

Index

Abaye, R., 96-102 Abimai, 179–86, 213 absolution of payment due, oaths taken for, 55-64 abstract concepts, textual continuity in common use of, 64-73 aggadah, transmissional life of, 118 Akiba, R., 79, 157, 158, 208–18 Alt, Albrecht, 123 ambiguous cases. See borderline or ambiguous cases amoraim, 33 analytic aspect of oral transmission, 7, authority of Mishnah dependent on study and interpretation, 116 borderline or ambiguous cases, interest in, 127, 155-67 casuistic form, analytic process required by,127, 139, 149. See also casuistic form development of, 30 dispute form, use or nonuse of, 158, 161, 165, 191 historical reliability of cases cited, 152, improbable cases, interest in, 126, 150-54, 186, 187

omnisignificance and narrow exegetical focus. See omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical focus on specific language pedagogical purpose of Mishnah, 167-73 performance, analytical function of, 221-22 re-oralization of study practices, serial events of renewed composition, Parry-Lord theory of, 13 talmudic sages' exegesis shaped by, 174-79, 218-19. See also talmudic sages, study practices of apodosis. See casuistic form atomization of text. See omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical focus on specific language authoritative sources used to resolve logically unsolvable cases, 187 authority of Mishnah, 77-81 analysis of text, dependent on, 116 biblical Scripture, m. Shev.'s treatment as, 78, 84–85, 115 development of, 6, 29, 74-76, 77-81, 115–16, 221

237



Index

authority of Mishnah (cont.) distinctive interpretive style of, 30 divine nature of text, relationship of intentionality of mishnaic other exegetical assumptions to, compositional process, assumption of, 109-15 intentionality of mishnaic omnisignificance of and narrow compositional process exegetical focus on mishnaic text, Bavli's reading of m. Shev. 3:2-3, 93-104 organization and structure, 33-34 redactional layers within, 82, 83 increasing importance given to, 81, tekyu or unsolvable cases, 186-91, 104-16 208-18 Yerushalmi on m. Shev. 3:8, 106-09 Lieberman's "authoritative copy" Yerushalmi, responding to elements of, theory, 19-22 95, 97 literary form, as correlative of, 75, Benovitz, Moshe, 205-06 79-80, 116 Bible multiform nature of, 74 authority of Mishnah and its treatment omnisignificance and narrow exegetical as biblical Scripture, 78, 84-85, 115 focus. See omnisignificance of and casuistic form in, 123-28 commandments of, validity of oaths narrow exegetical focus on specific taken to violate or keep, 159-64 language shift in perspective leading to fixing of divine nature of, relationship of other exegetical assumptions to, 115 Mishnah's relationship to, 2, 6, 33, 57 talmudic commentaries revealing, 81-83, 115-16 roots of mishnaic and tosephtic textual corruption theories, concepts in, 69-72 Tosephta's use of prooftexts from, 57 assumptions behind, 24-29 borderline or ambiguous cases, 179 ba'aya-type problems, 211 analytic aspect of oral transmission Babylonian Talmud. See Bavli revealed by interest in, 127, 155-67 bailees, financial liability of, in m. Shev. combined use of borderline, tekyu, and 8:6, 131-40 mai nafka mina techniques to reach Bavli (Babylonian Talmud or b. Shevuot), diametrically opposed conclusions, 208-18 assumptions for reading Mishnah, 162 deep and complex thought about legal borderline cases applications, encouraging, 186 combined use of borderline, tekyu, hava amina formula used in Bayli, 198, and mai nafka mina techniques to reach diametrically opposed mai nafka mina cases, 191-97, 208-18 conclusions, 208-18 in mishnaic exegesis by talmudic sages, hava amina formula used for, 198, 197–208 new source of ambiguity, talmudic plausible alternative ruling, sages' exegesis presenting, 207 presentation of, 199-208 opposing or "wrong" view, intellectual dating and development of mishnaic stretch provided by leading with, authoritativeness in comparison to Yerushalmi, 81 pedagogical use of, 165-67, 179-86



Index

plausible alternative ruling, talmudic sages' search for, 199 tekyu or unsolvable cases compared to, Bottéro, Jean, 125, 147 Braitha, 117 burning another's grain pile on Sabbath vs. Yom Kippur, 150-54 camels, flying, 106-09 Carruthers, Mary, 11, 13, 119 casuistic form, 122 analytic process required by, 127, 139, in Bible and ancient Near Eastern legal codes, 123-28 borderline or ambiguous cases. See borderline or ambiguous cases clarification and refinement of general principle through series of variant cases, 145-49 as dominant literary convention in Mishnah, 128 existing general principles demonstrated by following particular cases, 130 explanatory clauses, use of, 140 explicit vs. implicit expression of general principle, 140, 147 general principles illustrated by particular cases, 128-41 "if (protasis) . . . then (apodosis) , , ," formula as defining feature of, 124, improbable cases, interest in, 126, 150-54, 186, 187 inclusion vs. exclusion in a general rule, 144-45, 149 philosophical purpose and underlying logic of case patterns in, 140, 145 series of cases introducing variables to prototype case, 125-26, 141-49, 173 specific cases leading to formulation of general principles, 131-40 successive pairs of cases, 144-45 Talmuds dominated by, 175

civil and criminal norms, culpability in single act violating both, 153 collection or recovery of payment due, oaths taken for, 55-64, 155-57 compositional building blocks of oral transmission, 40, 220-21 common use of formulaic phrases, 55-64 overarching structural framework, 41-55 shared conceptual or thematic concerns, 64-73 concepts, textual continuity in common use of, 64-73 continuity between texts, nonliteral. See textual continuity not dependent on textual fixity criminal and civil norms, culpability in single act violating both, 153 cuneiform codes, casuistic form in, 123-28 declarative oaths, 31 commandments, validity of oaths taken to violate or keep, 159–64 multiple oaths as borderline or ambiguous case with pedagogical purpose, 179-86 as mai nafka mina case, 191-97 plausible alternative ruling presented in mishnaic exegesis by talmudic sages, 199-208 prohibited foods eaten after oath taken not to eat Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, 93-104, 109-15 Mishnah and Tosephta compared, Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to, 86-93 recovery or collection of payment due, oaths taken for, 55-64, 155-57 tekyu case on oath not to eat dust, trace amounts and oaths not to eat, 208-18



Index

deposit, oaths of fluid vs. fixed nature of oral text, 4-8, common structural framework in m. Shev. and t. Shev. regarding, 41-55 Finnegan's demonstration of fixed defined, 31, 32 exemplars, 15-16 origins of term, 45 Jaffee's explanation of transition dietary laws between, 76 explicit prohibition of, vs. oath not to Lieberman's "authoritative copy" consume, trace amounts, 215 theory, assumption of rote prohibited foods eaten after oath taken memorization of fixed text in, 20 Neusner's explanation of mnemonic Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, features, 21-22 Parry-Lord theory of, 9-14 93-104, 109-15 Mishnah and Tosephta compared, shift in perspective, 23-24 textual continuities indicating nonrote Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as method of reproducing tradition, 73. to, 86-93 See also textual continuity not dependent on textual fixity tekyu case on oath not to eat dust, flying camels vs. flying mice, 106-09 186-91 Foley, John Miles, 15, 39 trace amounts and oaths not to eat, forbidden foods eaten after oath taken not 208-18 Dimi, R., 193 dispute form, use or nonuse of, 158, 161, Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, 165, 191 93-104, 109-15 dissenting views, Mishnah's suppression Mishnah and Tosephta compared, double jeopardy for single violation of Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to, both criminal and civil norms, 86-93 avoidance of, 153 "forced" interpretations, 177, 205 dust, tekyu case on oath not to eat, 186-91 formulaic phrases used in oral composition different phrases used to express same Eleazar ben Pedat, 199 underlying concept, 73 Epstein, J. N., 25-27 Parry-Lord theory, 38, 40 excluded middles, 46, 150 textual continuity shown in common exegesis. See analytic aspect of oral transmission; talmudic sages, study use of, 55-64 Fraade, Steven, 16, 22, 24, 120, 121 practices of function of Mishnah financial liability of guardians of others' as both pedagogical and legal text, property, 131-40 financial vs. nonfinancial disputes, false dissenting views, presumptions swearing as to, 150-54 regarding Mishnah's suppression of, Finkelstein, J. J., 125, 126 Finnegan, Ruth, 15, 120 as legal code, 1, 100, 123, 154, 171-73 fixed or formulaic phrases. See formulaic as pedagogical tool. See pedagogical phrases used in oral composition purpose of Mishnah



gemara, 33. See also Talmud

Cambridge University Press 0521857503 - Transmitting Mishnah: The Shaping Influence of Oral Tradition Elizabeth Shanks Alexander Index More information

Index

general principles illustrated by particular cases in casuistic form, 128-41. See also casuistic form Goldberg, Abraham, 158, 168 grain pile of another burnt on Sabbath vs. Yom Kippur, 150-54 "Great Divide" between orality and literacy, theories nuancing, 14-18 guardians of others' property, financial liabilities of, 131-40 guslari (Yugoslavian storytellers), Parry and Lord's study of, 11-12, 48, 53 Haifa, 179-86, 213 halakhah, transmissional life of, 118 Halbertal, Moshe, 174 Halivni, David Weiss, 117, 122, 177, 205 HaMeiri, 137, 161 Handelman, Susan, 121 hava amina formula used in Bavli, 198, 215 Hayes, Christine, 80, 96 historical reliability of cases cited, 152, 186 Homeric epics, oral textuality of, 10-11, 13, "if (protasis) . . . then (apodosis) . . . " formula as defining feature of casuistic form, 124, 128. See also casuistic form improbable cases, interest in, 126, 150-54, 186, 187 intentionality of mishnaic compositional Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, 109-15 increasing importance given to, 81,

Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to,

aspect of oral transmission; talmudic

interpretation and study. See analytic

invalid oaths. See vain or invalid oaths

Islamic conceptualization of Quran as associated with its literary form, 116

sages, study practices of

Jacobs, Louis, 187 Jaffee, Martin, 17, 22-23, 36, 48, 76, 120 Jose ben Bun, R., 81 Judah the Patriarch, R., 2, 25, 26, 78, 168, 171 judges Mishnah viewed as resource for, 170 oaths of, 141-44 Kehati, Pinchas, 50 Kugel, James, 84, 115 large rather than small things, mishnaic composer's stylistic preference for, 106-09 legal analysis and Mishnah transmission. See analytic aspect of oral transmission; casuistic form legal codes ancient Near Eastern, casuistic form in, Mishnah viewed as, 1, 100, 123 Lieberman, Saul, 19-22, 24 literary textuality authority of Mishnah associated with its literary form, 75, 79-80, 116 bias in favor of, 5 exegetical focus. See omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical focus on specific language fluid vs. fixed nature of. See fluid vs. fixed nature of oral text "Great Divide" between orality and literacy, theories nuancing, 14-18 interplay of orality and literacy in Mishnah, 18-24 omnisignificance. See omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical focus on specific language textual corruption theories assuming, 24-29, 178, 204-07 Lord, Albert on ornamentation, 48, 53 on textual continuity, 35, 38, 39, 40 theory of oral composition, 5, 9-14

241

106-09



Index

mai nafka mina cases, 191-97, 208-18 6:1, series of prototype and variant Margulies, Moses (Pene Moshe), 186, 194, cases, 141-44 7:1-7, common fixed phrases in parallel Matniah, R., 108 Tosephta text, 41-55 7:4, use of borderline or ambiguous Meir, R., 79, 156, 157, 199 memory and memorization, 119. See also cases as analytic aspect of oral fluid vs. fixed nature of oral text transmission, 155-57 mice, flying, 106-09 8:6, specific cases leading to formulation midrashic texts, 33 of general principles, 131-40 Mishnah and m. Shevuot, 8-9 authority of. See authority of Mishnah 3:1, combined use of borderline, tekyu, biblical text, relationship to, 2, 6, 33, 57 and mai nafka mina techniques to centrality of text to rabbinic reach diametrically opposed curriculum, 174 conclusions in Bavli's reading, definition and significance of Mishnah, 208-18 3:1-3, omnisignificance of text and dissenting views suppressed in, 165 function of. See function of Mishnah narrow exegetical focus, 86-104 3:2-3, intentionality of mishnaic as legal code, 1, 100, 123, 154, 171-73 compositional process in Bavli's orality and literacy, interplay of, 18-24 organization and structure of, 31-32 reading, 109-15 pedagogical purposes of. See 3:4 as basis for tekyu case in Yerushalmi, pedagogical purpose of Mishnah relationship between Tosephta and common conceptual or thematic Mishnah, 36, 41, 48, 49 concerns in parallel Tosephta text, textual priority vis-à-vis Tosephta, 49, 3:6, use of borderline or ambiguous traditional accounts of origins of, 2, 78 cases as analytic aspect of oral use of terms, 9 transmission, 159-64 multiple oaths 3:7, Bavli's exegesis of, 199-208 as borderline or ambiguous case with 3:8, intentionality of mishnaic pedagogical purpose, 179-86 compositional process in as mai nafka mina case, 191-97 Yerushalmi's reading, 106-09 plausible alternative ruling presented in 4:1 and 4:2, illustrative case appearing mishnaic exegesis by talmudic sages, after citation of general rules in, 199-208 Muslim conceptualization of Quran as 4:3, use of specific case to illustrate associated with its literary form, 116 general principle, 129-30 4:4, clarification and refinement of Near Eastern legal codes, use of casuistic general principle through series of form in, 123-28 variant cases, 145-49 Neusner, Jacob, 6, 21-22, 50, 121, 144-45, 4:6-7, mishnaic use of improbable cases 150, 154 to illustrate theoretical points across legal spectrum, 150-54 oaths 5:4-5, common structural framework of declarative. See declarative oaths

of deposit. See deposit, oaths of

parallel Tosephta text, 41-55



Index

multiple. See multiple oaths written form, oral life of m. Shev. after testimonial. See testimonial oaths development of, 120-21 vain or invalid. See vain or invalid oaths Oral Torah vs. Written Torah, 3 "Oaths" tractate. See Shevuot ornamentation, 48, 53-54, 166 omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical Palestinian Talmud. See Yerushalmi focus on specific language Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, 93-104 parallel texts, nonliteral continuity increasing attention paid to, 81, 84-104, between. See textual continuity not dependent on textual fixity multiple and mutually exclusive parallelism, use of, 4, 143, 144-45 Parry, Milman, 9-14, 35, 38, 40 interpretations, 99 verbal economy, principle of, 80, 88 pedagogical purpose of Mishnah, 1, 167-73 Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to, advanced vs. beginning students, 54, opposing or "wrong" view, intellectual analytic aspect of oral transmission and, stretch provided by leading with, 154, 158, 167-73 borderline or ambiguous cases, 165-67, 213-14 oral textuality analytic aspect of. See analytic aspect of joint legal and pedagogical use, 171-73 living teacher, importance of, 170 oral transmission performative effect and, 169-71 casuistic form, analytic process required by oral performance of, 149 tekyu or unsolvable cases, 191 compositional building blocks of, 40, Pene Moshe (Moses Margulies), 186, 194, 195 performance common use of formulaic phrases, analytical function of, 221-22 overarching structural framework, idealized version in collective minds of performers, 39 41-55 shared conceptual or thematic oral texts not distinct from, 14, 22 ornamentation in, 53-55 concerns, 64-73 fluid vs. fixed nature of. See fluid vs. Parry-Lord theory of oral composition fixed nature of oral text in context of, 38 "Great Divide" between orality and pedagogical purpose of performative effect, 169-71 literacy, theories nuancing, 14-18 interplay of orality and literacy in script, written text viewed as, 120-21 Mishnah, 18–24 textual variants as different versions of, nonliteral, nonlinear continuity 37, 220-21 between parallel texts and, 35-40 philosophical purpose and underlying Parry-Lord theory of, 9-14, 35 logic of case patterns in casuistic re-oralization of study practices, form, 140, 145 prohibited foods eaten after oath taken serial events of renewed composition, not to eat understood as, 13 Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, talmudic exegesis adopting analytic 93-104, 109-15 methods of, 177-79. See also talmudic Mishnah and Tosephta compared, sages, study practices of 64 - 73



Index

prohibited foods eaten after oath taken not to eat (cont.)
Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to, 86–93
protasis. See casuistic form

Quran's authority associated with its

literary form, 116
Raba, 186–91

Rabbi (Judah the Patriarch), 2, 25, 26, 78,

rabbinical study and interpretation. See analytic aspect of oral transmission; talmudic sages, study practices of Rambam, 137, 161 rapists and seducers, fines and oaths extracted from, 41–55 Rava, 94–103, 189, 199–208 re-oralization of study practices, 214 recovery or collection of payment due, oaths taken for, 55–64, 155–57 repeating phrases, 4 Resh Lakish, 183, 191–97, 199 rhetorical performance and memory, 119 rote memorization of text. See fluid vs.

Sabbath vs. Yom Kippur, burning another's grain pile on, 150–54 sacrificial meat eaten after oath taken not

fixed nature of oral text

Bavli's reading of Mishnah as to, 93–104, 109–15

Mishnah and Tosephta compared, 64–73

Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to, 86–93

scripturalization of Mishnah. See authority of Mishnah

Scripture. See Bible

seducers and rapists, fines and oaths extracted from, 41–55

serial events of renewed composition, oral texts understood as, 13

Shapur (king), 107 Sherira Gaon, R., 78–80, 116 Shevuot, 8–9 b. Shevuot. *See* Bavli Mishnah. *See* Mishnah and m. Shevuot

Mishnah. See Mishnah and m. Shevuot talmudic commentaries on. See Talmud Tosephta. See Tosephta and t. Shevuot y. Shevuot. See Yerushalmi

Shimon, R., 45, 46, 47, 54, 65, 66, 67, 68,

Sifra, 88

Silberg, Moshe, 175

Stock, Brian, 17

structural framework, textual continuity in use of, 41–55

study and interpretation. See analytic aspect of oral transmission; talmudic sages, study practices of

sugya, 34, 95, 114

suppression of dissenting views in Mishnah, 165

Talmud (y. Shevuot and b. Shevuot), 2, 9. See also Bavli; Yerushalmi argumentation and dispute forms used in, 191

authority of Mishnah, study of talmudic commentaries revealing development of, 81–83, 115–16 ascribed intentionality of mishnaic compositional process, 81, 104–15 omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical focus on specific language, 81, 84–104

casuistic form dominating, 175 centrality of Mishnah to structure of, 174

oral analytic practices influencing,

structure and organization, 33–34 use of terms, 33

talmudic sages, study practices of analytic aspect of oral transmission shaping, 174–79, 218–19, 222–23 borderline or ambiguous cases. *See* borderline or ambiguous cases

244



Index

combined use of borderline, tekyu, and themes of oral composition (Parry-Lord mai nafka mina techniques to reach theory), 38, 40 diametrically opposed conclusions, theory of oral composition (Parry-Lord), 208-18 5, 9–14 mai nafka mina cases, 191–97 Tosephta and t. Shevuot, 32 Mishnah's centrality to, 174 biblical prooftexts used in, 57 mishnaic exegesis, 33, 197-208 common conceptual or thematic textual corruption theories, 178, 204-07 concerns in Mishnah and, 64-73 unsolvable or tekyu cases, 186-91 common fixed phrases in Mishnah and, tannaim, 4 characterizations of, 118 common structural framework of Lieberman's "authoritative copy" theory Mishnah and, 41-55 relationship between Mishnah and, 36, Mishnah regarded as tannaitic 41, 48, 49 document, 32 textual priority vis-à-vis Mishnah, 49, Tosephta regarded as tannaitic 53, 54 document, 32 trace amounts tekyu or unsolvable cases, 186-91, 208-18 dust, tekyu case on oath not to eat, testimonial oaths administration of, 129-30 explicit prohibition of vs. oath not to defined, 31 consume, 215 denial of knowledge by pairs of oaths not to eat and dietary laws witnesses, 145-49 generally, 208-18 financial liabilities of guardians of tractate Shevuot, 8-9 others' property, 131-40 Mishnah. See Mishnah and m. Shevuot financial vs. nonfinancial disputes, false talmudic commentaries on. See Bavli; swearing as to, 150-54 Talmud; Yerushalmi judges' oaths, 141-44 Tosephta. See Tosephta and t. Shevuot textual continuity not dependent on transmission of Mishnah. See more textual fixity, 29, 35-40, 220-21 specific entries, e.g., analytic aspect common use of formulaic phrases, of oral transmission multiform nature of tradition unsolvable or tekyu cases, 186-91, 208-18 illustrated by, 74 nonrote method of reproducing vain or invalid oaths commandments, oaths taken to violate tradition, 73 overarching structural framework, 41-55 or keep, 159-64 shared conceptual or thematic multiple oaths concerns, 64-73 as borderline or ambiguous case with three elements of, 40 pedagogical purpose, 179-86 textual corruption theories as mai nafka mina case, 191-97 authority of Mishnah, 24-29 plausible alternative ruling presented talmudic sages' exegetical practices and, in mishnaic exegesis by talmudic 178, 204-07 sages, 199-208 thematic concepts, textual continuity in tekyu case on oath not to eat dust, common use of, 64-73 186-91



Index

vain or invalid oaths (*cont.*) Yerushalmi's reading of Mishnah as to, 106–09 verbal economy, principle of, 80, 88

Westbrook, Raymond, 125, 127, 147 Written Torah vs. Oral Torah, 3 "wrong" or opposing view, intellectual stretch provided by leading with, 213–14

Yates, Frances, 119
Yehudah, R. (father of R. Matniah),
108
Yehudah ben Beterah, R., 160, 163–64
Yehuda ben Nahmani, R., 4
Yerushalmi (Palestinian Talmud or y.
Shevuot), 2, 9, 33–34
Bavli responding to elements of, 95,
97

borderline or ambiguous case with pedagogical purpose, 179-86 dating and development of mishnaic authoritativeness in comparison to Bavli, 81 intentionality of mishnaic compositional process, assumption of, 106-09 mai nafka mina case, 191–97 omnisignificance of and narrow exegetical focus on mishnaic text, organization and structure, 33-34 tekyu or unsolvable cases, 188 Yohanan, R., 138, 183, 191-97, 199 Yom Kippur vs. Sabbath, burning another's grain pile on, 150-54 Yose, R., 90–93, 95–97, 156, 157, 185, 186 Yugoslavian storytellers (guslari), Parry and Lord's study of, 11-12, 48