

## INTERNATIONAL LAW AND ITS OTHERS

Institutional and political developments since the end of the Cold War have led to a revival of public interest in, and anxiety about, international law. Liberal international law is appealed to as offering a means of constraining power, representing universal values and governing relations between sovereign states. This book brings together scholars who draw on jurisprudence, philosophy, legal history and political theory to analyse the stakes of this turn to international law. These essays explore the history of relations between international law and those it defines as other – other traditions (theology, philosophy, morality, economics), other logics (sacrifice, war, despotism, calculation), other forces (God, desire, markets, imperialism) and other groups (indigenous peoples, corporations, barbarians, terrorists). The authors explore the archive of international law as a record of attempts by scholars, bureaucrats, decision-makers and legal professionals to think about what happens to law at the limits of modern political organization. The result is a rich array of responses to the question of what it means to speak and write about international law in our time.

ANNE ORFORD is Chair of Law and Director of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at the University of Melbourne.



# INTERNATIONAL LAW AND ITS OTHERS

Edited by
ANNE ORFORD





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521859493

© Cambridge University Press 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85949-3 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-85949-2 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Hamish and Felix



#### CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	page	ix
Notes on the contribute	ors	X

1 A jurisprudence of the limit 1
ANNE ORFORD

# PART I Sovereignty otherwise

- Speaking law: on bare theological and cosmopolitan sovereignty 35
   COSTAS DOUZINAS
- 3 Law as conversation 57
  IAN DUNCANSON
- 4 Corporate power and global order 85
  DAN DANIELSEN
- 5 Seasons in the abyss: reading the void in *Cubillo* 100 CONNAL PARSLEY

# PART II Human rights and other values

- 6 Reassessing international humanitarianism: the dark sides 131
- 7 Trade, human rights and the economy of sacrifice 156
  ANNE ORFORD

vii



viii CONTENTS

- 8 Secrets of the fetish in international law's messianism 197 JUDITH GRBICH
- Human rights, the self and the other: reflections on a pragmatic theory of human rights
   ELORIAN F. HOFFMANN

#### PART III The relation to the other

- 10 Completing civilization: Creole consciousness and international law in nineteenth-century Latin America 247

  LILIANA OBREGÓN
- 11 From 'savages' to 'unlawful combatants': a postcolonial look at international humanitarian law's 'other' 265

  ERÉDÉRIC MÉGRET
- Lost in translation: re-scripting the sexed subjects of international human rights law
   DIANNE OTTO
- 13 Flesh made law: the economics of female genital mutilation legislation 357

  JULIET ROGERS

### PART IV History's other actors

- 14 On critique and the other 389
  ANTONY ANGHIE
- 15 Afterword: and forward there remains so much we do not know 401
  HILARY CHARLESWORTH AND DAVID KENNEDY

Index 409



#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book developed from the 1st Melbourne Legal Theory Workshop, on the theme of 'International Law and its Others', held at Melbourne Law School in July 2004. I would like to express my gratitude to all the speakers and participants at the workshop for making it such an engaged and lively conversation. The chapters in this collection benefited from discussion and debate at the workshop, in bars and restaurants around Melbourne during breaks from the formal programme, and in ongoing exchanges since. My heart-felt thanks also go to the authors of the chapters collected here, for their wonderful contributions and their good-humoured and timely participation in the process of bringing this book to fruition.

The workshop was made possible by the generous support of the Melbourne Law School and of Michael Crommelin, Dean of the Faculty of Law. I am also very grateful to Gerry Simpson, the co-convenor of the workshop, for his initial suggestion that we hold such an event and for his ongoing involvement in its planning and organisation. My thanks also go to Amy Harrington for her work in ensuring the workshop ran smoothly.

I owe a particular debt to Megan Donaldson who was the editorial assistant for this book. Her stamina, humour, insight and commitment, together with her ability to develop close readings of chapters, track down references and pick up a misplaced comma at ten paces, have made her absolutely indispensable. I cannot imagine how or when the manuscript would ever have been submitted without her. The commissioning editor at Cambridge University Press, Finola O'Sullivan, has again been a great source of encouragement and advice, and the comments made by the two anonymous referees have been very useful in shaping the collection.

Finally, as always, I would like to thank Andrew Robertson, for his comradeship and critical engagement, his enthusiastic and reassuring support for this project, and his unfailing ability to cheer me on at times when my spirits flag.



#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

Antony Anghie is the Samuel D. Thurman Professor of Law at S. J. Quinney College of Law, University of Utah. His teaching and research interests include public international law, international commercial transactions, jurisprudence and human rights, and he has focused particularly on exploring the colonial foundations of the discipline of international law. He is the author of *Imperialism*, *Sovereignty and the Making of International Law* (2005) and co-editor, with B. S. Chimni, Karin Mickelson and Obiora Okafor, of *The Third World and International Legal Order: Law, Politics and Globalization* (2003).

Hilary Charlesworth is Professor of International Law and Human Rights and Director of the Centre for International Governance and Justice at the Australian National University. She holds an Australian Research Council Federation Fellowship. She has held visiting appointments at Washington and Lee School of Law, Harvard Law School, New York University Law School and the University of Oregon Law School, and was the inaugural President of the Australian and New Zealand Society of International Law.

**Dan Danielsen** is Associate Professor of Law at Northeastern University. He teaches and publishes in the areas of international business regulation, international law, corporations law, conflict of laws and law and economic development. A practitioner with substantial experience in corporate finance, mergers and acquisitions, strategic partnerships and joint ventures, content and technology licensing and corporate strategy, he is currently researching the role of transnational corporations and the governance strategies that might be developed at institutional, national and international levels to harness corporate power for the advancement of social welfare and economic development.

**Costas Douzinas** is Professor of Law and Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Birkbeck College, London. He is the author of a trilogy of books that



#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

contributed to the development of a distinct British corpus of critical legal thought – *Postmodern Jurisprudence: The Law of Text in the Texts of Law* (1991) (with Ronnie Warrington and Shaun McVeigh); *Justice Miscarried: Ethics and Aesthetics in Law* (1994) (with Ronnie Warrington); and *The End of Human Rights: Critical Legal Thought at the Turn of the Century* (2000). His other books include *Law and the Image* (1999) (edited with Lynda Nead) and *Nomos and Aesthetics: Literature, Art, Justice* (2005). He has recently published *Critical Jurisprudence* (2005) (with Adam Gearey). His new books, *Human Rights and Empire* and *Adieu Derrida*, will be published in 2007.

Ian Duncanson is Adjunct Associate Professor at Griffith Law School, and a Research Associate of the Institute of Postcolonial Studies, Melbourne. He has researched and published extensively in the areas of contract law, legal education, legal history, and legal and social theory. He was instrumental in organising the first Law and Society and Law and History Conferences in Australia, now held annually, and regularly contributes to socio-legal and legal theory conferences both in Australia and internationally. His recent work has focused particularly on postcolonial approaches to law, and the position of the refugee in Australia.

**Judith Grbich** is Adjunct Associate Professor at Griffith Law School, and a Research Associate of the Institute of Postcolonial Studies, Melbourne. She is General Editor of the *Australian Feminist Law Journal*, a member of the Editorial Board of the *International Journal for the Semiotics of Law*, and a past President of the Law and Literature Association of Australia. Her research interests include feminist, jurisprudential, postcolonial and psychoanalytic approaches to property and economic law, and she is a co-editor, with Pheng Cheah and David Fraser, of *Thinking through the Body of the Law* (1996).

**Florian F. Hoffmann** is Assistant Professor of Law and Deputy Director of the Núcleo de Direitos Humanos at Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro. His research interests include international legal theory and the theory and practice of human rights, and he has recently been awarded the 'Premio Mauro Cappelletti' by the European University Institute for his doctoral thesis, 'Are Human Rights Transplantable? Reflections on a Pragmatic Theory of Human Rights under Conditions of Globalization'. Within the Núcleo de Direitos Humanos he is currently coordinating a research project examining the interaction of international trade,

хi



xii

#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

development and human rights from the perspective of the global South, and a collaborative study with a Brazilian non-governmental organization on rights consciousness, access to justice and alternative means of realizing human rights.

**David Kennedy** is the Manley O. Hudson Professor of Law at Harvard Law School, and Director of the European Law Research Center. He has been a visiting scholar and professor at a number of institutions, most recently at the Université de Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne (2005), and worked in both private practice and various international organisations, including the European Commission and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. Founder of the New Approaches to International Law project, he draws on sociology and social theory to explore issues of global governance, development and the role of the international lawyer. Recent publications include *The Dark Sides of Virtue: Reassessing International Humanitarianism* (2004) and *The Canon of American Legal Thought* (2006).

**Frédéric Mégret** is an Assistant Professor at McGill University where he holds the Canada Research Chair on the Law of Human Rights and Legal Pluralism. He has researched widely in international law, with a particular focus on international humanitarian law and international criminal law. Before moving to McGill, he was a research associate at the European University Institute and an Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law at the University of Toronto. He has also been a member of the French delegation to the Rome Conference that created the International Criminal Court, has worked for the International Committee of the Red Cross, assisted defence counsel for an accused before the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, and, most recently, advised the Liberian government on a human rights vetting programme for the Liberian armed forces. He is the author of *Le Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda* (2002), and co-editor, with Philip Alston, of *The United Nations and Human Rights: A Critical Appraisal* (2006).

**Liliana Obregón** is Director of the International Law Program and Assistant Professor of Law, Universidad de los Andes Law School, Bogotá. An SJD graduate of Harvard Law School, she teaches and researches international law, particularly the history and theory of international law in Latin America. Prior to attending Harvard, she received her master's degree from the School of Advanced International Studies at Johns Hopkins University and worked as the publications and research director of the Center for Justice and International Law in Washington DC (1993–6). She has



#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

also been a Research Associate and acting Associate Director of the Global Studies Program, University of Wisconsin, Madison (2001–2), as well as a visiting professor at the University of Florida, Gainesville (2004). She is currently working on a book, *Completing Civilization: Nineteenth Century Criollo Interventions in International Law.* 

Anne Orford is Chair of Law and Director of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at the University of Melbourne. She teaches and researches in the areas of history and theory of international law, international economic law, international human rights law, international law and security, postcolonial theory and feminist theory. She has been a Senior Emile Noël Research Fellow at the Jean Monnet Center, New York University Law School (2003) and a visiting professor at Lund University (2005). Her publications include *Reading Humanitarian Intervention: Human Rights and the Use of Force in International Law* (2003), in which she develops critical readings of the narratives that underpinned militarized humanitarian interventions in the 1990s. More recently, she has explored the legal engagement with economic globalization by reading the functional and pragmatic texts of international economic law for the politics they represent and the concepts (such as gift, sacrifice, responsibility and risk) upon which they depend.

Dianne Otto is an Associate Professor of Law at the University of Melbourne. She teaches and researches in international law, human rights and criminal law, with a particular interest in drawing on feminist, postcolonial and queer theory to recover voices and interests marginalized by mainstream legal discourse. She is Director of the International Human Rights Law Program of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at the University of Melbourne. In 2004, she spent a semester at Albany Law School in New York as the Kate Stoneman Visiting Professor of Law and Democracy. Recent publications include 'Disconcerting "Masculinities": Reinventing the Gendered Subject(s) of International Human Rights Law', in Doris Buss and Ambreena Manji (eds.), International Law: Modern Feminist Approaches (2005), and 'Securing the "Gender Legitimacy" of the UN Security Council: Prising Gender from its Historical Moorings', in Hilary Charlesworth and Jean-Marc Coicaud (eds.), Faultlines of International Legitimacy (2006). She is also active in several human rights NGOs including International Women's Rights Action Watch, Asia-Pacific, and the Women's Economic Equality Project.

**Connal Parsley** is currently teaching critical legal theory in the School of Law, University of Melbourne. His research interests stem from his

xiii



xiv

#### NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

undergraduate studies in structural and poststructural linguistics as well as jurisprudence. Connal has researched and published in the areas of linguistics, philosophy of law and sovereignty, and law, art and aesthetics, particularly with regard to public art and the figure of the asylum seeker. He has recently commenced a Master of Laws which will consider some relations between law, language, truth and the body in the work of Giorgio Agamben, amongst others.

**Juliet Rogers** is currently teaching and completing her PhD in the School of Law, University of Melbourne, and her MA in (clinical) psychoanalysis at Victoria University of Technology, Australia. She has researched in the areas of 'freedom, psychosis and democracy', Western legal interventions into 'female circumcision', and community consultation within multicultural landscapes, and has published internationally on these issues. She is currently researching a psychoanalytic jurisprudence of criminal law and sovereignty.