Feedback in Second Language Writing
THE CAMBRIDGE APPLIED LINGUISTICS SERIES

Series editors: Michael H. Long and Jack C. Richards

This series presents the findings of work in applied linguistics that are of direct relevance to language teaching and learning and of particular interest to applied linguists, researchers, language teachers, and teacher trainers.

Recent publications in this series:

- Cognition and Second Language Instruction edited by Peter Robinson
- Computer Applications in Second Language Acquisition by Carol A. Chapelle
- Contrastive Rhetoric by Ulla Connor
- Corpora in Applied Linguistics by Susan Hunston
- Criterion-referenced Language Testing by James Dean Brown and Thom Hudson
- Critical Pedagogies and Language Learning by Bonny Norton and Kelleen Toobey
- Culture in Second Language Teaching and Learning edited by Eli Hinkel
- Exploring the Dynamics of Second Language Writing edited by Barbara Kroll
- Exploring the Second Language Mental Lexicon by David Singleton
- Focus on Form in Classroom Second Language Acquisition edited by Catherine Doughty and Jessica Williams
- Immersion Education: International Perspectives edited by Robert Keith Johnson and Merrill Swain
- Insights into Second Language Reading: A Cross-Linguistic Approach by Keiko Koda
- Interfaces Between Second Language Acquisition and Language Testing Research edited by Lyle F. Bachman and Andrew D. Cohen
- Learning Vocabulary in Another Language by I. S. P. Nation
- Network-based Language Teaching edited by Mark Warschauer and Richard Kern
- Pragmatics in Language Teaching edited by Kenneth R. Rose and Gabriele Kasper
- Research Genres: Explorations and Applications by John Swales
- Research Perspectives on English for Academic Purposes edited by John Flowerdew and Matthew Peacock
- Researching and Applying Metaphor edited by Lynne Cameron and Graham Low
- Second Language Vocabulary Acquisition edited by James Coady and Thomas Huckin
- Sociolinguistics and Language Teaching edited by Sandra Lee McKay and Nancy H. Hornberger
- Teacher Cognition in Language Teaching: Beliefs, Decision-Making, and Classroom Practice by Devon Woods
- Text, Role, and Context by Ann M. Johns
- Understanding Expertise in Teaching: Case Studies of Language Teacher Development by Amy B. M. Tsui
This book is for our parents, Barbara, Gwen, Les, and Mac.
For so many things.
Contents

Contributors xi
Series editors’ preface xiii
Preface x

Chapter 1 Contexts and issues in feedback on L2 writing: An introduction 1
Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland

I SITUATING FEEDBACK: SOCIOCULTURAL DIMENSIONS 21

Chapter 2 Sociocultural theory: A framework for understanding the social-cognitive dimensions of peer feedback 23
Olga S. Villamil and María C. M. de Guerrero

Chapter 3 Cultural issues in peer response: Revisiting “culture” 42
Gayle Nelson and Joan Carson

Chapter 4 Appropriation, ownership, and agency: Negotiating teacher feedback in academic settings 60
Christine Tardy

II SHAPING FEEDBACK: DELIVERY AND FOCUS DIMENSIONS 79

Chapter 5 Does error feedback help student writers? New evidence on the short- and long-term effects of written error correction 81
Dana Ferris

Chapter 6 Electronic feedback and second language writing 105
Paige D. Ware and Mark Warschauer
Contents

Chapter 7 Resource-rich Web-based feedback: Helping learners become independent writers 123
John Milton

Chapter 8 Feedback in portfolio-based writing courses 140
Liz Hamp-Lyons

Chapter 9 Students and research: Reflective feedback for I-Search papers 162
Ann M. Johns

III NEGOTIATING FEEDBACK: INTERPERSONAL AND INTERACTIONAL DIMENSIONS 183

Chapter 10 Feedback and revision in second language writing: Contextual, teacher, and student variables 185
Lynn Goldstein

Chapter 11 Interpersonal aspects of response: Constructing and interpreting teacher written feedback 206
Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland

Chapter 12 Formative interaction in electronic written exchanges: Fostering feedback dialogue 225
Ann Hewings and Caroline Coffin

Chapter 13 Scaffolded feedback: Tutorial conversations with advanced L2 writers 246
Robert Weissberg

Chapter 14 “You cannot ignore”: L2 graduate students’ response to discipline-based written feedback 266
Ilona Leki

Author index 287
Subject index 289
Contributors

Joan Carson, Georgia State University, United States
Caroline Coffin, The Open University, England
Dana Ferris, California State University, Sacramento, United States
María C. M. de Guerrero, Inter American University, Puerto Rico
Lynn Goldstein, The Monterey Institute of International Studies, United States
Liz Hamp-Lyons, University of Hong Kong and University of Melbourne, Australia
Fiona Hyland, University of London, England
Ken Hyland, University of London, England
Ann Hewings, The Open University, England
Ann M. Johns, San Diego State University, United States
Ilona Leki, University of Tennessee, United States
John Milton, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology
Gayle Nelson, Georgia State University, United States
Christine Tardy, DePaul University, United States
Olga S. Villamil, Inter American University, Puerto Rico
Paige D. Ware, Southern Methodist University, United States
Mark Warschauer, University of California, Irvine, United States
Robert Weissberg, New Mexico State University, United States
Series editors’ preface

Approaches to second language writing pedagogy have traditionally attributed a primary role to feedback, whether generated by the learner, a peer, a computer, or a teacher and whether occurring through error correction, self-editing, peer feedback, or conferencing. However, as the field of second language writing instruction has changed its focus from skills to process and then to genre, and most recently to sociocultural considerations, issues related to the nature, form, and value of feedback have had to be reexamined. The papers in this book provide the basis for such a reexamination by presenting a variety of research-based perspectives on the status and practice of feedback in second language writing.

Research into the role of feedback in L2 writing reveals that there are no simple answers to questions such as which activities merit feedback, how and when to give feedback, and what the benefits of giving feedback are. These questions are examined from different perspectives in this book, particularly in relation to writing in academic settings. The nature of feedback and revision, the effects of feedback on student writing, strategies for the delivery of feedback, the role of teachers’ and learners’ beliefs and expectations, as well as the influence of social, cultural, and contextual factors, are shown to be relevant to our understanding. The contributors draw on an extensive body of research to clarify the issues involved in understanding the nature of feedback and to draw implications for the teaching of L2 writing. This book provides a valuable source of information for researchers, teachers, and others interested in the role of feedback in the development of composition skills and confidence for second language students.

Michael H. Long
Jack C. Richards
Providing feedback to students, whether in the form of written commentary, error correction, teacher-student conferencing, or peer discussion, has come to be recognized as one of the ESL writing teacher’s most important tasks, offering the kind of individualized attention that is otherwise rarely possible under normal classroom conditions. Teachers are now very conscious of the potential feedback has for helping to create a supportive teaching environment, for conveying and modeling ideas about good writing, for developing the ways students talk about writing, and for mediating the relationship between students’ wider cultural and social worlds and their growing familiarity with new literacy practices.

However, despite the major part feedback plays in modern writing classrooms and in the lives of all teachers and learners, book-length treatments of the topic are rare, and much of the research published in journals fails to find its way to teachers. This volume sets out to address these gaps by providing readers with a clear synthesis of theory and practice, highlighting what is conceptually and pedagogically significant and offering a clear picture of the key issues in feedback today. We attempt to bring together theoretical understandings and practical applications of feedback for teachers, researchers, and others working in the fields of second language teaching and literacy studies.

We do this by focusing such key issues through three broad lenses. The first situates feedback in the context of the wider institutional, social, political, and cultural factors which have been found to influence how feedback is received and given. The second looks more closely at the “how” and “what” of feedback – the ways it is shaped through its modes of delivery and its form. The third is concerned with the negotiation of feedback in the relationships between providers and receivers, addressing issues that arise in the social interactions around feedback itself. These three lenses are not meant to imply divisions among context, delivery, and interaction, as it is evident that every act of feedback will involve a complex interaction among all three. They do, however, allow the authors to focus on one or another salient feature of the process and what each means for participants.
Another important feature of the book is that it takes a broad view of feedback on writing. In the following chapters, distinguished figures in the field of second language writing go beyond discussions of grammar and error correction to look at responses by peers, teachers, computers, and the self; to explore modes such as oral, written, computer-modeled, and electronically mediated feedback; to examine the kinds of commentary given on form, organization, academic conventions, and meaning; to study the preferences students have for different kinds of interaction and commentary; and to analyze the kinds of comments that are given and the issues that teachers consider when framing them. While the book provides no clear-cut, unequivocal answers to many questions raised by the practical use of feedback in second language writing classrooms, it nevertheless poses the most interesting of those questions and shows that there is a vast array of potential answers that we might explore.

Finally, we have tried to make the volume as useful to teachers and researchers as possible. Rather than dwell on the abstract benefits of various feedback practices, the authors take care to link research with practice, highlighting what the research tells us about feedback and exploring its relevance for the classroom. The volume goes a long way toward answering questions that researchers and teachers have been asking for some time. These questions include: “What shall I give feedback on?,” “How shall I express it?,” “What mode should I use?,” “How will this affect my relationship to this student?,” and “Will this make a difference to students’ writing?” Thus, each chapter gives teachers and researchers a clear, complete perspective on current issues that can provide a basis for classroom practice or research into this fascinating and fundamental area.

Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland