in Principles, 417
alternative methods for improving system, 139	minimization of, need for legal processes designed
assisted reproduction and volitional obligation, 137,	for, 415
138	protection of individual interests of parents,
in Australia, 411	overemphasis on, 416
bargaining for custody under Principles, 140	and unmarried parents, 416
and binary biological ideal (See Binary biological	emotional needs of children outweighing financial
ideal)	needs of children under Principles, 133, 134,
Child Support Formula under Principles and binary	136
biological ideal, 128	estoppel, parenthood by
conciliatory process, proposal of	defined differently than for custody and visitation,
generally, 420, 423	124
benefits to children under, 421	rarity of obligation to pay under Principles, 124, 12.



as relationship category for purposes of, 124 Etzioni, Amitai, on, 135	visitation, differential treatment under Principles generally, 133
expansion of state power under Principles, effect of,	Miller v. Miller, 135, 136
130, 133	parents by estoppel defined differently, 124
and family fragmentation	volitional obligation
economic impact, 413	generally, 136, 139
emotional impact, 415, 418	affirmative conduct requirement, 136
formula in Principles, 413, 414	agreement requirement, 136
functional approach, dangers of, 139, 140	arbitrariness, 138
Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich, on, 135	and assisted reproduction, 137, 138
hiding or flight of obligors, default judgments as	inconsistency with other treatment of obligation in
encouraging, 419	Principles, 138, 139
imbalance between parental rights and obligations	problems with requiring intent, 137, 138, 140, 141
under Principles	voluntary payments in excess of requirements, 412
generally, 121, 141	"Children's rights" movement, 69
child support, relationship categories for purposes	Cicero
of, 124, 126	on adultery, 43
custody and visitation, relationship categories for	on shame and family, 43
purposes of, 122, 124	"Civil Covenant"
overview, 121, 122	generally, 397
improvements in enforcement efforts, 418, 419	overlap with "Economic Covenant," 397, 398
imputation of income to stay-at-home parents (See	Civil law
Imputation of income to stay-at-home	contractual aspect of marriage under, 319
parents)	Civil unions
inadequate payments to children, recognition in	in Connecticut
Principles, 411, 412	and Equal Protection, 281
interim orders, need for, 423	obligations of parties under Principles compared,
	280
interstate collection, difficulties with, 420 judicial perspectives, 409, 424	in Vermont
legal parents as relationship category for purposes of, 124	and Equal Protection, 280, 281
	obligations of parties under Principles compared, 280
Locke, John, on, 135 mediation in	Classical liberalism
Indiana, proposed rule in, 423	and marriage, 256
lack of mention in Principles, 417 slowness of, 423	Clinton, Bill
	independence of marriage, 292
in Michigan, 409, 410	Clinton, Hillary independence of marriage, 292
political difficulties in implementing Principles, 412	1
under Principles	Clinton Administration
generally, 411, 413	marriage initiatives, Principles neglecting as
decline of two-parent family, failure to address, 412,	alternative to divorce, 24, 25
413	Codebtors
inadequate payments to children, recognition in	spouses as, effect on shielding marital wealth from
Principles, 411, 412	creditors, 206
political difficulties in implementing, 412	Coercion
right of noncustodial parent to higher standard of	adjustments to marital agreements and, difficulties in
living, problems with priority of, 412	applying commercial principles to, 383
and "private ordering," 287	Cohabitation. See also Domestic partnerships
relationship categories for purposes of, 122, 124	African-Americans, growth among, 273
right of noncustodial parent to higher standard of	assimilation into marriage, effect of Principles as, 305
living, problems with priority of in Principles,	in Australia
412	generally, 5, 314
surrogate parents and volitional obligation, 137, 138	aboriginal populations, among, 314
and two-parent model (See Binary biological ideal)	blurring of distinction with marriage, 346
unemployed fathers, difficulties obtaining money	Brinig, Margaret F., on, 276
from, 419	in California
unpaid child support	Friedman v. Friedman, 335, 336
in California, 419, 420	Marvin v. Marvin, 333
government payments substituting for, 415	in Canada, 313
statistics on, 414, 415	childbearing less likely than in marriage, 308, 312

Cohabitation (cont.)	financial attitudes, 310, 312
commitment	Kiernan, Kathleen, on, 275
impact of provisions of Principles regarding	in Sweden, 275
cohabitation on, 232	Marvin v. Marvin
marriage compared, 274, 276, 309	generally, 214, 276, 333
common law partnerships, claims based on, 336	and contractual rights, 321
compensation for services, post-relationship claims	Morone v. Morone, 336
for, 335	in New York, 336
conduct, financial claims based on, 334, 335	in New Zealand
constructive trusts, claims based on, 321, 336,	generally, 314
362	aboriginal populations, among, 314
and contract law	Nock, Steven L., on, 276
generally, 271, 273	post-Marvin cases, 335, 337
agreements between cohabitants treated like	prevention of exploitation in as goal of Principles, 230
premarital agreements under Principles,	and "private ordering," 288, 289
problems with, 341, 342	prosperity, marriage compared, 308, 323
family law, greater flexibility than, 271	purchase money resulting trusts, claims based on, 321
contribution, claims based on, 336	putative spouse doctrine, 362
as "de facto" parents (See "De facto" parents)	quality of relationship, marriage compared, 312
default terms, imposition of, 229, 230	quantum meruit, claims based on, 321, 336, 362
dependent partners, greater financial protection of in marriage, 346, 347	reasons for preferring as alternative to marriage, 269, 270
destigmatization of as goal of Principles, 230	restitution, claims based on, 336
disagreement between partners as to nature of	same-sex couples ( <i>See</i> Same-sex couples)
relationship, 316	and "selection" effects of marriage, 324, 325, 327
division of property, relationship to under Principles,	and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 206
163, 164	Smock, Pamela, on, 311, 313
divorce, resulting from high rate of, 277	stability, marriage compared, 273, 275, 276, 312
domestic violence, greater incidence in than in	statistics regarding, 333, 334
marriage, 273, 274, 309, 323	typical post-relationship claims, 334
duration, marriage compared, 273, 307, 308	unjust enrichment, avoiding, 321, 362
economic disadvantages of, 276	U.S. Fragile Family Study, 312
Ellman, Ira Mark, on anecdotal evidence of marriage	wrong message about marriage and cohabitation,
developing from, 314	Principles conveying, 322, 327
enforcement problems of post-relationship claims,	Colorado
337	marital property, property acquired in contemplation
in Europe, 313	of marriage deemed in, 167
existing state of law, 277, 281	Commitment
expectation of marriage in, 313	and cohabitation
express agreements, enforceability, 334	impact of provisions of Principles regarding
fairness as underlying basis for treatment under	cohabitation on, 232
Principles, 221, 222	marriage compared, 274, 276, 309
financial attitudes compared with marriage	fault, effect of treatment of under Principles on, 232,
generally, 310, 312	233
Blumstein, Philip, on, 310, 311	Frank, Robert, on importance of, 230, 231
Schwartz, Pepper, on, 310, 311	Scott, Elizabeth, on importance of, 231, 232
in Sweden, 312	spousal support, importance to (See Spousal support)
in France, 5	Common law marriage
Friedman v. Friedman, 335, 336	and contractual aspect of marriage, 319
health, marriage compared, 323	and domestic partnerships
implied contract, claims based on, 334, 335	advantages of common law marriage over, 429, 430
individualistic ethic in, 313	431
infidelity, greater incidence than in marriage, 309	evidentiary problems with factual inquiries,
in Latin America, 314	analogy to, 316
legislative response, considerations in, 273, 274	instability of, analogy to, 306, 307
Manning, Wendy D., on, 311, 313 marital property, property acquired prior to marriage	not constituting revival of common law marriage, 346
in domestic partnership deemed, 166	waiting period for domestic partnerships, problems
marriage, differences from	compared with, 318
generally, 274, 277	evidentiary problems with factual inquiries, analogy
empirical studies difficulties with 274 275	to domestic partnerships 316

instability of, analogy to domestic partnerships, 306,	Contract law
307	biological parents contracting for rights as
mutual intention requirement, 426	relationship category for purposes of custody
present intention requirement, 426	and visitation, 123
problems in determining existence of, 426	Blumberg, Grace, on inadequacy of in domestic
in South Carolina, 425, 426	partnerships, 337, 338
Toal, Jean Hoefer, on, 425, 431	Canada, private contract as legal model for living
waiting period for domestic partnerships, problems	under "Beyond Conjugality" Report in, 368
compared with, 318	and cohabitation
Common law partnerships	generally, 271, 273
cohabitants, claims based on, 336	agreements between cohabitants treated like
Community property	premarital agreements under Principles,
fixed-share division of community property	problems with, 341, 342
compared to division of marital property	family law, greater flexibility than, 271
under Principles	and domestic partnerships
in California, 182	agreements between cohabitants treated like
in Louisiana, 182	premarital agreements under Principles,
in New Mexico, 182	problems with, 341, 342
and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 198	existing remedies, Principles adding nothing to,
Comparative Constitutionalism (Dorsen), 396	321
Compensable losses	obligations under Principles not based on, 428
in spousal support (See Spousal support)	viewed as inadequate under Principles, 337
Compensation for services	Dorsen, Norman, on, 396
cohabitants, post-relationship claims for, 335	Ellman, Ira Mark, on inadequacy of in domestic
recharacterization of separate property as marital	partnerships, 337, 338
property, problems with Principles, 193	enforcement aspect of contracts
Compensatory payments. See Spousal support	generally, 285
'Compulsory agency" theory	and premarital agreements, 286
and doctrine of necessities, 200	and family law
Conference of Chief Justices	generally, 271, 273
child support and problem-solving courts, 422	Ayres, Ian, on, 271
Conference of State Court Administrators	cohabitation, less flexibility than, 271
child support and problem-solving courts, 422	Gernter, Robert, on, 271
Confucianism	fault, failure to consider contract law as problem with
honor and family in, 42	critique of in Principles, 15
Connecticut	historical tradition of marriage as contractual, 319,
civil unions for same-sex couples in	320
and Equal Protection, 281 obligations of parties under Principles compared,	implied contract theory for domestic partnerships (See Implied contract theory for domestic
280	partnerships)
Consent	intimate relationships, difficulties in application to,
and marriage, 354, 355	295, 296
premarital agreements, informed consent requirement	Joo, Thomas, on, 285
generally, 375	Maine, Henry, on, 295
rebuttable presumption of, 375, 376	marital agreements (See Marital agreements)
Consideration	and Married Women's Property Acts, 295
marital agreements, required in, 383, 384	Marvin v. Marvin and, 321
Constitutional law	premarital agreements ( <i>See</i> Premarital agreements)
biological parents, protection of (See Parenthood)	"private ordering" (See "Private ordering")
decision-making regarding marriage as 14th	Rawls, John, on, 286
Amendment liberty interest, 320, 327,	relational aspect of contracts
329	generally, 285, 286
Due Process (See Due Process)	and parenthood by estoppel, 290
Equal Protection (See Equal Protection)	same-sex couples, inadequacy of, 321
religious freedom, 395	separation agreements ( <i>See</i> Separation agreements)
Constructive fraud	spousal support, preclusion as underlying theory of,
and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 200	257
Constructive trusts	sui generis contract, marriage as, 356, 357, 358
cohabitants, claims based on, 321, 336, 362	two distinct understandings of contract, 285
Continuing contact with children	Contribution
"de facto" parents (See "De facto" parents)	cohabitants, claims based on, 336

Contributions of spouses	and constructive fraud, 200
division of property, as basis of (See Division of	divorce, view of by creditors
property)	generally, 202, 205
spousal support, as basis of (See Spousal support)	exclusivity of remedy, 202, 204
Convention on Intercountry Adoption, 399	marriage, comparison of effect of, 202
Convention on Maintenance, 400	secured creditors, effect of divorce on, 204
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of	unsecured creditors, effect of divorce on, 204, 205
Discrimination Against Women. See	and doctrine of necessities
"Women's Covenant" and premarital	generally, 200, 201
agreements	under agency law, 200
Convention on the Recognition of Foreign Judgments,	"compulsory agency" theory, 200
393	equal protection considerations, 200, 201
Corporations	quasi-contractual obligations, 200
international human rights agreements, model codes	and domestic partners, 206, 207
of conduct respecting, 398	exempt property, 197, 198
Corrective justice	fraudulent transfers, 200
generally, 472, 487	individual liability, 196, 202
move toward under Principles, 473, 474, 479	interest rates, role of, 197
Corrigan, Maura D.	liens, role of, 197, 204
on child support, 409, 424	marriage, view of by creditors
Cost-benefit analysis	generally, 202, 205
premarital agreements, regarding enforceability of	divorce, comparison of effect of, 202
generally, 380	overview, 195, 196, 207
inability of parties to protect interests, 380	Reilly, Marie T., on, 195, 207
social benefits to marriage, 380	secured creditors, effect of divorce on, 204
third parties, presence of, 380	sureties, spouses as, 196
Covenant marriage	and tenancy by the entirety, 198
in Arizona, 265, 359	and tenancy in common, 198, 199
in Arkansas, 265, 359	unsecured creditors, effect of divorce on, 204, 205
declaration of intent, 265	vicarious liability, 200
hostility of Principles regarding covenant marriage,	Criminal justice system
359	preference for, 13
in Louisiana, 265, 268, 359	problems with reliance on, 171, 173
mandatory premarital counseling, 265, 359, 377	and prosecutorial discretion, 172
more restrictive divorce grounds, 265, 359, 377	Crippen, Gary
and premarital agreements	on past caretaking standard, 450
generally, 377, 378	Custody
hostility of Principles regarding premarital	generally, 47, 120
agreements toward, 359	actual parenting concept, 70
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23, 24	"approximate time" standard (See "Approximate
and spousal support, 265, 268	time" standard)
unenforceability under Principles, 377	balance between doctrinal rule and judicial discretion,
Coverture, 294, 295	68
Craft, John	bargaining for child support under Principles, 140
on sexual abuse of children, 108	Becker, Mary, on "maternal deference" standard,
Creditors, shielding marital wealth from	68
generally, 195, 207	"best interests of child" standard (See "Best interests
bankruptcy, effect of, 204	of child" standard)
change in divorce law contemplated in Principles,	binary biological ideal rejected for purposes of, 128
effect of	and care givers (See Care givers)
generally, 205, 207	child support, differential treatment under Principles
and cohabitants, 206	generally, 133
and domestic partners, 206, 207	Miller v. Miller, 135, 136
codebtors, spouses as, 206	
and cohabitants, 206	parents by estoppel defined differently, 124 and "children's rights" movement, 69
collaborative relationship of debtors	"de facto" parents ( <i>See</i> "De facto" parents) division of under Principles, 51
generally, 196	*
"marital like" collaboration, 199	emotional needs of children outweighing financial
nature of collaboration, relevance of, 201, 202	needs of children under Principles, 133, 134,



estoppel, parenthood by as relationship category for	generally, 48
purposes of	"best interests of child" standard, relationship with
generally, 123	68
parents by estoppel defined differently than for	decline of, 68
child support, 124	"primary caretaker" doctrine, relationship with, 70
expansion of state power under Principles, effect of	third-party custody concept as alternative to test for
generally, 130, 133	status as "de facto" parents, 119
Painter v. Bannister, 132	two-parent model rejected for purposes of, 128
"friendly parent" doctrine	uncertain rules, impact of, 68
generally, 71, 74	"winner/loser" mentality, moving away from, 70
in Missouri, 73	Custody evaluators
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act not adopting,	protection of interests of children by, 83
73	Czapanskiy, Karen
and grandparents	"de facto" parents, on problems regarding autonomy
Painter v. Bannister, 132	of, 99
•	01, 99
under Principles, 132	Desire Christia
historical context, 67, 78	Davies, Christie
joint custody (See Joint custody)	on shame, 40
Kornhauser, Lewis A., on impact of uncertain rules, 68	"De facto" parents
legal parents as relationship category for purposes of,	generally, 50, 53
123	absence of mother, risk of sexual abuse of children
Levy, Robert J., on, 67, 89	during, 112, 115
Maryland, functional approach in, 139	adult not residing with child from infancy, risk of
"maternal deference" standard, 68	sexual abuse of children by, 115, 116
mediation	agreement requirement, 94, 95
Grillo, Trina, on, 69	Anderson, Kermyt G., on importance of biological ties
Schepard, Andrew, on, 69	to parental involvement, 102, 106
mental health professionals, proposals by, 69, 70	attachment as important factor in continuing contact
Mnookin, Robert H., on impact of uncertain rules, 68	with, 117
necessity of identifying parents, 48	attractiveness of single mothers to sex offenders
and nonparents	targeting children, 110, 112
"best interests of child" standard, 49	autonomy of, problems with, 99
extraordinary circumstances, awarding custody in,	Bagley, Christopher, on risk of sexual abuse of
49	children, 109
preference for parents over, 49	Baker, Katharine A., on child support obligations of,
Painter v. Bannister, 132	98
parenthood under existing custody law, 48, 50	"best interest of child" standard inapplicable to
parenting plans (See Parenting plans)	continuing contact with, 94
past caretaking standard (See Past caretaking	biological parents, empirical studies comparing
standard)	generally, 102, 106
preference for parents over nonparents, 49	parental investment, importance of biological ties
and preference of children, 69	
	to, 102, 106
"primary caretaker" doctrine	wellbeing of children, importance of biological ties
generally, 70, 71	to, 93, 102
"best interests of child" standard, relationship with,	Bolen, Rebecca, on risk of sexual abuse of children, 110
71	care givers as, 50
"degendered maternal presumption," 70	caretaking requirement
problems with, 71	generally, 94, 95, 96
"tender years" doctrine, relationship with, 70	exceptions to, 96
protection of interests of children in (See Protection of	child support obligations of, 98
interests of children)	cohabitants, risk of sexual abuse of children by, 107,
psychiatrists, proposals by, 69, 70	110
psychologists, proposals by, 69, 70	Constitutional protection of biological parents, legal
quasi-property rights of fathers, 68	status of precluded by, 54
relationship categories for purposes of, 122, 124	continuing contact with children
shared parenting (See Shared parenting)	attachment as important factor in, 117
substantive standards for awarding	"best interest of child" standard inapplicable to, 94
generally, 67, 78	criticism of Principles, 99, 100
difficulties in drafting, 87	failure to consider negative repercussions in
"tender years" doctrine	Principles, 101

De facto" parents (cont.)	and "private ordering," 290, 291
magnitude of shift proposed by Principles, 98	private right of action under Principles, 97
negative repercussions of, 106, 117	problems with expansion of rights for
overview, 119, 120	generally, 90, 94
"psychological parent" requirement, 117, 118	Eekelaar, John, on, 92
treatment of in Principles, 94, 98	residency requirement, 94
unadulterated good, seen as in Principles, 94, 101	in Rhode Island, 3, 52
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act compared, 98	rights of in Principles, 51
Craft, John, on risk of sexual abuse of children, 108	Russell, Diana, on risk of sexual abuse of children, 107
criticism of treatment of under Principles, 99, 100	Salter, Anna, on risk of sexual abuse of children, 111
custody, as relationship category for purposes of, 123,	San Francisco, empirical studies on sexual abuse of
124	children in, 107
Czapanskiy, Karen, on problems regarding autonomy	secondary status under Principles, 51
of, 99	sexual abuse of children, risk of (See Sexual abuse of
defined in Principles, 51	children)
_	·
dilution of parental authority by recognition of	standing concept as alternative to test for status, 117,
generally, 64, 66 in California, 65	
	stepparents, risk of sexual abuse of children by, 107,
Constitution, permissible under, 64, 65	110
intermediate scrutiny standard	substantive rights under Principles
generally, 64, 65	generally, 97
Principles, adoption in, 65	encouragement of litigation as problem with, 100
encouragement of litigation as problem with	test for status
substantive rights of, 100	generally, 94
failure of test for status to separate good risk from	agreement requirement, 94, 95
bad, 117	caretaking requirement
Fergusson, David, on risk of sexual abuse of children,	generally, 94, 95, 96
107	exceptions to, 96
Finkelhor, David, on risk of sexual abuse of children,	failure to separate good risk from bad, 117
115	intervention concept as alternative to, 118, 119
Herman, Judith, on risk of sexual abuse of children,	refining to minimize harm while preserving good,
112	117, 119
Hirschman, Lisa, on risk of sexual abuse of children,	residency requirement, 94
112	standing concept as alternative to, 117, 118
Hofferth, Sandra L., on importance of biological ties	third-party custody concept as alternative to, 119
to parental involvement, 102, 106	third-party custody concept as alternative to test for
inability of biological parents to excise from lives, 99	status, 119
intervention concept as alternative to test for status,	treatment of under Principles
118, 119	generally, 94, 98
King, Kathleen, on risk of sexual abuse of children, 96	criticism of, 99, 100
Lamb, Kathleen A., on importance of biological ties to	failure to consider negative repercussions, 101
wellbeing of children, 93, 102	in United Kingdom
Levy, Robert J., on exceptions to caretaking	generally, 441
requirement for, 96	empirical studies on sexual abuse of children in, 109
in Maine, 52	visitation, as relationship category for purposes of, 123
majority of custodial responsibility precluded, 97	Wallerstein, Judith, on risk of sexual abuse of children,
Manning, Wendy D., on importance of biological ties	111
to wellbeing of children, 93, 102	Williams, Linda, on risk of sexual abuse of children,
Margolin, Leslie, on risk of sexual abuse of children,	115
108	Wilson, Robin Fretwell, on, 90, 120
in Massachusetts, 3, 52	Wisconsin, rights of in, 117 Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of
Murphy, Jane, on case law regarding, 98	
negative repercussions of continuing contact with,	Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on
106, 117	Religious Belief, 395
New Zealand, empirical studies on sexual abuse of	Default judgments
children in, 107	child support (See Child support)
Oregon, rights of in, 117	Default rules
presumptive access to records precluded, 116	in domestic partnerships (See Domestic partnerships)
presumptive entitlement to decision-making	imposition in spousal support (See Spousal support)
responsibility precluded, 97	Deinstitutionalization of marriage



in Europe, 275, 276	corrective justice
Dekeuwer-Défossez, Françoise	generally, 472, 487
on joint custody, 460	move toward under Principles, 473, 474, 479
Denmark	criticism of Principles
division of property in, 473	generally, 179, 181, 193, 194
same-sex couples in, 275	autonomy, curtailing of, 179, 180
Denning, Lord	inaccurate assumptions regarding no-fault divorce,
on fault in spousal support and division of property in	180
United Kingdom, 436	internal inconsistency, 180
Dewar, John	interstate uniformity, failure to promote, 179
on parenthood, 469	judicial discretion, insufficient limitation on, 179,
Dilution of parental authority	180, 181, 183
in California, 65	uninformed treatment of economic matters, 180
Constitution, permissible under, 64, 65	Damone v. Damone, 173
intermediate scrutiny standard	in Denmark, 473
generally, 64, 65	dissipation of assets, in cases of
Principles, adoption in, 65	generally, 167, 169
by recognition of new parents, 64, 66	in Illinois, 168
Dissipation of assets. See Waste of assets	invasion of separate property, 168, 169
Dissolution	in Kentucky, 168
limitation of mission of ALI to, 215	treatment in Principles, 168
reason for use of term in Principles, 164	distributive justice
Distributive justice	generally, 472
generally, 472	move away from under Principles, 473, 474, 479
move away from under Principles, 473, 474, 479	in domestic partnerships, 361, 427
Division of property	dramatic departure from mainstream family law,
generally, 163, 207	Principles as, 181
alimony, relationship with, 183	educational degrees, 185
in Australia, 475	Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 173
autonomy, curtailing of as criticism of Principles, 179,	equitable distribution
180	and adjustment of behavior
"balance sheet" concept, 434	generally, 483, 487
Blanchard v. Blanchard, 173	inadequacy of results, 486
in Canada, 475	under Principles, 486
characterization of property upon dissolution, 185,	general rule, 185, 186
193	overview, 487, 488
cohabitants, relationship to under Principles, 163, 164	rarely applied to, 166
Colorado, property acquired in contemplation of	Uniform Probate Code compared, 182, 183
marriage deemed marital property in, 167	waste of assets, in cases of, 167, 169
consumption unit, spouses as, 484, 485, 486	fairness as underlying concern regarding, 216, 219
context, placing Principles in, 166, 173	and fault
contributions of spouses as basis of	generally, 169, 173
generally, 473	attempted murder, 184, 185
child care, 475, 477, 478	"catchall" factor, 169, 170
"comparison model," 474, 475	when consideration always required, 169
consumption, effect of, 476, 477	criminal justice system, problems with reliance on,
"contribution model," 477, 478, 479, 487	171, 173
economic contributions, importance of, 484	elimination from consideration under Principles,
equal contribution rule, rejection of in Principles,	184, 185
474	Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 250
housework, 475, 478	murder, 184, 185
indirect contributions	in New York, 169, 170, 171
	Principles, rejection of consideration of fault under
generally, 475, 477, 487	169, 170
in Australia, 475 in Canada, 475	prosecutorial discretion, 172
	1
in Norway, 475, 476	relationship to under Principles, 164
in United Kingdom, 475	relevant fault, consideration required, 169
labor, 474, 475	Swisher, Peter Nash, on, 170, 171
Silbaugh, Katharine B., on, 484	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, rejection of
valuation of, 473, 474, 479	consideration of fault under, 169

Division of property (cont.)	perception of unfairness, 178
financial misconduct justifying unequal division, 186, 191	unpredictability of economic consequences of dissolution, 177, 178
in Finland, 473	need as alternative ground for under Uniform
Garrison, Marsha, on insufficient limitation on	Marriage and Divorce Act, 218
judicial discretion in, 181	in Netherlands, 473
in Germany, 473	nonfinancial matters, exclusion from consideration,
gifts	236
deemed separate property for purposes of division	in North Dakota, 174
of property, 166	in Norway
recharacterization as marital property, problems	generally, 473
with Principles, 192, 193	indirect contributions of spouses, 475, 476
Glendon, Mary Ann, on insufficient limitation on	objective of Principles, 179
judicial discretion in, 182, 183	O'Brien v. O'Brien, 169, 170
Gregory, John DeWitt, on, 163, 175	Partyka, In re, 168
Havell v. Islam, 170, 171	premarital agreements, relationship to under
Holman v. Holman, 174	Principles, 164
houses, effect of ownership of on, 484, 485, 486, 487	professional licenses, 185
Illinois, equitable distribution of property in cases of	radical paternalism, Principles as model of, 163, 175
waste of assets, 168	rational behind Principles, 183, 185
impact of Principles, gauging	rational for imposing obligations under Principles,
generally, 173, 174	434, 435
potential impact of, 167	and reciprocity, 487, 488
inaccurate assumptions regarding no-fault divorce as	Robinette v. Robinette, 168
criticism of Principles, 180	separate property (See Separate property)
income tax treatment of, 183, 184	shielding marital wealth from creditors (See Creditors
inconsistency between Principles and settled law, 167	shielding marital wealth from)
inheritances deemed separate property, 166	spousal support, relationship with
interdependence between work of spouses ignored in	generally, 183
Principles, 484	under Principles, 163
internal inconsistency as criticism of Principles, 180	Sverdup, Tone, on, 472, 488
interstate uniformity, failure to promote as criticism	in Sweden, 473
of Principles, 179	and time factor, 487, 488
invasion of separate property in cases of waste of	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, need as
assets, 168, 169	alternative ground for under, 218
investment unit, spouses as, 484, 485, 486	uninformed treatment of economic matters as
in Ireland, 473	criticism of Principles, 180
judicial discretion, insufficient limitation on as	in United Kingdom ( <i>See</i> United Kingdom)
criticism of Principles	in Vermont, 173
generally, 179, 180	waste of assets, in cases of
division of community property compared, 182	generally, 167, 169
elective share compared, 182	in Illinois, 168
intestacy compared, 182	invasion of separate property, 168, 169
Uniform Probate Code compared, 182, 183	in Kentucky, 168
in Kentucky	treatment in Principles, 168
generally, 174	Weber v. Weber, 174
equitable distribution of property in cases of waste	Westfall, David, on
of assets, 168	generally, 176, 194
Kittridge v. Kittridge, 174	problems with quorum requirement for ALI
lack of influence of Principles over, 173, 174, 175	proceedings, 164, 165, 176, 177
in Louisiana, 173	Divorce
marital property (See Marital property)	Amato, Paul, on, 264
Marriage of Altman, In re, 167	cohabitation resulting from high rate of, 277
Marriage of O'Neill, In re, 168	covenant marriage, more restrictive divorce grounds,
in Massachusetts, 174	265, 359
necessity for serious reform of family law	creditors' view of
	generally, 202, 205
generally, 177, 185	ę ,
disparity of results between states, 178	exclusivity of remedy, 202, 204
expenses and time involved in proceedings, 177, 178 lack of guidance, 177	marriage, comparison of effect of, 202 secured creditors, effect of divorce on, 204
IACK OI EMINGIICE, 1//	secured elections, effect of anyone our 404

Index 519

unsecured creditors, effect of divorce on, 204, 205 and contract law agreements between cohabitants treated like default rules for financial protection of parties, 347 fault (See Fault) premarital agreements under Principles, grounds for as fault-based, 319 problems with, 341, 342 existing remedies, Principles adding nothing to, 321 mixed state of divorce law, 249 protection of interests of children in (See Protection of obligations under Principles not based on, 428 interests of children) viewed as inadequate under Principles, 337 Divorce Culture, The (Whitehead) creation of under Principles, 338, 339, 360, 361, 426, on autonomy model of family, 214 Doctrine of necessities dependent partners, financial protection of generally, 200, 201 greater protection of in marriage, 347, 348 under agency law, 200 under Principles, 331, 339, 340 "compulsory agency" theory, 200 rights only arising at end of relationship, less equal protection considerations, 200, 201 protection when, 348 quasi-contractual obligations, 200 devaluation of marriage, Principles as causing, 306 Doctrine of self-executing treaties disadvantages of Principles generally, 318, 327 international human rights law and incorporation of, 405, 406 erosion of integrity of law, 319, 320 Domestic partnerships. See also Cohabitation individual autonomy, conflict with, 320, 322 generally, 269, 349 wrong message about marriage and cohabitation, ability of cohabitants to fairly distribute gains and conveying, 322, 327 losses ignored in Principles, 428, 429 disagreement between partners as to nature of automatic imposition of status at termination of relationship, 316 cohabitation, 339 diversity of contemporary families, recognition of in Bala, Nicholas, on imposition of unwanted Principles, 331 obligations under Principles, 279 division of property in, 361, 427 Blumberg, Grace, on inadequacy of contract law in, Ellman, Ira Mark, on inadequacy of contract law in, 337, 338 337, 338 blurring of distinction with marriage, 346 end of relationship, rights only arising at Brinig, Margaret F., on, 269, 283 generally, 332 in California, 277, 278 dependent partners, less financial protection of, 348 in Canada equivalence as rationale behind Principles Adolphe, Jane, on, 351, 371 generally, 307, 315, 362, 363 "Beyond Conjugality" Report, as legal model for lack of empirical evidence supporting, 307 living under, 369, 370 erosion of integrity of law, Principles causing generally, 319, 320 obligations of parties under Principles compared, 280 "checkerboard" pattern of law resulting from same-sex couples, 281, 283 Principles, 312, 320 underprotection of parties under Principles evidentiary problems with factual inquiries, analogy compared, 269 to common law marriage, 316 choice, Principles not fostering, 320, 327, 329 expectations of parties, importance of enforcing, 348 "common child" for purposes of, 427 exploitation, importance of preventing, 348 "common household" for purposes of, 427 fairness as underlying basis for treatment under and common law marriage Principles, 221, 222 advantages of over domestic partnerships as Fineman, Martha, on oppression of women in proposed in Principles, 429, 430, 431 marriage, 346 evidentiary problems with factual inquiries, formality of marriage less important under Principles, analogy to, 316 instability of, analogy to, 306, 307 Garrison, Marsha, on, 305, 330 not constituting revival of common law marriage, in Hawaii, 278 implied contract theory, proposal of (See Implied waiting period for domestic partnerships, problems contract theory for domestic partnerships) compared with, 318 imposition of unwanted obligations under Principles, conduct not required under Principles, 316 269, 279, 320, 327, 329, 332 Connecticut, civil unions for same-sex couples in incontestability of status in cases of common children, and Equal Protection, 281 339, 340 obligations of parties under Principles compared, individual autonomy, Principles conflicting with, 320, 322 consistency of family law, Principles as undermining, intent not required under Principles, 316 306 intention of parties ignored under Principles, 429

Domestic partnerships (cont.)	reconstituting of family law under Principles, 361
judicial discretion regarding enforcement, 339	same-sex couples (See Same-sex couples)
judicial perspectives, 425, 431	scope of Principles, 360
legal duty, obligations under Principles not based on,	shielding marital wealth from creditors and, 206, 207
428	"significant period of time" for purposes of, 427
legislative response, considerations in, 273, 274	spousal support in, 361, 427
liberal reform, Principles not constituting, 320, 327,	state paternalism, Principles as form of, 321
329	status, obligations under Principles based on rather
"life together as a couple" for purposes of, 427	than on contract, 426
litigation, Principles as encouraging, 306, 316, 331, 340	"substantial injustice" standard for nonenforcement,
marital property, property acquired prior to marriage	Toal, Jean Hoefer, on, 425, 431
in domestic partnership deemed, 166	undermining of traditional marriage in Principles
Marvin v. Marvin, 214	criticism of, 331
more limited status than marriage, 346 in Netherlands, 275	overview, 356
in Norway, imposition of unwanted obligations under	underprotection of parties under Principles generally, 269
Principles, 269	Canada compared, 269
objectives of Principles, 360	same-sex couples, 278, 280
obligations, unorthodox manner of imposing under	in United Kingdom (See United Kingdom)
Principles, 428, 429	Vermont, civil unions for same-sex couples in
opting-out provisions	and Equal Protection, 280, 281
generally, 339	obligations of parties under Principles compared,
problems with, 317, 340, 341, 429	280
paternalistic approach of Principles, 332	waiting period, proposal for
penalty default rules under Principles	generally, 317, 318
generally, 269, 283	common law marriage, problems compared with,
assumption of contracting, problems with, 272	318
Ayres, Ian, on, 270	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 317
bargaining, injury to relationship through, 272	Wardle, Lynn D.
criticism of, 271, 272, 277	on equivalence with marriage, 362
Ertman, Martha, on, 272	on undermining of traditional marriage in
Fuller, Lon, on, 272, 273	Principles, 346, 362
Gernter, Robert, on, 270	wrong message about marriage and cohabitation,
insurance, inability of parties to obtain, 271,	Principles conveying, 322, 327
272	Domestic violence
proposal of, 270, 271	Bix, Brian H., on, 402
"worst case" scenario, lack of contemplation of, 272	caretaking requirement for "de facto" parents, exception to in cases of, 96
personal autonomy, Principles as diminishing, 306	cohabitation, greater incidence in than in marriage,
Polikoff, Nancy, on oppression of women in marriage,	273, 274, 309, 323
346	and criminal justice system, 172, 173
practicality as rationale behind Principles	protection of interests of children by appointment of
generally, 315, 318	attorneys or guardians ad litem, 86
presumptions, based on, 315, 316	Westfall, David, on, 401
presumption of, 338, 427	"Women's Covenant," as reason for incorporation of
and "private ordering," 287, 288, 289	into family law, 401, 402
property under, 361	Dorsen, Norman
public policy disadvantages under Principles generally, 318, 327	on contract law and premarital agreements, 396 Drug abuse
erosion of integrity of law, 319, 320	caretaking requirement for "de facto" parents,
individual autonomy, conflict with, 320, 322	exception to in cases of, 96
wrong message about marriage and cohabitation,	Dualist systems
conveying, 322, 327	international human rights law, incorporation of in,
quasi-contract, Principles adding nothing to existing	405
remedies, 321	Due Process
rationale behind Principles	deference to state law definition of property interests,
generally, 306, 307, 318	analogy to deference to state law definition of
equivalence, 307, 315	parenthood
practicality, 315, 318	generally, 57, 58
reasonable cohabitation period for, 338	and curtailment of existing definitions, 61, 62

Marrill Thomas on 61 62	ancial institutions
Merrill, Thomas, on, 61, 62 positivist trap, deference as, 61	social institutions distrust of in Principles, 505, 506
Duress	role of, 501, 502
premarital agreements, lack of duress requirement	technical skills and expertise as minimizing danger of,
generally, 375	494
rebuttable presumption of, 375, 376	and therapeutic individualism, 502, 505
1	and unintended consequences of laws, 497, 498
Earning capacity	in United Kingdom, 490
spousal support, compensation for loss of	working within established authority as minimizing
generally, 480, 481	danger of, 494
contributions of spouses as basis of, 481	Ellman, Ira Mark
"Economic Covenant" and premarital agreements	on classical liberal view of marriage, 256
generally, 397, 403, 405	cohabitation, on anecdotal evidence of marriage
"adequate standard of living" standard, 404	developing from, 314
economic justice, notion of, 403, 404	on consistency of law, 444
furthering Principles, incorporation of as, 404,	on criticism of fault in dissolution proceedings, 10
405	on division of property under Principles, 173
jurisprudence of monitoring bodies, 406	domestic partnerships, on inadequacy of contract law
overlap with "Civil Covenant," 397, 398	in, 337, 338
procedural requirements, 403	on egalitarian marriage, 263
reasons for incorporation of, 403, 404	on exclusion of nonfinancial matters from
"substantial injustice" standard for nonenforcement,	consideration in spousal support, 235
404	fault, on role of in division of property and spousal
unconscionability and, 404	support, 250
United States not party to, 398	on human rights law, 400, 406
Economic theory of marriage, 256 Educational degrees	on noncompensable losses, 260, 261
and division of property, 185	on premarital agreements and fairness, 393, 394 on spousal support
Eekelaar, John	child support compared, 253
"de facto" parents, on problems with expansion of	in United Kingdom, 437
rights for, 92	Embodied cognition theory, 293, 300
on United Kingdom family law and Principles, 433,	Emery, Robert
445	on shared parenting and wishes of children, 465
Egalitarian marriage	Employee stock options
generally, 256	earnings before marriage or future earnings as
advantages of, 349	separate property, problems with Principles,
Ellman, Mark Ira, on, 263	190, 191
Oldham, Thomas, on, 256	Equal Protection
Eisenhower, Dwight D.	Connecticut, same-sex couples in, 281
Truman, Harry S., on, 497	doctrine of necessities, equal protection
Elective share	considerations, 200, 201
fixed-share rule compared with division of property	Vermont, same-sex couples in, 280, 281
under Principles, 182	Equitable distribution
Elitism and law reform	in division of property (See Division of property)
and American Law Institute, 490, 491	Equivalence
and decline of marriage and parenthood, 502	domestic partnerships, as rationale behind provisions
democratic ideals, conflict with, 495	of Principles regarding
and enforcement problems, 496, 497	generally, 307, 315, 362, 363
ethos of Principles, 506	lack of empirical evidence supporting, 307
family law, special problems with, 494, 495	Ertman, Martha
historical background, 490	on penalty default rules in domestic partnerships,
homogeneity of legal academic profession, 495, 496	272
and inaccessibility of Principles, 499, 500	on "private ordering," 284, 304
international law, relationship with, 495	Establishment Clause
and legal academic profession, 495 and need for public collaboration, 498, 499	and religious freedom, 395 Estoppel, parenthood by
problems with, 491, 492	generally, 50, 53
Roe v. Wade, attitudes toward, 495	child support
Schneider, Carl E., on, 489, 506	rarity of obligation to pay under Principles, 124, 125
shift in focus from class to identity, 492, 493	as relationship category for purposes of
and social control 500 501	generally 124

Estoppel, parenthood by (cont.)	Ellman, Ira Mark, on fairness and premarital
parents by estoppel defined differently than for	agreements, 393, 394
custody and visitation, 124	premarital agreements, as underlying basis for
custody, as relationship category for purposes of	treatment under Principles, 222, 225
generally, 123	and separation agreements, 388
parents by estoppel defined differently than for	as underlying concern of Principles, 215, 216
child support, 124	Family fragmentation
defined in Principles, 51	and child support (See Child support)
dilution of parental authority by recognition of	Family law. See specific topic concerned
generally, 64, 66	Fault
Constitution, permissible under, 64, 65	generally, 9
intermediate scrutiny standard	abolition of fault forcing consideration of fault
generally, 64, 65	"underground," 17
Principles, adoption in, 65	absolutism, misunderstanding of as problem with
equivalence with legal parents under Principles, 51	critique of in Principles, 22, 23
historical development, 214	abuse of, 17
and "private ordering," 287, 290	and adultery
and relational aspect of contracts, 290	generally, 254, 255
rights of in Principles, 51	intentional infliction of emotional distress claims
United Kingdom compared, 441	based on, 12
visitation, as relationship category for purposes of	agent of morality, fault justified as, 11
generally, 123	alternatives to divorce, Principles neglecting
parents by estoppel defined differently than for	generally, 23, 25
child support, 124	alternative dispute resolution, 23
Ettelbrick, Paula	covenant marriage, 23, 24
on marriage as social institution, 505	different procedures for parties with children than
Etzioni, Amitai	for parties without children, 23
on child support, 135	mandatory mediation, 23
Europe	marriage education programs, 23
cohabitation in, 313	marriage initiatives
deinstitutionalization of marriage in, 275, 276	generally, 23, 24
recent developments in family law paralleling	Bush Administration, 24
Principles, 3	Clinton Administration, 24, 25
European Convention for the Protection of Human	marriage revitalization movement
Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	generally, 24
Ireland, dissemination of information regarding	community-based programs, 25
abortion in, 399	discussion in legal literature, 25
Lawrence v. Texas, citation of in, 399	overview, 9
nonresidential parents, contact with children under,	premarital counseling, 23
442	therapeutic jurisprudence, 23
same-sex couples under, 440	waiting periods, 23
European Court of Human Rights	battery claims
nonresidential parents, contact with children, 442	demise of interspousal immunity, effect of,
European Social Charter	12
United Kingdom, protection of economic rights in	effect of availability of on, 12
under, 405	intentional infliction of emotional distress claims
Ex live-in lovers	combined with, 12
as "de facto" parents (See "De facto" parents)	social consensus against, 18
at at moto parents (our permets parents)	causation, relationship with morality, 19, 21
Fabricius, William V.	commitment, effect of treatment of fault under
and changes in attitudes of fathers and shared	Principles on, 232, 233
parenting, 467	community standards as alternative to fault/no-fault
and wishes of children regarding shared parenting, 465	paradigm, 9, 10, 25, 26
Fairness	contract law, failure to consider as problem with
Aristotle on, 401	critique of in Principles, 15
cohabitation, as underlying basis for treatment under	criminal justice system
Principles, 221, 222	preference for, 13
division of property, underlying concern regarding,	problems with reliance on, 171, 173
216, 219	and prosecutorial discretion, 172
domestic partnerships, as underlying basis for	critique of in Principles
treatment under Principles, 221, 222	generally, 10, 23



Index 523

availability of tort claims, based on, 10 overview, 9, 16 consistency of law, based on, 10 private relational interests, misunderstanding of, Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 10 limiting compensation to financial losses, based on, public interest in marriage, failure to recognize, 18 questionable reliability of factual data, 14 10 overview, 10, 13 public interest in marriage, failure to recognize as punitive nature of, 11 problem with critique of in Principles, 18 distorted emphasis on economic considerations as punitive nature of, 11 problem with critique of in Principles, 15 questionable reliability of factual data as problem with and division of property (See Division of property) critique of in Principles, 14 divorce, grounds for, 319 and shame (See Shame) duration of marriage, effect of, 13 social consensus favoring, 17 failure to adequately address arguments in favor of and spousal support (See Spousal support) fault as problem with critique of in Principles, state-by-state analysis of role of fault generally, 11 FitzGibbon, Scott, on, 28, 45, 360 almost pure no-fault states, 11 forfeiture as alternative to tort claims, 13 full-fault states, 11 honor and ascription of fault, 35 (See also Honor) no-fault property but fault in alimony states, 11 ideological narrowness of drafters as problem with pure no-fault property and almost pure no-fault critique of in Principles, 26 alimony states, 11 increased financial needs of spouse as exception to pure no-fault states, 11 repudiation of fault in Principles, 10 tort claims intentional infliction of emotional distress claims critique of fault in Principles based on availability adultery, based on, 12 of, 10 battery claims combined with, 12 effect of availability of on, 12, 13 effect of availability of on, 12, 13 forfeiture as alternative to, 13 judicial discretion, misunderstanding of as problem preference for, 13 with critique of in Principles, 22 Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, rejection of lack of realism as problem with critique of in marital misconduct as consideration under, 10 Principles, 16, 17 Wardle, Lynn D., on generally, 27 causation, relationship with, 19, 21 and "private ordering," 304 misunderstanding of as problem with critique of in waste of assets Principles, 19, 21 as exception to repudiation of fault in Principles, nonfinancial matters, elimination of fault as 10 justification for exclusion of from social consensus against, 18 consideration in spousal support Woodhouse, Barbara Bennett, on drafters' "fear of generally, 239, 240 fault," 26 circular reasoning employed by Principles, 239 Fergusson, David on sexual abuse of children, 107 overview, 238 reluctance to investigate intimate relationships, Financial misconduct based on, 239, 240 and spousal support (See Spousal support) and obligation, 29, 34 (See also Obligation) unequal division of marital property, justifying, 186 overview, 9, 10, 26, 27 Finch, Janet and premarital agreements, 360 on obligation and time, 443 private relational interests, misunderstanding of as Fineman, Martha problem with critique of in Principles, 18, on autonomy model of family, 214 on dependency and family, 297 problems with critique of in Principles on oppression of women in marriage, 346 generally, 13, 16, 23 Finkelhor, David absolutism, misunderstanding of, 22, 23 on sexual abuse of children, 115 contract law, failure to consider, 15 Finland distorted emphasis on economic considerations, 15 division of property in, 473 failure to adequately address arguments in favor of First Amendment and religious freedom, 395 ideological narrowness of drafters, 26 FitzGibbon, Scott on fault, 28, 45, 360 judicial discretion, misunderstanding of, 22 lack of realism, 16, 17 Florida morality, misunderstanding of, 19, 21 past caretaking standard in, 3 no-fault divorce not obviating value of Forfeiture consideration of fault, 21, 22 tort claims, as alternative to, 13

Former care givers	Grutter v. Bollinger, citation of international law in,
as "de facto" parents (See "De facto" parents)	399
"Formless City"	Glendon, Mary Ann
and dissolution of family, 43	division of property, on insufficient limitation on
honor and instrumental good, 36	judicial discretion in, 182, 183
obligation	family law in perspective, 489
and instrumental good, 32	Foreword by, xiii, xv
and noninstrumental good, 33, 34	Globalization
Saxenhouse, Arlene, on, 31	and family law, 392, 396
and shamelessness, 39, 40	Good faith
Fourteenth Amendment	adjustments to marital agreements and, difficulties in
doctrine of necessities, equal protection	applying commercial principles to, 383
considerations, 200, 201	Goodwill
marriage, decision-making regarding as 14th Amendment liberty interest, 320, 327, 329	earnings before marriage or future earnings as separate property, problems with Principles,
France	189, 190
cohabitation in, 5	Grades
joint custody in, 459	"de facto" parents, empirical studies on children living
Frank, Robert	with, 102
on adaptive rationality, 231	Grandparents
on importance of commitment, 230, 231	benefits of marriage to, 326
Fraudulent transfers	and custody
and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 200	Painter v. Bannister, 132
French, Peter	under Principles, 132
on shame, 38	rights of, Constitutional deference to state law, 59
"Friendly parent" doctrine	Gregory, John DeWitt
generally, 71, 74	on division of property, 163, 175
in Missouri, 73	international human rights, on incorporation of into
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act not adopting, 73	family law, 406
Fukuyama, Francis	Grillo, Trina
on "Great Disruption," xiii	on mediation in custody matters, 69
Fuller, Lon	Guardians
on penalty default rules in domestic partnerships, 272, 273	parental rights of, Constitutional deference to state law, 56
Functional status of parenthood, 53	Guardians ad litem
Tunetional status of parentinoou, or	protection of interests of children by
Gambling	generally, 83
financial misconduct, relationship to, 246	attorneys compared, 84
Garrison, Marsha	balancing parental rights with, 83, 84, 87
division of property, on insufficient limitation on	child abuse or neglect cases, 86
judicial discretion in, 181	domestic violence cases, 86
on domestic partnerships, 305, 330	judicial discretion in appointing, 85, 86
Gays. See Same-sex couples	neutral experts compared, 86, 87
Geldof, Bob	1 1 , ,
on joint custody, 459	Hadfield, Gillian
Germany	on separation agreements, 390
division of property in, 473	Hall, Jeff A.
spousal support in, 479	and changes in attitudes of fathers and shared
Gernter, Robert	parenting, 467
on contract law in family law context, 271	and wishes of children regarding shared parenting,465
on penalty default rules in domestic partnerships,	Hawaii
270	domestic partnerships in, 278
Gifts	reciprocal beneficiaries in, 297
deemed separate property for purposes of division of	Hazard, Geoffrey
property, 166	on purposes of Principles, 215
recharacterization as marital property, problems with	Health and Human Services Department
Principles, 192, 193	unpaid child support, statistics on, 414, 415
Gilbreth, Joan	Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich
on shared parenting and parental responsibility, 462	on child support, 135
Ginsburg, Ruth Bader	Herman, Judith



on sexual abuse of children, 112	consensus among divergent systems, incorporation of
Himmelfarb, Gertrude	constituting, 397
on morality, 503	and doctrine of self-executing treaties, 405, 406
Hirschman, Lisa	dualist systems, incorporation of in, 405
on sexual abuse of children, 112	Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 400, 406
Historical background of ALI, 490, 491	existing impact of international law on family law,
Historical development of Principles, 165	399
Hofferth, Sandra L.	family privacy, incorporation of as violating, 398
on importance of biological ties to parental	globalization, effect of, 396
involvement, 102, 106	goals of Principles furthered by incorporation of, 398,
Hofstadter, Richard	400
on elitism and legal profession, 490	greater respect for American decisions by foreign
Home schooling	courts, incorporation leading to, 400
imputation of income to stay-at-home parents, effect	Gregory, John DeWitt, on, 406
of school as adequate child care alternative,	Grutter v. Bollinger, citation of international law in,
147, 148	399
Homosexuals. See Same-sex couples	how incorporation would work, 405, 406
Honor	increased participation in private international law
	regimes, incorporation leading to, 400
generally, 35, 37	Lawrence v. Texas, citation of international law in,
and ascription of fault, 35	
and civil society, 37	399
components of	monist systems, incorporation of in, 405
generally, 35	in Netherlands, 405
appreciation of respect by individual, 35	normative parameters lacking in American law, 406,
credit for fulfilling obligation, 35	407
obligation, fulfillment of, 35	overview, 392, 393
respect of society, 35	reasons for incorporation of, 393, 400
and Confucian tradition, 42	and same-sex couples, 400
and family, 41, 43	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 406
"Formless City" and instrumental good, 36	Stark, Barbara, on, 392, 407
instrumental good	vulnerable parties, protection of as justifying
generally, 36	restrictions on agreements, 394, 396
insufficiency of, 36	
nature of, 35	IIllinois
noninstrumental good, 36, 37	equitable distribution of property in cases of waste of
and obligation	assets, 168
credit for fulfilling obligation as component of	parenting plans in, 79
honor, 35	Implied bad faith
fulfillment of obligation as component of honor, 35	and premarital agreements, 394
Pericles on, 37	Implied contract theory for domestic partnerships
in Plato's <i>Republic</i> , 36	generally, 349
and reciprocity, 37	autonomy of parties, 345
and repudiation of fault in Principles, 44, 45	cohabitants, post-relationship claims based on, 334,
and shame, 37, 40	335
Wallerstein, Judith, on, 43, 44	criteria for separating marriage-like from
Wilson, James Q., on, 42	nonmarriage-like relationships, 342, 343
Houses	default rules, 332, 333, 342, 345
division of property, effect of ownership of on, effect	dependent partners, financial protection of, 347, 348
of ownership of on, 484, 485, 486, 487	existing contract law, advantages over, 343, 344
Hughes, Charles Evans	expectations of parties, enforcing, 343
American Law Institute, as incorporator of, 490	exploitation, reducing risk of, 343, 344
Human nature	financial security, improving, 344
and marriage, 352, 353	incremental rather than radical building on existing
Pannikar, Raimundo, on, 352	law, 344, 345
Human rights law and premarital agreements	liberal values, compatibility with, 345
generally, 392, 407	overview, 331, 333, 349, 362
clearer legal boundaries fostered by incorporation of,	presumptions, 342
398	Principles, advantages over, 344, 345
cognitive capacity, limits on as justifying restrictions	reasonable cohabitation period for, 342, 343, 344
on agreements, 394	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 349

Imputation of income to stay-at-home parents	exceptions for residential parents, 144, 145
generally, 142, 161	justification for differential treatment in Principles
Addington v. Addington, 154	generally, 150, 153
adequate child care alternatives, role of	avoiding gainful labor, risk of, 153
generally, 146, 148	concealing income, risk of, 153
deference to decisions of residential parents, 149	increase in household income as goal, 151
home schooling, effect of, 147, 148	more fair division of support obligation as goal,
lack of flexibility in Principles, 148	151
school, effect of, 147	responsibility considerations, 157, 160
younger and older children compared, 145, 147	risk of shirking obligations, 153, 157
Bencivenga v. Bencivenga, 155	lack of neutrality in Principles, 148
benefits of caretaking compared with increased	maximization of earnings based on residential
income, 158, 159	duties, exception for, 144, 147
best interests of child, presumptions, 145	parenting choices, 145, 146
in California, 155, 156	responsibility considerations as justification for
children under age six	differential treatment from nonresidential
children not similarly situated, 147	parents in Principles, 157, 160
exception for residential parents caring for, 144	Roberts v. Roberts, 157
older children compared, 145, 147, 160	Rohloff v. Rohloff, 153, 154
circumstances when income may be imputed, 143, 144	shirking obligations, risk of as justification for
demonstrated earning capacity, use of, 144	differential treatment of residential and
failure to differentiate between willful and	nonresidential parents in Principles
unavoidable lack of income in Principles, 151	generally, 153, 157
*	•
Guskjolen v. Guskjolen, 155, 156	avoiding gainful labor, 153
increase in household income	concealing income, 153
benefits of caretaking compared with, 158, 159	Strasser, Mark, on, 142, 161
goal of Principles, as, 151	Tetreault v. Coon, 159
justification for policy choices in Principles, 150, 160	Thomas v. Thomas, 154, 155
in Louisiana, 160	underemployment, in cases of, 143, 144
Marriage of LaBass, In re, 155, 156	unemployment, in cases of, 143, 144
Marriage of Padilla, In re, 156	in Vermont, 159
Marriage of Scott, In re, 149, 150	in Wisconsin, 157
McAlexander v. McAlexander, 154	Income
McHale v. McHale, 160	imputation to stay-at-home parents (See Imputation
in Michigan, 153, 154	of income to stay-at-home parents)
more fair division of support obligation as goal of	Income tax
Principles, 151	division of property, treatment of, 183, 184
mothers, effect of disproportionate granting of	Incommensurability
custody to, 149	spousal support (See Spousal support)
neutral position of Principles, 148, 150	tort claims, remedies for nonfinancial losses in
in New Jersey, 154, 155	compared to spousal support, 240
nonfinancial factors ignored in Principles, 152	India
in North Dakota, 155, 156	Child Marriage Restraint Act of 1929, 399
in Ohio, 154	Indiana
older children	child support, proposed rule regarding mediation in,
children under age six compared, 145, 147, 160	423
residential parent staying home with, 158	Infidelity
overview, 142, 143, 160	cohabitation, greater incidence in than in marriage,
and parenting choices	309
generally, 145, 146	and premarital agreements, 360
residential and nonresidential parents compared,	Wardle, Lynn D., on, 360
145, 146	Informal unions. See Cohabitation; Domestic
in Pennsylvania, 154	partnerships
prevailing minimum wage, use of, 144	Informed consent
rationale for in Principles	and premarital agreements
generally, 143	generally, 375
weakness of, 160, 161	rebuttable presumption of, 375, 376
residential parents versus nonresidential parents	Inheritances
children under age six, exception for residential	deemed separate property for purposes of division of
parents caring for, 144	property, 166



recharacterization as marital property, problems with	Investments
Principles, 192, 193	enhancement of marital property by spousal labor,
Instrumental good	valuation issues, 188, 189
and honor	Iowa
generally, 36	joint custody in, 458
insufficiency of, 36	shared parenting in, 457
and obligation	Ireland
generally, 32	dissemination of information regarding abortion in,
insufficiency of, 32	399
Intentional infliction of emotional distress	division of property in, 473
	Islamic law
adultery, based on, 12	
battery claims combined with, 12	contractual aspect of marriage under, 319
effect of availability of claims for on divorce, 12, 13	mahr and premarital agreements, 378, 379
Interest	Israel
shielding marital wealth from creditors, role of	religious agreements in, 395
interest rates in, 197	
Intermediate scrutiny standard	Jewish law
in dilution of parental authority by recognition of new	contractual aspect of marriage under, 319
parents	kebutah and premarital agreements, 378
generally, 64, 65	John Paul II, Pope
Principles, adoption in, 65	on shame, 39
Lawrence v. Texas, 64	Johnson, Lyndon B.
Troxel v. Granville, 59	elitism and war on poverty, 492
International Bill of Rights, 397	Joint custody
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	generally, 69
generally, 397	in Australia, 458, 459
overlap with "Economic Covenant," 397, 398	Dekeuwer-Défossez, Françoise, on, 460
International Covenant on Economic, Social, and	in France, 459
Cultural Rights. See "Economic Covenant"	Geldof, Bob, on, 459
and premarital agreements	in Iowa, 458
International Covenant on the Elimination of All Forms	joint legal custody preferred over joint physical
of Racial Discrimination	custody, 69
Grutter v. Bollinger, citation of in, 399	in Louisiana, 458
International law. See also specific agreement concerned	in Maine, 458
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of	in Oklahoma, 458
Discrimination Against Women (See	and past caretaking standard, 457, 460
"Women's Covenant" and premarital	Principles at odds with, 460
agreements)	Royal, Ségolène, on, 460
elitism and law reform, relationship with, 495	Théry, Irène, on, 460
human rights law and premarital agreements (See	in United Kingdom, 459
Human rights law and premarital agreements)	in Wisconsin, 457
International Covenant on Economic, Social, and	Joint Problem-Solving Courts Committee
Cultural Rights (See "Economic Covenant"	and child support, 422
and premarital agreements)	Joint venture model of marriage
McCrudden, Christopher, on deference to, 495	generally, 261, 263
religious freedom less well developed in, 395	egalitarian marriage compared, 263
International perspectives	Kay, Herma Hill, on, 262, 263
generally, 433, 506	Joo, Thomas
division of property and spousal support, 472, 488	on "private ordering" and contract law, 285
United Kingdom family law and Principles, 433, 445	Judicial discretion
Interracial marriage	and "approximate time" standard, 76, 78
overturning of ban on, 297	division of property, insufficient limitation on judicia
Intervention	discretion as criticism of Principles
"de facto" parents, intervention concept as alternative	generally, 179, 180
to test for status, 118, 119	division of community property compared, 182
Intestacy	elective share compared, 182
fixed-share rule compared with division of property	intestacy compared, 182
under Principles, 182	Uniform Probate Code compared, 182, 183
recharacterization of separate property as marital	domestic partnerships, regarding enforcement of,
property, problems with Principles, 193	339

Cambridge University Press

0521861195 - Reconceiving the Family: Critique on the American Law Institute's Principles of the Law of Family Dissolution

Edited by Robin Fretwell Wilson

Index

More information

528 Index

Judicial discretion (cont.) child support, as relationship category for purposes of, 124 misunderstanding of as problem with critique of in Principles, 22 custody, as relationship category for purposes of, 123 Westfall, David, on, 22 defined in Principles, 51 Judicial interviews recognition based on assumption of parental role protection of interests of children by, 83 agreements, 52 Judicial perspectives same-sex couples, 52 child support, 409, 424 surrogate parents, 52 domestic partnerships, 425, 431 status subject to quick change, 126 Juvenile delinquency Uniform Parentage Act, presumption of legal "de facto" parents, empirical studies on children living parenthood under, 125 with, 102 visitation, as relationship category for purposes of,123 Legal positivism Kay, Herma Hill and marriage, 371 on joint venture model of marriage, 262, 263 Levy, Robert J. caretaking requirement for "de facto" parents, on on past caretaking standard, 455 Kelly, Alicia exceptions to, 96 on custody, 67, 89 on partnership theory of marriage, 217 Liberty Kentucky division of property and Principles in, 174 marriage, decision-making regarding as 14th Amendment liberty interest, 320, 327, 329 equitable distribution of property in cases of waste of assets in, 168 Liens shielding marital wealth from creditors, role of liens Kenva marital property law, effect of, 399 in, 197, 204 religious agreements in, 395 Lippman, Walter Kiernan, Kathleen on morality, 500 on cohabitation, differences from marriage, 275 Locke, John on child support, 135 King, Kathleen on sexual abuse of children, 96 Knowledge covenant marriage in, 265, 268, 359 and obligation, 34 division of property and Principles in, 173 and shame, 38 fixed-share division of community property Kornhauser, Lewis A. compared to division of marital property under Principles, 182 on impact of uncertain custody rules, 68 imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, Lack of critical review of Principles, 165 160 Lakoff, George joint custody in, 458 embodied cognition, theory of, 293, 300 Luckmann, Thomas on social institutions, 501 on metaphors in family law context generally, 293 body-based metaphors, 293, 300 Macdonald, Roderick Lamb, Kathleen A. legislative law as highest type of law, on on importance of biological ties to wellbeing of misconception of, 371 children, 93, 102 Lamont, Michèle "de facto" parents in, 52 on individualism, 504 joint custody in, 458 Lasch, Christopher Maine, Henry on "culture wars," 491 on contract law and marriage, 295 on "Middle America," 493 Mandatory mediation Latin America Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23 cohabitation in, 314 Manning, Wendy D. Laumann-Billings, Lisa on cohabitation and marriage, 311, 313 on shared parenting and wishes of children, 465 on importance of biological ties to wellbeing of Laws (Plato) children, 93, 102 on shame, 38 Margolin, Leslie Laycock, Douglas on sexual abuse of children, 108 on Newdow case dilemma, 58 Marital agreements generally, 382, 387 Legal parents

Borelli v. Brusseau, 386, 387

enforceability, 386, 387

in California

biological nonlegal parents as relationship category

for purposes of custody and visitation,



penalty clauses, 384, 386	international human rights agreements, adoption of,
coercion and adjustments to agreements, difficulties	398
in applying commercial principles to, 383	same-sex couples in, 293, 297
consideration requirement, 383, 384	"Maternal deference" standard, 68
current doctrine regarding, 382	McCrudden, Christopher
enforceability, 386, 387	international law, on deference to, 495
financial sanctions for specific behavior, 384, 386	Mediation
good faith and adjustments to agreements, difficulties	in child support
in applying commercial principles to, 383	Indiana, proposed rule in, 423
Mehren v. Dargan, 384, 386	lack of mention in Principles, 417
overview, 382, 384	slowness of, 423
penalty clauses, 384, 386	in custody matters
premarital agreement provisions of Principles applied	Grillo, Trina, on, 69
to, 384, 386	Schepard, Andrew, on, 69
Uniform Premarital Agreement Act inapplicable to,	Théry, Irène, on, 444
382	Mental health professionals
Marital misconduct. See Fault	custody, proposals regarding, 69, 70
Marital property	Merrill, Thomas
·	
contributions to education, problems with Principles,	Due Process property interests, on analogy to deference to state law definition of
defined, 185	positivist trap, deference as, 61
determination of	relaxation of unbridled deference, 61, 62
generally, 186	Metaphors in family law context
enhancement by spousal labor, problems with	and "private ordering" (See "Private ordering")
Principles, 188, 189	Meyer, David D.
division of (See Division of property)	on parenthood, 47, 66
enhancement by spousal labor, problems with	Michigan
Principles	child support in, 409, 410
generally, 186, 189	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 153
marital property portion, determination of, 188,	154
189	Minnesota
overview, 186	past caretaking standard in, 448, 449, 450
"substantial time," definition of, 187, 188	Misconduct. See Fault
property acquired during marriage deemed, 166	Missouri
property acquired in contemplation of marriage	"friendly parent" doctrine in, 73
deemed, 167	shared parenting in, 457
property acquired prior to marriage in domestic	Mnookin, Robert H.
partnership deemed, 166	on divorce negotiations, 499
shielding marital wealth from creditors (See Creditors,	on impact of uncertain custody rules, 68
shielding marital wealth from)	Monist systems
United Kingdom, no distinction between marital and	international human rights law, incorporation of in,
separate property in, 436	405
Market theory of marriage, 256	Morality
Marriage. See specific topic concerned	causation, relationship with, 19, 21
Marriage education programs	fault justified as agent of morality, 11
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23	Himmelfarb, Gertrude, on, 503
Marriage initiatives	Lippman, Walter, on, 500
Bush Administration, 24	misunderstanding of as problem with critique of in
Clinton Administration, 24, 25	Principles, 19, 21
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23, 24	Trilling, Lionel, on, 490
Marriage revitalization movement	"Most appropriate" parent
community-based programs, 25	determination of, 62, 63
, 1 6	Motherhood
discussion in legal literature, 25	
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 24	categories of, 300
Married Women's Property Acts, 295	Multiple parenthood
Maryland	Bartholet, Elizabeth, on, 55
functional approach to custody and visitation in,	criticism of
139	generally, 53
Massachusetts	in California, 54
"de facto" parents in, 3, 52	possibility under Principles, 51
division of property and Principles in, 174	privacy arguments against, 55

Murder	Nicholls, Lord
division of property, effect on under Principles, 184, 185	on equitable distribution in spousal support and division of property in United Kingdom, 436
Murphy, Jane	No-fault divorce
"de facto" parents, on case law regarding, 98	California, enactment in, 252
Mutual funds	contractual aspect of marriage, effect on, 319
enhancement of marital property by spousal labor, valuation issues, 188	division of property, inaccurate assumptions regarding no-fault divorce as criticism of Principles, 180
National Center for Health Statistics	mixed state of divorce law, 249
out-of-wedlock births, statistics on, 414	New York, exception to no-fault divorce rule retained
National Longitudinal Study of Adolescent Health	in
disengagement of fathers, research on, 468	generally, 191
Neale, Bren	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act compared, 178
on past caretaking standard, 456	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 261
Necessities, doctrine of	and spousal support, 249, 252
generally, 200, 201	Nock, Steven L.
under agency law, 200	on cohabitation, 276
"compulsory agency" theory, 200	Noncompensable losses
equal protection considerations, 200, 201	in spousal support (See Spousal support)
quasi-contractual obligations, 200	Nonfinancial matters, exclusion from consideration
Need	in division of property, 236
division of property, as alternative ground for under	in premarital agreements, 236
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, 218	in spousal support (See Spousal support)
spousal support, rejection of as ground for	Noninstrumental good
generally, 219, 221, 433	and honor, 36, 37
loss substituted for need as criterion for, 249, 250,	and obligation
479, 480	generally, 33, 34
reasons for, 253	Wilson, James Q., on, 41
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, problems with	Nonparents
determination of need under, 252	"best interests of child" standard and custody, 49
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, problems with determination of need under, 252	extraordinary circumstances, awarding custody in, 49 preference for parents over in custody matters, 49
Netherlands	Nonresidential parents
division of property in, 473	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents (See
domestic partnerships in, 275	Imputation of income to stay-at-home
international human rights law, incorporation of in,	parents)
405	North Dakota
same-sex couples in, 275	division of property and Principles in, 174
New Jersey	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 155
imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 154,	156
155	Norway
parenting plans in, 79	division of property in
New Mexico	generally, 473
fixed-share division of community property	contributions of spouses as basis of, 475, 476
compared to division of marital property	domestic partnership in, imposition of unwanted
under Principles, 182	obligations under Principles compared, 269
New York	Marriage Act of 1991, 476
cohabitation in, 336	Obligation
division of property, consideration of "catchall" fault	Obligation
factor in, 169, 170, 171	generally, 29, 45
no-fault divorce rule, exception to retained in	Aristotle on, 33
generally, 191	child support (See Child support)
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act compared, 178	derivation of, 30
New Zealand	and family, 40, 41
aboriginal populations, cohabitation among, 314 cohabitation in, 314	and fault, 29, 34
	Finch, Janet, on, 443
egg and sperm donors in, 1	"Formless City"
sexual abuse of children, empirical studies on in, 107	and instrumental good, 32
shared parenting in, 465	and noninstrumental good, 33, 34



Saxenhouse, Arlene, on, 31	"biology plus caretaking" formula, 59, 60
and honor	classes of parents in Principles, 51
credit for fulfilling obligation as component of	Constitutional protection of biological parents
honor, 35	Buss, Emily, on, 54
fulfillment of obligation as component of honor, 35	child rearing rights of, 54
instrumental good	criticisms of Principles based on, 54, 55
generally, 32	"de facto parents," legal status of precluded by, 54
insufficiency of, 32	dilution of parental authority by recognition of new
and knowledge, 34	parents permissible under Constitution, 64, 65
noninstrumental good	extension of parental status to nonparents
generally, 33, 34	precluded by, 54
Wilson, James Q., on, 41	independent parental status for unwed fathers
overview, 29, 30	under Constitution, 59
in Plato's Republic, 30, 31, 34	intermediate scrutiny standard, 64, 65
and repudiation of fault in Principles, 44, 45	overview, 48
Saint Thomas Aquinas on, 33	"psychological parents," legal status of precluded
Saxenhouse, Arlene, on "Formless City," 31	by, 54
and separation agreements, 391	custody (See Custody)
and shame, 37	"de facto" parents (See "De facto" parents)
and steadiness, 33	decision-making responsibility, assignment of under
volitional obligation (See Child support)	Principles, 51
Wallerstein, Judith, on, 43, 44	Dewar, John, on, 469
Wilson, James Q., on, 41	dilution of parental authority by recognition of new
Office of Child Support Enforcement	parents
unpaid child support, statistics on, 414, 415	generally, 64, 66
Ohio imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 154	in California, 65
Oklahoma	Constitution, permissible under, 64, 65
joint custody in, 458	intermediate scrutiny standard generally, 64, 65
Oldham, Thomas	Principles, adoption in, 65
on spousal support, 256	by estoppel ( <i>See</i> Estoppel, parenthood by)
Opting-out provisions	under existing custody law, 48, 50
domestic partnerships	functional status of, 53
generally, 339	grandparents, rights of, 59
problems with, 317, 340, 341, 429	guardians, parental rights of, 56
Oregon	ideological narrowness of drafters as problem with
"de facto" parents, rights of in, 117	new approach to in Principles, 53
	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents (See
Pannikar, Raimundo	Imputation of income to stay-at-home
on human nature, 352	parents)
Parental autonomy	independent parental status for unwed fathers under
"de facto" parents, problems with, 99	Constitution, 59
division of property, curtailing of autonomy as	legal parents (See Legal parents)
criticism of Principles, 179, 180	Meyer, David D., on, 47, 66
parenting plans	"most appropriate" parent, determination of, 62, 63
as reason for, 78, 80	multiple parenthood
tension between autonomy and judicial control, 81	Bartholet, Elizabeth, on, 55
problems in modifying, 87, 88	criticism of
Parental involvement	generally, 53
"de facto" parents, empirical studies on children living	in California, 54
with, 102, 106	possibility under Principles, 51
Parenthood	privacy arguments against, 55
adoptive parents, parental rights of, 56	new approach to in Principles, 47, 48, 53, 66
assumption of parental role, based on	noncustodial parents, lack of parental rights of, 56, 57
generally, 53	nonmarital biological fathers, lack of parental rights
agreements, 52	of, 60
same-sex couples, 52	problems with new approach to in Principles
surrogate parents, 52	Constitutional criticisms, 54, 55
asymmetric parenthood, 121, 141	ideological narrowness of drafters, 53
Baker, Katharine A., on, 121, 141	overview, 47, 48



Parenthood (cont.)	spousal support, rejection of as ground for, 219, 221
state law definition of, Constitutional deference to	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act embracing, 214,
generally, 56, 63	293 Uniform Probate Code embracing, 203
adoptive parents, parental rights of, 56 "biology plus caretaking" formula, 59, 60	Uniform Probate Code embracing, 293 Past caretaking standard
Buss, Emily, on, 60	generally, 446, 471
Due Process property interests, analogy to	"approximate time" standard compared, 449
deference to state law definition of	in Australia, 451
generally, 57, 58	Crippen, Gary, on, 450
and curtailment of existing definitions, 61, 62	"de facto" parents, past care givers as (See "De facto"
Merrill, Thomas, on, 61, 62	parents)
positivist trap, deference as, 61	in Florida, 3
relaxation of unbridled deference, 61, 62	Garska v. McCoy, 448
Elk Grove Unified School District v. Newdow, 56, 59	historical background, 448, 449
grandparents, rights of, 59	and joint custody, 457, 460 ( <i>See also</i> Joint custody)
guardians, parental rights of, 56	Kay, Herma Hill, on, 455
independent parental status for unwed fathers	in Minnesota, 448, 449, 450
under Constitution, 59	Neale, Bren, on, 456
Lehr v. Robertson, 59, 60	overview, 446, 447, 470, 471
Michael H. v. Gerald D., 60	Parkinson, Patrick, on, 446, 471
	Pikula v. Pikula, 448, 449
"most appropriate" parent, determination of, 62, 63	and predictability
noncustodial parents, lack of parental rights of, 56,	÷ '
57	generally, 449, 454
nonmarital biological fathers, lack of parental rights	choice of primary care giver, 450
of, 60	equal sharing of past caretaking, 451, 452
overview, 55	exceptions, effect of, 450, 451
Prince v. Massachusetts, 56	overview, 449, 450
Stanley v. Illinois, 59	visitation, effect on, 452, 454
Troxel v. Granville, 59	and role-divided marriage
unwed fathers, parental rights of, 59	generally, 454, 455
in United Kingdom	visitation, effect on, 455, 456
generally, 441, 443	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 449, 453, 454
"de facto" parents, English law compared, 441	and shared parenting, 456, 457 (See also shared
estoppel, parenthood by, English law compared, 441	parenting)
residence orders, 441	Smart, Carol, on, 456
unwed fathers, independent parental status for under	in West Virginia, 3, 448
Constitution, 59	Paternity
Parenting plans	problems with leaving outside scope of Principles, 127
generally, 78, 82	Peabody Picture Vocabulary test
advantages of, 82	"de facto" parents, empirical studies on children living
difficulties in implementation, 82	with, 102
in Illinois, 79	Penalty default rules
individuals with custodial rights under as relationship	in domestic partnerships (See Domestic partnerships)
category for purposes of custody and	Pennsylvania
visitation, 123	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 154
judicial efficiency as reason for, 79	paternalistic system, decline of in, 213
in New Jersey, 79	premarital agreements, enforceability of in, 381
parental autonomy	Pericles
as reason for, 78, 80	on honor, 37
tension with judicial control, 81	Planiol, Marcel
and "private ordering," 80	on spousal support, 256
protection of interests of children by, 83	Plato
and separation agreements, 389	"Formless City" (See "Formless City")
specific requirements, 80, 81	honor in Republic, 36
state-by-state analysis, 79, 80	obligation in Republic, 30, 31, 34
in Washington, 81	on shame
Parkinson, Patrick	in Laws, 38
on past caretaking standard, 446, 471	in Republic, 39
Partnership theory of marriage	Polikoff, Nancy
Kelly, Alicia, on, 217	on oppression of women in marriage, 346



Polygamy	and infidelity, 360
in Belgium, 1	informed consent requirement
Pound, Roscoe	generally, 375
public and private interests in marriage, distinction	rebuttable presumption of, 375, 376
between, 18	and international human rights law (See Human
Practicality	rights law and premarital agreements)
domestic partnerships, as rationale behind provisions	and Islamic mahr, 378, 379
of Principles regarding	and Jewish kebutah, 378
generally, 315, 318	lack of duress requirement
presumptions, based on, 315, 316	generally, 375
Premarital agreements	rebuttable presumption of, 375, 376
generally, 351, 407	limits to coverage, 375
Adolphe, Jane, on, 351, 371	marital agreements, provisions of Principles applied
and annulment, 359	to, 384, 386
balance between choice and protection of vulnerable	nonfinancial matters, exclusion from consideration,
parties under Principles, 375, 379, 391	236
benefits of, 356, 357	overreaching, protection against, 357
Bix, Brian H., on, 358, 372, 391	overview, 372, 375
and "bounded rationality"	Pennsylvania, enforceability in, 381
generally, 375	"private ordering" and, inconsistency of Principles,
overstatement of problems with, 379, 380	358
in Canada	procedural guidelines under Principles
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms,	generally, 375, 376
protection of economic rights under, 405	benefits of, 381
not binding in, 403	and reaffirmation of marriage, 359
commercial contracts, tension with, 392	and religious agreements, 378, 379
cost-benefit analysis regarding enforceability	and religious freedom, 394, 395
generally, 380	same-sex couples, infrequency among, 277
inability of parties to protect interests, 380	standard view of, 372, 373
social benefits to marriage, 380	Stark, Barbara, on, 392, 407
third parties, presence of, 380	"substantial injustice" standard for nonenforcement
and covenant marriage	generally, 357, 358, 376, 377, 394
generally, 377, 378	children, effect on, 376, 377
hostility of Principles regarding premarital	difference in outcome, 376, 377
agreements toward, 359	and "Economic Covenant," 404
current doctrine regarding, 372, 374	short marriages, difference in circumstances in, 376
division of property, relationship to under Principles,	third parties, protection of, 376, 377
164	weakness of, 381
Dorsen, Norman, on, 396	and unconscionability
and "Economic Covenant" (See "Economic	generally, 394
Covenant" and premarital agreements)	"Economic Covenant," 404
economic interests, marriage reduced to by, 358	undermining of traditional marriage in Principles
enforceability	generally, 351, 356, 371
cost-benefit analysis, 380	"private ordering" and, inconsistency of Principles,
effect of on decision to marry, 381	358
employment agreements with restrictive covenants	under Uniform Premarital Agreement Act
not best analogy, 380	enforceability, 381
living wills as best analogy, 380	fairness inquiry, 374
in Pennsylvania, 381	historical background, 373
spectrum of enforceability, 380, 381	writing requirement, 374
under Uniform Premarital Agreement Act, 381	in United Kingdom
and enforcement aspect of contracts, 286	generally, 439
fairness	European Social Charter, protection of economic
Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 393, 394	rights under, 405
as underlying basis for treatment under Principles,	not binding in, 403
222, 225	and "Women's Covenant" (See "Women's Covenant"
fairness inquiry, 374, 375	and premarital agreements)
and fault, 360	workable rules, attempt to provide in Principles, 357,
historical background, 372, 373	358
and implied had faith 394	writing requirement 374 375



Premarital counseling	and same-sex couples
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23	generally, 288, 289
Prenuptial agreements. See Premarital agreements	problems with analysis, 293
"Primary caretaker" doctrine	Private relational interest in marriage
generally, 70, 71	misunderstanding of as problem with critique of in
"best interests of child" standard, relationship with,	Principles, 18, 19
71	Pound, Roscoe, on distinction between public and
"degendered maternal presumption," 70	private interests in marriage, 18
problems with, 71	Problem-solving courts
"tender years" doctrine, relationship with, 70	use of in child support cases, 422
Principles. See specific topic concerned	Professional licenses
Privacy	and division of property, 185
multiple parenthood, arguments against based on,	Property, division of. See Division of property
55	Property law
"Private ordering"	1 /
<u>e</u>	domestic partnerships in United Kingdom, relevance
generally, 284, 304	to, 440
advantages of	Prosecutorial discretion
generally, 291, 292	Armstrong; United States v., 172
equality, 291	division of property and fault, problems with reliance
naturalness, 292	on in cases involving, 172
plurality, 291	Newton v. Rumery, 172
application of Principles, 300, 304	Wayte v. United States, 172
in California, 300, 304	Protection of interests of children
and child support, 287	generally, 82
and cohabitation, 288, 289	by attorneys (See Attorneys)
as conceptual basis for family law, 291	by custody evaluators, 83
and contract law, 286, 288	by guardians ad litem (See Guardians ad litem)
and "de facto" parents, 290, 291	by judicial interviews, 83
deferral of existing family law to, 284	by parenting plans, 83
and domestic partnerships, 287, 288, 289	Psychiatrists
Elisa B. v. Emily B., 301, 302	custody, proposals regarding, 69, 70
and equality	"Psychological parents"
generally, 292	as care givers, 50
as advantage of "private ordering," 291	Constitutional protection of biological parents, legal
Aristotle on, 292	status of precluded by, 54
Ertman, Martha, on, 284, 304	requirement for continuing contact with children,
Joo, Thomas, on, 285	117, 118
K.M. v. E.G., 302, 303	Psychological view of marriage
Kristine H. v. Lisa R., 302	Schneider, Carl E., on, 255, 256
metaphors in family law context	spousal support, rejection of fault as criterion for
body-based metaphors, 293, 300	under, 255, 256
coverture as, 294, 295	Psychologists
handshake as, 297, 299	custody, proposals regarding, 69, 70
Lakoff, George, on, 293, 300	Public interest in marriage
motherhood, categories of, 300	failure to recognize as problem with critique of in
overview, 284, 285	Principles, 18
under Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, 293	Pound, Roscoe, on distinction between public and
under Uniform Probate Code, 293	private interests in marriage, 18
and naturalness	Public policy
generally, 293	domestic partnerships, disadvantages under Principles
as advantage of "private ordering," 292	generally, 318, 327
overview, 284, 286, 304	erosion of integrity of law, 319, 320
and parenthood by estoppel, 287, 290	individual autonomy, conflict with, 320, 322
and parenting plans, 80	wrong message about marriage and cohabitation,
and plurality	conveying, 322, 327
= -	, 9
generally, 292, 293	Purchase money resulting trusts
as advantage of "private ordering," 291	cohabitants, claims based on, 321
premarital agreements and, inconsistency of	Putative spouse doctrine, 362
Principles, 358	Ou antique manuit
problems in modifying, 87, 88 Rawls, John, on, 286	Quantum meruit cohabitants, claims based on, 321, 336, 362
15aw 15, 101111, 011, 400	COHADITATIOS, CIAITIIS DASEU OH, 321, 330, 302

More information

Cambridge University Press
0521861195 - Reconceiving the Family: Critique on the American Law Institute's Principles of the Law of Family Dissolution
Edited by Robin Fretwell Wilson
Index

Quasi-contract	Russell, Diana
and doctrine of necessities, 200	on sexual abuse of children, 107
domestic partnerships, Principles adding nothing to	Calkan Anna
existing remedies, 321	Salter, Anna on sexual abuse of children, 111
same-sex couples, inadequacy of, 321 spousal support, preclusion as underlying theory of,	Same-sex couples
257, 258	Baker v. State, 280, 281
Quorum requirement for ALI proceedings	in Canada, 1, 281, 283
problems with, 164, 165, 176, 177	as care givers, 49
problems with, 104, 103, 170, 177	Connecticut, civil unions for in
Rape	and Equal Protection, 281
financial misconduct, relationship to, 246	obligations of parties under Principles compared,
Rawls, John	280
on "private ordering" and contract law, 286	contract law, inadequacy of, 321
Reaffirmation of marriage	in Denmark, 275
and premarital agreements, 359	egalitarian marriage, advantages of, 349
Reciprocal beneficiaries	under European Convention for the Protection of
in Hawaii, 297	Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,
in Vermont, 297	440
Reciprocity	and international human rights law, 400
and division of property, 487, 488	Lawrence v. Texas
and honor, 37	generally, 213
and spousal support, 487, 488	intermediate scrutiny standard, 64
Reilly, Marie T.	international law, citation of in, 399
on shielding marital wealth from creditors, 195, 207	as legal parents
Religious agreements	assumption of parental role, based on, 52
generally, 378, 379	marriage
in foreign countries, 395	anxiety regarding, 299, 322
Islamic mahr, 378, 379	Principles as paving way for, 280, 283
in Israel, 395	in Massachusetts, 293, 297
Jewish kebutah, 378	in Netherlands, 275
in Kenya, 395	premarital agreements, infrequency of among, 277
Religious freedom	and "private ordering"
Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of	generally, 288, 289
Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on	problems with analysis, 293
Religious Belief, 395	quasi-contract, inadequacy of, 321
international law, less well developed in, 395	Rosengarten v. Downes, 281
Elk Grove Unified School District v. Newdow case, issue	in South Africa, 1
avoided by deference to state law definition of	in Spain, 5
parenthood in, 58, 59	underprotection under Principles, 278, 280
and premarital agreements, 394, 395	in United Kingdom, 440
Sullivan, Donna, on, 395, 396	Vermont, civil unions for in
Republic (Plato)	and Equal Protection, 280, 281
honor in, 36	obligations of parties under Principles compared,
obligation in, 30, 31, 34	280
shame in, 39	San Francisco
Residential parents	international human rights agreements, adoption of
imputation of income to stay-at-home parents (See	398
Imputation of income to stay-at-home	sexual abuse of children, empirical studies on in, 107
parents)	Saudi Arabia
Restitution	family law in, 397
cohabitants, claims based on, 336	Saxenhouse, Arlene
Rhode Island	on "Formless City," 31
"de facto" parents in, 3, 52	Schepard, Andrew
Rome, Ancient	on mediation in custody matters, 69
contractual aspect of marriage in, 320	Schiavo, Terri
shame and family in, 43	elitism and attitudes toward case of, 493
Root, Elihu	Schneider, Carl E.
American Law Institute, as incorporator of, 490	on elitism and law reform, 489, 506
Royal, Ségolène	on noncompensable losses, 261
on joint custody, 460	on psychological view of marriage, 255, 256



Schools	and autonomy, 391
"de facto" parents, empirical studies on children living with, 102	and "best interests of child" standard, 388 challenges to, 388
imputation of income to stay-at-home parents, effect	court approval, 388
of school as adequate child care alternative,147	current doctrine regarding, 388
Schwartz, Pepper	defenses, 388
on financial attitudes in cohabitation, 310, 311	deference in financial matters, 388
Scott, Elizabeth	disclosure requirement, 389
on "approximate time" standard, 74, 444, 449, 454	enforceability, 389
on "best interests of child" standard and custody, 441,	fairness standard, 388
442	frequency of, 387
domestic partnerships, on waiting period for, 317	Hadfield, Gillian, on, 390
on implied contract theory for domestic partnerships,	less deference to, arguments for, 390, 391
349	and obligations, 391
on importance of commitment, 231, 232	overview, 387, 389
international human rights, on incorporation of into	and parenting plans, 389
family law, 406	under Principles, 389, 390
on no-fault divorce, 261	"substantial injustice" standard for nonenforcement,
on past caretaking standard, 449, 453, 454	389
Scott, James	unconscionability standard, 388
on unintended consequences of laws, 498	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, unconscionability
"Selection" effects of marriage, 324, 325, 327	under, 388
Self-executing treaties, doctrine of	writing requirement, 389
international human rights law and incorporation of,	"Serial marriage," 262
405, 406	Sexual abuse of children
Separate property	absence of mother, risk of during, 112, 115
defined, 185	adult not residing with child from infancy, risk of by,
earnings before marriage, problems with Principles	115, 116
generally, 189, 191	attractiveness of single mothers to sex offenders
employee stock options, 190, 191	targeting children, 110, 112
goodwill, 189, 190	Bagley, Christopher, on, 109
overview, 186	Bolen, Rebecca, on, 110
future earnings, problems with Principles	cohabitants, risk of by, 107, 110
generally, 189, 191	Craft, John, on, 108
employee stock options, 190, 191	"de facto" parents, risk of by, 106, 117
goodwill, 189, 190	Fergusson, David, on, 107
overview, 186	Finkelhor, David, on, 115
gifts deemed to be	Herman, Judith, on, 112
generally, 166	Hirschman, Lisa, on, 112
recharacterization as marital property, problems	King, Kathleen, on, 96
with Principles, 192, 193	Margolin, Leslie, on, 108
inheritances deemed to be	New Zealand, empirical studies in, 107
generally, 166	overview, 116, 117
recharacterization as marital property, problems	Russell, Diana, on, 107
with Principles, 192, 193	Salter, Anna, on, 111
invasion of in cases of waste of assets, 168, 169	San Francisco, empirical studies in, 107
recharacterization as marital property, problems with	stepparents, risk of sexual abuse of children by, 107,
1 1 1 1	110
Principles	
generally, 192	United Kingdom, empirical studies in, 109
compensation for services, 193	Wallerstein, Judith, on, 111
distributions from trusts, 193	Williams, Linda, on, 115
gifts, 192, 193	Sexuality
inheritances, 192, 193	and marriage, 353, 354
intestacy, 193	Shame
overview, 186	generally, 37, 39
rational in Principles, 192	Cicero on, 43
United Kingdom, no distinction between marital and	Davies, Christie, on, 40
separate property in, 436	and family, 43
Separation agreements	French, Peter, on, 38
generally, 387, 391	and honor, 37, 40



John Paul II, Pope, on, 39	Sullivan Principles in, 398
and knowledge, 38	South Carolina
nature of, 37, 38	common law marriage in, 425, 426
and obligation, 37	Spaht, Katherine Shaw
Plato on	on spousal support, 249, 268
in Laws, 38	Spain
in Republic, 39	adoption in, 5
and repudiation of fault in Principles, 44, 45	same-sex couples in, 5
and Roman tradition, 43	Spousal support
"Shameful City," 40	generally, 209
"Shameless City," 39, 40	and adaptive rationality, 231
Taylor, Gabriele, on, 38	agreement as to division of labor, effect of, 482
Wallerstein, Judith, on, 43, 44	alternative conception of marriage, need for, 264, 268
"Shameful City," 40	analysis of Principles, 252, 261
"Shameless City," 39, 40	in Austria, 479
Shared parenting	authority regarding dissolution, ignoring tension over
generally, 70, 461, 470	divide between public and private, 225, 229
Amato, Paul, on, 462	state-regulated status <i>versus</i> contract theory of
in Australia	marriage, 225, 229
children, wishes of, 465	backward-looking jurisprudence, Principles
community attitudes toward parental	representing
responsibility, changes in, 461, 462	advantages of, 210
fathers, changes in attitudes of, 467	authority regarding dissolution, ignoring tension
Beck, Ulrich, on, 468 Beck-Gernsheim, Elisabeth, on, 468	over
in Canada, 465	generally, 211
children, wishes of, 464, 466	divide between public and private, 225, 229 state-regulated status <i>versus</i> contract theory of
community attitudes toward parental responsibility,	marriage, 225, 229
changes in, 461, 462	disarray within family law as goal, correction of as
Emery, Robert, on, 465	goal, 212, 215
Fabricius, William V., on, 465, 467	disputes resolved at dissolution rather than at
fathers, changes in attitudes of, 467, 468	creation of relationship, 209
Gilbreth, Joan, on, 462	explicit <i>ex post</i> perspective, 209, 210
and governments, 469, 470	explicitness of agreements, lack of, 211
Hall, Jeff A., on, 465, 467	family behavior, role of family law in creating
in Iowa, 457	understanding of, 211, 268
Laumann-Billings, Lisa, on, 465	historical development, 214
in Missouri, 457	multiplicity of relationships, providing for, 210
in New Zealand, 465	overview, 209, 212
nonresidential parents, benefits of closeness to, 462,	problems with, 210
464	"balance sheet" concept, 434
overview, 461	Carbone, June, on, 209, 233
and past caretaking standard, 456, 457	care giver spouse, loss of earning capacity for as
problems with, 87	compensable loss
in United Kingdom	disproportionate share of caretaking, 258
children, wishes of, 465, 466	fulfillment of moral obligation, 258
fathers, changes in attitudes of, 468	child support compared, Ellman, Mark Ira, on, 253
Silbaugh, Katharine B.	commitment, importance of
on contributions of spouses as basis of division of	generally, 230, 233
property, 484	cohabitation, impact of provisions of Principles
on spousal support, 234, 248	regarding, 232
Smart, Carol	fault, effect of treatment of under Principles, 232,
on past caretaking standard, 456	233
Smock, Pamela	Frank, Robert, on, 230, 231
on cohabitation and marriage, 311, 313	restatement of Principles as terms of marital
Social nature of marriage	partnership, 233
generally, 355 "Reyond Conjugality" Pepart, obscuring in 365	Scott, Elizabeth, on, 231, 232
"Beyond Conjugality" Report, obscuring in, 365 South Africa	compensable losses
same-sex couples in, 1	generally, 258, 260 alternatives to, 259
outife sea couples iii, i	arcerratives (0, 25)



Spousal support (cont.)	emotional damages as noncompensable losses, 260,
Carbone, June, on, 259	261
care giver spouse, loss of earning capacity for	entitlement, Principles viewing as, 482
disproportionate share of caretaking, 258	equitable sharing of financial loss
fulfillment of moral obligation, 258	generally, 219, 221
criticism of, 258, 259	as purposes of Principles, 215
higher living standard, loss of, 258	expectation damages as noncompensable losses, 260
as improvement over existing law, 259, 260	fairness as underlying concern regarding, 219, 221
investment in earning capacity of other spouse,	fault, rejection of as criterion for
258	availability of other remedies at law, 253
	and classical liberalism, 256
short marriage, disproportionate loss in, 258	*
contract law, preclusion as underlying theory of, 257	and economic theory of marriage, 256
contributions of spouses as basis of	and egalitarian marriage, 256
generally, 473	Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 250, 256
child care, 482, 483	impossibility of assigning fault as reason for, 254
"contribution model," 482, 487	and market theory of marriage, 256
earning capacity, compensation for loss of, 481	Oldham, Thomas, on, 256
housework, 482, 483	Planiol, Marcel, on, 256
indirect contributions, 479, 487	under psychological view of marriage, 255, 256
corrective justice	Schneider, Carl E., on, 255, 256
generally, 472, 487	tort law, reliance on in lieu of
move toward under Principles, 473, 474, 479	generally, 253
and covenant marriage	adultery, tort claims for, 253
generally, 265, 268	financial misconduct, consideration of as alternative
in Arizona, 265	to Principles
in Arkansas, 265	generally, 244, 247
in Louisiana, 265, 268	and adultery, 246
decline in frequency of, 479	division of property compared, 245
default terms, imposition of	and gambling, 246
generally, 229, 230	intertwining of financial and nonfinancial
on cohabitants, 229, 230	misconduct, 246, 247
on married couples, 229	prevailing state law regarding, 246, 247
on unmarried couples, 229, 230	and rape, 246
disarray within family law as goal, correction of as	forward-looking jurisprudence, need for in Principles
goal of Principles	210, 225, 230
generally, 212, 215	in Germany, 479
autonomy/choice/contract model	higher living standard, loss of as compensable loss, 258
advent of, 212	
	investment in earning capacity of other spouse as
attacks on, 214	compensable loss, 258
Fineman, Martha, on, 214	and joint venture model of marriage
and Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, 214	generally, 261, 263
and Uniform Premarital Agreement Act, 214	egalitarian marriage compared, 263
and Lawrence v. Texas, 213	Kay, Herma Hill, on, 262, 263
"love family," 213	loss substituted for need as criterion for
overview, 210	generally, 249, 250
paternalistic notions, decline of, 212	kinds of compensable losses, 258, 260
in Pennsylvania, 213	need, rejection as ground for
Simeone v. Simeone, 213	generally, 219, 221, 433
traditional regulatory model, 212	loss substituted for need as criterion for, 249, 250,
Whitehead, Barbara Dafoe, on, 214	479, 480
distributive justice	reasons for, 253
generally, 472	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, problems with
move away from under Principles, 473, 474, 479	determination of need under, 252
division of property, relationship with	and no-fault divorce, 249, 252
generally, 183	noncompensable losses
under Principles, 163	generally, 260, 261
in domestic partnerships, 361, 427	Ellman, Mark Ira, on, 260, 261
earning capacity, compensation for loss of	emotional or psychological damages, 260, 261
generally, 480, 481	expectation damages, 260
contributions of spouses as basis of, 481	Schneider, Carl E., on, 261



nonfinancial matters, exclusion from consideration	short marriage, disproportionate loss in as
generally, 234, 248	compensable loss, 258
continuation of exchange of nonfinancial benefits	Silbaugh, Katharine B., on, 234, 248
after dissolution	Spaht, Katherine Shaw, on, 249, 268
generally, 237, 238	standard of living, compensation for loss of
assumptions in Principles, 242, 243	generally, 481
Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 235	moral obligation as basis of, 481, 482
emotional losses, financial losses as, 237	Sverdup, Tone, on, 472, 488
evaluation of, 236, 244	in Switzerland, 479
exchange of financial and nonfinancial benefits,	and time factor, 487, 488
237	tort claims
fairness of exclusion, 243, 244	adultery, tort claims for, 253
fault, elimination of as justification for	preclusion as underlying theory of, 257
generally, 239, 240	reliance on tort claims in lieu of, 253
circular reasoning employed by Principles, 239	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act, problems with
overview, 238	determination of need under, 252
reluctance to investigate intimate relationships,	in United Kingdom (See United Kingdom)
based on, 239, 240	unjust enrichment, preclusion as underlying theory
financial misconduct, consideration of as	of, 257, 258
alternative, 244, 247	Standard of living
	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e
incommensurability as justification for	spousal support, compensation for loss of
generally, 240, 242	generally, 481
deliberate ignoring of problem for social reasons,	moral obligation as basis of, 481, 482
241, 242	Standing "I for " I for the standing to the st
impracticality of devising metric, 241	"de facto" parents, standing concept as alternative to
inconsistency of Principles, 242	test for status, 117, 118
intrusiveness of devising metric, 241	Stark, Barbara
presumption of equal exchange during marriage,	on international human rights law and premarital
240, 241	agreements, 392, 407
tort claims, remedies for nonfinancial losses	State interest in marriage, 355, 356
compared, 240	Stay-at-home parents
justification for	imputation of income to (See Imputation of income
generally, 238, 243	to stay-at-home parents)
in Principles, 238	Stephen, James Fitzjames
overview, 234, 235, 248	on social institutions, 501, 502
reason for exclusion, 235	Stepparents
relationship between financial and nonfinancial	as "de facto" parents (See "De facto" parents)
matters as defining attribute of marriage, 236,	Stock options
237	earnings before marriage or future earnings as
significance of exclusion, 236, 238	separate property, problems with Principles,
treatment under Principles, 235, 236	190, 191
partnership theory of marriage, rejection of as ground	Strange Death of Moral Britain, The (Davies)
for, 219, 221	shame in, 40
and postmodern marriage, 249, 268	Strasser, Mark
psychological damages as noncompensable losses,	on imputation of income to stay-at-home parents,
260, 261	142, 161
purposes of alimony, 252, 258	"Substantial injustice" standard for nonenforcement
purposes of Principles	domestic partnerships, 339
generally, 214	premarital agreements (See Premarital agreements)
dissolution, limitation to, 215	separation agreements, 389
equitable sharing of financial loss, 215	Sui generis contract
Hazard, Geoffrey, on, 215	marriage as, 356, 357, 358
preference for Principles over Restatement, 214	Sullivan, Andrew
quantification of loss and gain, 483	on liberationist view of marriage, 504, 505
quasi-contract, preclusion as underlying theory of,	on marriage as social institution, 502
257, 258	Sullivan, Donna
rational for imposing obligations under Principles,	on religious freedom and gender equality, 395, 396
433, 434	Sullivan Principles in South Africa, 398
and reciprocity, 487, 488	Summa Theologica (Aquinas)
and "serial marriage," 262	obligation in, 33
and scriatinatiage, 202	oongation in, 33

Cambridge University Press

0521861195 - Reconceiving the Family: Critique on the American Law Institute's Principles of the Law of Family Dissolution

Edited by Robin Fretwell Wilson

Index

More information

540 Index

Support	incommensurability, remedies for nonfinancial losses
child support (See Child support)	in tort claims compared to spousal support,
spousal support (See Spousal support)	240
Sureties	intentional infliction of emotional distress
spouses as, effect on shielding marital wealth from creditors, 196	adultery, based on, 12 battery claims combined with, 12
Surrogate parents	effect of availability of claims for on divorce, 12, 13
as legal parents based on assumption of parental role,	spousal support
52	adultery, tort claims for, 253
and volitional child support obligation, 137, 138	preclusion as underlying theory of, 257
Surviving spouses	reliance on tort claims in lieu of, 253
elective share, fixed-share rule compared with division	Treasury securities
of property under Principles, 182	enhancement of marital property by spousal labor,
Sverdup, Tone	valuation issues, 188
on division of property and spousal support, 472, 488	Trilling, Lionel
Sweden	on morality, 490
cohabitation, differences from marriage in, 275	Truman, Harry S.
division of property in, 473	on Eisenhower, Dwight D., 497
financial attitudes in cohabitation in, 312	on elitism, 492
Swisher, Peter Nash	Trust law
on division of property and fault, 170, 171	domestic partnerships in United Kingdom, relevance
Switzerland	to, 440
spousal support in, 479	recharacterization of separate property as marital
T. G. MEH II I	property, problems with Principles, 193
Taft, William Howard	Two-parent model. See Binary biological ideal
American Law Institute, as incorporator of, 490 Taylor, Gabriele	Unconscionability
on shame, 38	and premarital agreements
Tenancy by the entirety	generally, 394
and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 198	"Economic Covenant," 404
Tenancy in common	and separation agreements, 388
and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 198, 199	Unexpected Legacy of Divorce, The (Wallerstein)
"Tender years" doctrine	dissolution without obligation, honor or shame in, 43,
generally, 48	44
"best interests of child" standard, relationship with, 68	UNICEF Report on Child Marriage, 399
decline of, 68	Uniform Commercial Code
"primary caretaker" doctrine, relationship with, 70	different rules for different situations, analogy to
Termination of parental rights	family law, 288
individuals required by state law to support children	Principles compared, 291
following as relationship category for purposes	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act
of child support, 124	adoption in eight states, 178
Therapeutic jurisprudence	and autonomy/choice/contract model of family, 214
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23	continuing contact with "de facto" parents under,
Théry, Irène	Principles compared, 98
on joint custody, 460 on mediation, 444	"friendly parent" doctrine, not adopting, 73 metaphors in family law context under, 293
Toal, Jean Hoefer	need
on domestic partnerships and common law marriage,	as alternative ground for division of property
425, 431	under, 218
Tocqueville, Alexis de	problems with determination under, 252
on American individualism, 502, 503	New York, exception to no-fault rule retained in, 178
Tort claims	partnership theory of marriage, embracing, 214, 293
adultery, tort claims for, 253	promulgation, 178
battery (See Battery)	rejection of marital misconduct as consideration
fault in divorce, relationship with	under, 10
critique of fault in Principles based on availability of, 10	separation agreements and unconscionability under, 388
effect of availability of on, 12, 13	Uniform Parentage Act
forfeiture as alternative to, 13	broad appeal required, 210

preference for, 13

presumption of legal parenthood under, 125



Uniform Premarital Agreement Act	Human Rights Act of 1968, 440
and autonomy/choice/contract model of family, 214	joint custody in, 459
broad appeal required, 210	parenthood in
enforceability under, 381	generally, 441, 443
fairness inquiry under, 374	"de facto" parents, English law compared, 441
historical background, 373	estoppel, parenthood by, English law compared, 44
marital agreements, inapplicable to, 382	residence orders, 441
writing requirement under, 374	premarital agreements in
Uniform Probate Code	
	generally, 439
fixed-share rules compared with division of property	European Social Charter, protection of economic
under Principles, 182, 183	rights under, 405
metaphors in family law context under, 293	not binding in, 403
partnership theory of marriage, embracing, 293	Principles compared with English family law, 433,
United Kingdom	443, 445
"best interests of child" standard in, 441, 442	recent developments in family law paralleling
Civil Partnership Act of 2004, 440	Principles, 3
custody in	same-sex couples in, 440
generally, 441, 443	sexual abuse of children, empirical studies on in, 109
"approximate time" approach, rejection of, 443	shared parenting in
and "best interests of child" standard, 441, 442	children, wishes of, 465, 466
nonresidential parents, rights of	fathers, changes in attitudes of, 468
generally, 442, 443	spousal support in
Canada compared, 443	generally, 433
Fathers4Justice, 442	"balance sheet" concept, applicability of, 435, 438
welfare of children as paramount consideration, 442	Denning, Lord, on, 438
"de facto" parents in	equitable distribution
1	*
generally, 441	blurring of distinction with need, 437
empirical studies on sexual abuse of children in, 109	general rule, 435
division of property in	good reason required for deviation from, 435
generally, 433, 473	Nicholls, Lord, on, 436
"balance sheet" concept, applicability of, 435, 438	fault, exclusion of, 438
Denning, Lord, on, 438	and legitimacy, 438, 439
equitable distribution	need
blurring of distinction with need, 437	blurring of distinction with equitable distribution,
general rule, 435	437
good reason required for deviation from, 435	Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 437
Nicholls, Lord, on, 436	meeting of as first objective, 435
fault, exclusion of, 438	welfare of children as first consideration, 438
indirect contributions of spouses, 475	United States Census Bureau
and legitimacy, 438, 439	single-parent households and poverty, statistics on,
marital and separate property, distinction not made	414
between, 436	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
need	generally, 397
blurring of distinction with equitable distribution,	family as fundamental group unit of society under, 41
437	Unjust enrichment
Ellman, Ira Mark, on, 437	cohabitants avoiding, 321, 362
meeting of as first objective, 435	spousal support, preclusion as underlying theory of,
welfare of children as first consideration, 438	257, 258
domestic partnerships in	Unmarried couples. See Cohabitation; Domestic
generally, 440	partnerships
common child, parents of, 440	U.S. Fragile Family Study, 312
and legitimacy, 439	
property law, relevance of, 440	Vermont
same-sex couples, 440	civil unions for same-sex couples in
trust law, relevance of, 440	Equal Protection and, 280, 281
Eekelaar, John, on English family law and Principles,	obligations of parties under Principles compared,
433, 445	280
elitism and law reform in, 490	division of property and Principles in, 173
European Social Charter, protection of economic	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 159
rights under, 405	reciprocal beneficiaries in, 297
0,	

Vicarious liability	Washington
and shielding marital wealth from creditors, 200	parenting plans in, 81
Viladrich, Pedro Juan	Waste of assets
on legal positivism and marriage, 371	equitable distribution of property in cases of
Visitation	generally, 167, 169
binary biological ideal rejected for purposes of, 128	in Illinois, 168
child support, differential treatment under Principles	invasion of separate property, 168, 169
generally, 133	in Kentucky, 168
and Miller v. Miller, 135, 136	treatment in Principles, 168
parents by estoppel defined differently, 124	as exception to repudiation of fault in Principles, 10
continuing contact with children by "de facto" parents	social consensus against, 18
(See "De facto" parents)	West Virginia
"de facto" parents as relationship category for	"approximate time" standard in, 74
purposes of, 123	past caretaking standard in, 3, 448
emotional needs of children outweighing financial	Westfall, David
needs of children under Principles, 133, 134,	on division of property, 176, 194
136	on domestic violence, 401
estoppel, parenthood by	judicial discretion, criticism of position of Principles
parents by estoppel defined differently than for	on, 22
child support, 124	quorum requirement for ALI proceedings, on
as relationship category for purposes of, 123	problems with, 164, 165, 176, 177
expansion of state power under Principles, effect of,	Weston, Kath
130, 133	on family choice, 505
legal parents as relationship category for purposes of,	Whitehead, Barbara Dafoe
123	on autonomy model of family, 214
Maryland, functional approach in, 139	Wiebe, Robert H.
past caretaking standard, effect of, 452, 454, 455, 456	on elitism, 489
relationship categories for purposes of, 122, 124	Williams, Linda
two-parent model rejected for purposes of, 128	on sexual abuse of children, 115
Volitional obligation	Wilson, James Q.
in child support (See Child support)	on decline of two-parent family, 413, 414, 415
	on honor and family, 42
Waiting periods	on obligation and family, 41
domestic partnerships, proposal for	Wilson, Robin Fretwell
generally, 317, 318	on "de facto" parents, 90, 120
common law marriage, problems compared with,	Introduction by, 1, 7
318	Wisconsin
Scott, Elizabeth, on, 317	"de facto" parents, rights of in, 117
Principles neglecting as alternative to divorce, 23	imputation of income to stay-at-home parents in, 157
Wald, Michael	joint custody in, 457
on child abuse and neglect, 497	protection of interests of children by attorneys in, 83
Wallerstein, Judith	"Women's Covenant" and premarital agreements
on dissolution without obligation, honor or shame,	generally, 400, 403
43, 44	domestic violence as reason for incorporation of, 401,
on sexual abuse of children, 111	402
Wardle, Lynn D.	furthering Principles, incorporation of as, 403
on equivalence of domestic partnerships with	Grutter v. Bollinger, citation of in, 399
marriage, 362	jurisprudence of monitoring bodies, 406
on fault	reasons for incorporation of, 400, 401
generally, 27	United States not party to, 398
and "private ordering," 304	wage disparity as reason for incorporation of, 402,
on infidelity, 360	403
on undermining of traditional marriage in Principles,	Woodhouse, Barbara Bennett
346, 362	on drafters' "fear of fault," 26