

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

Note: Entries followed by a lowercase *f* or *t* represent subject material contained in figures or tables.

- abduction, or inference to the best explanation, 17, 68–69
- acceptability judgments: and
 - competence–performance distinction, 232; and distinction with grammaticality judgments in linguistics, 233–235, 238–239, 248–251; and distinction with permissibility judgments in moral theory, 251–252
- acquisition models, of language and morality, 88–91
- act (action): basic, 176; and circumstances, 81, 86–87, 112f, 125–129, 132, 255; and consequences, 80–81, 86–87; definition of, 126; deontic status of, 85; descriptions of, in trolley problems, 81, 112t, 256; distinction with event, 87–88; and distinction between tokens and types, 111–117, 112f, 115–116f, 124–125, 130, 134–136; infinitely varying circumstances of, 81; mental representations of, 114–117; and plans, 118–120, 118–119f, 174f; as primary object of moral judgment, 87–88; structural descriptions of, 118–120; structural features of, 80–81, 85–86, 92–93; and tree diagrams, 39, 118–120, 126–128, 175–178; unconscious appraisals of, 82–85, 111–117, 118–120, 121–122, 162–175; voluntary, 88, 158. *See also* action plans; act trees; directly intended action; harm, and acts; permissible acts; possible acts
- action-descriptions, 81, 256
- action plans, 118–121, 128, 127–128f, 174f
- act-token representation, 129, 176–177. *See also* complex act-token representation
- act trees: definition of, 39; and explanations of variance in trolley problems, 126–8; and structural descriptions, 118–120, 175–178
- Adams, John, 307, 317
- Alexander, Richard, 24
- American Law Institute, 130–131, 134
- Anscombe, G. E. M., 6n7
- appraisal theory, 111–117, 120–122, 162–174
- Aquinas, St. Thomas, 148, 296
- Aristotle, 7n8, 47, 132n4, 219
- Asperger's syndrome, 121
- Austin, John, 50n4, 176
- autism, 121
- Ayer, A. J., 4, 317
- Baier, Kurt, 315n2
- Bain, Alexander, 6n7, 8t, 83n5, 187, 315
- basic action, 176
- battery: definition of, 117, 133–137; derivation of, 171f, 173, 174f; distinction between harmful and offensive, 134n6; division of into purposeful (I-generated) and knowing (K-generated), 136, 146t, 154–156t, 159–161t, 319–350; location of in act trees as element of structural descriptions, 120, 174f; and means-side effect distinction, 118, 154–156t; and moral-conventional distinction, 104; multiple counts of as partial explanation of variance in trolley intuitions, 126–128; and Principle of Double Effect, 149–150; prohibitions of, 133–134, 135–136; and trolley problems generally, 324, 326, 327–329, 331, 334; voluntary act requirement for, 158

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

394

Index

- behavioral adequacy, 29
- behaviorism: and competence–performance distinction, xv, 17–19, 51–55; and contrast with mentalism, 18–19, 236; damage to moral theory caused by, 19; inability to account for projection problem in moral theory, 95; and Kohlberg's moral psychology, 263n15; shift of focus of moral theory away from, 19. *See also* mentalism
- Bentham, Jeremy, 8t, 9n9, 129, 131, 133, 144, 299, 300, 315
- binding theory, 70
- biolinguistics, 23
- Black, Hugo L., 298
- Blackburn, Simon, 221
- Blackstone, William, 133
- Blair, James, 24
- Bloom, Paul, 23
- Botha, R. P., 69n10
- Boyd, Richard, 221
- Bradley, F. H., 20, 83nn4–5
- Brandt, Richard, 5, 8t, 40, 97, 186, 247, 263, 315n2
- Brentano, Franz, 20, 77, 83n5
- Brink, David, 221, 315n2, 316n6
- Broad, C. D., 191, 316n7
- Bromberger, Sylvain, xii, 9n10
- Burlamaqui, Jean Jacques, 303n12
- Butler, Joseph, 88n8, 191, 244, 315n2, 316
- “by” test, as a tool for constructing structural descriptions and act trees, 119–120, 177–178
- Carnap, Rudolf, 193
- categorical imperative, 96, 133
- causal structure, 86, 130–132, 134, 172
- causation: and C-generation (causal generation), 131–132; computational theory of, 132; and definitions of battery and homicide, 134–136; as element of problem of descriptive adequacy and its solution, 86, 117–122; as implied by notion of K-generation, 132; and moral calculus of risk, 135–144; and Periodic Tables of Moral Elements, 154–156t, 159–161t; and Principle of Double Effect, 148–152; and Rescue Principle, 144–148; and Self-Preservation Principle, 136–137; as a universal feature of moral psychology and legal systems, 104–105
- certitude: as criterion of considered judgments, 51–52, 245–246; and distinction with certainty, 245; as property of trolley problem judgments, 97–99. *See also* uncertainty
- ceteris paribus* clause, 144
- C-generation (causal generation), 131–132
- children: intuitive jurisprudence of, 104; linguistic abilities of, 4, 58–60, 70; moral competence of, 258–264, 346–350; and trolley problems, 82, 259–261, 346–350
- Chomsky, Noam: and ambiguity in Quine's notion of grammaticality or meaningfulness, 95–96; and analysis of “knowledge of language,” 24–25, 61–63, 68n9, 220; and argument for linguistic grammar, 17, 46–47, 68, 189; and competence–performance distinction, 17–19, 52–53, 231, 239, 240, 252–253, 255, 257n12; and considered judgments, 264n16; and distinction between descriptive and observational adequacy, 49; and distinction between methodological and metaphysical naturalism, 194n6; and generative grammar, 87, 89–90, 184, 204, 233, 314; and human rights, 299; and I-language interpretations of language, 24–25, 61–63, 211; and linguistic analogy, 3, 8t, 9n9, 64, 98, 102, 104, 175, 229, 262n15; and linguistics and philosophy at MIT, 9n10; and mentalism, 19, 236; nativist, modular, and representationalist theory of mind, 216n15; and new framework for theory of moral cognition, 13–41, 307–308; and problem of language acquisition, 69–70; and rationalism, 4, 48; and scientific revolution, 275–276; and theoretical grammar, 60–61; and transformation of linguistics and psychology, 4, 6
- Cicero, 126, 255, 296
- circumstances: and acts as elements of structural descriptions, 125–130; Bentham on etymology of, 129; Cicero's list of, 126, 255; descriptions of in trolley problems, 111–112; as element of problem of descriptive adequacy and its solution, 48–49, 85–86, 91–93; indefinitely varying quality of, 81; insufficient information about as illustration of poverty of perceptual stimulus, 111–117, 120–121, 162–174; notation of in complex act-token representations, 125; and question-formation in linguistic theory, 255
- closure rule, 132–133, 310. *See also* Principle of Natural Liberty; Residual Permission Principle

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

395

- cognition, as substitute for "knowledge," 68.
See also cognitive science; moral cognition
- cognitive science: and artificial experiments, 94–96, 104; and computational theory, 36–38, 91–93, 102–104, 178; and framing the problem of descriptive adequacy, 87–93; and future of moral philosophy, 11, 317–318; and levels of empirical adequacy, 21–23; and mental representations, 46–48, 114–117; and modularity, 216n15, 314–315; and nativism, 35, 216n15; and Rawls' assumptions about moral development, 35–36; and unconscious inference, 175
- Cognitive Science Society (CSS), 319
- coherentism, 287. *See also* hypothetico-deductive method; reflective equilibrium
- common law: and concepts of "intent," 130–132; and definition of act, 126; and definitions of battery and homicide, 133–136; and Dworkin's constructive model of adjudication, 266, 269–270; and particularism, 72–73; and Rescue Principle, 117, 144; and traditional model of adjudication, 93, 101; and trolley problems, 159–161t, 163–167t; and unreasonable risk (negligence), 140–141, 158, 159–161t
- competence–performance distinction: and basic elements of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 51–56, 59t; in Chomsky's framework, 17–19; and Nagel's criticism of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 228–265; theory-dependence of, 55–56, 59t; and trolley problems, 342
- competent judge: as element of Dworkin's interpretation of Rawls, 266–267, 269–270; as idealized component of explication, 196, 246
- completion, rule for dating of action by time of, 125
- complex action-description, 111.
See also action-descriptions
- complex act-token representation, 117, 124.
See also act-token representation
- complex omission-token representation, 144–145, 147. *See also* omission
- computational theory, 36–38, 91–93, 102–104, 178
- conceptual analysis, 4, 184, 192, 218–219
- Confucianism, and concept of *li*, xv
- conscientia* (conscience), 93; and argument for moral grammar, 44; and distinction with *synderesis*, 93; and Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 307, 317–318
- consent, concept of in definition of battery, 136–137
- consequence, as element of problem of descriptive adequacy and its solution, 86–87
- consequentialism: descriptive inadequacy of simple forms of with respect to trolley problems, 96; and trends in contemporary moral philosophy, 317
- considered judgments: and competence–performance distinction, 51–52, 53; distinction between moral intuitions and, 282–283; distinction between reflective equilibrium and, 99–100; as evidence for moral theory, 236, 282–287; and explication, 196; moral competence and revisability of, 55–56; and moral intuitions of ordinary persons, 237; and Nagel's criticism of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 240–265; and prejudice, 162n11, 263; Rawls' use of concept, 40–41, 221–222; and trolley problems, 86t, 110, 111t
- constituent questions, in linguistic theory, 255
- constructive model (Dworkin), 266–267, 269–271, 273–274, 278t, 280, 294, 304
- constructivism, Rawls on Dworkin's understanding of, 267n1. *See also* social constructivism
- contact, and definition of battery, 134–165
- contractual argument, in *A Theory of Justice*, 198–202
- conversion rules, 117, 120–121, 162–174
- cost-benefit analysis: and moral calculus of risk, 141–143, 158; and Principle of Double Effect, 150–152; and Rescue Principle, 147–148
- criminal law: as element of moral grammar and intuitive jurisprudence, 102–103; and periodic table of moral elements, 158–162; universal grammar of, 105.
See also battery; homicide; legal theory
- Damasio, Antonio, 24
- Damasio, Hanna, 24
- Dancy, Jonathan, 48, 71
- Daniels, Norman, 5, 30, 40, 44n1, 47, 52n5, 186, 198, 211–212, 237n5, 247, 293
- Danto, Arthur, 176
- Darley, John, 5
- Darwall, Stephen, 6n7, 316n6
- Darwin, Charles, 8t, 23, 24n7, 66, 183, 187, 315
- decision procedure, 26, 27

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

396

Index

- deductive-nomological explanation, 91
- degeneracy of stimulus, 70–71
- deontic concepts and deontic modalities in natural language, 104, 105f
- deontic logic: and periodic table of moral elements, 157; and square of opposition and equipollence, 104, 105f
- deontic rules: 117–118, 132–152; and problem of descriptive adequacy, 225
- deontic status: of acts and problem of descriptive adequacy, 85, 86; and periodic table of moral elements, 154t, 156t, 157; and simplifying assumptions in moral grammar hypothesis, 124–125
- deontic structure, as feature of structural descriptions of trolley problems, 173–174
- deontology, and trends in contemporary moral philosophy, 317
- Descartes, René, xvii, 4, 17
- descriptive adequacy: and cognitive science, 87–93; and normative adequacy, 223–224; problem of, 77–100, 195–197; and Rawls' linguistic analogy, 29–30, 37, 48–50, 51, 59t; and trolley problems, 78–82, 106–110, 111f; use of term, 21, 22–23, 28
- descriptive ethics, 29n11, 48–49, 218.
See also descriptive adequacy
- De Waal, Frans, 24
- dharma*, Hindu concept of, xv
- directly intended action, 149, 150.
See also I-generation
- discounted expected benefit, and cost-benefit analysis, 141
- discovery procedure, 26, 27
- Donagan, Alan, xvii, 8t, 97
- Duncan-Jones, Austin, 315n2
- Durkheim, Emile, 189
- Dworkin, Ronald, 5, 7, 40, 41, 42, 58, 66, 186, 198, 204, 214, 266–304, 303n12, 313
- Dwyer, Susan, 3, 8t, 64n7
- Einstein, Albert, xvii
- E-language, 62, 211. *See also* I-language
- E-morality: distinction between I-morality and, 63–64, 266–304. *See also* I-morality
- emotion: and considered judgments, 244–245; and Greene's dual process theory, 121–122; and intuitive appraisal theory, 111–117, 121–122; and overemphasis in recent moral psychology, 178
- empirical adequacy: distinction between normative adequacy and, 183–227; and formal model of moral grammar and intuitive jurisprudence, 123–179; and moral grammar hypothesis, 101–122; and new framework for theory of moral cognition, 21–23, 32; and problem of descriptive adequacy, 77–100, 223–224; use of term, 30n12
- Enlightenment: and competence–performance distinction, 259; and discussions of moral psychology in treatises on moral philosophy, natural law, and law of nations, 5n4; and grounding of human rights in theory of human nature, 296; and moral cognition, 315; and noncognitivism in ethical theory, 218–219; and rationalism, 174–175; and theory of moral sentiments, 216
- equipollence relations, 105f
- ethical theory: and moral intuitions, 248–256; and particularism, 317; and Rawls' use of term “moral theory,” 257; and virtue ethics, 317. *See also* descriptive ethics; metaethical adequacy; moral theory; normative ethics
- evaluation procedure: for grammars, 26, 27; and reflective equilibrium, 213, 272
- evidence, for moral theory, as element of Dworkin's misinterpretation of Rawls, 282–7. *See also* considered judgments, moral intuitions
- evolution: and Darwin's theory of moral sense, 183, 187; of human language, 23–24; of human morality, 23–24, 258–264; and instinct for self-preservation, 172; and moral and intentional structure of trolley problems, 172–173; and origin of prejudice, 258–264
- evolutionary adequacy, 29
- explanandum* phenomenon, 91
- explanatory adequacy: and justice as fairness, 208; and Rawls' linguistic analogy, 29, 33, 51, 59t; and reflective equilibrium, 212–213; and trolley problems, 82; use of term in linguistics and cognitive science, 21–23, 28
- explication, 191–195, 196–197
- express principles, 19–21, 30, 50–51, 59t, 84–85. *See also* operative principles
- extensionality, as property of E-language and E-morality, 62, 64
- externalization, as property of E-language and E-morality, 62, 64, 299, 303

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

397

- fairness, 201–202, 207, 208, 210, 297
 Ferguson, Adam, 3, 7, 8t
 Firth, Roderick, 64n8
 Fletcher, George, 8t, 73n11
 Fodor, Jerry, 35, 68, 149, 216n15
 Foot, Philippa, xvii, 7, 38, 77, 309, 320
 “for the purpose of” test, as tool for
 constructing structural descriptions and
 act trees, 119–120, 177–178
 forbidden acts, 85, 105f, 124
 framing effects, 345–346
 Frankena, William, 8t, 315n2
 Frege, Gottlob, 123
 Freud, Sigmund, vi, xv, 35, 66
 Fried, Charles, xxii, 9n10

 Galileo, 16, 275–276
 Gall, F. J., 315
 Gardner, Howard, 315n2
 generative grammar: Chomsky's concept
 of, 87, 89–90, 204; and competence–
 performance distinction, 233; and problem
 of descriptive adequacy, 87; requirement
 of perfect explicitness, 87; as theory of
 linguistic competence, 53–54; use of term, 14
 generative linguistics: and basic elements
 of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 57; and
 competence–performance distinction, 236,
 238–240; use of term, 13–14
 Geneva Conventions (1949), 335
 Gert, Bernard, 8t, 234–235, 236
 Gibbard, Allan, 6n7, 316n6
 Gilligan, Carol, 7, 8
 Ginét, Carl, xviii, 124
 goal: and action plans, 118–120, 176; and
 recursive definition of I-generation, 131
 goal(s) of moral theory, 6, 14–15, 23–24,
 26–33, 48–49, 67t; as element of Dworkin's
 misinterpretation of Rawls, 276, 277,
 280–282, 293. *See also* descriptive
 adequacy; explanatory adequacy;
 normative adequacy
 Goldman, Alvin, xvii, 3, 8t, 124, 125,
 130, 176
 Goodman, Nelson, 31, 46, 188, 204n10,
 207–208, 209, 212–213, 293, 312
 Gould, Stephen Jay, 23
 grammar: argument for linguistic (Chomsky),
 17, 44–46; argument for mental
 (Jackendoff), 44; argument for moral, 17,
 43–48; argument for tacit knowledge of, 4,
 17, 44; different meanings of in generative
 linguistics, 14, 58–60; distinction between
 theoretical and mental, 22n6, 60–61,
 250; distinction between theoretical and
 pedagogical, 58–60; distinction between
 universal and particular, 14–15; and
 grammaticality judgments of linguists
 versus acceptability judgments of native
 speakers, 232, 233–235, 237–240, 248–249,
 252, 256; and speaker's knowledge of
 language in Chomsky's framework, 15–16;
 as system of unconscious principles or
 rules, 15. *See also* generative grammar;
 linguistic grammar; mental grammar; moral
 grammar; Universal Grammar; Universal
 Moral Grammar
 Green, Leon, 73n11
 Greene, Joshua, 1, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 39, 102,
 112, 113f, 121, 310, 315n2, 338
Griswold v. Connecticut (1965), 298
 Grotius, Hugo, vi, xv, 5n4, 8t, 296, 303n12
*Grounds. See Study in the Grounds of Ethical
 Knowledge, A*
 Guest, Stephen, 299

 Haegeman, Liliane, 233, 239n7, 248–249,
 253n10, 256
 Hague Convention of 1907, 336
 Haidt, Jonathan, 39, 111–112, 113f, 315n2
 Hall, Jerome, 73n11
 Halle, Morris, 69
 Hampshire, Stuart, 8t, 241
 Hand Formula, 140–141
 Hare, R. M., 5, 7, 29n11, 40, 42, 58, 96,
 97, 183–227, 229, 267, 271, 294, 299,
 311–312, 316
 harm: and acts, 145–147, 146t; bodily,
 136; concept of in definition of battery,
 135–136; concept of in moral calculus of
 risk, 137–144; and contact requirement
 in definition of battery, 135–136; and
 distinction between harmful and
 offensive battery, 134n6; and omissions,
 144–145, 146t; and Principle of Double
 Effect, 150–152; and Rescue Principle,
 144–148
 Harman, Gilbert, xxi, 3, 5, 8t, 9n10, 220, 236, 320
 Harrison, Jonathan, 315n2
 Hart, H. L. A., 223, 296
 Hegel, G. W. F., 315–316
 Helmholtz, H. V., 83n5, 175
 Hempel, Carl, 91, 134n5, 193
 Henkin, Louis, 317

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

398

Index

- Hilliard, Francis, 73n11, 135, 324
- Hinduism, and concept of *dharma*, xv
- Hobbes, Thomas, 50n4, 133
- Hofstadter, Richard, 315n3
- Hohfeld, Wesley Newcomb, 178, 299, 300, 301f
- Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 84n5, 101, 176, 299
- homicide: definition of, 117, 133–134; division of into purposeful (I-generated) and knowing (K-generated), 134, 146t, 154–156t, 159–161t, 319–350; location of in act trees as element of moral geometry, 120, 174f; and means-side effect distinction, 118, 154–156t; and Principle of Double Effect, 149; prohibition of, 104, 133–136, 172; as universal feature of legal systems, 104–105
- human nature: and a common moral nature, 296–297, 308, 318; competing accounts of in Freud and St. Paul, xv; and human rights, 296; and mentalism versus behaviorism, 19
- human rights, 57, 295–303, 317–318.
See also rights; Universal Declaration of Human Rights
- Humboldt, Wilhelm von, 35
- Hume, David, xvii, 8t, 35, 42, 72, 187, 208, 294, 296–297, 316, 317
- Hutcheson, Francis, 8t, 20–21, 259, 303n12, 315n2, 317
- hypothetico-deductive method: and coherentism, 287; and common law adjudication, 93, 101, 266, 269–270; and deductive-nomological explanation, 91; and Dworkin's interpretation of Rawls, 289, 291; and medieval theory of conscience, 93; and problem of descriptive adequacy, 91–93; and Rawls' conception of scientific method, 287n5, 288; and reflective equilibrium, 291; use of by Chomsky, 287n5; use of by Kant and Sidgwick, 287n5
- idealization: and considered judgments, 54; and linguistic competence, 233; and moral diversity, 56–57; as property of I-language and I-morality, 25, 26, 62; and Rawls' linguistic analogy, 56–57, 59t, 64–65
- ideal theory, versus non-ideal theory, 199
- I-generation: and act-token representations, 176; definition of, 130–132; and periodic table of moral elements, 154t, 156t; and Principle of Double Effect, 150; and recursive definition, 131.
See also K-generation
- I-language: Chomsky's interpretation of, 211; and competence–performance distinction, 233, 236; explanation of concept, 25, 62–63; and heart of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 67t; and metaethical adequacy, 219–221
- immediacy, as property of moral judgments, 83n4
- I-morality: and Chomsky's concept of I-language, 25–26; and difference between wide and narrow reflective equilibrium, 211; and distinction with E-morality in Dworkin's commentary on Rawls, 266–304; and heart of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 67t; and metaethical adequacy, 219–221; moral theory as theory of, 63–67; and subject matter of moral theory, 276–277
- impartiality, as property of moral judgments, 244–245
- implicit bias, 162n11. *See also* prejudice
- “in order to” test, as tool for constructing structural descriptions and act trees, 119–120, 177–178
- inaction, distinction with omission, 151
- “Independence of Moral Theory, The” (Rawls 1975), 10, 49n3, 65, 66, 190, 198, 210–211, 213–217, 283, 293
- individualization, as property of I-language and I-morality, 25, 62, 63
- induction: and abduction, 17, 68–69; and explication, 192–193; and reflective equilibrium, 207–209
- initial situation, role played by in Rawls' theory of justice, 198, 200, 201, 202
- initial state, role played by in Chomsky's theory of language, 14–15n2
- innateness: Descartes' and Chomsky's dispositional sense of, 17; different views of Reid and Mill on with respect to rules of justice and rules of grammar, 9n9; Dworkin's “profound” interpretation of Rawls and, 266, 268; and initial state of language faculty, 14–15; and language acquisition, 4, 69–71; of moral knowledge or moral principles, xv, 36n16, 82, 183, 187–190, 266, 268, 307, 317–318, 320, 346–350; and moral and intentional structure of trolley problems, 172–173; and nativism in cognitive science, 35–36; and poverty of the stimulus arguments, 14–17, 69–71, 82, 346–347, 349–350. *See also* explanatory

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

399

- adequacy; poverty of the stimulus; Universal Grammar; Universal Moral Grammar
- instantaneous language acquisition, idealization of, 69
- intensionality: as property of I-language and I-morality, 25, 62, 63; and Rawls' conception of moral principles as functions, 64, 66
- intention: in Anglo-American jurisprudence, 130–131; Bentham's distinction between direct and oblique, 131; computational theory of, 130–131; and construction of act trees, 175–178; and definitions of battery and homicide, 134–136; and distinction between intended and foreseen, 130–132; as element of problem of descriptive adequacy and its solution, 86–87, 117–122; and I-generation, 130–132; and means-side effect distinction, 118–121, 154–156t, 159–161t; ordinary language and, 130–131; and Periodic Tables of Moral Elements, 154–156t, 159–161t; and Principle of Double Effect, 148–152; recursive aspect of explication of, 131; and Rescue Principle, 144–148; and theory of mind, 143, 178; as universal feature of moral psychology and legal systems, 104–105; use of by children to distinguish two acts with the same result, 104. *See also* “for the purpose of” test; I-generation, “in order to” test; intentional structure
- intentional structure, 172–173
- intentionalism, as property of I-language and I-morality, 25, 62, 63, 220
- intersubjective stability, 243
- intersubjective validity, 223, 226
- intuition(s), and linguistic judgments of native speakers, 232–236.
See also intuitionism; moral intuitions
- intuitionism: and contrast with justice as fairness, 198; and descriptive adequacy, 133; and Moore, Prichard, and Ross, 316.
See also intuitions; social intuitionist model
- intuitive jurisprudence: and appraisal theory, 111–117, 121–122; formal model of moral grammar and, 123–179; young children's possession of, 104
- Irwin, Terence, xviii, 93n11, 241
- Islamic rationalism, xv
- Jackendoff, Ray, xxi, 17, 58, 68
- Jefferson, Thomas, 307, 317
- justice: and natural rights theory, 297; distinction between conceptions of and concept of, 199; sense of, 4, 65, 66; Rawls' two principles of, 31n13, 200.
See also fairness; social justice
- justification: 191–192, 201–202, 219, 222; and trolley problem experiments, 321–323, 329–330, 332–333t, 340, 345, 348
- Kagan, Jerome, 8t
- Kagan, Shelly, 263, 314
- Kant, Immanuel, 4, 8t, 13, 20, 35, 75–76, 93n12, 96, 123, 131, 191n4, 198, 285, 287n5, 303n12
- Kaplow, Louis, 5
- Katz, Jerrold, 62–63, 64n7, 68, 124, 211
- K-generation: and act-token representations, 176; definition of, 130–132; and periodic table of moral elements, 154t, 156t; and Principle of Double Effect, 148–152; and Rescue Principle, 146–147; and trolley problem experiments, 320–321.
See also I-generation; knowing battery; knowing homicide; knowingly harmful acts and omissions
- knowing battery, representation of, 136
- knowing homicide, representation of, 134, 148
- knowingly harmful acts and omissions, 145, 146t, 147
- knowledge: and competence–performance distinction, 18, 53; and distinction between knowledge how and knowledge that, 68; and justified true belief, 68; and possession of a mental structure, 61–62.
See also moral knowledge
- Kohlberg, Lawrence, 1, 5, 6, 7, 8, 8t, 9, 10, 11, 21, 34, 35, 66, 82n2, 84, 94n12, 96, 189, 243, 262, 263n15, 309, 315n12, 346, 349
- labeled brackets, and linguistic structural descriptions, 253
- language acquisition, psychological and logical versions of problem of, 69–70
- LaPiana, William, 315n3
- legal theory: and formal model of moral grammar and intuitive jurisprudence, 123–179; and human rights, 268, 295–303; and intuitive emotional appraisal, 121–122; and legal positivism, 50n4, 299–300; and moral grammar hypothesis, 101–104; and principle of natural liberty, 132–133; and rule of dating action by time of completion, 125; and structural

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

400

Index

- legal theory (*cont.*)
 descriptions of act-token representations, 125–132; transformation of in past decade, xvi–xvii. *See also* criminal law; human rights; intuitive jurisprudence
- Leibniz, G. W., 4, 20, 35, 36n16, 303n12
- Levi, Edward, 73
- Lewontin, Richard, 23
- li* (Confucian concept), xv
- libertarianism, and principle of natural liberty, 133
- linguistic analogy: basic elements of Rawls', 42–73; concluding remarks on, 314–318; Dworkin's commentary on, 266–304; Hare's and Singer's criticisms of, 183–190, 226–227; Nagel's criticism of, 228–258; place of within history of philosophy, 7–9; preliminary clarifications about, 27–33; and problem of empirical adequacy in moral theory, 77–179; question presented by, 1–12. *See also* moral theory; Universal Grammar, Universal Moral Grammar
- linguistic competence: and competence–performance distinction, 18, 233; Chomsky's use of term, 4. *See also* generative grammar
- linguistic grammar, argument for, 44, 58
- linguistic performance, 15
- linguistic theory: and linguistic intuitions, 248–256; and summary of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 67t; use of term, 13–14
- linguistics: and competence–performance distinction, 54n6, 257–258; influence of Chomsky on, 6; initial comparisons between moral theory and, 14–27; and intuitions of native speakers, 232–236. *See also* generative linguistics; grammar; linguistic analogy; linguistic competency; linguistic grammar; linguistic performance; linguistic theory
- Locke, John, 198
- logical positivism, 316
- Lorenz, Konrad, 66
- Lyons, David, xviii, 200, 247, 263
- Mackie, J. L., 220–221, 315n2
- Macnamara, John, 3n1, 93n11
- Mahlmann, Matthias, xix, 3, 8t, 9n10
- Mardiros, A. M., 195n7
- Marr, David, 103, 149, 178
- Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), xix, 9n10, 77–78, 319, 320, 338
- “maximin” rule, 201
- McDowell, John, 48
- Mead, G. H., 189
- means-based moral principles, and trolley problems, 96, 337. *See also* categorical imperative; “for the purpose of” test; I-generation; intention; intentional structure; “in order to” test
- mental capacity: and moral sense as complex illustration of, 55; and Rawls on sense of justice as, 65, 281; and subject matter of Rawls' conception of moral theory, 277–280
- mental chemistry, 127f, 129
- mental grammar: argument for, 44, 58, 59t; distinction between theoretical grammar and, 60–61
- mentalism: and contrast with behaviorism, 18–19; and moral theory, 19, 224–225; and subject matter of linguistics, 19, 236
- mental representation, and moral grammar hypothesis, 38, 114, 116–117
- mental state attributions, and trolley problems, 337
- metaethical adequacy: problem of, 31, 32, 217–221, 223, 226–227; and reflective equilibrium, 212–213; use of term, 28, 29t. *See also* metaethics
- metaethics, 9, 29n11, 217–221
- metaphysics: and conceptions of naturalism and physicalism, 184; and Dworkin's interpretation of Rawls, 270, 296, 298; and independence of moral theory, 213, 216; and logical positivism's verificationist criterion of meaning, 316; and metaethics, 217–222; and moral realism, 219; and Rawls' interpretation of justice as fairness, 298
- method, as element of Dworkin's interpretation of Rawls, 287–291. *See also* hypothetico-deductive method; scientific method
- Mikhail, John, 8t, 82n1
- Mill, John Stuart, xvii, 8t, 9n9, 35, 84n5, 127f, 129
- Miller, Richard, 73n12
- mind-independence, 220, 279. *See also* externalization
- Model Penal Code, 158
- modularity, and cognitive science, 216n15
- modus ponens*, 92
- Moore, G. E., 4, 228, 315n2, 316
- Moore, Michael S., 73n11, 176, 220
- moral agent, concept of, 87–88, 302n11

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

401

- Moral Calculus of Risk, 137–144, 148, 158
- moral cognition: brain regions involved in, 105–106; modeling theory of on Universal Grammar, 3–12; and naturalism, 34–39, 303–304, 313; new framework for theory of, 13–41; and nineteenth-century neuropsychology, 315
- moral competence: of children, 346–350; as distinct from moral performance, 18, 52; and parallel to linguistic competence, 6; and rationality, 33; and Rawls' use of alternative terms for, 4n2
- moral diversity: innate constraints on, 15–17; problem of, 215; and Rawls' use of idealization, 56–57; significant influence of culture on, 90
- moral faculty, xv, 44, 269, 276–287, 303–304, 307, 314–318. *See also conscientia* (conscience); moral grammar; “Sense of Justice, The”
- moral geometry: and mental representation of trolley problems, 119–120, 174f; Rawls on theorems of, 36–37
- moral grammar: argument for, 17, 30, 43–48, 58, 59f; and conversion rules, 120–121, 162–174; and deontic rules, 117–118, 132–152; and distinction between K-generation and I-generation, 130–132; as feature of Rawls' conception of moral theory, 43–48, 58, 59f; formal model of intuitive jurisprudence and, 123–179; generative character of, 15; hypothesis of, 38–39, 101–122, 310–311; and human rights, 295–303; initial evidence for, 104–106; and intuitive legal appraisal, 121–122; and particularism, 71–73; and poverty of the perceptual stimulus, 111–117; and problem of descriptive adequacy, 30–31, 106–110, 111f; and problem of normative adequacy, 30–31; and simplifying assumptions, 124–125; and structural descriptions, 118–120, 125–132, 153–162; use of term, 16. *See also* Universal Moral Grammar
- moral intuitions: and comparison with linguistic intuitions, 4–5, 16–17, 43–48, 232–256; as data for moral theory, 236–238, 240–256, 257–265; distinction between considered judgments and, 40–41, 51–55, 282–283; as evidence of mental structure rather than as subject matter of psychology, 236n4; malleability and revisability of, 229, 247–250; and Nagel's criticism of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 236–238, 248–256; and particularism, 71–73; and reflective equilibrium, 197–213; and trolley problems, 78–82, 82–86. *See also* considered judgments; moral judgment
- moral judgment: and descriptive adequacy, 82–85; expanded perceptual model of, 114f; impartiality of, 51–55, 242, 244–246; intuitive character of, 16–17, 82–83, 97, 246; and nature of explication, 194; novelty and unboundedness of, 72–73; properties of, 16–17, 72, 82–85, 242–246; spontaneous character of, 16–17, 83, 97, 243; stability of, 72, 83, 97, 242–244. *See also* considered judgments; moral intuitions
- moral knowledge: and competence–performance distinction, 17–19, 51–56, 228–265; and main questions of the theory of moral cognition, 15, 24, 27, 29f; and skepticism, 68; and use of term, 61–67
- morally preferable alternatives, 151–152
- morally-worse-than relation, 138–139
- moral patient, concept of, 299, 302
- moral performance: and competence–performance distinction, 54n6; distinction between moral competence and, 18, 52; and use of moral knowledge, 15
- moral personality, 297
- moral philosophy: academic status of, xvi; and recent discussions of moral faculty, 44, 314; and Hare's and Singer's criticisms of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 184, 186; main trends in since 1950s, 317; and problems of empirical and normative adequacy, 216; Rawls' distinction between moral theory and, 213–214; Rawls' knowledge of history of, 9n10; Raz's distinction between moral psychology and, 286
- moral principles: comparative, 145–147; conditional, 81, 91–93; decision procedure for, 10, 27; and descriptive adequacy, 22–23; discovery procedure for, 27; evaluation procedure for, 27, 213, 217, 221–223, 226–227; and explication, 191–196, 223; and metaethical adequacy, 28, 31–32; and normative adequacy, 28, 31–32; and particularism, 71–73; simplicity requirement for, 291n7. *See also* moral grammar
- moral psychology: development of as an academic discipline, xvi–ii, 5n4, 19, 20–21; importance of for moral philosophy, 6n7,

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

402

Index

- moral psychology (*cont.*)
 41–49, 63–67, 77–179, 181–304; importance of for political, social, and legal theory, 318; negative impact of behaviorism on, 19, 20–21; Rawls' approach to cognitive development and, 35–36; Rawls' conception of moral theory and, 6; Raz's distinction between moral philosophy and, 286. *See also* moral cognition; moral theory
- moral realism, and metaethical adequacy, 219–220, 270
- moral reality, Dworkin's use of term, 278–279
- moral relativism, and problems of empirical and normative adequacy, 216. *See also* relativism
- moral structure, of trolley problems, 170f, 172
- moral theory: features of Rawls' conception of, 43–57, 67t; goal of, 276, 277, 280–282, 293; Hare's and Singer's criticisms of Rawls' conception of, 226–227; and I-morality, 63–67; initial comparisons between linguistics and, 14–27; and Nagel's criticism of Rawls' linguistic analogy, 228–229, 236–238, 252; noncognitivism and Rawls' conception of, 218–219; Rawls' distinction between moral philosophy and, 213; and Rawls on problems of empirical and normative adequacy, 213–217; and subjectivity, 222; subject matter of, 276, 277–280
- motive, as element of problem of descriptive adequacy and its solution, 86–87
- Mu'tazalites, xv
- Nagel, Thomas, 5, 7, 40, 42, 58, 78, 228–265, 267, 312–313, 341
- nativism, in cognitive science and philosophy of mind, 35–36, 38, 216n15. *See also* innateness; Universal Grammar; Universal Moral Grammar
- naturalism: and distinction between methodological and metaphysical, 194; and jurisprudence, xvi, 266–268, 295–303; and theory of moral cognition, 34–39, 303–304, 313. *See also* physicalism
- natural law: and Grotius, xv–xvi; and human rights, 296–297, 317–318; and jurisprudence, 266, 295–303; and Pufendorf, 266; and St. Paul, xv
- natural liberty, principle of, 132–133. *See also* Residual Permission Principle
- natural model (Dworkin), 266–267, 269–274, 278t, 279, 283, 288, 289, 295, 303–304
- natural rights, Rawls' theory of, 295, 297–299
- necessity: as affirmative defense, 148, 158; cases of, xvi, 117
- negative act, and complex omission-token representation, 144–145
- negative utilitarianism, 158
- negligence: common law of, 140–141, 158, 159–161t; and Hand Formula, 140–141; and moral calculus of risk, 137–144; and trolley problems, 159–161t, 163–167t
- Nelson, Sharon, 3, 4
- neurocognitive adequacy, 23–24, 28–30, 29t
- neuroscience: and brain regions involved in moral cognition, 105; and computing structural descriptions, 118–121, 162–174; and inadequate appraisal theory of trolley problems, 112–117, 121–122; and neurocognitive adequacy, 23–24, 28–30, 29t
- Nietzsche, Friedrich, 8t, 33
- noncognitivism, and metaethical adequacy, 218–221, 316–317
- normal form, of complex act-token representation, 124
- normative adequacy: distinction between empirical adequacy and, 183–227; and Rawls' linguistic analogy, 29–30, 31; and descriptively adequate moral theory as a presumptive solution to problem of, 30, 40, 187, 192, 195–197, 215–217, 221–222, 225–226; and problems of descriptive and explanatory adequacy, 223, 225; and reflective equilibrium, 31–33, 40; and requirement of rationality, 32–33, 191, 230, 265, 313; use of term, 28. *See also* normative ethics
- normative ethics, 29n11, 184, 186, 215, 218, 219, 227, 292–293. *See also* normative adequacy
- novelty: of linguistic expressions, 45–46, 94–95; of moral judgments, 46–48, 72–73, 78; and unfamiliarity of trolley problems, 95
- Nowell-Smith P., 315n2
- Nozick, Robert, 8t, 9, 54–55, 64n7, 98
- nullum crimen sine lege* (no crime without law) and *nullem peona sine lege* (no penalty without law), 132
- obiter dictum* (“something said in passing”), 20n4
- objection from insufficient normativity, 188, 190
- objection from prejudice, 40, 246–247
- objective validity, 223, 226

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

403

- objectivity, in moral judgment, 83.
 See also subjectivity
- obligatory acts, 85, 105f, 124
- observational adequacy: and problem of descriptive adequacy in moral theory, 49–50, 59t, 252; use of term in linguistics and cognitive science, 21–23
- omission: and complex omission-token representation, 144–145, 146t, 147; and equipollence relations, 105f; and periodic table of moral elements, 157; and Principle of Double Effect, 151–152
- operative principles, 19–21, 30, 50–51, 59t, 84–85. *See also* express principles
- order of priority, and problems of descriptive and normative adequacy, 30, 197
- original position, 198, 200–201
- “Outline of a Decision Procedure for Ethics” (Rawls 1951), 10, 27, 40, 49n33, 66, 187, 190, 195–197, 212, 217, 221, 242, 246
- pacifism, and knowing homicide, 148
- parsing problem, 16. *See also* perception problem
- particularism, 71–73
- Paul, St., vi, xv
- Pauline Principle, 337, 338t
- PDE. *See* Principle of Double Effect
- perception problem: in linguistics and moral theory generally, 16, 17; in moral cognition
- perceptual model, 88–91, 111–117
- performance. *See* competence–performance distinction
- periodic table, of moral elements, 153–162
- permissibility judgments, 251–252
- permissible acts, 85, 105f, 124
- Perry, Ralph Barton, 25n8
- personal-impersonal distinction (Greene), 112–114, 113f, 121–122
- Petrinovich, Lewis, 110n1, 323
- philosophy of science, Dworkin's misconceptions about, 276.
 See also scientific method
- physicalism, distinction between methodological and metaphysical, 194.
 See also naturalism
- Piaget, Jean, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8t, 11, 21, 34, 35, 82n2, 84, 96, 189, 243, 346, 349
- Pinker, Steven, 8t, 23, 50n4, 57
- P-language, 62–63
- Plato, 4, 305
- P-morality, 63, 64
- political philosophy, of Rawls in 1980s and 1990s, 298
- political science, and Rawls' theory of justice, 280n4
- Popper, Karl, 288n5
- Posner, Richard, 8t, 224–225, 315n2
- possible acts, 85
- Potts, Timothy, 93n11
- Pound, Roscoe, 73
- poverty of the stimulus: as argument for innate knowledge, 17, 70–71, 82, 90; and distinction with degeneracy of the stimulus, 70; and moral perception, 111–117. *See also* innateness; Universal Grammar; Universal Moral Grammar
- prejudice: and competence–performance distinction, 258–263; and considered judgments, 162n11, 263. *See also* implicit bias; objection from prejudice; racial discrimination
- prescriptivism, and noncognitivism, 317
- Price, Richard, 316
- Prichard, H. A., 316
- primary act-token and act-type descriptions, 111, 114, 115–116t
- primary agent-description, 111
- Principle of Double Effect (PDE):
 decomposition of, 149; and deontic rules, 117–118; and empirical adequacy, 148–152; historical roots of (Aquinas), 148; and negative utilitarianism, 158; and periodic table of moral elements, 154t, 156t; as principle of justification, 152, 158; and self-defense, 148; and trolley problems, 154t, 156t, 324, 335, 336, 343
- Principle of Natural Liberty. *See* natural liberty, principle of
- probability, and Rawls on explication, 193.
 See also Moral Calculus of Risk
- production problem, in linguistics and moral theory, 16–17
- projection problem, 30, 46–47, 72–73, 78, 94–96; and argument for moral grammar, 30, 43–48; and novelty and unboundedness of moral judgments, 47–48
- proper names, potential prejudicial effect of on moral intuitions, 162n11
- properties of moral judgment, 51–55, 82–85, 241–236
- Prosser, William, 134, 324
- provisional justification, 201–202
- Pufendorf, Samuel, 8t, 266, 303n12
- pure procedural justice, 201, 203, 207

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

404

Index

- purposeful battery, representation of, 136
- purposeful homicide, representation of, 134, 148
- purposely harmful acts and omissions, 145, 146t, 147
- Putnam, Hilary, 35
- Quine, W. V. O., 8t, 9n9, 68, 95, 271
- Quinn, Warren, 68n9
- Rachels, James, 147
- racial discrimination: and considered judgments, 258–261; and reflective equilibrium, 203. *See also* prejudice
- Railton, Peter, 6n7, 314n1, 316n6
- Rashdall, Hastings, 316
- ratio decidendi* (“reason for deciding”), 20n4, 93, 101
- rationality: compatibility of principles of moral competence with requirements of, 33; and Enlightenment, 174–175; and problem of normative adequacy, 209; and Rawls’ approach to ethical theory, 191–192; and theory of rational choice, 31–33; and trolley problems, 97. *See also* rational judgments; reasonable men; rational reconstruction
- rational judgments, and Rawls on considered judgments, 192, 242, 245–246
- rational reconstruction (real and virtual), 191n4
- Rawls, John: assumptions about cognitive development, 35–36; author’s conversations with about moral theory, xvi, 36n16; and basic elements of linguistic analogy, 18, 21, 23, 26, 42–73, 308; and concluding remarks on linguistic analogy, 307–318; and considered judgments, 97, 99, 102, 110, 341; and contractual argument in *A Theory of Justice*, 198–202; and distinction between operative and express principles, 21; and Dworkin’s commentary on distinction between I-morality and E-morality, 266–304; and eight reasons for pursuing moral theory, 215–217; and empirical and normative adequacy in *Grounds*, 191–195; and empirical and normative adequacy in *Independence*, 213–215; and empirical and normative adequacy in *Outline*, 195–197; on explication of commonsense morality, xvii; Hare’s and Singer’s criticisms of linguistic analogy of, 183–190; and hypothetico-deductive method, 91–93; and lexical order of moral principles, 146n7; and linguistics and philosophy at MIT, 9n10; and metaethics, 27, 217–221, 221–227; and modeling of theory of moral cognition on Universal Grammar, 3–12, 229; and Nagel’s criticism of linguistic analogy, 228–266; and outline of plan of book, 33–38, 39–41; and preliminary clarifications about linguistic analogy, 27–33; and principle of natural liberty, 133; and problem of descriptive adequacy, 30, 78, 85–86, 88, 89, 96, 221; and reflective equilibrium, 31, 32, 99–100, 102, 179, 197–198, 202–212. *See also* “Independence of Moral Theory, The”; “Outline of a Decision Procedure for Ethics”; *Study in the Grounds of Ethical Knowledge, A; Theory of Justice, A*
- Raz, Joseph, 5, 284–285, 286–287
- reasonable men, Rawls’ concept of in *Grounds*, 192, 242, 246
- reflective equilibrium: concept of, 31, 32, 102, 179, 202–213; and considered judgments, 99–100; distinction between narrow and wide, 209–212; and Dworkin’s constructive model, 273–274; and Dworkin’s natural model, 271–274, 289–291; and Rawls on goal of moral theory, 293; and scientific method, 31, 99–100, 291; Singer’s commentary on Rawls’ concept of, 188–189; as state of affairs, rather than method or technique, 204–205, 289; in *A Theory of Justice*, 197–213
- Reichenbach, Hans, 317
- Reid, Thomas, xvi, 8t, 9n9, 187, 303n12, 317
- relativism, and Dworkin on natural and constructive models, 270, 272–273. *See also* moral relativism
- religious intolerance, and reflective equilibrium, 203
- representationalism, in cognitive science, 216n15
- Rescue Principle, 117, 144–148, 151, 152
- Residual Permission Principle, 124
- Residual Prohibition Principle, 132–133
- Restatement of Torts, 73n11, 158, 176
- rewrite rules: and linguistic structural descriptions, 253; and moral structural descriptions, 129, 137
- rights: Bentham’s paraphrastic analysis of, 299–300; derivative status of in computational theory of moral cognition, 299; derived expressions about trolley problems incorporating, 300–302; Hohfeld’s analysis of, 299, 301t;

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

Index

405

- human or natural, 57, 295–303, 317–318.
See also human rights; natural rights
- risk: gratuitousness of, 141; magnitude of, 140; marginal calculus of, 141; moral calculus of, 137–144, 148, 158; necessity of, 140–141; utility of, 140, 142–143
- Robinson, Paul, 5
- Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, 57
- Rorty, Richard, 9, 315n2
- Ross, W. D., 8t, 68n9, 191, 316
- Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 8t, 20, 35, 36n16, 198, 303n12
- Russell, Bertrand, xvii
- Ryle, Gilbert, 8t, 68
- Salmond, John, 178
- Scanlon, T. M., xviii, 144, 284, 285, 286, 303n12
- Schlick, Moritz, 181, 317
- Schneewind, J. B., 21n5, 294n9
- scientific method: and competence–performance distinction, 54–55; and Dworkin's interpretation of Rawls, 267, 269, 271–272; and “Galilean” style of inquiry, 275–276; and hypothetico-deductive method, 91–93, 287n5; and preference for explanatory depth to mere coverage of data, 274–276; and Rawls' notion of idealization, 54, 56, 65; and reflective equilibrium, 31, 99–100, 291; and scientific revolution, 275
- secondary act-type descriptions, 111, 114, 115–16t
- self-defense, and homicide, 148
- self-preservation principle, 136–137, 172
- semantic properties, and causal structure, 172
- “Sense of Justice, The” (Rawls 1963), 66
- Shavell, Steven, 5
- side-effect effect, 121, 143
- Sidgwick, Henry, 5n4, 34, 35, 84n5, 93n12, 96, 131, 186, 187, 212, 219, 227, 285–286, 287n5, 294, 312, 315, 316
- simple expected benefit, and cost-benefit analysis, 141
- Singer, Peter, 5, 7, 34, 40, 42, 58, 144, 183–227, 267, 293n8, 294, 299, 311–312, 315n2
- Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter, 11n12
- skepticism: and Dworkin on natural and constructive models, 270; and use of term “knowledge” to describe linguistic or moral principles, 68
- Skinner, B. F., 95
- Smith, Adam, xvi, 1, 7, 8t, 187, 294, 303n12, 317
- Soames, Scott, 62–63
- social constructivism, 35, 189
- social instincts, and moral structure, 172
- social institutions, and Rawls on concept of justice, 199
- social intuitionist model, of moral judgment (Haidt), 113f
- social justice: no computational theory of, 37; Rawls' concept of in *A Theory of Justice*, 199
- Social Science Research Network (SSRN), 319
- Society for Research in Child Development (SRCD), 319
- Sorrentino, Cristina, xix, 8t, 77, 82n1, 319
- Spelke, Elizabeth, xvii, xix, 8t, 35, 77, 319
- Spencer, Herbert, 84n5
- spontaneity, as property of moral judgments, 83n4, 243
- square of opposition and equipollence, 104, 105f. *See also* deontic logic
- stability, as property of moral judgments, 83n4, 243–244
- Stanley, Jason, xviii, 230n1, 237, 238, 258n13, 264n16
- steady state, of language and moral faculties, 14–15n2
- Stevenson, Charles L., 4, 316
- Stich, Stephen, xxiii, 3, 8t, 11
- Stone, Julius, 73, 134n5, 310
- strong generation, 89n9, 252–256
- structural features: of acts, 92, 118–120, 125–132; of omissions, 144–148; and periodic table of moral elements, 153–162
- structure-dependent rules, of language acquisition, 70
- Study in the Grounds of Ethical Knowledge, A* (Rawls 1950), 10, 49n3, 66, 187, 190, 191–195, 196, 197, 212, 217, 219, 241–242, 246
- Sturgeon, Nicholas, xviii, 221, 315n2
- subjective stability, 243
- subjectivity: in moral judgment, 83; and Singer's critique of Rawls, 222–223. *See also* objectivity; subjective stability
- subject matter, of moral theory, as element of Dworkin's interpretation of Rawls, 276, 277–280. *See also* *conscientia* (conscience); moral competence; moral faculty; moral grammar; I-morality; “Sense of Justice, The”
- Sunstein, Cass, 11n12

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85578-5 - Elements of Moral Cognition: Rawls' Linguistic Analogy and the Cognitive Science of Moral and Legal Judgment

John Mikhail

Index

[More information](#)

406

Index

- SVO hypothesis, 239n7
- synderesis* (first principles of practical reason), 93
- Syntactic Structures* (Chomsky 1957), 26, 46–47, 49, 89, 253
- Taking Rights Seriously* (Dworkin), 291, 296, 304
- temporal structure, 171, 337
- Tenenbaum, Josh, xix, 3n1
- Terry, Henry, 176, 178
- Theory of Justice, A* (Rawls 1971), xvii, 3–12, 21, 26–27, 31–38, 40, 42–43, 66–67, 73, 88, 133, 183–190, 197–213, 215n14, 217, 228, 241, 242, 249, 251, 253, 266–304, 308, 309, 311, 312, 313, 318
- Thomson, Judith Jarvis, xvii, xxiii, 7, 14, 38, 77, 158, 309, 320, 337
- thought experiments, xvi, 78–80, 96, 106–109t, 163–167t
- Toulmin, Stephen, 262
- tree diagram, and linguistic structural descriptions, 253
- Trivers, Robert, 24, 66
- trolley problems: artificiality of, 94, 95–96, 97; and cognitive mechanisms, 80–81; and considered judgments, 86t; and cost-benefit analysis, 142–143; description of experiments, 319–350; explanations of variance in, 126–128; and manipulation of structural features, 163–167; originating in the work of Foot and Thomson, 7, 77–78; permissibility versus acceptability judgments in, 251–252; and problem of descriptive adequacy, 78–82, 94–100, 106–110, 111t, 112t; racism and prejudice in moral judgments and, 259–261; structural descriptions of, 118f, 119f; unfamiliarity of, 94–95
- unboundedness: of linguistic judgment, 46; of moral judgment, 72–73
- uncertainty, of trolley problems, 94, 97–99
- unconscious inference: Helmholtz's concept of, 175; and Leibniz's argument for innate moral knowledge, 36n16
- Unger, Peter, 144
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 57, 303, 307
- Universal Grammar (UG): and acquisition models, 90; and Chomsky, 3, 14; and criminal law systems, 105; and distinction with particular linguistic grammar, 14; general introductions to theory of, 14n1; modeling of theory of moral cognition on, 3–12. *See also* acquisition models; explanatory adequacy; innateness; linguistic analogy; linguistic grammar; Universal Moral Grammar
- Universal Jurisprudence, 300
- Universal Moral Grammar (UMG): and acquisition models, 90; and author's overriding objective, 11; and a common human moral nature, 73, 317–318; and comparisons between linguistics and moral theory, 14, 15; and conclusions on theory of moral cognition, 307–318; and distinction with particular moral grammar, 15. *See also* acquisition models; explanatory adequacy; innateness; linguistic analogy; moral grammar; Universal Grammar
- Urmson, J. O., 316n6
- utilitarianism: descriptive inadequacy of simple forms of, 96; inadequacy of with respect to prohibitions of battery and homicide, 133; justice as fairness as a viable alternative to, 198, 210; and necessity defense, 158; negative version of, 158; Rawls and refutation of, 191, 198. *See also* consequentialism, cost-benefit analysis, necessity, negative utilitarianism
- voluntary act, 87–88
- Von Savigny, F. C., 8t, 9n9, 123
- weak generation, 89n9, 252–256
- Weinrib, Ernest, 144
- Westermarck, Edward, 316
- Whewell, William, 20, 21n5, 84n5
- White, Alan, 315n3
- Williams, Bernard, 5, 44n1, 186, 247, 314, 315n2, 316n6
- Wilson, E. O., 24
- Wilson, James, 307, 317
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 61
- Wolff, Robert Paul, 31n14, 191n4
- Wood, Allen, 9n9, 258n13
- Xu, Fei, 331n4
- Xu, Yaoda, 331n4
- yes–no questions, and phrase structure in syntax, 255
- Young, Robert M., 315